

TECHNICAL EVALUATION REPORT

(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

- 1 Name of procuring Agency: Managing Director/CSF/PR/H.Q: Office, Lahore
- 2 Method of Procurement: Single Stage Two Envelope Procedure (as per rule 36(b)
- 3 Title of Procurement: Supply of Bell Washers = 200,000 Nos for CSF/Khanewal.
- 4 Tender Inquiry No: CSF/925/P/2022
- 5 PPRA Ref. No. (TSE): TS511686E
- 6 Date & Time of Bid Closing: 08-06-2023 at 11:00 Hours
- 7 Date & Time of Bid Opening: 08-06-2023 at 11:30 Hours
- 8 No of Bids Received: Five
- 9 Criteria for bid Evaluation: Attached
- 10 Details of Bid(s) Evaluation: Attached

| Name of Bidder | Technical Marks Obtained | Rule/Regulation/SBD*/Policy/Basis for Rejection/Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004 |
|---|---------------------------------|--|
| M/s. Al Majeed Ibrahim Steel Industries (Pvt) Ltd, Lahore | 91 | The bid found responsive and technically qualified |
| M/s. Continental Engg: Services (Pvt) Ltd; Karachi. | 81 | The bid found responsive and technically qualified |
| M/s. Spirit Industries (Pvt) Ltd; Lahore. | 85 | The bid found responsive and technically qualified |
| M/s Decent Builders, Lahore. | 73 | The bid found responsive and technically qualified |
| M/s Business Masters, Lahore. | 70 | The bid found responsive and technically qualified |


(Tayyab Riaz)
for Managing Director/CSF,
Ph # 042-99201737.



ANNEXURE-“A”**CRITERIA FOR EVALUATION OF TECHNICAL PROPOSAL****1. General**

The technical proposal of the Bidders shall be evaluated for qualification of bidders for the subject Bid based on the criteria regarding Eligibility, Work Experience, Equipment Capabilities and Financial Soundness as follows;

2. Weightage/Marks

The weightage/distribution of the marks shall be as given below:

| | |
|---|----|
| i. Basic Eligibility (Mandatory) | 35 |
| ii. Experience of manufacturing of Steel/raw material | 25 |
| iii. Manufacturing equipment & Inspection / Testing Facility | 20 |
| iv. Financial Soundness | 20 |

Total 100 Marks

The overall minimum qualifying score shall be 70% (35% from mandatory and 35% from others) marks to qualify. A detailed qualification criterion is given hereunder.

3. (i) Basic Eligibility (mandatory)

The firms fulfilling the following basic requirements shall only be considered for further evaluation (relevant documents to be attached).

- a) Proof / Documents of registration as supplier or Manufacturer / Sole proprietor / partnership deed / Memorandum of Association of Firm in case of Limited Company etc. **(2 Marks)**
- b) The bidder must be registered with Sales Tax and Income Tax Departments and must be on FBR's Active Tax Payer's List **(documentary proof must be submitted along with bid)**. **(2 Marks)**
- c) Litigation history / Affidavit on Legal Stamp paper in original to the fact that no litigation hinders the bidder to participate in this tender. **(2 Marks)**
- d) Affidavit on legal stamp paper declaring that the firm has never been black listed. **(2 Marks)**
- e) Bid Security as mentioned in tender documents from Scheduled Bank in Pakistan in favor of MD/CSF or FA&CAO/M&S, Pakistan Railways, Headquarters office Lahore "OR" Registration of Carriage Factory/Islamabad. **(2 Marks)**
- f) Manufacturer must have at least 2 years experience of manufacturing of similar goods (Bell Washers etc) **(documentary proof must be submitted alongwith bid)** **(3 Marks)**
- g) The bidder must allow that the purchaser shall have the right of stage inspection of manufacturing facilities. The signatures of Bidders on all pages of bidding documents will be considered their permission. **(2 Marks)**
- h) Bidder shall certify on their letter head that goods shall be brand new, free of any defect, **R**s per drawing and material must be of following specifications (Table-1 & 2): - **(12 Marks)**

Contd.....

ANNEXURE-"A/1"

TABLE-1 SPECIFICATION

| LIMIT VALUES OF CHEMICAL COMPOSITION | | | | Marks |
|--------------------------------------|---|-------------|---------|-------|
| RULING ELEMENTS | | % BY WEIGHT | | - |
| | | Minimum | Maximum | - |
| Carbon | C | - | 0.08 | 3 |

TABLE-2 DIMENSIONS AND PROPERTIES

| | | Minimum Value | Maximum Value | Marks |
|------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------------|---------------------------------|-------|
| Tensile strength | N/mm ² | 270 N/mm ² | 350 N/mm ² | 3 |
| | "OR" Kg/mm ² | "OR" 27.5 Kg/mm ² | "OR" 35.5 Kg/mm ² | |
| Yield Value | N/mm ² | - | 220 N/mm ² | 3 |
| | "OR" Kg/mm ² | - | "OR" 22.5 Kg/mm ² | |
| Elongation | % | 36% | - | 3 |

- i) Manufacturer must have manufacturing capacity of Bell Washers, at least 5000 Nos per day (**Attach certificate on letterhead**) (8 Marks)

4. Experience of manufacturing of Bell Washers / Raw Material (Max Marks = 25)

Marking for work experience of the manufacturer shall be evaluated as per following criteria.

| S. No. | Description | Max. Marks |
|--------|--|------------|
| 1 | The Manufacturer has experience of manufacturing / supplying Bell Washers / Similar Goods to various organizations / customers / countries. a) More than 10 years. 100% b) Less than 10 years but more than 5 years. 80% c) Less than 5 years, more than 2 years. 65% d) Less than 2 years. 0% | 25 |

Note: Manufacturer's / company brochure / profile / letter / purchase orders be enclosed for evidence.

5. Manufacturing equipment & Inspection / Testing Facility (Max Marks = 20)

| S. No. | Description | Max. Marks |
|--------|--|------------|
| 1 | The manufacturer has all equipments of their own required for manufacturing of offered material. | 10 |
| 2 | The manufacturer possesses adequate inspection, testing/analysis facilities. | 10 |

Note: The information about plant & machinery can be in the form of list / information provided by the manufacturer or contained in the company brochure.

Contd.....

R

ANNEXURE-"A/2"**(i) Financial soundness of Bidder (Max Marks = 20)**

| S.No. | Description | Max. Marks |
|-------|--|------------|
| 1 | Annual Turnover of Bidder Average annual Turnover for the last 3 years: Greater than 40 Million = 20 Marks 30 Million to 40 Million = 18 Marks 20 Million to 30 Million = 15 Marks. 10 Million to 20 Million = 12 Marks. 5 Million to 10 Million = 10 Marks. Less than 5 Million = 0 Marks | 20 |

Note: - Annual Audit reports / Bank Statement or annual sales tax returns of the bidder shall be enclosed.

**Total = 100 Marks. Minimum
Qualifying Marks = 70**

**EVALUATION REPORT OF TECHNICAL BIDS AGAINST ADVERTISED TENDER NO.CSF/925/P/2022 OPENED ON 08.06.2023 FOR THE
PROCUREMENT OF BELL WASHERS = 200,000 NOS FOR CSF/KHANEWAL.**

**PARTICULARS REQUIREMENTS
AS PER QUALIFICATION
CRITERIA. PLACED AT S.NO.3/129 &
6/131)**

| | Total Marks | M/s. AL-Majeed Ibrahim Steel Indt. (Pvt) Ltd; Lahore. | | M/s. Continental Engg: Services (Pvt) Ltd; Karachi. | | M/s. Spirit Industries (Pvt) Ltd; Lahore. | | M/s Decent Builders, Lahore | | M/s Business Masters, Lahore | |
|---|-------------|--|----------------|---|----------------|---|----------------|---|----------------|---|----------------|
| | | Provided or not provided | Marks Obtained | Provided or not provided | Marks Obtained | Provided or not provided | Marks Obtained | Provided or not provided | Marks Obtained | Provided or not provided | Marks Obtained |
| (i) BASIC ELIGIBILITY (MANDATORY) (35 MARKS) | | | | | | | | | | | |
| a | 2 | Provided (As flagged-1 in technical bid) | 2 | Provided (As flagged-12 in technical bid) | 2 | Provided (As flagged-22 in technical bid) | 2 | Provided (As flagged-32 in technical bid) | 2 | Provided (As flagged-41 in technical bid) | 2 |
| b | 2 | Provided (As flagged-2 in technical bid) | 2 | Provided (As flagged-13 in technical bid) | 2 | Provided (As flagged-23 in technical bid) | 2 | Provided (As flagged-33 in technical bid) | 2 | Provided (As flagged-42 in technical bid) | 2 |
| c | 2 | Provided (As flagged-3 in technical bid) | 2 | Provided (As flagged-14 in technical bid) | 2 | Provided (As flagged-24 in technical bid) | 2 | Provided (As flagged-34 in technical bid) | 2 | Provided (As flagged-43 in technical bid) | 2 |
| d | 2 | Provided (As flagged-4 in technical bid) | 2 | Provided (As flagged-15 in technical bid) | 2 | Provided (As flagged-25 in technical bid) | 2 | Provided (As flagged-34 in technical bid) | 2 | Provided (As flagged-44 in technical bid) | 2 |
| e | 2 | Provided registration (As flagged-5 in technical bid) | 2 | Provided Bid security (As flagged-16 in technical bid) | 2 | Provided registration (As flagged-26 in technical bid) | 2 | Provided Bid security (As flagged-35 in technical bid) | 2 | Provided registration (As flagged-45 in technical bid) | 2 |
| f | 3 | Provided copies of purchase orders of similar goods (As flagged-6) | 3 | Provided copies of purchase orders of similar goods (As flagged-17) | 3 | Provided copies of purchase orders of similar goods (As flagged-27) | 3 | Provided copies of purchase orders of similar goods (As flagged-36) | 3 | Provided list of purchase orders of similar goods (As flagged-46) | 3 |

| | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--|----|--|---|---|---------------------------------------|---|------------------------|---|---------------------------|---|-------------------------|
| <p>the bidder allowed that the bidder shall have the right of single inspection of manufacturing facilities by the signing on all pages of bidding documents?</p> | 2 | Yes by signing all pages of bidding documents. | 2 | Yes by signing all pages of bidding documents | 2 | Yes by signing all pages of bidding documents | 2 | Yes by signing all pages of bidding documents | 2 | Yes by signing all pages of bidding documents | 2 |
| <p>11. Has the bidder certified on their letter head that goods shall be brand new free of any defect, as per drawing and material must be of specifications (Table-1 & 2) mentioned on page No.132 of the bidding documents?</p> | 12 | Provided (As flagged-7 & 7/A in technical bid) | 12 | Provided (As flagged-18 in technical bid) | 12 | Provided (As flagged-28 in technical bid) | 12 | Provided (As flagged-37 in technical bid) | 12 | Provided (As flagged-47 in technical bid) | 12 |
| <p>12. Has the bidder attached certificate on their letter head that the manufacturer must have manufacturing capacity of Bell Washers, at least 5000 Nos per day?</p> | 8 | Provided (As flagged-8 in technical bid) | 8 | Provided (As flagged-19 in technical bid) | 8 | Provided (As flagged-29 in technical bid) | 8 | Provided (As flagged-38 in technical bid) | 8 | Provided (As flagged-48 in technical bid) | 8 |
| <p>(ii) EXPERIENCE OF MANUFACTURING OF BELL WASHERS/RAW MATERIAL (25 MARKS)</p> <p>1. Has the bidder provided evidence in the shape of manufacturer's / company's brochure or profile or letter or copies of purchase orders showing that the Manufacturer has experience of manufacturing / supplying Bell Washers/ Similar Goods to various organizations / customers / countries. Distribution of mark as per following detail:-</p> <p>a) More than 10 years. 100%</p> <p>b) Less than 10 years but more than 5 years. 80%</p> <p>c) Less than 5 years, more than 2 years. 65%</p> <p>d) Less than 2 years. 0%</p> | 25 | Provided copies of purchase orders of similar goods (As flagged-6) | 16.25 (More than 4 years with CSF in similar items) | Provided copies of purchase orders of similar goods (As flagged-17) | 16.25 (More than 2 years' experience) | Provided copies of purchase orders of similar goods (As flagged-27) | 20 (More than 5 years) | Provided copies of purchase orders of similar goods (As flagged-36) | 16.25 (More than 4 years) | Provided list of purchase orders of similar goods (As flagged-46) | 25 (More than 10 years) |
| Total (A): | 35 | - | 35 | - | 35 | - | 35 | - | 35 | - | 35 |

[Handwritten signatures and initials]

iii) MANUFACTURING EQUIPMENT & INSPECTION / TESTING FACILITY (20 MARKS)

| | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--|----|---|----|---|----|--|----|---|----|---|----|
| Has the bidder provided evidence in the form list / information provided by the manufacturer or contained in the company brochure showing that the manufacturer has all equipment's of their own required for manufacturing of offered material? | 10 | Provided List (As flagged-9 in technical bid) | 10 | Provided List (As flagged-20 in technical bid) | 10 | Provided (As flagged-30 in technical bid) | 10 | Provided List (As flagged-39 in technical bid) | 10 | Provided List (As flagged-49 in technical bid) | 10 |
| 2 Has the bidder provided evidence in the form list / information provided by the manufacturer or contained in the company brochure showing that the manufacturer possesses adequate inspection, testing/analysis facilities? | 10 | Provided List (As flagged-10 in technical bid) | 10 | Not Provided | 0 | Not provided | 0 | Not provided | 0 | Not provided | 0 |

(iv) FINANCIAL SOUNDNESS OF BIDDER (20 MARKS)

| | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--|---------------------------------------|--|---|--|---|--|---|---|---|---|--|
| 1 Annual Turnover of Bidder Average annual Turnover for the last 3 years in the shape of annual audit reports or Bank Statement or annual sales tax returns of the bidder: Greater than 40 Million = 20 Marks 30 Million to 40 Million = 18 Marks 20 Million to 30 Million = 15 Marks. 10 Million to 20 Million = 12 Marks. 5 Million to 10 Million = 10 Marks. Less than 5 Million = 0 Marks | 20 | Provided in the shape of last 3 years financial statement / audit report (As flagged-11 in technical bid) | 20 (Greater than 40 Million annual turn over | Provide in the shape of last 3 years audit reports (As flagged-21 in technical bid) | 20 (Greater than 40 Million annual turn over | Provided in the shape of sales tax returns & annual audit reports (As flagged-31) | 20 (Greater than 40 Million annual turn over | Provided in the shape of sales tax returns (As flagged-40) | 12 (More than 10 Million average annual turnover | Provided in the shape of sales tax returns (As flagged-50) | 0 (Less than 05 Million average annual turnover |
| Total (B): | 65 | - | 56.25 | - | 46.25 | - | 50 | - | 38 | - | 35 |
| Minimum Qualifying Marks = 70 (35 from mandatory & 35 from others) out of Total Marks = 100 | Grand Total Marks Obtained (A+B) = 91 | | Grand Total Marks Obtained (A+B) = 81 | | Grand Total Marks Obtained (A+B) = 85 | | Grand Total Marks Obtained (A+B) = 73 | | Grand Total Marks Obtained (A+B) = 70 | | |
| Status of the firm | Technically Suitable / Qualified | | Technically Suitable / Qualified | | Technically Suitable / Qualified | | Technically Suitable / Qualified | | Technically Suitable / Qualified | | |

WM/CSF/KWL

DCP-THQ

DD/P&L/HQ

XEN/CSF

