

EVALUATION REPORT

(As per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

1. Name of Procuring Agency: Cantonment Board Clifton
2. Method of Procurement: Single Stage Two Envelop
3. Title of Procurement: Annual Maintenance & Repair Works 2022-23
4. Tender Inquiry No.: Tender Notice vide dailies "Jang" "Duniya" "Tribune" "The News" "Express & Karachi-21-News dated 01-07-2022
5. PPRA Ref No. (TSE): TS484855E dated 01-7-2022
6. Date & Time of Bid closing: 19-07-2022 at 12:00 AM
7. Date & Time of Bid Opening: 19-07-2022 at 12:30 PM
8. No. of Bids Received: 22 Nos
9. Criteria of Bid Evaluation: Attached as Annex-A
10. Details of Bid(s) Evaluation: Given Below

S #	Name of Bidder	Technical Evaluation (Marks)	Financial Bid	Lowest evaluated bidder	Rule/Regulation/SBD*/ Policy/ Basis for rejection/ Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rule, 2004
(A)	D-2(a) Building				
1	M/s Altaf Hussain & Co	56	15% Above	Not Lowest evaluated bidder as financial bid is on the higher side	Rejected
2	M/s Al-Zaman Construction	59	32.13% Above	Not Lowest evaluated bidder as financial bid is on the higher side	Rejected
3	M/s Haider Builders	70	13.84% Above	Not Lowest evaluated bidder as financial bid is on the higher side	Rejected
4	M/s OS Construction	52	13.00% Above	Lowest Evaluated bidder/ Most advantageous bidder	Accepted being most advantageous bidder
5	M/s Al-Hakeem Builders	55	34.88% Above	Not Lowest evaluated bidder as financial bid is on the higher	Rejected

				side	
6	M/s Lutuf Ur Rehman	23	-	-	Failed to qualify as for Non-Responsive
7	M/s AEA	41	-	-	Failed to qualify as for Non-Responsive
(B)	D-2 (b) Road-Package-1				
1	M/s KKB(Kaim Khani Brothers)	55	14.91% Willingly reduced to 15.51% Below	Lowest	Accepted
2	M/s King Enterprises	60	29.50% Above	Not Lowest evaluated bidder as financial bid is on the higher side	Rejected
(C)	D-2 (b) Road-Package-2				
1	M/s KA Brothers	51	10.01% Below	Not Lowest evaluated bidder as financial bid is on the higher side	Rejected
2	M/s King Enterprises	60	29.25% Above	Not Lowest evaluated bidder as financial bid is on the higher side	Rejected
3	M/s Azeem Shah Khetrani	62	15.51% Below	Lowest	Accepted
(D)	D-2 (b) Road-Package-3				
1	M/s KKB(Kaim Khani Brothers)	55	12.76% Willingly reduced to 15.51% Below	Lowest	Accepted
2	M/s King Enterprises	60	29% Above	Not Lowest evaluated bidder as financial bid is on the higher side	Rejected
3	M/s Al Zaman Construction	-	-	-	Not qualified due to non compliance of clause -07 of tender notice as the firm has not owned its Asphalt plant.
(E)	D-2 (b) Road-Package-4				

1	M/s Azeem Shah Khetran	62	14% Willingly reduced to 15.51% Below		Lowest	Accepted
2	M/s King Enterprises	60	28.95% Above		Not Lowest evaluated bidder as financial bid is on the higher side	Rejected
3	M/s Hasham & Co.	-	-		-	Not qualified due to non compliance of clause -07 of tender notice as the firm has not owned its Asphalt plant.
(F)	D-2(c) Sewerage					
			Rate quoted on MES Sch of Rates 2021 (as amended)	Rates quoted for S/F of RPC Manhole cover		
1	M/s Haider Builders	65	9.95% Below		Lowest	Accepted
2	M/s Rafiq & Sons	52	18.94% Above		Not Lowest evaluated bidder as financial bid is on the higher side	Rejected
3	M/s Al-Hakeem Builders	41	-		-	Failed to qualify as for Non-Responsive
4	M/s HA Warsi & Sons	42	-		-	Failed to qualify as for Non-Responsive
5	M/s Al Zaman Construction	44	-		-	Failed to qualify as for Non-Responsive
(G)	D-2 (d) Water Supply					
1	M/s Al-Hakeem Builders	53	9.38% Below		Not Lowest evaluated bidder as financial bid is on the higher side	Rejected
2	M/s Al Zaman Construction	57	12.39% Below		Lowest	Accepted
3	M/s Altaf Hussain & Co	57	15% Above		Not Lowest evaluated bidder as financial bid is on the higher side	Rejected
4	M/s Haider Builder	44	-		-	Failed to qualify as for Non-Responsive
5	M/s OS Construction	24	-		-	Failed to qualify as for Non-Responsive

6	M/s Lutuf Ur Rehman	23	-	-	Failed to qualify as for Non-Responsive
H (a)	D-2(f) Misc. Public Improvement/Civil Works (i.e. maintenance of green belts, centre median, footpath and improvement works in CBC Nurseries, Parks, Grave Yards including painting to stone Kerbs, construction of culerts, Nullahs, construction of speed breakers, maintenance, etc)				
1	M/s NR Enterprises	65	12.75 Above	Not Lowest evaluated bidder as financial bid is on the higher side	Rejected
2	M/s King Enterprises	62	50% Above	Not Lowest evaluated bidder as financial bid is on the higher side	Rejected
3	M/s Al-Zaman Construction	59	2.75% Below	Lowest	Accepted

H {b(I)}. SUPPLY & FIXING OF LED STREET LIGHTS

SNo	Description of work	Rate Quoted by the bidder(Rs.)			Firm Quoted lowest rate
		M/s NR Enterprises	M/s King Enterprises	M/s Al Zaman Construction	
1.	LED Road light 70 Watts, 120 & 130 Watts, 140 & 150 Watts 160 & 170 Watts, 180 Watts 220-240 Volts Premium Quality Only	29.12% Above	75.00% Above	97% Above	M/s NR Enterprises

H {b(II)}. Other Electric Items

S. No	Description of work	Rate Quoted by the bidder(Rs.)			Firm Quoted lowest rate
		M/s NR Enterprises	M/s King Enterprises	M/s Al Zaman Construction	
1.	Other Electric Items as per MES schedule of rates, 2021 (Amended upto date) except LED street light.	29.75% Above	70.00% Above	88% Above	M/s NR Enterprises

H (c). Traffic Signals on Market Item Rate basis for Non-Schedule Items

S No	Description of work	Unit	Rate Quoted by the bidder(Rs.)			Firm Quoted lowest rate
			M/s NR Enterprises	M/s King Enterprises	M/s Al Zaman Construction	
1.	Providing & fixing of polycarbonate Traffic Light IP-65 light Emitting Diod (LED) Optical system. (Central Light Source Complete) imported					
	a) 3 Aspect 300 mm	Each (RS.)	105000/-	Not Quoted	167000/-	M/s NR Enterprises
	b) 3 Aspect 200 mm	Each (RS.)	79,000/-	Not Quoted	138000/-	-do-
2.	Provision & fixing of 2 digit LED light source Red, Green Countdown time Imported Polycarbonate (300 mm)	Each (RS.)	2200/-	Not Quoted	45000/-	-do-
3.	P/L testing & Commissioning of Multicore PVC insulated sheathed copper conductor cable (New Age, Pakistan cable fast cable or imported) 0.20mm ² - 1mm ² Multicore(4-core/6-core/12-core)Includes Power cable for wapda connections of each crossing as per site requirement.	RFE	900/-	Not Quoted	1450/-	-do-
4.	Microprocessor based Traffic signal controller (imported), extendable with 12 output 4vehicular/ signal groups, Phase holding facility & 7 different time plan programming as per site requirement, manual control with warning flasher, Green wave system with 7 different program (optional) operating on 230 V 50 Hz, with lock & key arrangements, with circuit breaker, output module with SSR along with Standard quality of Controller Cabinet complete in all respect	Each (RS.)	405000/-	Not Quoted	590,000/-	-do-
5.	Supply & fixing of 2" PVC Pipe with Road cutting	RFT	525/-	Not Quoted	1670/-	-do-
6.	Red Modules(imported)	Each (RS.)	10500/-	Not Quoted	17200/-	-do-
7.	Green Modules(imported)	Each (RS.)	11000/-	Not Quoted	17300/-	-do-
8.	Yellow Modules(imported)	Each (RS.)	11500/-	Not Quoted	18400/-	-do-
9.	Providing and fixing of signal standard poles (hot dip galvanized) with 15 feet height GI Pipe 4" dia complete with base plat 12 mm thick with 4 Nos. 3/8" thickness and stiffener	Each (RS.)	65000/-	Not Quoted	113000/-	-do-
10.	Providing and fixing of single arm cantilever pole(hot dip galvanized) 20 feet high pole of 5 inch/ 3 inch dia GI Pipe with base plate 400x400 x 18mm thick with 4 Nos. 3/8" thickness with pole cap	Each (RS.)	105000/-	Not Quoted	178000/-	-do-
11.	Providing and fixing of double arm cantilever pole (hot dip galvanized) 20 feet high pole of 5 inch / 3 inch dia GI Pipe with base plate 400X400 x 18mm	Each (RS.)	157000/-	Not Quoted	257,000/-	-do-

	thick with 4 Nos. 3/8" thickness with pole cap.					
12.	Foundation making for cantilever pole (hot dip galvanized) traffic pole including 1" dia 4 feet long J-Bolts nuts washers inclusive of sundry material like cement, sand, concrete with paint and labour charges	Each (RS.)	32000/-	Not Quoted	47800/-	-do-
13.	Foundation making for standard traffic pole (hot dip galvanized) including 3/4" dia 2.5 ft long J-Bolts nuts washers inclusive of sundry material like cement, sand, concrete (PCC) with paint & labour charges	Each (RS.)	26000/-	Not Quoted	48000/-	-do-
14.	Construction of 2'x2'x2' inner draw pit with PCC Cover	Each (RS.)	16000/-	Not Quoted	23000/-	-do-
15.	Termination of complete intersection including connector strip, Testing & Commissioning the existing pre laid cabling as site, includes grouping in junction box as well controller	Each (RS.)	26000/-	Not Quoted	47000/-	-do-
16.	I Aspect Countdown timer, 2.5 digits (188), 400mm Optical System with Red & Green High Intensity LEDs, Poly-Carbonate Housing i/c Gasket, Poly Carbonate hood/visor, set of Mounting /hanging Brackets Complete in all respect(Imported)	Each Rs.	78000/-	Not Quoted	165000/-	-do-

H(d). For Sign Boards on Market Item Rate basis for Non-Schedule Items

S No	Description of work (supply & fixing)	Specification	Unit	Rate Quoted by the bidder(Rs.)			Firm Quoted lowest rate
				M/s NR Enterprises	M/s King Enterprises	M/s AI Zaman Construction	
1.	Supply & Fixing of Informator y Signs Board (single sided) with one sheet having a clear height of 5ft from ground with two pipes as per specifications.	GI Sheet 14 Gauge (1.8mm thick), Vertical Posts (2 nos) GI 2.5" dia 11/12 gauge pipes 9 feet each, using 3M high intensity Grade Reflective Sheeting printed directly Plus Printer & 3M UV Inks (or equivalent), meeting all other requirements set forth in ASTM D 4956 including Shrinkage, Flexibility, Liner Adhesion, Impact resistance, Specular gloss and Outdoor weathering (Types III and IV) GI Clamps, channels	Per Sq.ft (Rs.)	3200	Not Quoted	7900/-	M/s NR Enterprises

		with nuts and bolts, 2 ft x 2 ft x 3 ft 1:2'4 foundations, complete with fixing and with warranty letter from the original manufacturer of the sheeting.					
2.	Supply & Fixing of Informator y Signs Boards (Double Sided) 2X sheets having a clear height of 5ft from ground with two pipes.	GI Sheet 14 Gauge (1.8mm thick), Vertical Posts (2 nos) GI 2.5" dia 11/12 gauge pipes 9 feet each, using 3M high intensity Grade Reflective Sheeting printed directly Plus Printer & 3M UV Inks (or equivalent), meeting all other requirements set forth in ASTM D 4956 including Shrinkage, Flexibility, Liner Adhesion, Impact resistance, Specular gloss and Outdoor weathering (Types III and IV) GI Clamps, channels with nuts and bolts, 2 ft x 2 ft x 3 ft 1:2'4 foundations, complete with fixing and with warranty letter from the original manufacturer of the sheeting.	Per Sq.ft (Rs.)	6500	Not Quoted	10600/-	M/s NR Enterprises
3.	a. Supply & Fixing of Informa tory signs board, skin only as per specifica tion includin g removal of existing skin.	3M High Intensity Grade Reflective Sheeting printed directly with Durst RHO 162 TS Plus Printer & 3 M UV Inks & meeting all other requirements set forth in ASTM D 4956 including Shrinkage, Flexibility, Liner removal, Adhesion, Impact resistance, Specular gloss and Outdoor weathering (Types III and IV).	Per Sq.ft (Rs.)	1500	Not Quoted	1470/-	M/s Al Zaman Construction
	b. Supply & Fixing	GI Sheet 14 Gauge (1.8mm thick)	Per Sq.ft	2200	Not Quoted	7400/-	M/s NR

	of Street sign boards (single side) GI sheet + skin as per specification.	&3M High Intensity Grade Reflective Sheeting printed directly with TS Plus printer & 3M UV Ink, meeting all other requirements set forth in ASTM D 4956 including Shrinkage, Flexibility, Liner removal, Adhesion, Impact resistance, Specular gloss and Outdoor weathering (Types III and IV) GI Clamps, channels with nuts and bolts, complete with fixing and with warranty letter from the original manufacturer of the sheeting.	(Rs.)				Enterprises
	c. Supply & Fixing of Street sign boards (Double Side) GI sheets + skin as per specification.		Per Sq.ft (Rs.)	4000	Not Quoted	10600/-	M/s NR Enterprises
4.	Cate Eyes/Studs						
	Cate Eyes/Studs i. Supply & fixing of 3M RPM 290 Series/Cate eyes Plastic Body (Single Side Yellow/ White/ Red/Green) or equivalent.	100mm x 100mm x 19 mm	Each	390/-	Not Quoted	830/-	M/s NR Enterprises
	ii. Supply & fixing of 3M RPM 291 Series / Cate eyes Plastic body (Double	100mm x 100mm x 19 mm	Each	500/-	Not Quoted	995/-	M/s NR Enterprises

	Side Yellow/ White/ Red/ Green) or equivalent.						
5.	Providing and laying of Road Marking with Thermoplastic Paint with glass beads and Zebra crossing	1.5mm to 2mm thick	Sft	125/-	Not Quoted	117/-	M/s Al Zaman Construction



Executive Officer
Cantonment Board Clifton