

DIRECTORATE GENERAL MIS/FABS
OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER GENERAL OF ACCOUNTS

FINAL EVALUATION REPORT (RFP-31)

Publishing of FER for RFP-31 "Hiring of SAP ERP and Network Consultants for FABS Competency Centres" as per Rule 35 of PPRA Rules, 2004

1. Name of Procuring Agency: Directorate General MIS, Controller General of Accounts (CGA)
2. Method of Procurement: Single stage-one envelope
3. Title of Procurement: Hiring of Consultancy Services for FABS Competency Centres
4. Tender Inquiry No.: IFB-31/MIS/FABS/Proc/New Consultants/2021
5. PPRA Ref. No. (TSE): TS No.478217E dated 14.04.2022
6. Date & Time of Bids Closing: May 09th, 2022, 11:00 A.M
7. Date & Time of Bids Opening: May 09th, 2022, 11:30 A.M
8. No of Bids Received: Fifteen (15)
9. Criteria for Bids Evaluation: Annex-I
10. Details of Bid(s) Evaluation:

| Sr # | Name of Bidder/ Consultant | Marks | | Evaluated Cost (Rs) | Rules/ Regulations/SBD/Policy/ Basis for Rejection/ Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PPRA Rules, 2004 |
|--|-------------------------------|--------------------------|-----------------------------|---|---|
| | | Technical (70% Marks) | Financial (30% Marks) | | |
| i) Senior SAP Basis Consultant (02 Positions, 01 candidate qualified) | | | | | |
| Minimum Technical Bid Qualification Weightage = 60% , Minimum Combined Technical and Financial Qualification Weightage = 60 % . | | | | | |
| 1. | Mr. Naveed Bashir Qureshi | 61.60 | 24.710 | Rs.448,000/ per month with total yearly Consultancy fee of Rs.5,376,000/ per annum (fixed) | The Technical and Financial bids submitted by Mr. Naveed Bashir Qureshi have been accepted by the Technical and Financial Bid Evaluation Committee as the Ist Most Advantageous Bid in a compliance to Technical and Financial bids evaluation criteria mentioned under RFP-31 document. The Technical and Financial Bid Evaluation Committee recommended the issuance of contract award for the consultancy position of Sr. SAP (BASIS) Consultant for one year to the above mentioned consultant at a monthly |

CGA/7622
Pd K

| | | | | | |
|----|-----------------------|-------|--------|---|---|
| | | | | | Consultancy fee of Rs. 448,000/- (per month) with total fixed yearly Consultancy fee of Rs.5,376,000/ per annum. |
| 2. | Mr. Anjum Latif | 47.60 | 27.675 | Rs.400,000/ per month with total yearly Consultancy fee of Rs.4,800,000/ per annum (fixed) | The financial bid/Consultancy Fee received from Mr. Anjum Latif for the position of Sr. SAP (BASIS) Consultant was found 2nd lowest Consultancy Fee among the participant bidders /consultants. The Consultant was found 1st in Technical and Financial Bid Evaluation but not recommended by committee due to non appearance in Interview. |
| 3. | Mr. Arshad Mehmood | 37.80 | 30.00 | Rs.369,000/ per month with total yearly Consultancy fee of Rs. 4,428,000/ per annum (fixed) | The financial bid/Consultancy Fee received from Mr. Arshad Mehmood for the position of Sr. SAP (BASIS) Consultant was found 1st lowest among the participant bidders /consultants. The Consultant was disqualify due to non compliance of minimum technical qualification weightage i.e 60% after securing 54% weightage in light of the Technical and Financial bid Evaluation Criteria under RFP Document-31. |
| 4. | Mr. Jawad Ahmed Hasan | - | - | Rs.439,000/ per month with total yearly Consultancy fee of Rs. 5,268,000/ per annum (fixed) | The financial bid/Consultancy Fee received from Mr. Jawad Ahmed Hasan for the position of Sr. SAP (BASIS) Consultant was found 3rd lowest among the participant bidders /consultants. The Consultant was disqualify in Technical Bid Evaluation for not furnishing requisite SAP BASIS Certification. |

ii) Senior SAP (FI) Consultant (02 Positions)

Minimum Technical Bid Qualification Weightage = 60%,

Minimum Combined Technical and Financial Qualification Weightage = 60 % .

| | | | | | |
|----|------------------------|--------|--------|---|--|
| 1. | Mr. Bilal Mehmood Qazi | 53.200 | 26.667 | Rs.450,000/ per month with yearly consultancy fee of Rs.5,400,000/- (fixed) | The Technical and Financial Bid Evaluation Committee recommended the issuance of contract award for one year against 1st consultancy position of Sr. SAP FI Consultant to the above mentioned consultant at a monthly Consultancy fee of Rs. 450,000/- (per month) with total fixed yearly Consultancy fee of Rs.5,400,000/ per annum. The financial bid/Consultancy Fee received from Mr. Bilal Mehmood Qazi for the position of Sr. SAP (FI) Consultant was found 3rd lowest among the participant bidders/consultants. The Committee recommended issuance of contract award against 1st Consultancy Services position of Senior SAP FI Consultant to Mr. Bilal Mehmood Qazi |
|----|------------------------|--------|--------|---|--|

| | | | | | |
|--|-------------------------|--------|--------|--|---|
| | | | | | based on compliance of technical bid qualification (76.00 weightage) and Combined Technical and financial bid qualification with first Most Advantageous bid weightage of 79.867 out of 100. |
| 2. | Mr. Shahid Muhammad | 49.000 | 26.667 | Rs. 450,000/ per month with yearly consultancy fee of Rs.5,400,000/- (fixed) | The Technical and Financial bids submitted by Mr. Shahid Muhammad have been accepted by the Technical and Financial Bid Evaluation Committee as the 2nd Most Advantageous Bid in a compliance to bid evaluation criteria mentioned under RFP-31 document. The Technical and Financial Bid Evaluation Committee recommended the issuance of contract award for one year against the 2 nd consultancy position of Sr. SAP FI Consultant to the above mentioned consultant at a monthly Consultancy fee of Rs. 450,000/- (per month) with total fixed yearly Consultancy fee of Rs.5,400,000/ per annum. The financial bid/Consultancy Fee received from Mr. Shahid Muhammad for the position of Sr. SAP (FI) Consultant was found 3rd lowest among the participant bidders/consultants. The consultant obtained technical qualification (70.00% weightage) and Combined Technical and financial bid qualification with 2nd highest weightage of 75.667 out of 100. |
| 3. | Mr. Shehzad Ahmed Iqbal | 36.400 | 30.000 | Rs. 400,000/per month with total yearly fee of Rs-4,800,000/- (fixed) | The financial bid/Consultancy Fee received from Mr. Shahzad Ahmed Iqbal for the position of Sr. SAP (FI) Consultant was found 1st lowest among the participant bidders /consultants. However, the consultant was disqualify due to non compliance of minimum technical qualification weightage i.e 60% after securing 52% weightage out of 100. |
| 4. | Mr. Farrukh Iqbal | 40.00 | 28.986 | Rs. 414,000/ per month with total yearly fee of Rs- 4,968,000/- (fixed) | The financial bid/Consultancy Fee received from Mr. Farrukh Iqbal for the position of Sr. SAP (FI) Consultant was found 2nd lowest among the participant bidders /consultants. However, the consultant disqualify due to non compliance of minimum technical qualification weightage i.e 60% after securing weightage of 40% out of 100. |
| iii) Junior SAP (FI) Consultant (01 Position) Minimum Technical Bid Qualification Weightage = 60% , Minimum Combined Technical and Financial Qualification Weightage = 60 % . | | | | | |

| | | | | | |
|---|-------------------|--------|--------|--|---|
| 1. | Mr. Yasir Khan | 58.100 | 30.000 | Rs. 250,000/per month with total yearly fee of Rs.3,000,000/- (fixed) | Technical and Financial bids of Mr. Yasir Khan have been declared by the Technical and Financial Bids Evaluation Committees as the Most Advantageous single bid after complying Rule 38B of PPRA Rules, 2004. The Technical and Financial Bid Evaluation Committee recommended the issuance of contract award for the single consultancy position of Jr. SAP FI Consultant for one year to the above mentioned consultant at a monthly Consultancy fee of Rs. 250,000/- (per month) with total fixed yearly Consultancy fee of Rs.3,000,000/ per annum. The consultant has obtained Technical qualification weightage of 83% weightage and Combined Technical and financial bid qualification with Most Advantageous bid weightage of 88.100 out of 100. |
| iv) Senior SAP (HR) Consultant (01 Position) Minimum Technical Bid Qualification Weightage = 60%, Minimum Combined Technical and Financial Qualification Weightage = 60 %. | | | | | |
| 1. | Rao Imran Maqbool | 37.100 | 24.425 | Rs. 522,000/per month with total yearly fee of Rs.6,264,000/- (fixed) | The financial bid/Consultancy Fee received from Rao Imran Maqbool for the position of Sr. SAP (HR) Consultant was found 2nd lowest among the participant bidders /consultants. However, the consultant was disqualify due to non compliance of minimum technical qualification weightage i.e 60% after securing 53.00% weightage out of 100. |
| 2. | Mr. Fawad Hanif | 45.500 | 30.000 | Rs. 425,000/per month with total yearly fee of Rs. 5,100,000/- (fixed) | The financial bid/Consultancy Fee received from Fawad Hanif for the position of Sr. SAP (HR) Consultant was found 1st lowest among the participant bidders /consultants. The Committee recommended issuance of contract award against single Consultancy Services of Senior SAP HR Consultant to Mr. Fawad Hanif for one year for one year to the above mentioned consultant at a monthly Consultancy fee of Rs. 425,000/- (per month) with total fixed yearly Consultancy fee of Rs.5,100,000/ per annum. based on compliance of technical qualification (65% weightage) and Combined Technical and financial bid qualification with highest marks/weightage of 75.500 out of 100. Technical and Financial bids of Mr. Fawad Hanif has been declared by the Technical and Finance Committees as the 1st Most Advantageous bid in a compliance to Technical and Financial |

| | | | | | |
|--|------------------------|--------|--------|---|---|
| | | | | | Bids Evaluation Criteria under RFP-31 Document for the Consultancy position of Sr. SAP HR Consultant. |
| v) Junior SAP (HR) Consultant (01 Position) | | | | | |
| Minimum Technical Bid Qualification Weightage = 60% , Minimum Combined Technical and Financial Qualification Weightage = 60 % . | | | | | |
| 1. | Mr. Humayun Habib Baig | 45.500 | 30.00 | Rs. 245,000/per month with total yearly fee of Rs.2,940,000/- (fixed) | The single Consultancy bid and fee of Rs.245,000/per month received from Mr. Humayun Habib Baig for the position of Junior SAP (HR) Consultant was found reasonable and within the budgetary estimates published by this office in the RFP-31 i.e Rs200,000/per month to Rs.250,000/per month consultancy fee for Jr. SAP (HR) Consultant. The consultant has obtained (65% weightage) and Combined Technical and financial bid qualification with Most Advantageous bid weightage of 75.500 out of 100. Further, single bid was accepted in a compliance to PPRA rule 38B with the recommendations of the Committee for issuance of contract award against single Consultancy Services of Junior. SAP HR Consultant to Mr. Humayun Habib Baig. |
| vi) Procurement Assistant (01 Position) | | | | | |
| Minimum Technical Bid Qualification Weightage = 60%, Minimum Combined Technical and Financial Qualification Weightage = 60 % . | | | | | |
| 1. | Mr. Jamshaid Ansari | 51.800 | 30.00 | Rs.80,000/ per month with total yearly fee of Rs.960,000/- (fixed) | The Single financial bid/Consultancy fee received from bidder within the departmental budgetary estimates published by this office in the RFP-31 i.e Rs50,000/per month to Rs.80,000/per month consultancy fee for Procurement Assistant. However, Committee recommended that Consultant is not required for the project. |
| vii) Network Assistant (01 Position) | | | | | |
| Minimum Technical Bid Qualification Weightage = 60%, Minimum Combined Technical and Financial Qualification Weightage = 60 % . | | | | | |
| 1. | Mr. Hamza Nadeem | 46.900 | 30.000 | Rs. 80,000/ per month with total yearly fee of Rs.960,000/- (fixed) | The financial bid/Consultancy Fee received from Mr. Hamza Nadeem for the position of Network Assistant was found within the budgetary estimates published by this office in the RFP-31 i.e Rs50,000/per month to Rs.80,000/per month consultancy fee for Network Assistant. The consultant has obtained (67% weightage) and Combined Technical and financial bid qualification with highest marks/weightage of 76.900 out of 100.The Committee recommended issuance of contract award for one year against single Consultancy Services of Network Assistant to Mr. Hamza |

| | | | | | |
|---------------------------------------|-----------------|----------------------|-----------------|---|---|
| | | | | | Nadeem at a monthly Consultancy fee of Rs. 80,000/- (per month) with total fixed yearly Consultancy fee of Rs.960,000/ per annum after declaration of his Technical and Financial bid as the 1st Most Advantageous Bid. |
| 2. | Mr. Bilal Ahmed | 44.800 | 30.000 | Rs. 80,000/ per month with total yearly fee of Rs.960,000/- (fixed) | The financial bid/Consultancy Fee received from Mr. Bilal Ahmed for the position of Network Assistant was found within the budgetary estimates published by this office in the RFP-31 i.e Rs50,000/per month to Rs.80,000/per month consultancy fee for Network Assistant. The consultant has obtained (64% weightage) and Combined Technical and financial bid qualification with 2nd highest Most Advantageous bid with weightage of 74.800 out of 100. |
| viii) Network Programmer | | (01 Position) | | | |
| ix) Junior SAP ABAP Consultant | | (01 Position) | | | |
| 1. | No bid Received | No bid Received | No bid Received | No bid Received | The Technical and Financial Bid Evaluation Committee observed that no bid(s) received against two consultancy positions of Junior SAP ABAP Programmer and Network Programmer. The Committee Recommended to re-assess the requirement in Next Financial Year (FY 2022-23) keeping in view the critical operational requirements, selection criteria and budgetary provision. |



(Muhammad Umer)
Director General (MIS/FABS)

Copy to:

1. The Asstt. Director (PPRA) for uploading on to PPRA Website prior to award of Contract/Letter of Acceptance.
2. PS to the Deputy CGA (FABS/MIS), Islamabad.
3. All 15 Participant Bidders/Consultants (RFP-31).

EVALUATION SHEET FOR INDIVIDUAL SENIOR CONSULTANT (S)

EVALUATION CRITERIA (Sr. HR / FI / ABAP /BASIS)

| A. TECHNICAL EVALUATION STAGE -PASSING (60/100) | | | |
|--|---|----|--------|
| Pre requisition qualification | | | YES/NO |
| TECHNICAL EVALUATION STAGE | | | Marks |
| 1 | Individual Consultant(s) Profile | | 30 |
| | 16 years of education | 5 | |
| | Requisite certification (SAP) | 10 | |
| | Relevant additional certifications from SAP / Oracle | | |
| | 5 for each additional certification (Maximum 15) | 15 | |
| | Individual Consultant(s) experience in foreign IT projects | | 5 |
| | Experience in SAP ERP Projects experience of complete SAP life cycle implementation in different Orgaizations | | 10 |
| 3 | Up to 01 SAP project | 3 | |
| | Up to 03 SAP project | 5 | |
| | More Than 05 SAP project | 10 | |
| 4 | General Experience relevant to IT (2 year or more) | | 5 |
| 5 | Public Sector SAP implementation Experience In HR / FI / ABAP /BASIS | | 10 |
| | Minimum 3 years | 3 | |
| | Minimum 5 years | 6 | |
| | Minimum 8 years | 10 | |
| 6 | Understanding of TOR, Scope and Work Plan, KPIs | 5 | 15 |
| | Work Plan and KPIs | 10 | |
| 7 | Interview / Presentation by individual Consultant (s) | | 25 |
| TOTAL POINTS(Minimum qualification score 60%) | | | 100 |
| b. FINANCIAL EVALUATION STAGE -II | | | |
| St = 100 x Fm/F in which St is the financial score Fm is the lowest price and F is the price of proposal under consideration | | | 100 |
| FINAL SCORE | | | |

EVALUATION SHEET FOR INDIVIDUAL JUNIOR CONSULTANT (S)

EVALUATION CRITERIA (Jr. HR / FI / ABAP /BASIS)

| A. TECHNICAL EVALUATION STAGE -PASSING (60/100) | | | |
|---|---|----|--------|
| Pre requisition qualification | | | YES/NO |
| TECHNICAL EVALUATION STAGE | | | Marks |
| 1 | Individual Consultant(s) Profile | | 30 |
| | 16 years of education | 5 | |
| | Requisite certification (SAP) | 25 | |
| 2 | Experience in SAP ERP Projects experience of complete SAP life cycle implementation | | 10 |

| | | | |
|--|---|----|-----|
| 3 | Up to 01 SAP project | 10 | |
| 4 | General Experience relevant to IT (2 year or more) | | 5 |
| 5 | Public Sector SAP implementation Experience In HR / FI / ABAP | | 10 |
| | Minimum 1 years | 5 | |
| | Minimum 3 years | 10 | |
| 6 | Understanding of TOR, Scope and Work Plan, KPIs | 5 | 15 |
| | Work Plan and KPIs | 10 | |
| 7 | Interview / Presentation by individual Consultant (s) | | 30 |
| TOTAL POINTS(Minimum qualification score 60%) | | | 100 |
| b. FINANCIAL EVALUATION STAGE -II | | | |
| St = 100 x Fm/F in which St is the financial score Fm is the lowest price and F is the price of proposal under consideration | | | 100 |
| FINAL SCORE | | | |

EVALUATION SHEET FOR INDIVIDUAL NETWORK CONSULTANT (S)
NETWORK EVALUATION CRITERIA

| A. TECHNICAL EVALUATION STAGE -PASSING (60/100) | | | |
|--|---|----|--------|
| Pre requisition qualification | | | YES/NO |
| TECHNICAL EVALUATION STAGE | | | Marks |
| 1 | Individual Consultant(s) Profile | | 45 |
| | 16 years of education (Computer Science) | 25 | |
| | Requisite certification (CCNA or MCSE) relevant certifications from | 20 | |
| 2 | Individual Consultant(s) General experience (after completion of 16 years' | | 20 |
| 3 | Experience in Network Projects implementation in different Organizations | | 20 |
| | Network project (Established LAN Setup including deployment of | 10 | |
| | Network project (Established WAN/MAN setup using Firewalls, Router | 10 | |
| 4 | Public Sector /Private General Experience relevant to Network (above 2 years | | 5 |
| 5 | Interview / Presentation by individual Consultant (s) | | 10 |
| TOTAL POINTS(Minimum qualification score 60%) | | | 100 |
| b. FINANCIAL EVALUATION STAGE -II | | | |
| St = 100 x Fm/F in which St is the financial score Fm is the lowest price and F is the price of proposal under consideration | | | 100 |
| FINAL SCORE | | | |