

TECHNICAL EVALUATION REPORT

(As per Rule 35 of PP Rules 2004)

1	Name of Procuring Agency:	Karachi Port Trust
2	Method of Procurement:	Notice for tender invitation through news paper published in Daily Business Recorder and Daily Express on 21.01.2025 and tender documents uploaded in KPT & PPRA websites on 23.01.2025 under PPRA rule 36(b) i.e. single stage two envelope procedure.
3	Title of Procurement:	Supply, installation & commissioning of 144 KW on-grid solar system at berths 1 to 4, East Wharf.
4	Tender Inquiry No:	E-02/2025
5	PPRA Ref. No (TSE):	TS 555355E
6	Date & Time of Bid Closing:	20-02-2025 at 11:00 hrs
7	Date & Time of Bid Opening:	20-02-2025 at 11:30 hrs
8	No of Bids Received:	07 Nos
9	Criteria for Bid Evaluation:	As per TEC
10	Details of Bid(s) Evaluation:	Given Below

Name of Bidder	Technical Marks	Rule/ Regulation/SBD/policy /Basis for Rejection/ Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules,2004
M/s Ideal power solutions (Pvt) Ltd	100 Marks Weightage=70 out of 70	Qualified
M/s Direct Energy (Pvt) Ltd	99 Marks Weightage=69.3 out of 70	Qualified
M/s Renewable Stars (Pvt) Ltd	96 Marks Weightage=67.2 out of 70	Qualified
M/s A.A. Enterprises	94.5 Marks Weightage=66.15 out of 70	Qualified
M/s Creative Electronics (Pvt) Ltd	92.5 Marks Weightage=64.75 out of 70	Qualified
M/s Beyondgreen (Pvt) Ltd	90.5 Marks Weightage=63.35 out of 70	Qualified
M/s Iceberg Industries	78 Marks Weightage= 54.6 out of 70	Qualified

11. Any other additional / supporting information, the procuring agency may like to share.
(Attached)

Signature:.....

TEC Convener

Dy. Chief Electrical Engineer (O&M)
Karachi Port Trust

Official Stamp:.....

No.(M)/Elect/O&M/ Solar/2025/91
Dated 25-04-2025



KARACHI PORT TRUST
DCEE S&C SECTION
Berth No.10, Keamari, Karachi

Mech & Elect Engg Deptt.
M.I. YARD , West Wharf,
Karachi

DY.CHIEF ELECT. ENGINEER(S&C)

IR:NO: 527
DATED: 25.4.25

**SUBJECT: SUPPLY INSTALLATION & COMMISSIONING OF 144KW ON-GRID
SOLAR SYSTEM AT BERTHS 1 TO 4, EAST WHARF.**

Reference:

DCEE(S&C) letter No. (M)/Elect/02/2025/62 dated 24-02-2025

In pursuance to the tender vide reference above, it is intimated that original file of subject case along with 07 offers submitted by participated i.e.

- i. M/s. A&A Enterprises
- ii. M/s. Renewable Stars (Pvt) Ltd
- iii. M/s. Creative Electronics (Pvt) Ltd
- iv. M/s. Iceberg Industries
- v. M/s. Beyondgreen (Pvt) Ltd
- vi. M/s. Direct Energy (Pvt) Ltd
- vii. M/s. Ideal Power Solutions (Pvt) Ltd

Technical Evaluation Committee reviewed listed firms mandatory requirements along with Performa 'A&B'. The committee determined that all above mentioned seven firms meet mandatory TEC requirements and declared technically qualified as per attached Technical Evaluation Report.

Therefore you are requested to open financial bid of said tender.

Enclosed:

Subject Tender file (Original)
Technical Evaluation Report
Performa 'A&B' for bidders Comparisons
Scope of Work Comparisons

DY. CHIEF ELECT. ENGINEER (O&M)

Convener

Copy To:

CMEE-II
GM (E)

KARACHI PORT TRUST
MECH & ELECT ENGG DEPTT

SUPPLY, INSTALLATION & COMMISSIONING OF 144 KW ON-GRID SOLAR SYSTEM AT BERTHS 1 TO 4 EAST WHARF

TECHNICAL EVALUATION REPORT

1. It is submitted that with the approval of Competent Authority the subject tenders were invited through press advertisement under PPRA rule 36(b) (i.e. single stage two envelope procedure) and the same were published in the newspapers on 21-01-2025 and accordingly uploaded on KPT and PPRA websites. The last date of issue of tender was fixed on 19-02-2025. Tender Bid opened on 20-02-2025 at 11:30 hrs.

2. In response following seven bidders participated and submitted Technical offers.

- i. M/s. A&A Enterprises
- ii. M/s. Renewable Stars (Pvt) Ltd
- iii. M/s. Creative Electronics (Pvt) Ltd
- iv. M/s. Iceberg Industries
- v. M/s. Beyondgreen (Pvt) Ltd
- vi. M/s. Direct Energy (Pvt) Ltd
- vii. M/s. Ideal Power Solutions (Pvt) Ltd

3. In this regards, first meeting of technical evaluation committee was held on 26-02-2025 at 10:00 hrs in the office of CM&EE-II. The meeting was chaired by CM&EE-II and following members attended the meeting.

- a) Dy.CEE(O&M)
- b) Asst. Electrical Engr.
- c) Asst. Manager Finance



4. During the meeting the technical proposal reviewed by above technical committee and discusses the technical proposal.
5. The second meeting of the committee was held on 10:00hrs dated 05-03-2025 and all the committee members attended the meeting. During the meeting the technical proposal was reviewed by above technical committee and after detailed deliberations some discrepancies were observed regarding mandatory requirement of evaluation criteria and other terms & conditions and the same were forwarded to Dy.CEE(S&C) vide Dy.CEE(O&M) letter No.(M)/Elect/O&M/Solar/2025/56 dated: 10-03-2025 for following shortcoming clarification was asked from bidders to furnish.

CLARIFICATIONS:

M/s. A&A Enterprises

1.	Does not provide experience of Engineers for technical staff involved in solar work.
2.	Does not specify make of items / materials i.e. Panels, Inverters, Lighting arrestors, AC & DC breakers and cables as per KPT's Scope of Work for technical bid of said tender.

M/s. Renewable Stars (Pvt) Ltd

1.	Does not specify make of items / materials i.e. Panels, Inverters, Lighting arrestors, AC & DC breakers and cables as per KPT's Scope of Work for technical bid of said tender.
----	---

M/s. Creative Electronics (Pvt) Ltd

1.	Does not specify make of items / materials i.e. Panels, Inverters, Lighting arrestors, AC & DC breakers and cables as per KPT's Scope of Work for technical bid of said tender.
----	---



M/s. Iceberg Industries

1.	In case of companies and firms, last 03 years financial statements are to be provided showing minimum average turnover of Rs 20 million. (Financial statement for year 2023 & 2024 Not provided)
2.	Does not specify make of items / materials i.e. Panels, Inverters, Lighting arrestors, AC & DC breakers and cables as per KPT's Scope of Work for technical bid of said tender.

M/s. Beyondgreen (Pvt) Ltd

1.	Does not provide List of work facility equipments required in TEC.
2.	Does not specify make of items / materials i.e. Panels, Inverters, Lighting arrestors, AC & DC breakers and cables as per KPT's Scope of Work for technical bid of said tender.

M/s. Direct Energy (Pvt) Ltd

1.	Does not provide signed Affidavit of Non-Blacklisting of firm. Also Affidavit which is provided is on Rs. 50/- Stamp paper.
----	---

M/s. Ideal Power Solutions (Pvt) Ltd

1.	Does not specify make of items / materials i.e. Panels, Inverters, Lighting arrestors, AC & DC breakers and cables as per KPT's Scope of Work for technical bid of said tender.
----	---

6. In response above mentioned bidders submitted their clarifications for above shortcomings and their reply was received to Dy.CEE(O&M) vide Dy.CEE(S&C) letter No.(M)/Elect/02/2025/122 Dated: 28-03-2025.

7. The third meeting of the committee was held on 03-04-2025 at 10:00hrs in the office of CM&EE-II and all committee members attended the meeting. The committee discusses the response received from bidders and found that still scope of work is not clarified according to KPT's SOW for subject tender case in responses received from bidders. Accordingly committee again furnished a clarification regarding scope of work for subject tender from all seven bidders participated in tender vide Dy.CEE(O&M) letter No.(M)/Elect/O&M/Solar/2025/71 dated: 08-04-2025 to Dy.CEE(S&C).

1). MANDATORY REQUIREMENT:

CAUTION: Non compliance of any Mandatory Conditions will leads rejection of bid and no further evaluation:-

[illegible]

II). TECHNICAL REQUIREMENT

Minimum Qualifying Marks =70% in each category
The points / marks shall be given in the following manners:

Summary of marks / points

Category	Maximum point / marks	To qualify Minimum points to be scored separately in each category
A. Status of firm	10	7 i.e 70% of 10 marks
B. Professional Capability	30	21 i.e 70% of 30 marks
C. Relevant Experience	40	28 i.e 70% of 40 marks
D. Financial	20	14 i.e 70% of 20 marks
Total	100	70 i.e 70% of 100 marks

S.No.	Description	Min/Max Marks	M/s. A&A Enterprises	M/s. Renewable Stars (Pvt) Ltd	M/s. Creative Electronics (Pvt) Ltd	M/s. Iceberg Industries	M/s. Beyondgreen (Pvt) Ltd	M/s. Direct Energy (Pvt) Ltd	M/s. Ideal Power Solutions (Pvt) Ltd
A.	STATUS OF FIRM : (Max. marks-10) (Min marks 07)								
	i). Private Limited / corporation . Partnership . Proprietor	05 marks 04 marks 3.5 marks	3.5 Marks Before S.No. 03	05 Marks S.No. 09	05 Marks S.No. 18	04 Marks S.No. 27	05 Marks S.No. 36	05 Marks S.No. 45	05 Marks S.No. 52
	ii). Completion of 04 years of firm established Completion of 03 years of firm established Completion of 02 years of firm established . Below 02 years of firm established (Evidence to be provided)	05 marks 04 marks 3.5 marks 00 marks	05 Marks Before S.No. 03	05 Marks S.No. 09	05 Marks S.No. 18	05 Marks S.No. 27	05 Marks S.No. 36	04 Marks S.No. 45	05 Marks S.No. 52
Total			8.5 Marks	10 Marks	10 Marks	09 Marks	10 Marks	09 Marks	10 Marks

B.	PROFESSIONAL CAPABILITY (Max. marks-40) (Min marks 28)	Min/Max Marks	M/s. A&A Enterprises	M/s. Renewable Stars (Pvt) Ltd	M/s. Creative Electronics (Pvt) Ltd	M/s. Iceberg Industries	M/s. Beyondgreen (Pvt) Ltd	M/s. Direct Energy (Pvt) Ltd	M/s. Ideal Power Solutions (Pvt) Ltd
	i). <u>Managerial staff. (10 Marks)</u> • Director / Controller (10 years experience) • Manager Engineering (05 years experience) • Manager Finance (05 years experience)	10 marks 8.5marks 07 marks	<u>10 Marks</u> S.No. 05	<u>10 Marks</u> S.No. 11	<u>8.5 Marks</u> S.No. 21	<u>07 Marks</u> S.No. 28	<u>8.5 Marks</u> S.No. 38	<u>10 Marks</u> S.No. 46	<u>10 Marks</u> S.No. 54
	ii). <u>Technical staff. (20 Marks)</u> Provide detail of technical staff involved in Solar installation work: Electrical / Electronic / Mechatronics Engineer having 05-10 years experience. Electrical / Electronic / Mechatronics Engineer having 03-05 years experience. Electrical / Electronic / Mechatronics Engineer having 01-03 years experience.	10 marks 8.5marks 07 marks	<u>07 Marks</u> S.No. 05	<u>10 Marks</u> S.No. 12	<u>10 Marks</u> S.No. 22	<u>07 Marks</u> S.No. 29	<u>10 Marks</u> S.No. 39	<u>10 Marks</u> S.No. 46	<u>10 Marks</u> S.No. 55
	iii. <u>Work Facility (10 marks)</u> Detail to be provided methodology of Solar repairing workshop facility, fully equipped with machine & tools required for subject work having following accessories.								
	<ul style="list-style-type: none">Online facility 24/7 diagnosing fault.Air compressorPneumatic toolsPlate bending machineWelding plantShaper grinding machineElectric grindersTools for fabrication workList of safety equipment such as helmet safety goggles hand gloves etc will carry.	2 marks 1 marks 1 marks 1 marks 1 marks 1 marks 1 marks 1 marks	<u>09 Marks</u> S.No. 06	<u>06 Marks</u> S.No. 13	<u>04 Marks</u> S.No. 23	<u>07 Marks</u> S.No. 30	<u>08 Marks</u> Flag 'B'	<u>10 Marks</u> S.No. 47	<u>10 Marks</u> S.No. 56
	Total		26 Marks	26 Marks	22.5 Marks	21 Marks	26.5 Marks	30 Marks	30 Marks

C. <u>RELEVANT EXPERIENCE OF SOLARIZATION WORK.</u> (Max. marks -40) (Min marks 28)		Min/Max Marks	M/s. A&A Enterprises	M/s. Renewable Stars (Pvt) Ltd	M/s. Creative Electronics (Pvt) Ltd	M/s. Iceberg Industries	M/s. Beyondgreen (Pvt) Ltd	M/s. Direct Energy (Pvt) Ltd	M/s. Ideal Power Solutions (Pvt) Ltd
Give reference to (documentary proof) in.									
D. <u>FINANCIAL SOUNDNESS</u> (Max. marks-20) (Min marks 14)	▪ 05 contracts for Solar Installation work 140KW or above.	40 marks	<u>40 Marks</u> S.No. 07	<u>40 Marks</u> S.No. 14	<u>40 Marks</u> S.No. 24	<u>28 Marks</u> S.No. 31	<u>34 Marks</u> S.No. 40	<u>40 Marks</u> S.No. 48	<u>40 Marks</u> S.No. 57
	▪ 03 contracts for Solar Installation work 140KW or above.	34 marks							
	▪ 02 contracts for Solar Installation work 140KW or above.	28 marks							
<u>Turnover.</u>									
30 Million and above.		20 marks	<u>20 Marks</u> S.No.1 & 4	<u>20 Marks</u> S.No.8(a)	<u>20 Marks</u> S.No.15 & 20	<u>20 Marks</u> S.No. 25 & Flag 'A'	<u>20 Marks</u> S.No.32 & 33	<u>20 Marks</u> S.No. 41 & 42	<u>20 Marks</u> S.No. 49
25 Million and less than 30 Million.		16 marks							
20 Million and less than 25 Million.		14 marks							
Below 20 Million.		00 marks							
Grand Total (A+B+C+D)			94.5 Marks	96 Marks	92.5 Marks	78 Marks	90.5 Marks	99 Marks	100 Marks
Technical Score = $\frac{\text{Bidder's Technical Score}}{\text{Total Technical Score}} \times 70$			$\frac{94.5}{100} \times 70$	$\frac{96}{100} \times 70$	$\frac{92.5}{100} \times 70$	$\frac{78}{100} \times 70$	$\frac{90.5}{100} \times 70$	$\frac{99}{100} \times 70$	$\frac{100}{100} \times 70$
			66.15 Score	67.2 Score	64.75 Score	54.6 Score	63.35 Score	69.3 Score	70 Score

RECOMMENDATIONS:

The technical evaluation committee reviewed the technical proposal and after detailed deliberation and discussion unanimously recommended that:

07 Nos. firms i.e.:

- i. M/s. A&A Enterprises
- ii. M/s. Renewable Stars (Pvt) Ltd
- iii. M/s. Creative Electronics (Pvt) Ltd
- iv. M/s. Iceberg Industries
- v. M/s. Beyondgreen (Pvt) Ltd
- vi. M/s. Direct Energy (Pvt) Ltd
- vii. M/s. Ideal Power Solutions (Pvt) Ltd

Above seven firms meet mandatory TEC requirements and declared technically qualified, their financial bid may be opened.

ASSTT MANAGER FINANCE

Member

ASSTT ELECTRICAL ENGINEER

Member

DY. CHIEF ELECTRICAL ENGINEER (O&M)

Convener