



NATIONAL HIGHWAY AUTHORITY

Procurement & Contract Administration Section
28 Mauve Area, G-9/I, Islamabad ☎ 051-9032727, 📠 051-9260419

No. 2(542)/GM(P&CA)/NHA/2023/594

06 September, 2023

Director General

Public Procurement Regulatory Authority
1st Floor FBC Building near State Bank,
Sector G-5/2, Islamabad

Subject: **ANNOUNCEMENT OF EVALUATION REPORT (PPRA RULE-16) AND INITIAL SELECTION DOCUMENTS ITA CLAUSE 28.1: CONSTRUCTION OF PESHAWAR - TORKHAM EXPRESSWAY (PTEX), INCLUDING SOUTHERN LINK ROAD - DESIGN AND BUILD**
➤ **LOT-1: CONSTRUCTION OF PESHAWAR - TORKHAM EXPRESSWAY (PTEX) ON DESIGN BUILD BASIS**
LOT-2: CONSTRUCTION OF SOUTHERN LINK ROAD ON DESIGN BUILD BASIS

Reference: PPRA Rule-16 and Initial Selection Documents ITA Clause 28.1

Find enclosed herewith the Evaluation Report (as per Rule 16 of PPRA Rules, 2004 and Initial Selection Documents ITA Clause 28.1) for the subject Works for uploading on PPRA website at the earliest, please.


(SAMI UR RAHMAN)
General Manager (P&CA)

Enclosure: Evaluation Report along with **Annex-I**

Copy for kind information to:

- Member (Planning), NHA, Islamabad;
- Director (Procurement)-KPEC, NHA, Islamabad;
- Director (MIS), NHA, Islamabad.

EVALUATION REPORT

(As Per Rule 16 of PPRA Rules, 2004 and Initial Selection documents ITA Clause 28.1)

1	Name of Procuring Agency	National Highway Authority
2	Method of Procurement	Initial Selection (Pre-Qualification)
3	Title of Procurement	Construction of Peshawar – Torkham Expressway (PTEX), Including Southern Link Road – Design And Build Lot-1: Construction of Peshawar – Torkham Expressway (PTEX) on Design Build Basis Lot-2: Construction Of Southern Link Road on Design Build Basis
4	Tendering Inquiry No.	<u>2(542)</u>
5	PPRA Ref No. (TSE)	TS488983E
6	Date & Time of Bid Closing	16 th November 2022 at 1130 hours
7	Date & Time of Bid Opening	16 th November 2022 at 1200 hours
8	No. of Bids Received	Lot-1: Ten (10) PQ Applications Lot-2: Ten (10) PQ Applications
9	Criteria for PQ Evaluation	Attached
10	Details of Applicant's Evaluation	As mentioned below

Sr. No.	Applicant Name	Lots	Technical Marks (if applicable)	Rule/Regulation/SBD*/Policy/Basis for Rejection /Acceptance
1	M/s IC Ictas Insaat Sanyai ve Ticeret AS (Turkey)	1 2	-----	The Applicant has been evaluated as substantially responsive to the requirement of IS Document.
2	M/s CMC-UJC-SMADB (JV)	1 2	-----	The Applicant has been evaluated as substantially non-responsive to the requirement of IS Document. The applicant not meeting the requirement for "Financial Situation and Performance".
3	M/s China Gezhouba Group Company Limited and M/s JSTI Group Co. Ltd.	1 2	-----	The Applicant has been evaluated as substantially responsive to the requirement of IS Document.
4	M/s ESER – SMC JV	1	-----	The Applicant has been evaluated as substantially responsive to the requirement of IS Document.

EVALUATION REPORT

(As Per Rule 16 of PPRA Rules, 2004 and Initial Selection documents ITA Clause 28.1)

5	M/s ZGCC – Matracon (JV)	1	-----	The Applicant has been evaluated as substantially responsive to the requirement of IS Document.
		2		
6	M/s China Road and Bridge Corporation	1	-----	The Applicant has been evaluated as substantially responsive to the requirement of IS Document.
		2		
7	M/s Sino Hydro Corporation Limited	1	-----	The Applicant has been evaluated as substantially responsive to the requirement of IS Document.
		2		
8	M/s National Logistics Cell Engineers	1	-----	The Applicant has been evaluated as substantially non-responsive to the requirement of IS Document. The applicant not meeting the criteria for “eligibility as per ITA 4.9, Specific Experience of Similar Construction Contracts for Lot-1, Key requirements for Specific Construction Activities and Specific Design Experience”.
		2		
9	M/s Frontier Works Organization	1	-----	The Applicant has been evaluated as substantially non-responsive to the requirement of IS Document. The applicant not meeting the criteria for “eligibility as per ITA 4.9, Specific Design Experience and Specific Experience in Managing ES Aspects”.
		2		
10	M/s ZKB – AZVIRT (JV)	1	-----	The Applicant has been evaluated as substantially responsive to the requirement of IS Document.
		2		

11. Any other additional/ supporting information, the procuring agency may like to share:

The issuance of Bid Document will be consequent to announcement of evaluation results and disposal of grievance(s) (if any).

Signature.....



GIM (P&CA)

Official Stamp:.....



Section III - Initial Selection Criteria and Requirements

This section contains all the methods, criteria, and requirements that the Employer shall use to evaluate Applications. The information to be provided in relation to each requirement and the definitions of the corresponding terms are included in the respective Application Forms.

Contents

Table 1 – Qualification Criteria and Requirements	27
1. Eligibility	27
2. Historical Contract Non-Performance	28
3. Financial Situation and Performance.....	31
4. Experience	33
Table 2 – Rated Criteria and Requirements.....	38
1. Past Performance.....	38



Table 1 – Qualification Criteria and Requirements**1. Eligibility**

No.	Subject	Criteria Requirement	Single Entity Requirements	Joint Venture Requirements			Documentation Submission Requirements
				All Members Combined	Each Member	One Member	
1.1	Nationality	Nationality in accordance with ITA 4.5	Must meet requirement	Must meet requirement	Must meet requirement	N/A	Forms ELI – 1.1 and 1.2, with attachments
1.2	Conflict of Interest	No conflicts of interest in accordance with ITA 4.6	Must meet requirement	Must meet requirement	Must meet requirement	N/A	Application Submission Letter
1.3	Bank Eligibility	Not having been declared ineligible by the Bank, as described in ITA 4.7 and 5.1	Must meet requirement	Must meet requirement	Must meet requirement	N/A	Application Submission Letter
1.4	United Nations resolution or Borrower's country law	Not having been excluded as a result of prohibition in the Borrower's country laws or official regulations against commercial relations with the Applicant's country, or by an act of compliance with UN Security Council resolution, both in accordance with ITA 5.1 and Section V.	Must meet requirement	Must meet requirement	Must meet requirement	N/A	Forms ELI – 1.1 and 1.2, with attachments



2. Historical Contract Non-Performance

No.	Criteria		Single Entity Requirements	Joint Venture Requirements			Documentation Submission Requirements
	Subject	Requirement		All Members Combined	Each Member	One Member	
2.1	History of Non-Performing Contracts	Non-performance of a contract ¹ did not occur as a result of contractor's default in the last ten (10) years from the date of submission.	Must meet requirement ¹	Must meet requirements	Must meet requirement ²	N/A	Form CON-2
2.2	Suspension Based on Execution of Bid or Proposal Securing Declaration by the Employer	Not under suspension based on execution of Bid or Proposal Securing Declaration pursuant to ITA 4.10.	Must meet requirement	Must meet requirement	Must meet requirement	N/A	Application Submission Letter
2.3	Pending Litigation	Applicant's financial position and prospective long-term profitability still sound according to criteria established in 3.1 below and assuming that all pending litigation will be resolved against the Applicant.	Must meet requirement	N/A	Must meet requirement	N/A	Form CON – 2

¹ Non-performance, as decided by the Employer, shall include all contracts where (a) non-performance was not challenged by the contractor, including through referral to the dispute resolution mechanism under the respective contract, and (b) contracts that were so challenged but fully settled against the contractor. Non-performance shall not include contracts where Employer's decision was overruled by the dispute resolution mechanism. Non-performance must be based on all information on fully settled disputes or litigation, i.e., dispute or litigation that has been resolved in accordance with the dispute resolution mechanism under the respective contract and where all appeal instances available to the applicant have been exhausted.

² This requirement also applies to contracts executed by the Applicant as a member.



No.	Subject	Criteria		Joint Venture Requirements			Documentation Submission Requirements
		Requirement	Single Entity Requirements	All Members Combined	Each Member	One Member	
2.4	Litigation History	No consistent history of court/arbitral award decisions against the Applicant ³ in the last ten (10) years from the date of submission.	Must meet requirement	Must meet requirement	Must meet requirement	N/A	Form CON – 2
2.5	Declaration: Environmental and Social (ES) past performance	Declare any civil work contracts that have been suspended or terminated and/or performance security called by an employer for reasons related to the non-compliance of any environmental, or social (including Sexual Exploitation and Abuse) contractual obligations in the past ten years. ⁴	Must make the declaration. Where there is Specialized Sub-contractor/s such Specialized Sub-contractor/s must make the declaration.	N/A	Each must make the declaration. Where there is Specialized Sub-contractor/s such Specialized Sub-contractor/s must make the declaration.	N/A	Form CON-3 ES Performance Declaration

³ The Applicant shall provide accurate information on the related Application Form about any litigation or arbitration resulting from contracts completed or ongoing under its execution over the last ten years. A consistent history of awards against the Applicant or any member of a joint venture may result in rejection of the Application.

⁴ The Employer may use this information to seek further information or clarifications during the request for proposal stage and the associated due diligence.



No.	Subject	Criteria Requirement	Single Entity Requirements	Joint Venture Requirements			Documentation Submission Requirements
				All Members Combined	Each Member	One Member	
2.6	Bank's SEA and/or SH Disqualification	<p>(a) At the time of Contract Award, not subject to disqualification by the Bank for non-compliance with SEA/ SH obligations</p> <p>(b) If the Applicant had been subject to disqualification by the Bank for non-compliance with SEA/ SH obligations, the Applicant shall either (i) provide evidence of an arbitral award on the disqualification made in its favour; or (ii) demonstrate that it has adequate capacity and commitment to comply with SEA/SH prevention and response obligations; or (iii) provide evidence that it has already demonstrated such capacity and commitment for another Bank financed works contract</p>	Must meet requirement (Including each subcontractor)	N/A	Must meet requirement (including each subcontractor proposed by the Applicant)	N/A	Application Submission Letter, Form CON-4



3. Financial Situation and Performance

No.	Subject	Criteria Requirement	Single Entity Requirements	Joint Venture Requirements			Documentation Submission Requirements			
				All Members Combined	Each Member	One Member				
3.1	Financial Capabilities	(1) The Applicant shall demonstrate that it has access to, or has available, liquid assets, unencumbered real assets, lines of credit, and other financial means (independent of any contractual advance payment) sufficient to meet the cash flow requirements estimated as mentioned below for the respective lots/contracts	Must meet requirement	Must meet requirement	Must meet at least 30% of the requirement, with the exception of a design firm if a design firm is one of the JV members	Must meet at least 50% of the requirement	Form FIN – 3.1, with attachments			
		<table border="1"> <tr> <td>for Lot-1</td> <td>US\$ 22 million equivalent</td> </tr> <tr> <td>for Lot-2</td> <td>US\$ 13 million equivalent</td> </tr> <tr> <td>for Combine both Lots (Lot-1 & Lot-2)</td> <td>US\$ 35 million</td> </tr> </table>	for Lot-1	US\$ 22 million equivalent	for Lot-2	US\$ 13 million equivalent		for Combine both Lots (Lot-1 & Lot-2)	US\$ 35 million	
for Lot-1	US\$ 22 million equivalent									
for Lot-2	US\$ 13 million equivalent									
for Combine both Lots (Lot-1 & Lot-2)	US\$ 35 million									
		(2) The Applicant shall also demonstrate, to the satisfaction of the Employer, that it has adequate sources of finance to meet the cash flow requirements on contracts currently in progress and for future contract commitments.	Must meet requirement	Must meet requirement	N/A	N/A				



12

No.	Subject	Criteria Requirement	Single Entity Requirements	Joint Venture Requirements			Documentation Submission Requirements						
				All Members Combined	Each Member	One Member							
		(3) The audited balance sheets or, if not required by the laws of the Applicant's country, other financial statements acceptable to the Employer, for the last Five (05) years shall be submitted and must demonstrate the current soundness of the Applicant's financial position and indicate its prospective long-term profitability.	Must meet requirement	N/A	Must meet requirement	N/A							
3.2	Average Annual Turnover	<p>Minimum average annual construction turnover of following value, calculated as total certified payments received for contracts in progress and/or completed within the last five (05) years, divided by five (05) years.</p> <table border="1"> <tr> <td>for Lot-1</td> <td>US\$ 100 million equivalent</td> </tr> <tr> <td>for Lot-2</td> <td>US\$ 60 million equivalent</td> </tr> <tr> <td>for Combine both Lots (Lot-1 & Lot-2)</td> <td>US\$ 160 million equivalent</td> </tr> </table>	for Lot-1	US\$ 100 million equivalent	for Lot-2	US\$ 60 million equivalent	for Combine both Lots (Lot-1 & Lot-2)	US\$ 160 million equivalent	Must meet requirement	Must meet requirement	Must meet at least 30% of the requirement, with the exception of a design firm if a design firm is one of the JV members	Must meet at least 50% of the requirement	Form FIN – 3.2
for Lot-1	US\$ 100 million equivalent												
for Lot-2	US\$ 60 million equivalent												
for Combine both Lots (Lot-1 & Lot-2)	US\$ 160 million equivalent												



10

4. Experience

No.	Subject	Criteria Requirement	Single Entity Requirements	Joint Venture Requirements			Documentation Submission Requirements
				All Members Combined	Each Member	One Member	
4.1	General Experience	Experience under construction contracts in the role of prime contractor, JV member, subcontractor, or management contractor for at least the last 10 years since the application submission deadline.	Must meet requirement	N/A	Must meet requirement, with the exception of a design firm if a design firm is one of the JV members	N/A	Form EXP – 4.1
4.2 (a)	Specific Experience	(i) Specific experience of similar construction contracts: Minimum number and value of similar contract(s) for construction of highway/expressway as specified below that have been satisfactorily and substantially completed ⁵ as a prime contractor, joint venture member, management contractor or subcontractor in last ten years from Application submission	Must meet requirement	Must meet requirement ⁷	N/A	N/A	Form EXP 4.2



⁵ Substantial completion shall be based on 80% or more of the contract completed.

⁷ In the case of JV, the value of contracts completed by its members shall not be aggregated to determine whether the requirement of the minimum value of a single contract has been met. Instead, each contract performed by a member contributing to meeting the requirement shall satisfy the minimum value of a single contract as required for single entity. In determining whether the JV meets the requirement of total number of contracts, only the number of contracts completed by members, each of value equal or more than the minimum value required, shall be aggregated.

J

No.	Subject	Criteria		Single Entity Requirements	Joint Venture Requirements			Documentation Submission Requirements
		Requirement			All Members Combined	Each Member	One Member	
		deadline:						
		for Lot-1	One (1) similar contract with value US\$159 million equivalent					
		for Lot-2	One (1) similar contract with value US\$96 million equivalent					
		for Combine both Lots (Lot-1 & Lot-2)	One (1) similar contract with value US\$159 million and One (1) similar contract with value US\$96 million OR One (1) similar contract with value US\$ 255 million equivalent.					



✓

No.	Subject	Criteria Requirement	Single Entity Requirements	Joint Venture Requirements			Documentation Submission Requirements
				All Members Combined	Each Member	One Member	
		<p>(ii) Key requirements for specific construction activities successfully completed</p> <p>For the above and/or any other contract(s) substantially completed and under implementation as prime contractor, joint venture member, or Subcontractor in the last ten years from the application submission deadline, a minimum construction experience in the following key activities successfully completed⁶:</p> <p>Lot-1</p> <p>(a) 4-lanes highway / expressway of more than 25 Km length</p> <p>(b) One Tunnel of 1,000 Meters length, and</p> <p>(c) At least one (01) No. "Two (02) Lane Bridge of more than 300 Meter Length"</p> <p>Earth Work 1,458,000 CM in One Year</p>					



⁶ Volume, number or rate of production of any key activity can be demonstrated in one or more contracts combined if executed during same time period.

Handwritten mark

No.	Subject	Criteria Requirement	Single Entity Requirements	Joint Venture Requirements			Documentation Submission Requirements
				All Members Combined	Each Member	One Member	
		<p>Sub-Base and Base 159,000 CM in One Year</p> <p>Asphaltic Concrete Pavement 48,000 CM in One Year</p> <p>Lot-2</p> <p>(a) 4-Lanes highway / expressway of more than 25 Km length, and</p> <p>(b) At least one (01) No. "Two (02) Lane Bridge of more than of 300 Meter Length", and</p> <p>Earth Work 1,710,000 CM in One Year</p> <p>Sub-Base and Base 205,000 CM in One Year</p> <p>Asphaltic Concrete Pavement 53,000 CM in One Year</p> <p>(iii) Specific Design Experience Minimum one (1) contract combined or separate contracts to establish experience in;</p> <p>i) engineering design of 4-lane highway / expressway of at least 25 Km length, and</p> <p>ii) design of 3 bridges of 2-lane each of more than 300-meter</p>					



Handwritten mark resembling a stylized 'H' or '4'.

No.	Subject	Criteria		Joint Venture Requirements			Documentation
		Requirement	Single Entity Requirements	All Members Combined	Each Member	One Member	Submission Requirements
		length, that have been satisfactorily and substantially completed in last ten years from the application submission deadline. <i>Note: The specific experience requirements under sub para 4.2 (a) (ii) and (iii) above must be met by the Applicant itself whether as a Single Entity or by a JV Partner or through a specialized sub-contractor.</i>					
4.2 (b)	Specific Experience in managing ES aspects	For the contracts in 4.2 (a)(i) above and/or any other contracts substantially completed and under implementation as prime contractor, joint venture member, or Subcontractor in the last ten (10) years from the Application submission deadline, experience in managing ES risks and impacts in the following aspects: <i>Successfully managed and executed contracts involving Environment and Social Safeguard compliance Requirement on any donor / MDB financed project.</i>	Must meet requirement	Must meet requirement	N/A	N/A	Form EXP – 4.2 (b)



Handwritten mark resembling a stylized 'V' or '2'.

Table 2 – Rated Criteria and Requirements

1. Past Performance

Requirement	Scoring		Documentation										
	Maximum score	Remark	Submission Requirement										
<p>Number of similar contracts Number of satisfactorily and substantially completed construction contracts that exceed the number specified in Table 1, Sub-Factor 4.2(a)(i) (where this number is x) that are:</p> <table border="1" style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%;">for Lot-1, x=1</td> <td style="width: 50%;"></td> </tr> <tr> <td>for Lot-2, x=1</td> <td></td> </tr> </table> <p>1. similar to the Requirements (Reference Table 1, 4.2a); and 2. completed during the past 10 years.</p> <p>Scoring methodology:</p> <table border="1" style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="width: 30%;">Number of contracts for construction (each Lot) Number of satisfactorily and substantially completed similar construction contracts specified in Table-1, sub-factor 4.2(a)(i)] Note: Each contract having value above the threshold for the respective lot shall be considered as one contract and shall not be considered multiple in numbers based on value of the contract, such as the contract with supposed value of</td> <td style="width: 10%; text-align: center;">X+5 contracts</td> <td style="width: 10%; text-align: center;">X+4 contracts</td> <td style="width: 10%; text-align: center;">X+3 contracts</td> <td style="width: 10%; text-align: center;">X+2 contracts</td> <td style="width: 10%; text-align: center;">X+1 contract</td> </tr> </table>	for Lot-1, x=1		for Lot-2, x=1		Number of contracts for construction (each Lot) Number of satisfactorily and substantially completed similar construction contracts specified in Table-1, sub-factor 4.2(a)(i)] Note: Each contract having value above the threshold for the respective lot shall be considered as one contract and shall not be considered multiple in numbers based on value of the contract, such as the contract with supposed value of	X+5 contracts	X+4 contracts	X+3 contracts	X+2 contracts	X+1 contract	80	In case of JV, all members combined will be evaluated.	Form EXP 4.2
for Lot-1, x=1													
for Lot-2, x=1													
Number of contracts for construction (each Lot) Number of satisfactorily and substantially completed similar construction contracts specified in Table-1, sub-factor 4.2(a)(i)] Note: Each contract having value above the threshold for the respective lot shall be considered as one contract and shall not be considered multiple in numbers based on value of the contract, such as the contract with supposed value of	X+5 contracts	X+4 contracts	X+3 contracts	X+2 contracts	X+1 contract								



[Handwritten mark]

Requirement	Scoring					Maximum score	Remark	Documentation Submission Requirement
<i>US\$318 Million against Lot-1 will be considered as one contract and not two for evaluation in accordance with the rated criteria specified under this Table-2.</i>						20		
Weighting	100%	90%	80%	70%	50%			
Number of contracts for design <i>Number of satisfactorily and substantially completed similar design contracts specified in Table-1, sub-factor 4.2(a)(iii)</i>	100%	90%	80%	70%	50%			



R