

NATIONAL HIGHWAY AUTHORITY

Procurement & Contract Administration Section 28-Mauve Area, G-9/1, Islamabad Tel: 9032727, Fax: 9260419

No. 6(627)/GM/(P&CA)/NHA/2024//76

Islamabad, April, 2024

DIRECTOR GENERAL

PUBLIC PROCUREMENT REGULATORY AUTHORITY 1st Floor FBC Building near State Bank, Sector G-5/2, **Islamabad**.

Reference: PPRA Rule-35

Find enclosed herewith the Technical Evaluation Report along with Evaluation Criteria (Annex-I) for the subject Services in line with PPRA Rule-35 for uploading on PPRA website at the earliest, please.

(FAYYAZ AH)

General Manager (P&CA)

Distribution:

Encl: Evaluation Report along with Annex- I

Copy to:

- Member (Planning), NHA, Islamabad;
- Dy. Director (P&CA), NHA, Islamabad.



SUBJECT: ANNOUNCEMENT OF TECHNICAL EVALUATION REPORT (PPRA RULE-35): CONSULTANCY SERVICES FOR DESIGN REVIEW & CONSTRUCTION SUPERVISION OF INTERCHANGE ON HAZARA MOTORWAY TO CONNECT ABBOTTABAD & SHERWAN ROAD RIGHT AFTER FIRST TUNNEL (SHMILA HILL TUNNEL) BESIDES SHERWAN ROAD.



EVALUATION REPORT (As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

1.	Name of Procuring Agency:	National Highway Authority					
2.	Method of Procurement:	Single Stage Two Envelope Procedure					
3.	Title of Procurement:	Consultancy Services for Design Review & Construction Supervision of Interchange on Hazara Motorway to Connect Abbottabad & Sherwan Road Right after First Tunnel (Shmila Hill Tunnel) besides sherwan road					
4.	Tender Inquiry No.:	6(627)					
5.	PPRA Ref. No. (TSE):	TS532073E					
6.	Date & Time of Bid Closing:	6th March, 2024 at 1130 hours local time					
7.	Date & Time of Bid Opening:	6 th March, 2024 at 1200 hours local time					
8.	No of Bids Received:	Ten (10) Proposals were received					
9.	Criteria for Bid Evaluation:	Criteria of Bid Evaluation is attached at Annex-I					
10.	Details of Bid(s) Evaluation:	As below					

Name of Bidder	Technical Score (out of 1000)	Rule/Regulation/ SBD**/Policy/ Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004.
1) M/s Associated Consultancy Centre (Pvt.) Ltd. in JV with M/s BK Consultants (Pvt.) Ltd. and in association with M/s Tareek Consulting Engineers (SMC-Pvt.) Ltd. (Sub-Consultant)	800	Technically Qualified
 M/s NESPAK (Pvt.) Ltd. in association with M/s Bosphorus Engineering (Pvt.) Ltd. (Sub-Consultant) 	778	Technically Qualified
 M/s Indus Associated Consultants (Pvt.) Ltd. in JV M/s Engineering Consultancy Services (Punjab) (Pvt.) Ltd., M/s Effective Engineering Expertise (Pvt.) Ltd. and in association with M/s Karakoram Engineers (Sub-Consultant) 	767	Technically Qualified

Consultancy Services for Design Review & Construction Supervision of Interchange on Hazara Motorway to Connect Abbottabad & Sherwan Road Right after First Tunnel (Shmila Hill Tunnel) besides sherwan road Page 1 of 3



EVALUATION REPORT (As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

	Name of Bidder	Technical Score (out of 1000)	Rule/Regulation/ SBD**/Policy/ Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004.			
Eng (CE Adv and M/s Ass	PAVRON in JV with M/s Civil ineering & Consultants CON), M/s Pakistan Railways isory Consultants (PRACS) in association with Engineering & Technical ociates (ETA) o-Consultant)	746	Technically Qualified			
asso	PEAS Consulting (Pvt.) Ltd. in ociation with M/s En Em ociates (Sub-Consultant)	735	Technically Qualified			
asso Con	Associated Consulting ineering (ACE) Ltd. and in ociation with M/s Hadi Engg sultants, Lahore o-Consultant)	731	Technically Qualified			
Cor Eng M/s Ser M/s	Prime Engineering & Testing sultants in JV with M/s Finite ineering (Pvt.) Ltd. Engineering & Management vices and in association with Z-Tech Engineering Solutions. -Consultant)	722	Technically Qualified			
Infra Ser with	CAMEOS in JV with National astructure Engineering vices (NIES) and in association M/s The Group of Engineers o-Consultant)	658	Technically Dis-Qualified (Less than 70%)			
Cor Eng ass	Development Management isultants in JV with M/s Global ineering System & in ociation with M/s Roghani ociates (Sub-Consultant)	Non-Responsive As per Clause 20.1 (I)- (iv) & (III) of Data She of RFP				
Asif	AA Associates in JV with M/s Ali Associates (Pvt.) Ltd. and in ociation with M/s Techno		on-Responsive 1 (I)- (i) of Data Sheet of RFP			

Consultancy Services for Design Review & Construction Supervision of Interchange on Hazara Motorway to Connect Abbottabad & Sherwan Road Right after First Tunnel (Shmila Hill Tunnel) besides sherwan road Page 2 of 3



Name of Bidder	Technical Score (out of 1000)	Rule/Regulation/ SBD**/Policy/ Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004.
Engineering Services- Peshawar (Sub-Consultant)		

11. Any other additional/supporting information, the procuring agency may like to share: The Procurement is being carried out in line with PPRA Rules & Regulations using the QCBS method with 80:20 Technical to Financial Proposals ratio.

1

Signature

General Manager (P&CA) Official Stamp: National Highway Authority **Standard Bidding Documents (SBD).



Consultancy Services for Design Review & Construction Supervision of Interchange on Hazara Motorway to Connect Abbottabad & Sherwan Road Right after First Tunnel (Shmila Hill Tunnel) besides sherwan road Page 3 of 3

National Highway Authority



Annex-I

Criteria

FOR

Technical Evaluation

Consultancy Services for Design Review & Construction Supervision of Interchange on Hazara Motorway to Connect Abbottabad & Sherwan Road Right After First Tunnel (Shmila Hill Tunnel) Besides Sherwan Road

April, 2024

X KINO

Annex-I to Data Sheet

SUMMARY EVALUATION SHEET FOR FULL TECHNICAL PROPOSALS (FTP)

, nta mananatana un segui s	Max.	* Firr	n 1	Fim	n 2
EVALUATION CRITERIA	Weightage	Rating	Score [*]	Rating	Scor
I. Firms Experience	100				
1-a. General Experience in road Transport Sector	25				
1-b. Specific Experience related to particular Assignment	75				
2. Approach and Methodology	250				
2-a. Appreciation of the Project	70				
(i) Evidence of Site Visit with Photographs giving a clear understanding/ proof of the project site	(30)				
(ii) Clarity of appreciation	(20)				
(iii) Comprehensiveness of appreciation	(20)				
2-b. Problem Statement/ understanding of objectives	50				
(i) Identification of Problems/ Objectives	(30)				
(ii) Components of Proposed Services	(20)				
2-c. Methodology	80				
(i) Proposed Solutions for this Project	(30)				
(ii) Quality of Methodology	(20)				ľ.
(iii) Conciseness, clarity and completeness of proposal	(30)				
2-d. Suggested Changes for Improvement in TOR	10				
2-e. Work Program	20				
2-f. Staffing Schedule	20				
3. Key Personnel	450				
Firm affidavit for presence of personnel	25			1.1.1.1	
a- Design Review (Key-Staff)	70				
i. Team Leader/ Highway Engineer	70				
b- Construction Supervision (Key-Staff)	355				
i. Resident Engineer '	110				
ii. Material Engineer	100)	1
iii. ARE (Structures)	85				
iv. Quantity Surveyor	60				
4. Performance Certification from clients	75				
Affidavit on stamp paper duly attested by the Oath Commissioner regarding non-blacklisting	25				
5. Present Commitments (current engagement and available strength – justification)	50				
6. Transfer of Knowledge (Methodology/ Plans)	50				
6. Transfer of Knowledge (Methodology/ Plans)			-		

Excellent - 100% Very Good - 90-99% Above Average – 80-89% Average – 70-79% Below Average – 1-69% Non-complying – 0% Score: Maximum Weightage x rating / 100. Minimum qualifying score is 70% or 700 marks.

Consultancy Services for Design Review & Construction Supervision of Interchange on Hazara Motorway to connect Abboatabad & Sherwan road right after first tunnel (Shimla Hill Tunnel) besides Sherwan road 34

Section II. Proposal Data Sheet

POSITION / AREA OF EXPERTISE	Name	Academic and General Qualification* Weightage 30%		Project related Experience Weightage 60% for [Design Review] and 65% for [Construction Supervision]		Status with the Firm** 10% for [Design Review] and 05% for [Construction Supervision]		OVERALL RATING (Sum of Weighted Ratings)	
(Show all experts to be evaluated)		Percentage Rating	Weighted Rating (A)	Percentage Rating	Weighted Rating (B)	Percentage Rating	Weighted Rating (C)	(A+B+C)	
Design Review Team									
i. Team Leader /Highway Engineer									
Construction Supervision (Key-Staff)			21						
i. Resident Engineer								-	
ii. Material Engineer									
iii. ARE (Structures)			Y						
iv. Quantity Surveyor									

PERSONNEL EVALUATION SHEET

Rating: - Excellent - 100% Very good - 90-99% Above Average - 80-89% Average - 70-79% Below Average - 1-69% Non-complying - 0%

Score: Maximum Weightage X rating / 100.

- * For Qualification and Experience of above Key Personnel, refer to TOR Chapter 5, Clause -5.6 (Qualification and Experience Requirement of Personnel).
- ** 6 month's older employee 100%;

The key professional staff whose duration with the firm is less than six (06) months/ available for the assignment/ associates/ part time available for the assignment in such case status with the firm's marks shall not be allocated.

