

## Evaluation Report

1	Name of Procuring Agency:	Benazir Income Support Programme (BISP)																														
2	Method of Procurement:	<b>Selection Based on the Consultant's Qualifications (CQS)- ADB's Procurement Regulations for ADB Borrowers: Goods, Works, Non-consulting and Consulting Services</b>																														
3	Title of Procurement:	Hiring of Chartered Accountant Firm for Conducting Audit of BISP's Annual Consolidated Financial Statements FY 2020-2021, 2021-2022 & 2022-2023																														
4	Tender Inquiry No.:	100(3)/FMS/ADB/F&A/2021																														
5	PPRA Ref. No. (TSE):	TS 465892 E																														
6	Date & Time for EOIs Closing:	15 <sup>th</sup> December 2021 at 1400 hours																														
7	Date & Time for EOIs Opening:	15 <sup>th</sup> December 2021 at 1430 hours																														
8	Name of Firm submitted Proposals	M/s KPMG Taseer Hadi & Co, Chartered Accountants, Islamabad.																														
9	No of EOI Received, Shortlisting and Evaluation:	<p>Five (05)</p> <table border="1" style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <thead> <tr> <th colspan="4" style="text-align: center;">Hiring of Chartered Accountant Firm for Conducting Audit of BISP's Annual Consolidated Financial Statements FY 2020-2021, 2021-2022 &amp; 2022-2023</th> </tr> <tr> <th style="width: 5%;">S.No</th> <th style="width: 65%;">Name of Participating Firms</th> <th style="width: 15%;">Shortlisting</th> <th style="width: 15%;">Marks Obtained Out of 100</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>1.</td> <td>M/s Muniff Ziauddin &amp; Co</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Yes</td> <td style="text-align: center;">84</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2.</td> <td>M/s Crowe Horwath Hussain Chaudhury &amp; Co</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Yes</td> <td style="text-align: center;">81</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3.</td> <td>M/s Naveed Zafar Ashfaq Jaffery &amp; Co</td> <td style="text-align: center;">No (Non-Responsive)</td> <td style="text-align: center;">N/A</td> </tr> <tr> <td>4.</td> <td>M/s KPMG Taseer Hadi &amp; Co.</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Yes</td> <td style="text-align: center;">98</td> </tr> <tr> <td>5.</td> <td>M/s Yousuf Adil &amp; Co</td> <td style="text-align: center;">No (Non-Responsive)</td> <td style="text-align: center;">N/A</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>Passing Marks : 75%</p>			Hiring of Chartered Accountant Firm for Conducting Audit of BISP's Annual Consolidated Financial Statements FY 2020-2021, 2021-2022 & 2022-2023				S.No	Name of Participating Firms	Shortlisting	Marks Obtained Out of 100	1.	M/s Muniff Ziauddin & Co	Yes	84	2.	M/s Crowe Horwath Hussain Chaudhury & Co	Yes	81	3.	M/s Naveed Zafar Ashfaq Jaffery & Co	No (Non-Responsive)	N/A	4.	M/s KPMG Taseer Hadi & Co.	Yes	98	5.	M/s Yousuf Adil & Co	No (Non-Responsive)	N/A
Hiring of Chartered Accountant Firm for Conducting Audit of BISP's Annual Consolidated Financial Statements FY 2020-2021, 2021-2022 & 2022-2023																																
S.No	Name of Participating Firms	Shortlisting	Marks Obtained Out of 100																													
1.	M/s Muniff Ziauddin & Co	Yes	84																													
2.	M/s Crowe Horwath Hussain Chaudhury & Co	Yes	81																													
3.	M/s Naveed Zafar Ashfaq Jaffery & Co	No (Non-Responsive)	N/A																													
4.	M/s KPMG Taseer Hadi & Co.	Yes	98																													
5.	M/s Yousuf Adil & Co	No (Non-Responsive)	N/A																													

  
**Shahid Ali**  
 Director Procurement  
 Benazir Income Support Programme  
 Islamabad

10	Criteria for evaluation of Technical Proposal:	Sr.#	Criteria/Sub-Criterions	Maximum	Marks Obtained by M/S KPMG Taseer Hadi & Co.
		1	Personnel Schedule & Work Plan:	100	43.75
		1.1	Work Plan (Criteria: presentation of activities, bar chart, work plan is realistic and implementable and work plan is responding to the ToRs, objective & also to the scope of the assignment.	60	26.25
		1.2	Personnel Schedule (Criteria: phasing of activities of work plan and timing of experts' individual inputs)	40	17.50
		2	Personnel (Key Experts)	900	793.30
		2.1	Team Leader / Coordinator	160	149
		2.2	Qualified Auditor-1 (Supervisor)	140	130
		2.3	Qualified Auditor-2 (Team Member)	140	130
		2.4	Audit Officer-1 (Team Member)	115	107
		2.5	Audit Officer-2 (Team Member)	115	107
		2.6	Audit Officer-3 (Team Member)	115	75
		2.7	MIS/IT Expert-1 (Team Member)	115	95
			Total	1000	837.05

Passing Marks: 750

#### 11. Detail of Proposal Evaluation

Name of Bidder	Technical Marks out of 1000	Evaluated and Negotiated Price in PAK Rs. (Without GST)	Final Score and Ranking
M/s EY Ford Rhodes, Chartered Accountants, Islamabad.	837.05	18,000,000	M/s KPMG was invited for submission of RFP as the top ranked firm based on amplified EOI in accordance with Consultant's Qualifications Selection (CQS) Method -as per ADB's Procurement Regulations for ADB Borrowers: Goods, Works, Non-consulting and Consulting Services.

(Shahid Ali)  
Director (Procurement)

**Shahid Ali**  
Director Procurement  
Benazir Income Support Programme  
Islamabad