

# **TECHNICAL EVALUATION REPORT**

**(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)**

- 1 Name of procuring Agency: Managing Director/CSF/PR/H.Q: Office, Lahore
- 2 Method of Procurement: Single Stage Two Envelope Procedure (as per rule 36(b)
- 3 Title of Procurement: Supply of Bell Washers = 200,000 Nos for CSF/Sukkur.
- 4 Tender Inquiry No: CSF/924/P/2022
- 5 PPRA Ref. No. (TSE): TS511686E
- 6 Date & Time of Bid Closing: 08-06-2023 at 11:00 Hours
- 7 Date & Time of Bid Opening: 08-06-2023 at 11:30 Hours
- 8 No of Bids Received: Five
- 9 Criteria for bid Evaluation: Attached
- 10 Details of Bid(s) Evaluation: Attached

<b>Name of Bidder</b>	<b>Technical Marks Obtained</b>	<b>Rule/Regulation/ SBD*/Policy/Basis for Rejection/Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004</b>
M/s. Al Majeed Ibrahim Steel Industries (Pvt) Ltd, Lahore	91	The bid found responsive and technically qualified
M/s. Continental Engg: Services (Pvt) Ltd; Karachi.	81	The bid found responsive and technically qualified
M/s. Spirit Industries (Pvt) Ltd; Lahore.	85	The bid found responsive and technically qualified
M/s Decent Builders, Lahore.	73	The bid found responsive and technically qualified
M/s Farooq Enterprises (Pvt) Ltd, Lahore.	82	The bid found responsive and technically qualified



**(Tayyab Riaz)**

for Managing Director/CSF,  
Ph # 042-99201737.

ANNEXURE-"A"**CRITERIA FOR EVALUATION OF TECHNICAL PROPOSAL****1. General**

The technical proposal of the Bidders shall be evaluated for qualification of bidders for the subject Bid based on the criteria regarding Eligibility, Work Experience, Equipment Capabilities and Financial Soundness as follows;

**2. Weightage/Marks**

The weightage/distribution of the marks shall be as given below:

i. Basic Eligibility (Mandatory)	35
ii. Experience of manufacturing of Steel/raw material	25
iii. Manufacturing equipment & Inspection / Testing Facility	20
iv. Financial Soundness	20

**Total 100 Marks**

The overall minimum qualifying score shall be 70% (35% from mandatory and 35% from others) marks to qualify. A detailed qualification criterion is given hereunder.

**3. (i) Basic Eligibility (mandatory)**

The firms fulfilling the following basic requirements shall only be considered for further evaluation (relevant documents to be attached).

- a) Proof / Documents of registration as supplier or Manufacturer / Sole proprietor / partnership deed / Memorandum of Association of Firm in case of Limited Company etc. **(2 Marks)**
- b) The bidder must be registered with Sales Tax and Income Tax Departments and must be on FBR's Active Tax Payer's List **(documentary proof must be submitted along with bid)**. **(2 Marks)**
- c) Litigation history / Affidavit on Legal Stamp paper in original to the fact that no litigation hinders the bidder to participate in this tender. **(2 Marks)**
- d) Affidavit on legal stamp paper declaring that the firm has never been black listed. **(2 Marks)**
- e) Bid Security as mentioned in tender documents from Scheduled Bank in Pakistan in favor of MD/CSF or FA&CAO/M&S, Pakistan Railways, Headquarters office Lahore "OR" Registration of Carriage Factory/Islamabad. **(2 Marks)**
- f) Manufacturer must have at least 2 years experience of manufacturing of similar goods (Bell Washers etc) **(documentary proof must be submitted alongwith bid)** **(3 Marks)**
- g) The bidder must allow that the purchaser shall have the right of stage inspection of manufacturing facilities. The signatures of Bidders on all pages of bidding documents will be considered their permission. **(2 Marks)**
- h) Bidder shall certify on their letter head that goods shall be brand new, free of any defect, as per drawing and material must be of following specifications (Table-1 & 2): - **(12 Marks)**

**Contd.....**

R

ANNEXURE-“A/1”

TABLE-1 SPECIFICATION

LIMIT VALUES OF CHEMICAL COMPOSITION			Marks	
RULING ELEMENTS		% BY WEIGHT		-
		Minimum	Maximum	-
Carbon	C	-	0.08	3

TABLE-2 DIMENSIONS AND PROPERTIES

		Minimum Value	Maximum Value	Marks
Tensile strength	N/mm <sup>2</sup>	270 N/mm <sup>2</sup>	350 N/mm <sup>2</sup>	3
	“OR” Kg/mm <sup>2</sup>	“OR” 27.5 Kg/mm <sup>2</sup>	“OR” 35.5 Kg/mm <sup>2</sup>	
Yield Value	N/mm <sup>2</sup>	-	220 N/mm <sup>2</sup>	3
	“OR” Kg/mm <sup>2</sup>		22.5 Kg/mm <sup>2</sup>	
Elongation	%	36%	-	3

i) Manufacturer must have manufacturing capacity of Bell Washers, at least 5000 Nos per day (Attach certificate on letterhead) (8 Marks)

#### 4. Experience of manufacturing of Bell Washers / Raw Material (Max Marks = 25)

Marking for work experience of the manufacturer shall be evaluated as per following criteria.

S. No.	Description	Max. Marks	
1	The Manufacturer has experience of manufacturing / supplying Bell Washers / Similar Goods to various organizations / customers / countries.	25	
	a) More than 10 years.		100%
	b) Less than 10 years but more than 5 years.		80%
	c) Less than 5 years, more than 2 years.		65%
	d) Less than 2 years.		0%

**Note:** Manufacturer's / company brochure / profile / letter / purchase orders be enclosed for evidence.

#### 5. Manufacturing equipment & Inspection / Testing Facility (Max Marks = 20)

S. No.	Description	Max. Marks
1	The manufacturer has all equipments of their own required for manufacturing of offered material.	10
2	The manufacturer possesses adequate inspection, testing/analysis facilities.	10

**Note:** The information about plant & machinery can be in the form of list / information provided by the manufacturer or contained in the company brochure.

Contd.....

R

ANNEXURE-“A/2”**(i) Financial soundness of Bidder (Max Marks = 20)**

S.No.	Description	Max. Marks
1	<b>Annual Turnover of Bidder</b> Average annual Turnover for the last 3 years: Greater than 40 Million = 20 Marks 30 Million to 40 Million = 18 Marks 20 Million to 30 Million = 15 Marks. 10 Million to 20 Million = 12 Marks. 5 Million to 10 Million = 10 Marks. Less than 5 Million = 0 Marks	20

**Note:** - Annual Audit reports / Bank Statement or annual sales tax returns of the bidder shall be enclosed.

**Total = 100 Marks. Minimum  
Qualifying Marks = 70**

**EVALUATION REPORT OF TECHNICAL BIDS AGAINST ADVERTISED TENDER NO. CSF/924/P/2022 OPENED ON 08.06.2023 FOR THE  
PROCUREMENT OF BELL WASHERS = 200,000 NOS FOR CSF/SUKKUR.**

PARTICULARS / REQUIREMENTS (AS PER QUALIFICATION CRITERIA, PLACED AT S.NO.3/129 & 6/131)	Total Marks	M/s Al-Majeed Ibrahim Steel Ind; (Pvt) Ltd; Lahore.		M/s. Continental Engg; Services (Pvt) Ltd; Karachi.		M/s. Spirit Industries (Pvt) Ltd; Lahore.		M/s Decent Builders, Lahore		M/s Farooq Enterprises (Pvt) Ltd. Lahore	
		Provided or not provided	Marks Obtained	Provided or not provided	Marks Obtained	Provided or not provided	Marks Obtained	Provided or not provided	Marks Obtained	Provided or not provided	Marks Obtained
<b>(i) BASIC ELIGIBILITY (MANDATORY) (35 MARKS)</b>											
a Proof / Documents of registration as supplier or Manufacturer / Sole proprietor / partnership deed / Memorandum of Association of Firm in case of Limited Company etc?	2	Provided (As flagged-1 in technical bid)	2	Provided (As flagged-11 in technical bid)	2	Provided (As flagged-20 in technical bid)	2	Provided (As flagged-30 in technical bid)	2	Provided (As flagged-39 in technical bid)	2
b Proof of registration with Sales Tax, Income Tax Departments and active on FBR's Active Tax Payer's List?	2	Provided (As flagged-2 in technical bid)	2	Provided (As flagged-12 in technical bid)	2	Provided (As flagged-21 in technical bid)	2	Provided (As flagged-31 in technical bid)	2	Provided (As flagged-40 in technical bid)	2
c Litigation history / Affidavit on Legal Stamp paper in original to the fact that no litigation hinders the bidder to participate in this tender?	2	Provided (As flagged-3 in technical bid)	2	Provided (As flagged-13 in technical bid)	2	Provided (As flagged-22 in technical bid)	2	Provided (As flagged-32 in technical bid)	2	Provided (As flagged-41 in technical bid)	2
d Affidavit on legal stamp paper declaring that the firm has never been black listed?	2	Provided (As flagged-4 in technical bid)	2	Provided (As flagged-14 in technical bid)	2	Provided (As flagged-23 in technical bid)	2	Provided (As flagged-32 in technical bid)	2	Provided (As flagged-42 in technical bid)	2
e Bid Security as mentioned in tender documents from Scheduled Bank in Pakistan in favor of MD/CSF or FA&CAO/M&S, Pakistan Railways, Headquarters office Lahore "OR" Registration of Carriage Factory/Isamabad	2	Provided registration (As flagged-5 in technical bid)	2	Provided Bid security (As flagged-15 in technical bid)	2	Provided registration (As flagged-24 in technical bid)	2	Provided Bid security (As flagged-33 in technical bid)	2	Provided registration (As flagged-43 in technical bid)	2
f Has the bidder provided documentary evidence that the manufacturer must have at least 2 years experience of manufacturing of similar goods (Bell Washers etc)?	3	Provided copies of purchase orders of similar goods (As flagged-6)	3	Provided copies of purchase orders of similar goods (As flagged-16)	3	Provided copies of purchase orders of similar goods (As flagged-25)	3	Provided copies of purchase orders of similar goods (As flagged-34)	3	Provided list of purchase orders of similar goods (As flagged-44)	3

*[Handwritten signature]*

*[Handwritten signature]*

*[Handwritten signature]*

*[Handwritten signature]*

	2	Yes by signing all pages of bidding documents.	2	Yes by signing all pages of bidding documents	2	Yes by signing all pages of bidding documents	2	Yes by signing all pages of bidding documents	2		
h	12	Provided (As flagged-7 in technical bid)	12	Provided (As flagged-17 in technical bid)	12	Provided (As flagged-26 in technical bid)	12	Provided (As flagged-35 in technical bid)	12		
i	8	Provided (As flagged-8 in technical bid)	8	Provided (As flagged-17/A in technical bid)	8	Provided (As flagged-27 in technical bid)	8	Provided (As flagged-36 in technical bid)	8		
Total (A):		35	35	-	3	-	35	-	35		
<b>(ii) EXPERIENCE OF MANUFACTURING OF BELL WASHERS/RAW MATERIAL (25 MARKS)</b>											
1	25	Provided copies of purchase orders of similar goods (As flagged-6)	16.25 (More than 4 years with CSF in similar items)	Provided copies of purchase orders of similar goods (As flagged-16)	16.25 (More than 2 years' experience)	Provided copies of purchase orders of similar goods (As flagged-25)	20 (More than 5 years)	Provided copies of purchase orders of similar goods (As flagged-34)	16.25 (More than 4 years)	Provided list of purchase orders of similar goods (As flagged-44)	25 (More than 10 years)
<p>Has the bidder provided evidence in the shape of manufacturer's / company's brochure or profile or letter or copies of purchase orders showing that the Manufacturer has experience of manufacturing / supplying Bell Washers/ Similar Goods to various organizations / customers / countries. Distribution of mark as per following detail:-</p> <p>a) More than 10 years. 100%</p> <p>b) Less than 10 years but more than 5 years. 80%</p> <p>c) Less than 5 years. 65%</p> <p>d) more than 2 years. 0%</p> <p>Less than 2 years. 0%</p>											

*[Handwritten signatures and initials]*



**MANUFACTURING EQUIPMENT & INSPECTION / TESTING FACILITY (20 MARKS)**

<p>Has the bidder provided evidence in the form list / information provided by the manufacturer or contained in the company brochure showing that the manufacturer has all equipment's of their own required for manufacturing of offered material?</p>	10	Provided List (As flagged-9 in technical bid)	10	Provided List (As flagged-18 in technical bid)	10	Provided List (As flagged-28 in technical bid)	2	10	Provided List (As flagged-9 in technical bid)	10	Not provided	0	Not provided	0				
<p>Has the bidder provided evidence in the form list / information provided by the manufacturer or contained in the company brochure showing that the manufacturer possesses adequate inspection, testing/analysis facilities?</p>	10	Provided List (As flagged-9 in technical bid)	10	Not provided	0	Not provided	<p><b>1 Annual Turnover of Bidder</b> Average annual Turnover for the last 3 years in the shape of annual audit reports or Bank Statement or annual sales tax returns of the bidder: Greater than 40 Million = 20 Marks 30 Million to 40 Million = 18 Marks 20 Million to 30 Million = 15 Marks 10 Million to 20 Million = 12 Marks 5 Million to 10 Million = 10 Marks Less than 5 Million = 0 Marks</p>	20	Provided in the shape of last 3 years financial statement / audit report (As flagged-10 in technical bid)	20	Provided in the shape of last 3 years audit reports (As flagged-19 in technical bid)	20	Provided in the shape of sales tax returns & annual audit reports (As flagged-29)	20	Provided in the shape of sales tax returns (As flagged-38)	12	Provided in the shape of sales tax returns (As flagged-48)	12
(iv) FINANCIAL SOUNDNESS OF BIDDER (20 MARKS)		-	56.25	-	46.25	-	50	-	38	-	47	-	-	-	-			
Minimum Qualifying Marks = 70 (35 from mandatory & 35 from others) out of Total Marks = 100		Grand Total Marks Obtained (A+B) = 91	Technically Suitable / Qualified	Grand Total Marks Obtained (A+B) = 81	Grand Total Marks Obtained (A+B) = 85	Grand Total Marks Obtained (A+B) = 73	Grand Total Marks Obtained (A+B) = 82	Status of the firm	Technically Suitable / Qualified	Technically Suitable / Qualified	Technically Suitable / Qualified	Technically Suitable / Qualified	Technically Suitable / Qualified	Technically Suitable / Qualified	Technically Suitable / Qualified			

**WM/CSF/SUK**

**DCP-IHQ**

**DD/P&L/HQ**

**XEN/CSF**

19/04/23