



TECHNICAL EVALUATION REPORT
(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

1. Name of Procuring Agency: **Karachi Port Trust**
2. Method of Procurement: PPRA Rule 36 (b) SSTE (Single Stage Two Envelops)
3. Title of Procurement: **REHABILITATION OF ROAD AT M.I YARD WEST WHARF**
4. Tender Inquiry No.: No. E/N-2(128)/
5. PPRA Ref. No. (TSE): TS528345E
6. Date & Time of Bid Closing: 11-01-2024 at 1100 Hrs.
7. Date & Time of Bid Opening: 11-01-2024 at 1130 Hrs.
8. No of Bids Received: 07 Nos.
9. Criteria for Bid Evaluation: As per TOR
10. Details of Bid(s) Evaluation: Given Below

S. No.	Name of Bidder	Technical Marks (if applicable)	Rule/Regulation/SBD/ Policy/ Basis for Technical Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules,
1.	M/s. Muhammad Shamsheer Khan & Co	93.46	Qualified
2.	M/s. Deen Muhammad	92.69	Qualified
3.	M/s. NKC	92.31	Qualified
4.	M/s. Muhammad Siddique & Brothers	86.15	Qualified
5.	M/s. Origin Enterprises	Not fulfilled criteria as per Bidding Documents	Not Qualified
6.	M/s. Shaikhibaz Khan & Brothers		Not Qualified
7.	M/s. Mehran Shah & J.V		Not Qualified

11. **NIL**

Signature:

Official Stamp: 
EXECUTIVE ENGINEER (NORTH)
KARACHI PORT TRUST

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE DEPARTMENTAL TENDER COMMITTEE HELD ON 23-02-2024 IN THE COMMITTEE ROOM OF THE ENGINEERING DEPARTMENT, KPT.

NAME OF WORK:- REHABILITATION OF ROAD AT M.I YARD WEST WHARF

1. West Wharf holds an important role in the smooth execution of Port operations, with the passage of time the existing road ways at West Wharf have been deteriorated hence causing inconvenience to the heavy vehicles carrying valuable cargo in the Port Areas. The current state of the roads in and around the Port has become a cause for concern. The deteriorated condition of road and potholes, cracks and uneven surface poses a significant risk to both for the vehicles and the pedestrians, the rough road conditions can also lead to increase wear & tear of vehicles affecting transportation efficiency and safety
2. The Traffic Manager vide his letter placed at S.No.1, has also requested to attend the subject work in order to provide smooth vehicular movement. Secretary KPT and Manager Port Safety vide their letters placed at S.No. 2 & 3 respectively have also directed to take up the same on priority. Accordingly, to resolve the issue AXEN (MIY), after carrying out site survey in consultation with user department have prepared an estimate amounting to Rs.338,710,511.00 alongwith plan placed at S.No.4/A & 4/B respectively to attend the work throughout sources as the same is beyond the scope of KPT's In-house arrangement.
3. It is pertinent to mention here that, after transfer of East Wharf to KGTCL, all the major activities of Port Operation of KPT diverted to West Wharf and most of the cargo handling on minimum considerable time span is required to be taken-up through West Wharf, for which the smooth Movement of Cargo Vehicles may cater for through out the area..
4. Accordingly, the tenders were invited through Press on 20-12-2023 and KPT / PPRA & MoMA Websites on 20-12-2023 and received on 11-01-2024 in accordance under Rule 36 (b) of PPRA.
5. In response, the following Seven Firms have submitted their sealed Technical / Financial Proposals.

S.No.	Name of Firms
1.	M/s. Origin Enterprises
2.	M/s. Muhammad Shamsheer Khan & Co
3.	M/s. Muhammad Siddique & Brothers
4.	M/s. Deen Muhammad
5.	M/s. Shaikhibaz Khan & Brothers
6.	M/s. NKC
7.	M/s. Mehran Shah & J.V

6. Technical Proposals for the above Seven firms were opened on same day in presence of the Committee Members or their representative.

7. After the opening of Technical Proposals, an In-house Committee comprising on the following members was constituted by the Chief Engineer KPT vide letter at S.No.15, to examine the received Technical Bid as per criteria and submit their Technical Evaluation Report as per the practice in vogue.

1.	Engr. Syed Jamil Akhtar	Dy. Chief Engineer-III	Convener
2.	Engr. M. Waqar Azeem	Executive Engineer (N)	Member
3.	Engr. Salman Basheer	Executive Engineer (P.W)	Member
4.	Engr. Muhammad Khan	Asst. Executive Engineer (W)	Member
5.	Mr. Waqas Ali Memon Rep. of Finance Division	Finance Officer	Member

8. The Technical Evaluation Criteria of the bidders as mentioned in the Advertisement / Tender Documents is as under:

- a. Duly licensed by the Pakistan Engineering Council (PEC) category C-3 and above with specialized code CE-01, CE-10 & CE-11 above valid on the date of opening of Tender.
- b. Copy of latest Valid NTN, SRB Certificates.
- c. Online Tax verification (fresh copy of ATL).
- d. Company Profile.
- e. Copy of Valid PEC Registration Certificate.
- f. Affidavit, that the firm is not defaulter in Income tax department nor blacklisted by any Organization.
- g. Provision of Audited Financial Statement for last 03Years showing minimum turnover of Rs. 500 Million. (As also specified in the S.No.PP-9).
- h. Relevant work experience (as laid down in Bidding Documents).
- i. All submission will be duly signed & stamped by the Bidder.

9. After due diligence, the Committee submitted its detail report as (placed at S.No.17) for reference. As per the Technical Evaluation Report of In-house Committee, The following four Bidders have been considered qualified in accordance with the given criteria:

S. No.	Name of Firms
1.	M/s. Muhammad Shamsheer Khan & Co
2.	M/s. Muhammad Siddique & Brothers
3.	M/s. Deen Muhammad
4.	M/s. NKC

RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE IN-HOUSE COMMITTEE:

It is pertinent to mention here that, to keep the Roads at West Wharf Operational and to prevent from further deterioration the rehabilitation of overall Road is the dire need for the smooth and hurdle free movement of heavy vehicles. Hence, the Technical Evaluation Committee after due diligence has recommended the following Bidders who stood Technically Qualified, after the due scrutiny of the received Technical Bids, details mentioned as under:

S. NO	NAME OF QUALIFIED FIRMS	OBTAINED MARKS IN TERMS OF PERCENTAGE	REMARKS
1.	M/s. Muhammad Shamsher Khan & Co	93.46	Qualified >
2.	M/s. Muhammad Siddique & Brothers	86.15	Qualified
3.	M/s. Deen Muhammad	92.69	Qualified
4.	M/s. NKC	92.31	Qualified

ENGR. M. WAQAR AZEEM
EXECUTIVE ENGINEER (N)
(MEMBER)

ENGR. SALMAN BASHEER
EXECUTIVE ENGINEER (PW)
(MEMBER)

ENGR. MUHAMMAD KHAN
ASST. EXECUTIVE ENGINEER (W)
MEMBER

ALI WAQAS MAMUN
FINANCE OFFICER
(MEMBER)

ENGR. SYED JAMIL AKHTAR
DY. CHIEF ENGINEER-III
(CONVENER)

The Evaluation Committee takes the entire responsibility of
Technical Grading of bids for submission.

RECOMMENDATIONS OF DEPARTMENTAL TENDER COMMITTEE:

10. The Departmental Tender Committee (DTC) considered the Evaluation Report carried by the In-house Committee and recommends to open the Financial Proposals of the following Technically Qualified firms:

S. No.	Name of Firms
1.	M/s. Muhammad Shamsheer Khan & Co.
2.	M/s. Muhammad Siddique & Brothers
3.	M/s. Deen Muhammad
4.	M/s. NKC



GENERAL MANAGER (O)
(MEMBER)



GENERAL MANAGER (E)
(MEMBER)



GENERAL MANAGER (P&D)
(MEMBER)



GENERAL MANAGER (F)
(MEMBER)



PORT INTELLIGENCE OFFICER
(MEMBER)



GENERAL MANAGER (CW)
(CONVENOR)

S.No. 17

TECHNICAL EVALUATION REPORT

REHABILITATION OF ROAD AT M.I. YARD WEST WHARF

S.No.	Name of Firm	Mandatory Requirements				Experience			Personnel				Financial Criteria			Status	
		Valid NTN	Valid SRB	Non-Defaulter Affidavit	Registration with PEC	Audited Financial Statement for last 03 years showing a minimum turnover of Rs. 500 M.	General Experience: a. Length of Experience from Establishment of the firm b. Completion of Three similar projects 3x of works not less than Rs. 450 (M) and above will score 10points. 01 Ongoing work not less than Rs. 400 (M) will score 05 points	Project related experience: a. Satisfactory supervision of Three sizeable projects by the firm, during last 10 years shall score 10points. Each additional project shall score 1 point. b. Scheme of Execution c. Methodology	No Litigation	PM & RE	SITE ENGINEER R 02 Nos	SITE SUPERVISOR 02 Nos	(Minimum Rs. 500 M turnover during last 03 years, which may be derived from Audited Financial Statement or FBR Returns as per status of concerned Bidder.)	Current Ratio	Total out of 130		%age Score out of 100
1	M/s Origin Enterprises	yes	yes	yes	yes			Missing essential requirement of CE-11 Code. Hence Not Evaluated									Fail
2	M/s. Muhammad Shamsheer Khan & Co.	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	29	26.5	yes	20	8	8	20	10	121.50	93.46	Pass
3	M/s. Muhammad Siddique & Brothers	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	24	24	yes	20	7	7	20	10	112.00	86.15	Pass
4	M/s. Deen Muhammad	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	29	24.5	yes	20	9	8	20	10	120.50	92.69	Pass
5	M/s. Shaikhbaz Khan & Brothers	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	22.5	20.25	yes	10	3.5	7	20	10	93.25	71.73	Fail in Project related Experience and Personnel Experience
6	M/s. NKC.	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	30	26	yes	20	7	7	20	10	120.00	92.31	Pass
7	M/s. Mehran Shah & Brothers																Fail

Submitted Bid in IV which is not allowed. Hence Not Evaluated.

Engr. Waqar Azeem
EXECUTIVE ENGINEER (N)
(Member)

Engr. Saiman Bashir
EXECUTIVE ENGINEER (PW)
(Member)

Engr. Muhammad Khan
ASST EXECUTIVE ENGINEER (W)
(Member)

Mr. Ali Waqas Memon
FINANCE OFFICER
(Member)

Engr. Syed Jamil Akhtar
DY. CHIEF ENGINEER-III
(CONVENOR)