

**EVALUATION REPORT  
(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)**

|    |                             |  |
|----|-----------------------------|--|
| 01 | Name of Procuring Agency    | Gwadar Port Authority,<br>Ministry of Ports and Shipping, Government of Pakistan |
| 02 | Method of Procurement       | Single Stage Two Envelope Bidding (SSTE) (EPC/Turnkey Basis)                     |
| 03 | Title of Procurement        | Construction of Eastbay Expressway of Gwadar Port                                |
| 04 | Tender Inquiry No.          | GPA / EBEW / 05/ 2017 dated 19-05-2017   |
| 05 | PPRA Ref. No. (TSE)         | -----  |
| 06 | Date & Time of Bid Closing  | 29th June 2017, 12:00 Hrs  |
| 07 | Date & Time of Bid Opening  | 29th June 2017, 12:30 Hrs (Technical) , 19th July 2017 at 15:30 Hrs (Financial)  |
| 08 | No. of Bids Received        | 06 (Six)   |
| 09 | Criteria for Bid Evaluation | Criteria of Bid Evaluation is attached at Annex-A                                |
| 10 | Detail of Bid(s) Evaluation | Given in the below table   |

| Particulars  | Marks/Evaluation<br>(Qualifying Marks=75% Overall) |                              | Evaluated Cost<br>(PKR) | Rule/Regulation/SBD*/<br>Policy/ Basis for<br>Rejection / Acceptance<br>as per Rule 35 of PP<br>Rules, 2004. |
|--|--|------------------------------|-------------------------|--|
|  | Technical (if<br>applicable)                       | Financial (if<br>applicable) |                         |  |
| M/S. China Communication Construction Co.Ltd                                     | Qualified  | Bid Price Opened             | 16,428,613,349          | 1st  |
| M/S. China Railway 17th Bureau Group Co. Ltd. J/V Zeeruk International Pvt. Ltd. | Qualified  | Bid Price Opened             | 16,862,300,113          | 2nd  |
| M/S. China State Construction Engineering Corporation Ltd.                       | Qualified  | Bid Price Opened             | 17,459,771,183          | 3rd  |
| China Railway First Group Co. Ltd.   | Not Technically Qualified                          |                              | N/A                     |  |
| Xinjiang Beixin Road & Bridge Group Co. Ltd.                                     | Not Technically Qualified                          |                              | N/A                     |  |
| China Yunnan Sunny Road & Bridge Co. Ltd.  | Not Technically Qualified                          |                              | N/A                     |  |

**Lowest Evaluated Bidders:** M/S. China Communication Construction Co.Ltd.

(Rationalized Bid Price PKR 15,088,155,333)

11. Any other additional/ supporting information, the procuring agency may like to share: the project is being financed by China Exim Bank. The bidding was done on EPC / Turnkey Basis Single Stage Two Envelope Bidding (SSTE) Procedure.

Signature: .....

Official Stamp: .....



**NAVEED AHMED**  
(PROJECT DIRECTOR)

## 1. QUALIFICATION CRITERIA

### 1.1 General

Post-Qualification will be based on all the criteria given in succeeding paras regarding the applicant's general and particular experience, personnel and equipment capabilities, and financial position, as demonstrated by the applicant's responses in the forms provided.

The Employer reserves the right to waive minor deviations if these don't materially affect the capability of an applicant to perform the contract. Sub-contractor's experience and resources shall not be taken into account in determining the applicant's compliance with the qualifying criteria. However, for Joint Venture, collective experience, resources and financial soundness of all partners shall be considered.

The Employer reserves the right to verify or seek clarification of the information furnished by the applicants. The Employer may reject any application for any misrepresentation made by any applicant in, or pursuant to, their application or for any statement furnished in connection therewith, and intended to be relied upon by the Employer, which is incorrect in any respect.

Following criteria has been adopted for Post-qualification of Applicant

| Category                                   | Marks      |
|--|------------|
|  | Weightages |
| <b>1. Financial Soundness</b>              | <b>35</b>  |
| <b>2. Working Capability</b>               | <b>40</b>  |
| Construction Capability                    | 28         |
| Design Capability                          | 12         |
| <b>3. Personnel Capability</b>             | <b>15</b>  |
| Personnel Capability for Construction firm | 10         |
| Personnel Capability for Design firm       | 5          |
| <b>4. Equipment Capability</b>             | <b>10</b>  |

Post-qualification status shall be decided on the basis of Pass/Fail approach. To qualify the applicant must secure at least 65% marks in each Category and obtain overall 75% marks.

### Financial Soundness

**Financial Capability** of an applicant will be considered as follows:

The Applicant should demonstrate that he has access to, or has available liquid assets, un-encumbered real assets, lines of credit and other financial means sufficient to meet the cash flow for the execution of works.

The audited financial statements (including balance sheet, income statement

and cash flow statements) for the last five years (**Form A-2, A-3 and A-9**) must be submitted and should demonstrate the soundness of the applicant's financial position, showing long term profitability. Where necessary, the Employer will make inquiries with the applicant's bankers.

Marks shall be awarded under this category based on the following criteria:

| <b>Sr. No.</b>               | <b>Description</b>                      | <b>Max Marks</b> | <b>Criteria for Marks Obtained</b>  |
|------------------------------|---|------------------|---|
| a)                           | Available Bank Credit Line(updated)     | 06               | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Two (02) Marks are given if the available bank credit line limit is equal to US\$ 40 Million. One mark is given for every US\$ 15 Million increase in the Credit Line.</li> <li>Full Marks are given in case of limit <math>\geq</math>US\$ <b>100</b> million.</li> </ul>   |
| b)                           | Average Working Capital in last 5 years | 14               | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Two (02) Marks are given if the average working capital for last <b>five</b> years is equal to US\$ 160 million. One additional (01) mark is given for every US\$ 70 million increase in the working capital.</li> <li>Full Marks are given in case of working capital <math>\geq</math>US\$ <b>1000</b> million.</li> </ul>                   |
| c)                           | Average Annual Turnover in last 5 years | 15               | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Three (03) Marks are given if the average annual turnover for last <b>five</b> years is equal to US\$ 500 million. One (01) additional mark is given for every US\$ 84 million increase in the average annual turnover.</li> <li>Full Marks are given in case of Average Annual Turnover <math>\geq</math>US\$ <b>1500</b> million.</li> </ul> |
| <b>Total Marks Allocated</b> |   |                  | <b>35</b>   |

## **Working Capability**

### **1) Construction Capability**

**Construction Capability for Projects Completed (Form A-4)** will be evaluated on the basis of the following Marks:

(Information regarding similar/comparable projects is to be supported by documents such as Letter of Intent/ Letter of Award, Job Completion Certificate and any other relevant document)

Marks shall be awarded under this category based on the following criteria:

| Capability  | Marks             |
|---|-------------------|
| <p>1. At least two large scale expressways constructed during last ten years, each costing US\$ 100 million or above</p> <p>Two additional marks will be given to those applicants who have completed above project on EPC basis.</p> | <p>8</p> <p>2</p> |
| <p>2. At least two bridge projects of each costing US\$ 50 million or above completed during last ten years.</p> <p>Two additional marks will be given to those applicants who have completed above project on EPC basis.</p>         | <p>6</p> <p>2</p> |
| <p>3. At least two off-shore road projects of each costing US\$ 50 million or above completed during last ten years.</p> <p>Two additional marks will be given to those applicants who has completed above project on EPC basis.</p>  | <p>8</p> <p>2</p> |
| <p><b>Maximum Marks</b></p>   | <p><b>28</b></p>  |

## 2) Design Capability

The applicants should clearly demonstrate if engineering design activity will be undertaken in-house or through a specialist design firm. In case of engaging specialist design firm, the applicants should identify the design firm and provide JV Agreement in this regard.

**Design Experience for Projects completed (Form A-5)** will be evaluated on the

basis of the following Marks:

(Information regarding similar/Comparable projects is to be supported by documents such as Letter of Intent/ Letter of Award and any other relevant document)

Marks shall be awarded under this category based on the following criteria:

| <b>Experience</b>  | <b>Marks</b> |
|--|--------------|
| Similar/Comparable projects designed during last ten years of project costing: |              |
| One Project of value US\$ 100 million or above                                 | 06           |
| Two Projects each of value US\$ 100 million or above                           | 09           |
| Three Projects each of value US\$ 100 million or above                         | 12           |
| <b>Maximum Marks</b>   | <b>12</b>    |

## **Personnel Capability**

### **1) Personnel Capability for Construction firm**

**Personnel Capability of Construction firm** will be evaluated on the basis of following Marks:

a) Key Personnel for construction firms :

| <b>Key Personnel</b>                          | <b>Marks</b> |
|---|--------------|
| i. Project Manager                            | <b>2</b>     |
| ii. Construction Manager                      | <b>1</b>     |
| iii. Material Engineer                        | <b>1</b>     |
| iv. Quality Control/Quality Assurance Manager | <b>1</b>     |
| v. Scheduling/Planning Manager                | <b>1</b>     |
| vi. Commercial Manager                        | <b>1</b>     |
| vii. Mechanical Engineer                      | <b>1</b>     |
| viii. Electrical Engineer                     | <b>1</b>     |
| ix. Hydrographic Surveyor                     | <b>1</b>     |
| <b>Total Marks</b>                            | <b>10</b>    |

Marks for construction's firm key personnel will be given on the basis of the following criteria:

**Project Manager (Form A-6 and A-7)**  
**(Must be a Civil Engineering University Degree Holder)**

| <b>Marks</b>                         |     |
|--------------------------------------|-----|
| <b>Total work Experience (years)</b> |     |
| More than 25                         | 1.0 |
| 20 <sup>+</sup> -25                  | 0.5 |
| 20 or less                           | 0.0 |
| <b>Specific Experience (years)</b>   |     |
| More than 20                         | 1.0 |
| 15 <sup>+</sup> -20                  | 0.5 |
| 15 or less                           | 0.0 |

**Construction Manager (Form A-6 and A-7)**  
**(Must be a Civil University Engineering Degree Holder)**

| <b>Marks</b>                       |     |
|------------------------------------|-----|
| <b>Specific Experience (years)</b> |     |
| More than 15                       | 1.0 |
| 10 <sup>+</sup> -15                | 0.5 |
| 10 or less                         | 0.0 |

**Material Engineer (Form A-6 and A-7) (Qualification BSc Civil Engineering / MSC in Geology)**

| <b>Marks</b>                       |     |
|------------------------------------|-----|
| <b>Specific Experience (years)</b> |     |
| More than 10                       | 1.0 |
| 05 <sup>+</sup> -10                | 0.5 |
| 05 or less                         | 0.0 |

**Quality Control/Quality Assurance Manager (Form A-6 and A-7) (Qualification BSc Civil Engineering)**

| <b>Marks</b>                       |     |
|------------------------------------|-----|
| <b>Specific Experience (years)</b> |     |
| More than 10                       | 1.0 |
| 05 <sup>+</sup> -10                | 0.5 |
| 05 or less                         | 0.0 |

**Scheduling/Planning Manager (Form A-6 and A-7) (Qualification BSc Civil Engineering)**

|                                    | <b>Marks</b> |
|------------------------------------|--------------|
| <b>Specific Experience (years)</b> |              |
| More than 10                       | 1.0          |
| 05 <sup>+</sup> -10                | 0.5          |
| 05 or less                         | 0.0          |

**Commercial Manager (Form A-6 and A-7) (Qualification MBA Finance / MSc Economics)**

|                                    | <b>Marks</b> |
|------------------------------------|--------------|
| <b>Specific Experience (years)</b> |              |
| More than 10                       | 1.0          |
| 05 <sup>+</sup> -10                | 0.5          |
| 05 or less                         | 0.0          |

**Mechanical Engineer (Form A-6 and A-7)  
(must be a University Engineering Degree Holder in Mechanical Engineering)**

|                                    | <b>Marks</b> |
|------------------------------------|--------------|
| <b>Specific Experience (years)</b> |              |
| More than 15                       | 1.0          |
| 10 <sup>+</sup> -15                | 0.5          |
| 10 or less                         | 0.0          |

**Electrical Engineer (Form A-6 and A-7)  
(must be a University Engineering Degree Holder in Electrical Engineering)**

|                                    | <b>Marks</b> |
|------------------------------------|--------------|
| <b>Specific Experience (years)</b> |              |
| More than 15                       | 1.0          |
| 10 <sup>+</sup> -15                | 0.5          |
| 10 or less                         | 0.0          |

**Hydrographic Surveyor (Form A-6 and A-7) (Qualification BSc Civil Engineering or Equivalent)**

|                                    | <b>Marks</b> |
|------------------------------------|--------------|
| <b>Specific Experience (years)</b> |              |
| More than 10                       | 1.0          |
| 05 <sup>+</sup> -10                | 0.5          |
| 05 or less                         | 0.0          |

## 2) Personnel Capability for Design firm

Personnel Capability of Design firm will be evaluated on the basis of following marks:

| Key Personnel                            | Marks<br>(Maximum) |
|--|--------------------|
| i. Structural Engineering(Team leader)   | 1.5                |
| ii. Marine Engineering(Team leader)      | 1.5                |
| iii. Mechanical Engineering(Team leader) | 1                  |
| iv. Electrical Engineering(Team leader)  | 1                  |
| <b>Total Marks</b>                       | <b>5</b>           |

Marks for Design firm's personnel will be given on the basis of the following criteria:

### Structural Engineering (Team Leader)

(Must have a Postgraduate Engineering Degree in Structural engineering)

|                             | Marks |
|-----------------------------|-------|
| Specific Experience (years) |       |
| More than 15                | 1.5   |
| 10 <sup>+</sup> -15         | 1.0   |
| 05 <sup>+</sup> -10         | 0.5   |
| Less than 05                | 0     |

### Marine Engineering (Team Leader)

(Must have a Postgraduate Engineering Degree in Marine Engineering)

|                             | Marks |
|-----------------------------|-------|
| Specific Experience (years) |       |
| More than 15                | 1.5   |
| 10 <sup>+</sup> -15         | 1.0   |
| 05 <sup>+</sup> -10         | 0.5   |
| Less than 05                | 0     |

### Mechanical Engineering (Team Leader)

(Must have a University Engineering Degree in Mechanical Engineering)

|                             | Marks |
|-----------------------------|-------|
| Specific Experience (years) |       |
| More than 15                | 01    |
| 10 <sup>+</sup> -15         | 0.5   |
| Less Than 10                | 0     |



**Electrical Engineering (Team Leader)**  
**(Must have a University Engineering Degree in Electrical Engineering)**

|                             | Marks |
|-----------------------------|-------|
| Specific Experience (years) |       |
| More than 15                | 01    |
| 10 <sup>+</sup> -15         | 0.5   |
| Less Than 10                | 0     |

**Equipment Capabilities**

The applicant should own, or have assured access to (through rented, lease, purchase agreement or other means), the following key equipment (limited to only major items of equipment) in full working order, and must demonstrate that, based on known commitments, these will be available for deployment on the proposed contract or works. **(Form A-8)** The applicant may also list alternative equipment which he would propose for the contract together with an explanation of the alternate proposal.

| S.NO.                | EQUIPMENT DESCRIPTION           | CAPACITY                      | REQUIRED (NOS.) | MARKS     |
|----------------------|---------------------------------|-------------------------------|-----------------|-----------|
| 1                    | Dump Trucks min                 | 10 m <sup>3</sup>             | 20              | 1         |
| 2                    | Loaders                         | 1.5 m <sup>3</sup>            | 10              | 1         |
| 3                    | Excavator                       | 1 m <sup>3</sup>              | 05              | 0.5       |
| 4                    | Rollers                         | 10 to 12 Ton                  | 06              | 0.5       |
| 5                    | Pneumatic Tyre Roller           | 8 - 24 Ton, Width = 2042 mm   | 04              | 0.5       |
| 6                    | Water Bowser                    | 9000 Ltr                      | 08              | 0.5       |
| 7                    | Generator                       | 100 KVA                       | 04              | 0.5       |
| 8                    | Total Station, Survey Equipment | -                             | 02              | 0.5       |
| 9                    | Concrete Batching Plant         | 30 m <sup>3</sup> / Hr        | 02              | 0.5       |
| 10                   | Transit Mixers                  | 6 m <sup>3</sup>              | 02              | 0.5       |
| 11                   | Asphalt Batching Plant          | 80 - 240 Ton/Hr               | 02              | 0.5       |
| 12                   | Concrete Pumps                  | 160 m <sup>3</sup> /Hr, L=35m | 02              | 0.5       |
| 13                   | Mobile Crane                    | 30 Ton, L= 25m                | 02              | 0.5       |
| 14                   | Asphalt Concrete Paver          | 4m                            | 02              | 0.5       |
| 15                   | Grader                          | 140 H.P                       | 02              | 0.5       |
| 16                   | Compressor                      | 2.5 m <sup>3</sup> /sec       | 02              | 0.5       |
| 17                   | Steel Welding Plant             | -                             | 02              | 0.5       |
| 18                   | Crawler Crane                   | 120 Ton                       | 02              | 0.5       |
| <b>Maximum Marks</b> |                                 |                               |                 | <b>10</b> |