

UNIVERSITY OF BUNER

Khyber Pakhtunkhwa - Pakistan

Ref. No. 240/Dia P&DINIT UOB 2021

Date: 15-07-2021

EVALUATION REPORT

(As Per Rule-35 of PPRA Rules, 2004)

| 1 | Name of Procuring Agency | The University of Buner, District Buner | |
|----|------------------------------|---|--|
| 2 | Method of Procurement | Two-Stage Two-Envelope | |
| 3 | Title of Procurement | Construction of Administration Block, Faculty & Staff Hosto Girls Hostel and Miscellaneous Structures at Swari Campu University of Buner (Phase – I, Package-2) | |
| 4 | Tender Inquiry No. | TS450690E | |
| 5 | PPRA Ref. No. (TSE) | TS450690E | |
| 6 | Date & Time of Bid Closing | May 25, 2021 at 1400 hours | |
| 7 | Date & Time of Bid Opening | May 25, 2021 at 1430 hours | |
| 8 | No. of Bids Received | Four (04) | |
| 9 | Criteria for Bid Evaluation | Attached as Annex-I | |
| 10 | Details of Bid(s) Evaluation | As mentioned below | |

| | Mai | ·ks | | Rule / Regulation | |
|-----------------------------------|--|------------|----------------------|---|--|
| Name of Bidder | Technical (if applicable) / Marks as per Pre- Qualification Report | | Evaluated Cost (Rs.) | / SBD* / Policy / Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004 | |
| M/s. Sabz Ali Khan & Company | 70.50 | Responsive | 504,823,163/- | Lowest | |
| M/s. ARCO Construction (Pvt) Ltd | 67.99 | Responsive | 566,213,630/- | 2 nd Lowest | |
| M/s. Bannu Construction (Pvt) Ltd | 81.00 | Responsive | 566,213,630/- | 2 nd Lowest | |
| M/s. Syed Yaqoob Shah & Sons | 73.68 | Responsive | 571,295,078/- | Highest | |

| Lowest Evaluated Bidder: | M/s. Sabz Ali Khan & Company (Rs. 504,823,163/-) |
|--------------------------|--|
|--------------------------|--|

Ant other additional / supporting information, the procuring agency may like to share.

(Project Director) University of Buner





3. Pre-Qualification Criteria

- 3.1 Pre-qualification shall be based on the criteria given in the succeeding paras regarding the applicant's Experience Record, Personnel Capabilities, Equipment Capabilities, Financial Soundness, etc. as demonstrated by the applicants' responses in the forms attached to this document.
- 3.2 The Employer reserves the right to waive minor deviations, if they do not materially affect the capability of an Applicant to perform the Contract. Sub-Contractor's experience and resources shall not be taken into account in determining the Applicant's compliance with the qualifying criteria.
- 3.3 In addition to the fulfillment of below mentioned mandatory requirements, the applicant must secure at least 50% score under each head of qualification criteria mentioned at para 3.3 (B). The mandatory requirements and other criteria is described hereunder:

A. Mandatory Requirements

 Valid registration with Pakistan Engineering Council (PEC) in following categories with mentioned codes of specialization, duly renewed for the year 2020:

| S. No. | Category to be Applied for | Relevant Category of PEC |
|-----------|--|--|
| (a) | Category-A (Eligible for works up to Rs. 1.0 Billion) | Category C-2 or above, having CE01, CE-09, CE-10, EE04 & EE05 as codes of specialization |
| (b) | Category-B (Eligible for works up to Rs.500 Million) | Category C-3 or above, having CE01, CE-09, CE-10, EE04 & EE05 as codes of specialization |

ii. Affidavit of "No-blacklisting" by authorized signatory on judicial stamp paper prepared within the current month of submission of prequalification document to the effect that the firm has never been blacklisted.

- iii. In case of no litigation, the affidavit of "No litigation" by authorized signatory on judicial stamp paper prepared within the current month of submission of prequalification document to the effect that the firm has never been involved in any litigation and, if involved in litigation, then details related to (a) year and matter in dispute, (b) value of award if against the applicant and (c) award as percentage of net worth of applicant.
- iv. Income Tax Registration Certificate.
- v. Registration with Sales Tax Department (with Federal Board of Revenue / relevant Provincial Tax Authorities).
- vi. On Active Tax Payer's List of Federal Board of Revenue / Provincial Tax Authorities.

B. Detailed Requirements

All the applications will be further evaluated as per following criteria, if mandatory requirements are fulfilled:

| S. No. | Category | Weight age / Marks | Passing Marks |
|-----------|------------------------|-----------------------|------------------|
| 1. | Experience Record | 50 | 25 |
| 2. | Personnel Capabilities | 12 | 6 |
| 3. | Equipment Capabilities | 12 | 6 |
| 4. | Financial Soundness | 26 | 13 |
| | Total: | 100 | 50 |

The applications for pre-qualifications shall be further evaluated as per following sub-criteria, if mandatory requirements are fulfilled:

B.1 Experience Capabilities

Marks for work experience will be given on the basis of the following criteria:

| S. | Description | Max. | Marks Al | llocation |
|-----|--|--|--|--|
| No. | Description | Marks | Category-A | Category-B |
| Com | pleted Projects | | | |
| (a) | Experience as Constructor in execution of Projects of similar nature & complexity (Construction of institutional building projects) completed during last <i>ten</i> (10) years. | 20 | 10 marks will be awarded for each completed project having covered area equal to or more than 180,000 sft. up to maximum of 20 marks. 7 marks will be awarded for each completed project having covered area from 150,000 sft. to 179,999 sft. up to maximum of 20 marks. | 10 marks will be awarded for each completed project having covered area equal to or more than 100,000 sft. up to maximum of 20 marks. 7 marks will be awarded for each completed project having covered area from 70,000 sft. to 99,999 sft. up to maximum of 20 marks. |
| | | | • 5 marks will be awarded for each completed project having covered area from 100,000 sft. to 149,999 sft. up to maximum of 20 marks. | • 5 marks will be awarded for each completed project having covered area from 40,000 sft. to 69,999 sft. up to maximum of 20 marks. |
| | | | No marks will be given for completed projects having covered area less than 100,000 sft. | No marks will be given for completed projects having covered area less than 40,000 sft. |
| (b) | Experience as Constructor in execution of Projects of similar nature and complexity | 10 | 10 marks will be awarded for completed project having cost equal to or more than Rs. 150 Mn. up to maximum of 10 marks. | 10 marks will be awarded for completed project having cost equal to or more than Rs. 120 Mn. up to maximum of 10 marks. |
| | (External Development works i.e. water supply, sewerage, roads & pavements etc.) completed during | 5 marks will be awarded for each completed project having cost from Rs. 100 Mn. to Rs. 149.9 Mn. up to maximum of 10 marks. | 5 marks will be awarded for each completed project having cost from Rs. 70 Mn. to Rs. 119.9 Mn. up to maximum of 10 marks. | |
| | last ten (10) years. | • 3.5 marks will awarded for eacompleted procest from Rs. 6 Rs. 99.9 Mn. u | 3.5 marks will be awarded for each completed project having cost from Rs. 60 Mn. to Rs. 99.9 Mn. up to maximum of 10 marks. | 3.5 marks will be awarded for each completed project having cost from Rs. 40 Mn. to Rs. 69.9 Mn. up to maximum of 10 marks. |
| | | | No marks will be given for completed projects having cost less than Rs. 60 Mn. | No marks will be given for completed projects having cost less than Rs. 40 Mn. |

| S. | Description Max. Max | Marks A | arks Allocation | |
|-------|--|---------|---|---|
| No. | No. Marks | | Category-A | Category-B |
| In-ha | nd Projects | | | |
| (c) | Experience as Constructor in execution of Projects of similar nature & complexity (Construction of institutional building projects) currently in-hand. | 12 | 6 marks will be awarded for project in-hand, having covered area equal to or more than 180,000 sft. up to maximum of 12 marks. 4 marks will be awarded for each project in-hand, having covered area from 150,000 sft. to 179,999 sft. up to maximum of 12 marks. 3 marks will be awarded for each project in-hand, | 6 marks will be awarded for project in-hand, having covered area equal to or more than 100,000 sft. up to maximum of 12 marks. 4 marks will be awarded for each project in-hand, having covered area from 70,000 sft. to 99,999 sft. up to maximum of 12 marks. 3 marks will be awarded for each project in-hand, |
| | | | having covered area from 100,000 sft. to 149,999 sft. up to maximum of 12 marks. No marks will be given for projects in-hand, having covered area less than 100,000 sft. | having covered area from 40,000 sft. to 69,999 sft. up to maximum of 12 marks. No marks will be given for projects in-hand, having covered area less than 40,000 sft. |
| (d) | Experience as Constructor in execution of Projects of similar nature and complexity (External Development works i.e. water supply, sewerage, roads & pavements etc.) | 08 | 8 marks will be awarded for in-hand project having cost equal to or more than Rs. 150 Mn. up to maximum of 8 marks. 4 marks will be awarded for each in-hand project having cost from Rs. 100 Mn. to Rs. 149.9 Mn. up to maximum of 8 marks. 3 marks will be awarded | 8 marks will be awarded for in-hand project having cost equal to or more than Rs. 120 Mn. up to maximum of 8 marks. 4 marks will be awarded for each in-hand project having cost from Rs. 70 Mn. to Rs. 119.9 Mn. up to maximum of 8 marks. 3 marks will be awarded |
| | completed during last <i>ten (10)</i> years. | | for each in-hand project having cost from Rs. 60 Mn. to Rs. 99.9 Mn. up to maximum of 8 marks. No marks will be given for projects in-hand having cost less than Rs. 60 Mn. | for each in-hand project having cost from Rs. 40 Mn. to Rs. 69.9 Mn. up to maximum of 8 marks. • No marks will be given for projects in-hand having cost less than Rs. 40 Mn. |
| Tota | al Marks Allocated | 50 | | |

Notes:

- i. The applicants must provide "Letter of Award" of in-hand projects and Taking Over/Completion Certificate of completed projects. No marks will be given to the projects for which above letter/certificate is not provided.
- ii. Applicant shall provide complete information of the projects including scope, cost and covered area etc.

B.2 Personnel Capabilities

Marks for personnel capabilities will be given on the basis of the following criteria:

| S. | Description | Max. | Marks Allocation | | |
|-----|---|-------|---|---|--|
| No. | Description | Marks | Category-A | Category-B | |
| (a) | Project Manager (B.Sc. Civil Engineer registered with Pakistan Engineering Council) | 3 | 3 marks will be awarded for each B.Sc. Civil Engineer having at least 10 years relevant experience. | 1.5 marks will be awarded for each B.Sc. Civil Engineer having at least 8 years relevant experience. | |
| (b) | Site / Planning Engineer (B.Sc. Civil) Engineer registered with Pakistan Engineering Council) | 2 | 2 marks will be awarded for each B.Sc. Civil Engineer having at least 07 years relevant experience. | 2 marks will be awarded for each B.Sc. Civil Engineer having at least 05 years relevant experience. | |
| (c) | Associate Engineer having DAE (Civil) Certificate | 3 | 1.5 marks will be awarded for each Associate Engineer DAE (Civil) having at least 07 years relevant experience. | 1.5 marks will be awarded for each Associate Engineer DAE (Civil) having at least 05 years relevant experience. | |
| (d) | Associate Engineer having DAE (Electrical / Mechanical) Certificate | 1.5 | 1.5 marks will be awarded for each Associate Engineer DAE (Electrical / Mechanical) having at least 07 years relevant experience. | 1.5 marks will be awarded for each Associate Engineer DAE (Electrical / Mechanical) having at least 05 years relevant experience. | |
| (e) | Quantity Surveyor having DAE (Civil) Certificate | 1.5 | 1.5 marks will be awarded for each quantity surveyor DAE (Civil) at least 07 years relevant experience. | 1.5 marks will be awarded for each quantity surveyor DAE (Civil) at least 05 years relevant experience. | |
| (f) | Surveyor having Certificate | 1 | 1 mark will be awarded for each surveyor having certificate and at least 07 years relevant experience. | 1 mark will be awarded for each surveyor having certificate and at least 05 years relevant experience. | |
| Tot | al Marks Allocated | 12 | | | |

Notes:

i. The applicant must provide verifiable proof of employment of the staff and attach detailed CVs & valid PEC Registration Certificates / Diploma / Certificates of the Engineer, DAEs staff along with appointment letters/pay slips.

B.3 Equipment Capabilities

Marks for equipment capabilities will be given on the basis of the following criteria:

| S. | Description | Max. | Minimum Quantity / Number of Equipment Required | |
|-------|-------------------------------------|-------|--|-------------|
| No. | | Marks | Category-A | Category-B |
| (a) | Concrete Batching Plant | 1.5 | 01 No. | 01 No. |
| (b) | Concrete Transit Mixer | 1 | 02 No. | 02 No. |
| (c) | Concrete Pump | 1 | 01 No. | 01 No. |
| (d) | Concrete Mixer Machine (Single Bag) | 1 | 02 Nos. | 01 Nos. |
| (e) | Excavator | 1 | 02 Nos. | 01 Nos. |
| (f) | Roller (10T) | 1 | 02 Nos. | 01 Nos. |
| (g) | Grader | 1 | 02 Nos. | 01 Nos. |
| (h) | Tractor Trolley | 0.5 | 03 Nos. | 02 Nos. |
| (i) | Water Bouzer | 0.5 | 03 Nos. | 02 Nos. |
| (j) | Scaffolding | 1 | 100,000 Rft. | 70,000 Rft. |
| (k) | Shuttering | 1 | 70,000 Sft. | 50,000 Sft. |
| (1) | Steel Cutting / Bending Machine | 0.5 | 01 No. | 01 No. |
| (m) | Generator Set (100 KVA) | 0.5 | 02 Nos. | 01 Nos. |
| (n) | Total Station | 0.5 | 01 No. | 01 No. |
| Total | Marks Allocated | 12 | | |

Notes:

- i. Proportionate marks will be awarded if minimum number of corresponding equipment is less than minimum required.
- ii. Applicant must provide an undertaking to the effect that the aforementioned equipment is available with the firm.

B.3 Financial Capabilities

- (a) The Applicant firms shall submit copies of annual audited reports for the last three years duly certified by the Chartered Accountants and must indicate the soundness of the Applicants financial position.
- (b) The minimum annual volume of construction works (Annual Turn Over) for each Category during any of the last three years is given below:

| Description | Max. Marks | Category-A | Category-B |
|-------------------------|---------------|---------------------------------------|---------------------------------------|
| Annual Turn Over during | 6.5 | Rs. 250 Million to Rs. 500 Million | Rs. 150 Million to Rs. 250 Million |
| any of last (03) Years | 13 | Above Rs. 500 Million | Above Rs. 250 Million |
| Total Marks Allocated | 13 | | |

(c) The minimum amount of liquid assets during the year (FY 2018-19) for each category is given below:

| Description | Max. Marks | Category-A | Category-B |
|-----------------------|---------------|--------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| Liquid Accete | 6.5 | Rs. 70 Million to Rs. 150 Million | Rs. 35 Million to Rs. 70 Million |
| Liquid Assets | 13 | Above Rs. 150 Million | Above Rs. 70 Million |
| Total Marks Allocated | 13 | | |

3.4 Litigation History

The Applicant should provide accurate information on any litigation or arbitration resulting from contracts completed or under execution by the firm over the last five years.

3.5 **Joint Venture**

Not allowed.

3.6 Conflict of Interest

The Applicant must not be associated, nor have been associated in the past, with the consultant or any other entity that has prepared the design, specifications, and other prequalification and bidding documents for the project, or was proposed as Engineer for the contract, over the last five years. Any such association may result in disqualification of the Applicant.

3.7 Updating Pre-qualification Information:

Bidders shall be required to update the financial, personnel and equipment information used for prequalification at the time of submitting their bids, to confirm their continued compliance with the qualification criteria and verification of the information provided at the time of prequalification. A bid shall be rejected if the Applicant's qualification thresholds are no longer met at the time of bidding.

3.8 Other Factors:

3.8.1 Only firms that have been pre-qualified under this procedure shall be invited to bid. A qualified firm may participate only in one bid for the contract. If a firm submits more than one bid, all bids including that bidder will be rejected. This rule will not apply in respect of bids which include specialist subconstructors who are used by more than one bidder.

3.8.2 The Employer reserves the right to:

- (a) Amend the scope and value of any contract(s) to be bid, in which event the bidder(s) will only bid among those pre-qualified bidders who meet the requirements of the contract(s) as amended. However the Employer may review the disqualified bids who originally do not meet the specified criteria for Pre-qualification.
- (b) Reject or accept any application; and
- (c) Cancel the prequalification process and reject all applications.
- 3.8.3 The Employer shall neither be liable for any such actions nor be under any obligation to inform the Applicant of the grounds for rejection, however, may be debriefed if solicited.
- 4. **Evaluation** 4.1 Applicants meeting the minimum requirements mentioned in Para 3 above besides other factors shall be considered for pre-qualification. No compromise shall be made on minimum requirements of **50% score** in each category.