

# EVALUATION REPORT

## (As Per Rule 35 of PPRA Rules,2004)

1.	Name of Procuring Agency:	<b>National Transport Research Centre(NTRC)</b>
2.	Method of Procurement:	Single Stage Two Envelop Procedure
3.	Title of Procurement:	NTRC Axle Load Survey in Pakistan (Additional Locations)
4.	Tender Inquiry No.:	NTRC-15(12)/2020-Vol-2
5.	PPRA Ref. No.(TSE):	TS 428212 E (10.08.2020)
6.	Date & Time of Bid Closing:	24 <sup>th</sup> August, 2020 11:00 AM
7.	Date & Time of Bid Opening:	24 <sup>th</sup> August, 2020 11:30 AM
8.	No of Bids Received:	Two (2) Proposals were received
9.	Criteria for Bid Evaluation:	Criteria of Bid Evaluation is attached at <b>Annex-I</b>
10.	Details of Bid(s) Evaluation:	As below

Name of Bidder	Marks			Evaluated Cost (PKR)	Rule/Regulation/SBD*/Policy/ Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 Of PPRules, 2004.
	Technical (if applicable)	Financial (if applicable)	Total		
1) M/s Finite Engineering, Pvt.Ltd Islamabad	<b>654.240</b>	<b>200</b>	<b>854.240</b>	<b>4,215,625/-</b>	1 <sup>st</sup> Top scoring firm in combined evaluation (PPRA Rule 36(b) (ix))
2) M/s ZEERUK International Pvt. Ltd	<b>628.480</b>	<b>121.838</b>	<b>750.318</b>	<b>6,920,000/-</b>	2 <sup>nd</sup>

**Top Ranked Bidder:** M/s Finite Engineering, Pvt. Ltd Islamabad

11. **Any other additional / supporting information, the procuring agency may like to share:** The Procurement was carried out in line with PPRA Rules & Regulations. The bidding was done on QCBS method with 80:20 Technical to Financial Proposals ratio.

Signature: .....



Official Stamp:

Muhammad Sayyar  
Deputy Chief  
National Transport Centre (NTRC)  
Ministry of Communication  
Islamabad

**\*Standard Bidding Documents(SBD).**

w 30348

Introc 49. pdf

COMBINED SUMMAY EVALUATION SHEET  
 Consultancy Services for Study on 'Axle Load Survey in Pakistan(Additional Locations)'

Evaluation Criteria	Max. Weight	M/s Finite Engineering						M/s Zeeruk					
		E-1	E-2	E-3	E-4	E-5	Avg	E-1	E-2	E-3	E-4	E-5	Avg
<b>i) Consultancy firm Experience</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>90</b>	<b>90</b>	<b>84</b>	<b>90</b>	<b>87</b>	<b>88.2</b>	<b>68</b>	<b>75</b>	<b>81</b>	<b>90</b>	<b>85</b>	<b>79.8</b>
a) General Experience	25	20	15	17	20	22		18	25	16	25	25	
b) specific Experience	75	70	75	67	70	65		50	50	65	65	60	
<b>ii) Approach and methodology</b>	<b>300</b>	<b>267</b>	<b>256</b>	<b>230</b>	<b>250</b>	<b>249</b>	<b>250.4</b>	<b>217</b>	<b>213</b>	<b>227</b>	<b>228</b>	<b>216</b>	<b>220.2</b>
a) Understanding of Objectives	50	45	40	45	45	46		35	30	44	40	40	
b) Quality of Methodology	200	180	180	151	170	165		145	150	150	155	150	
c) Innovativeness / Comments on TOR	10	8	6	7	5	5		7	7	7	5	5	
d) Work Program	10	8	7	6	6	7		8	6	6	5	5	
e) Staffing Schedule	10	9	5	6	6	8		7	5	6	5	5	
f) Conciseness, clarity and completeness in Proposal Presentation													
	20	17	18	15	18	18		15	15	14	18	10	
<b>iii) Personnel (Arrears of Expertise) Qualification and Competence of key personnel</b>	<b>500</b>	<b>386</b>	<b>402</b>	<b>458</b>	<b>385</b>	<b>385</b>	<b>403.2</b>	<b>388</b>	<b>422</b>	<b>458</b>	<b>398</b>	<b>401</b>	<b>413.4</b>
<b>a) Team Leader/Transportation Engr</b>	<b>200</b>	<b>162</b>	<b>158</b>	<b>170</b>	<b>157</b>	<b>157</b>	<b>160.8</b>	<b>150</b>	<b>170</b>	<b>170</b>	<b>160</b>	<b>160</b>	<b>162</b>
Academic (30%)		52	48	51	42	42		60	60	51	60	60	
Project Experience (60%)		92	90	102	95	95		80	100	102	90	90	
Status with Firm (10%)		18	20	17	20	20		10	10	17	10	10	
<b>b) Statistician</b>	<b>125</b>	<b>102</b>	<b>112</b>	<b>121</b>	<b>110</b>	<b>110</b>	<b>111</b>	<b>98</b>	<b>91</b>	<b>121</b>	<b>105</b>	<b>108</b>	<b>104.6</b>
Academic (30%)		32	34	36	37.5	37.5		35	28.5	36	37.5	37.5	
Project Experience (60%)		60	65.5	73	60	60		55	50	73	55	58	
Status with Firm (10%)		10	12.5	12	12.5	12.5		8	12.5	12	12.5	12.5	
<b>c) Computer Expert</b>	<b>125</b>	<b>80</b>	<b>92</b>	<b>121</b>	<b>78</b>	<b>78</b>	<b>89.8</b>	<b>95</b>	<b>117</b>	<b>121</b>	<b>93</b>	<b>93</b>	<b>103.8</b>
Academic (30%)		25	26	36	20	20		30	34.5	36	30	30	
Project Experience (60%)		45	53.5	73	45.5	45.5		55	70	73	50.5	50.5	
Status with Firm (10%)		10	12.5	12	12.5	12.5		10	12.5	12	12.5	12.5	
<b>d) Supervisor</b>	<b>50</b>	<b>42</b>	<b>40</b>	<b>46</b>	<b>40</b>	<b>40</b>	<b>41.6</b>	<b>45</b>	<b>44</b>	<b>46</b>	<b>40</b>	<b>40</b>	<b>43</b>
Academic (30%)		15	15	14	15	15		15	15	14	15	15	
Project Experience (60%)		22	20	28	20	20		25	24	28	20	20	
Status with Firm (10%)		5	5	4	5	5		5	5	4	5	5	
<b>iv) Past performance of the consultant in last two assignment the basis for post performance of the consultants is the report from previous clients</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>85</b>	<b>75</b>	<b>67</b>	<b>78</b>	<b>75</b>	<b>76</b>	<b>75</b>	<b>80</b>	<b>65</b>	<b>70</b>	<b>70</b>	<b>72.2</b>
<b>Total</b>	<b>1000</b>	<b>828</b>	<b>823</b>	<b>839</b>	<b>803</b>	<b>796</b>	<b>817.8</b>	<b>748</b>	<b>790</b>	<b>832</b>	<b>786</b>	<b>772</b>	<b>785.6</b>
<b>RANK</b>				<b>1st Rank</b>				<b>2nd Rank</b>					
Minimum qualifying is 70% or 700 marks													


- i) The basis Past Performance of the consultant is the report from various quarters in parts particularly technical / academic. The client's satisfaction certificates are also required to be attached for last three completed projects of comparable magnitude. The current commitments are be assessed as per works in hand of the consultant
- ii) The joint venture (JV) shall be evaluated in the same manner as a single entity, since they function as one unit.

E-1(Deputy Chief) Khizer Javed, Signature:   
**KHIZER JAVED**  
 Deputy Chief  
 National Transport Research Centre  
 Ministry of Communications  
 Government of Pakistan  
 Islamabad

E-2(Deputy Chief) MAFAY IDREES, Signature:   
**MAFAY IDREES**  
 Assistant Chief  
 National Transport Research Centre  
 Ministry of Communications  
 Government of Pakistan  
 Islamabad

E-3(Deputy Chief) Muhammad Sayyar, Signature:   
**Muhammad Sayyar**  
 Deputy Chief  
 National Transport Research Centre (NTRC)  
 Ministry of Communications  
 Islamabad

E-4(Assistant Chief) Yousaf Zia, Signature:   
**YOUSAF ZIA**  
 Assistant Chief  
 National Transport Research Centre  
 Ministry of Communications  
 Government of Pakistan  
 Islamabad

E-5(Assistant Chief) Zia ul Islam, Signature:   
**ZIA UL ISLAM**  
 Assistant Chief  
 National Transport Research Centre  
 Ministry of Communications  
 Government of Pakistan  
 Islamabad