



# NATIONAL HIGHWAY AUTHORITY

Procurement & Contract Administration Section

28-Mauve Area, G-9/1, Islamabad Tel: 9032727, Fax: 9260419

No. 6(557)/GM (P&CA)/NHA/2022/289-A

Islamabad, 23. May, 2022

## Director General

Public Procurement Regulatory Authority  
1<sup>st</sup> Floor FBC Building near State Bank,  
Sector G-5/2, Islamabad

Subject: **ANNOUNCEMENT OF EVALUATION REPORT (PPRA RULE-35):  
Consultancy Services for Hiring of Individual Legal  
Consultants for PPP projects (Kharian -Rawalpindi Motorway)**

Reference: PPRA Rule-35

Find enclosed herewith the Evaluation Report along with Evaluation Criteria (Annex-I) for the subject Services in line with PPRA Rule-35 for uploading on PPRA website at the earliest, please.

  
(SAMI-UR-REHMAN)  
General Manager (P&CA)

**Encl:** Evaluation Report along with **Annex- I**

### **Copy for kind information to:**

- Member (Planning), NHA, Islamabad;
- General Manager (PPP) NHA, Islamabad;
- Director (Tech. to Chairman), NHA, Islamabad;
- Director Consultancy (P&CA)-III, NHA, Islamabad.

# EVALUATION REPORT

## (As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

1.	Name of Procuring Agency:	National Highway Authority
2.	Method of Procurement:	Single Stage Two Envelope Procedure
3.	Title of Procurement:	Consultancy Services for Hiring of Individual Legal Consultants for PPP projects (Kharian –Rawalpindi Motorway)
4.	Tender Inquiry No.:	6(557)
5.	PPRA Ref. No. (TSE):	TS471658E
6.	Date & Time of Bid Closing:	28 <sup>th</sup> February, 2022 at 1130 hours local time
7.	Date & Time of Bid Opening:	28 <sup>th</sup> February, 2022 at 1200 hours local time
8.	No of Bids Received:	Ten (10) Proposals were received
9.	Criteria for Bid Evaluation:	Criteria of Bid Evaluation is attached at Annex-I
10.	Details of Bid(s) Evaluation:	As below

Name of Bidder	Marks			Evaluated Cost (EC)* (PKR)	Rule/Regulation/ SBD**/Policy/ Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004.
	Technical (if applicable)	Financial (if applicable)	Total (out of 100)		
1) Asghar Khan	60	20	80	2,500,000	Top scoring firm in combined evaluation (PPRA Rule 36(b) (ix))
2) Rizwan Faiz Muhammad	58	17	75	30,00,000	2 <sup>nd</sup>
3) Adil Anwar	52	15	67	3,250,000	3 <sup>rd</sup>
4) Ali Asghar Khan	57	4	61	12,500,000	4 <sup>th</sup>
5) Aziz Ul Haque Nishter	54	2	56	22,000,000	5 <sup>th</sup>
6) Mohsin Kamal Awan	41	10	51	5,040,000	6 <sup>th</sup>
7) Amna Warsi	37 Dis-qualified	Financial Proposal not opened			PPRA Rule 36(b) (v)
8) Azm Ali	26.4 Dis-qualified	Financial Proposal not opened			PPRA Rule 36(b) (v)



# EVALUATION REPORT

## (As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

Name of Bidder	Marks			Evaluated Cost (EC)* (PKR)	Rule/Regulation/ SBD**/Policy/ Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004.
	Technical (if applicable)	Financial (if applicable)	Total (out of 100)		
9) Asim Nazir	20 Dis-qualified	Financial Proposal not opened			PPRA Rule 36(b) (v)
10) Asad Abbas Butt	5.4 Dis-qualified	Financial Proposal not opened			PPRA Rule 36(b) (v)

*\*EC is the Evaluated Cost used for evaluation purpose and includes only the cost of competitive component (i.e. Remuneration and Direct Non-Salary Cost) and is exclusive of Provisional Sum, Contingency and Indirect Taxes.*

**Top Ranked Bidder: Mr. Asghar Khan**

11. **Any other additional/supporting information, the procuring agency may like to share:** The Procurement was carried out in line with PPRA Rules & Regulations. The bidding was done on QCBS method with 80:20 Technical to Financial Proposals ratio. The Contract is being awarded to Mr. Asgahr Khan at evaluated financial proposal of Pak. Rs. 2,900,000/-.

Signature:   
**General Manager (P&CA)**  
**National Highway Authority**  
**Islamabad**

Official Stamp: .....

**\*\*Standard Bidding Documents (SBD).**



# National Highway Authority



**Annex-I**

**Criteria**

*FOR*

**Bid Evaluation**

**Consultancy Services for Hiring of Individual  
Legal Consultants for PPP projects  
(Kharian –Rawalpindi Motorway)**

**May, 2022**

Say No to Corruption

5.1	Address for Opening of Proposals: <b>NHA Auditorium,</b> National Highway Authority, HQ. Office – NHA, 27, Mauve Area, G-9/1, Islamabad																									
5.3	<p><b>Technical Evaluation</b></p> <p>Technical proposals will be evaluated in accordance with the following Technical Evaluation Criteria:</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Sr#</th> <th>Assessment Criteria</th> <th>Maximum Points</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>1</td> <td>Academic qualifications (LLM/ Bar at Law)</td> <td>10</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2</td> <td>Experience in corporate advisory. 1 point for every year of relevant experience in corporate advisory will be awarded to a candidate, above minimum 10 years of experience with a maximum of 5 points for 15 years of cumulative relevant corporate advisory experience.</td> <td>5</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3</td> <td>Transactional experience of advising in engineering infrastructure projects/contracts with a transaction value of PKR 10 Billion or more. (i) 10 Points will be awarded for 1 such project/contract, (ii) 20 Points for 2 such projects/contracts, (iii) 25 points for 3 or more such projects/contracts</td> <td>25</td> </tr> <tr> <td>4</td> <td>Transactional experience of negotiating road infrastructure concessions in Public Private Partnership mode on behalf of Public Sector Enterprises of a transaction value over PKR 10 Billion. (i) 10 Points will be awarded for 1 such concession, (ii) 20 Points for 2 such concessions, (iii) 25 points for 3 or more such concessions</td> <td>25</td> </tr> <tr> <td>5</td> <td>Repute and competency recognized by international legal directory or ranking agency such as Legal 500, Chambers &amp; Partners, or equivalent: (i) 5 points will be awarded for at least one listing/ranking in past 3 years. (ii) 10 points will be awarded for current listing/ranking (in addition to at least one previous listing in last 3 years).</td> <td>10</td> </tr> <tr> <td>6</td> <td>Interview with the evaluation committee</td> <td>25</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="2" style="text-align: right;"><b>Total:</b></td> <td><b>100</b></td> </tr> </tbody> </table>		Sr#	Assessment Criteria	Maximum Points	1	Academic qualifications (LLM/ Bar at Law)	10	2	Experience in corporate advisory. 1 point for every year of relevant experience in corporate advisory will be awarded to a candidate, above minimum 10 years of experience with a maximum of 5 points for 15 years of cumulative relevant corporate advisory experience.	5	3	Transactional experience of advising in engineering infrastructure projects/contracts with a transaction value of PKR 10 Billion or more. (i) 10 Points will be awarded for 1 such project/contract, (ii) 20 Points for 2 such projects/contracts, (iii) 25 points for 3 or more such projects/contracts	25	4	Transactional experience of negotiating road infrastructure concessions in Public Private Partnership mode on behalf of Public Sector Enterprises of a transaction value over PKR 10 Billion. (i) 10 Points will be awarded for 1 such concession, (ii) 20 Points for 2 such concessions, (iii) 25 points for 3 or more such concessions	25	5	Repute and competency recognized by international legal directory or ranking agency such as Legal 500, Chambers & Partners, or equivalent: (i) 5 points will be awarded for at least one listing/ranking in past 3 years. (ii) 10 points will be awarded for current listing/ranking (in addition to at least one previous listing in last 3 years).	10	6	Interview with the evaluation committee	25	<b>Total:</b>		<b>100</b>
Sr#	Assessment Criteria	Maximum Points																								
1	Academic qualifications (LLM/ Bar at Law)	10																								
2	Experience in corporate advisory. 1 point for every year of relevant experience in corporate advisory will be awarded to a candidate, above minimum 10 years of experience with a maximum of 5 points for 15 years of cumulative relevant corporate advisory experience.	5																								
3	Transactional experience of advising in engineering infrastructure projects/contracts with a transaction value of PKR 10 Billion or more. (i) 10 Points will be awarded for 1 such project/contract, (ii) 20 Points for 2 such projects/contracts, (iii) 25 points for 3 or more such projects/contracts	25																								
4	Transactional experience of negotiating road infrastructure concessions in Public Private Partnership mode on behalf of Public Sector Enterprises of a transaction value over PKR 10 Billion. (i) 10 Points will be awarded for 1 such concession, (ii) 20 Points for 2 such concessions, (iii) 25 points for 3 or more such concessions	25																								
5	Repute and competency recognized by international legal directory or ranking agency such as Legal 500, Chambers & Partners, or equivalent: (i) 5 points will be awarded for at least one listing/ranking in past 3 years. (ii) 10 points will be awarded for current listing/ranking (in addition to at least one previous listing in last 3 years).	10																								
6	Interview with the evaluation committee	25																								
<b>Total:</b>		<b>100</b>																								
5.6	<p><b>Financial Evaluation</b></p> <p>The fee for providing legal consultancy services shall be quoted inclusive of all applicable taxes in Pakistan in Form A-4.</p> <p>The formula for determining the Financial Score is the following:  <math>Sf = 100 \times Fm / F</math>            Where, Sf is the Financial Score; Fm is the Lowest Price and F the Price of the Proposal under consideration.</p> <p>The Financial Proposal is the total competitive cost against the desired services quoted by the Applicant in the table under Form A-4.</p>																									