FINAL EVALUATION REPORT

(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

1. Name of Procuring Agency State Bank of Pakistan

Method of Procurement Least Cost Selection Method under Regulation 3(C) of Procurement of

Consultancy Services Regulations, 2010

Title of Procurement Procurement of Tax Consultancy Services for the State Bank of Pakistan

4. RFP Inquiry No. RFP No. GSD (Proc. II) /Finance-Tax Consultancy Services/73255/ 2022

5. PPRA Ref. No. (TSE) TS498169E

6. Date & Time of Bid Closing 30-12-2022 - 11:00 AM

7. Date & Time of Bid Opening 30-12-2022 - 11:30 AM

8. No. of Bids Received Four (04)

9. Criteria for Bid Evaluation Compliance & Score Based

10. Details of Bid(s) Evaluation

	Name of Consultant	Technical Status*	Weighted Average Rates**	Status
1.	M/s RSM Avais Hyder Liaquat Nauman, Chartered Accountants	Responsive & Compliant (41/55)	1.88	Most Advantageous
2.	M/s Grant Thornton Anjum Rahman	Responsive & Compliant (49/55)	4.00	
3.	M/s Junaidy Shoaib Asad, Chartered Accountants	Responsive & Compliant (39/55)	4.48	
4.	M/s A.F. Ferguson & Co.	Responsive & Compliant (55/55)	30.95	

^{*}Minimum Passing Score is 20/55 subject to no zero in any qualification parameter.

M/s RSM Avais Hyder Liaquat Nauman, Chartered Accountants 11. Most Advantageous Consultant:

12. Any other additional / supporting information the procuring agency may like to share. NA

Signature:

Assistant Director
General Services Department
State Bank of Pakistan
SBBSC (Bank)...
H-ad Office, Karachi Official Stamp: ...

^{**}The basis for award of contract and detailed financial rates & calculations are given in Annexure A.

<u>Annexure A</u> Final Evaluation Report – Procurement of Tax Consultancy Services for the State Bank of Pakistan

A. Advice on the Income Tax Ordinance 2001 regarding deductions/ collections of tax at source viz-a-viz domestic and foreign payments and applicability of other provisions of ITO-2001, Advice on levy of Sales Tax on Goods procured & deduction/ collection of Sales Tax at source under Federal Sales Tax Laws from payments made to suppliers/service providers. Advice on the applicability of Sales Tax at source under Federal Sales Tax Laws from payments made to suppliers/service providers. Advice on the applicability of Sales Tax at source under provisions of Provincial Sales Tax on Services Acts, Federal Excise Duty on services acquired and rendered under provisions of Provincial Sales Tax on Services Acts, Federal Excise Act, 2005 and relevant rules - Obtain Tax Exemption Certificates of Residence from tax authorities for exempting receipts & payments from deduction of tax at source - Facilitation in compliance with rules regarding payment of taxes and submission of tax returns/ withholding statements/ returns to the tax authorities. - Assisting, representing and preparing responses/ appeals for presenting before tax authorities in response to notices, orders, demands, etc., issued or raised by tax authorities.	1. M/s RSM Avais Hyder Liaquat Nauman, Chartered Accountants								
A. deductions / collections of tax at source viz-a-viz domestic and foreign payments and applicability of other provisions of ITO-2001, Advice on levy of Sales Tax on Goods procured & deduction / collection of Sales Tax at source under Federal Sales Tax Laws from payments made to suppliers/service providers. Advice on the applicability of Sales Taxes & Federal Excise Duty on services acquired and rendered under provisions of Provincial Sales Tax on Services Acts, Federal Excise Act, 2005 and relevant rules - Obtain Tax Exemption Certificates / Certificates of Residence from tax authorities for exempting receipts & payments from deduction of tax at source - Facilitation in compliance with rules regarding payment of taxes and submission of tax returns/ withholding statements/ returns to the tax authorities. - Assisting, representing and preparing responses/ appeals for presenting before tax authorities in response to notices, orders, demands, etc., issued or raised by tax authorities.	Category	Deliverable/Description				Fee (Rs.) (Excluding Services	Category Weighted	Category Weighted Rate	
A. deductions/ collections of tax at source viz-a-viz domestic and foreign payments and applicability of other provisions of ITO-2001, Advice on levy of Sales Tax on Goods procured & deduction/ collection of Sales Tax at source under Federal Sales Tax Laws from payments made to suppliers/service providers. Advice on the applicability of Sales Tax as source under Federal Sales Tax Laws from payments made to suppliers/service providers. Advice on the applicability of Sales Taxes & Federal Excise Duty on services acquired and rendered under provisions of Provincial Sales Tax on Services Acts, Federal Excise Act, 2005 and relevant rules - Obtain Tax Exemption Certificates / Certificates of Residence from tax authorities for exempting receipts & payments from deduction of tax at source - Facilitation in compliance with rules regarding payment of taxes and submission of tax returns/ withholding statements/ returns to the tax authorities. - Assisting, representing and preparing responses/ appeals for presenting before tax authorities in response to notices, orders, demands, etc., issued or raised by tax authorities.		Advice on the Income Tax Ordinance 2001 regarding	Low	w1 = 10%	1	7,000	700		
domestic and foreign payments and applicability of other provisions of ITO-2001, Advice on levy of Sales Tax on Goods procured & deduction/ collection of Sales Tax at source under Federal Sales Tax Laws from payments made to suppliers/service providers. Advice on the applicability of Sales Taxe & Federal Excise Duty on services acquired and rendered under provisions of Provincial Sales Tax on Services Acts, Federal Excise Act, 2005 and relevant rules - Obtain Tax Exemption Certificates / Certificates of Residence from tax authorities for exempting receipts & payments from deduction of tax at source - Facilitation in compliance with rules regarding payment of taxes and submission of tax returns/ withholding statements/ returns to the tax authorities. - Assisting, representing and preparing responses/ appeals for presenting before tax authorities in response to notices, orders, demands, etc., issued or raised by tax authorities.	Λ		Moderate	w2 = 30%	MA - 4006	10,000	3,000	127	
B. deduction / collection of Sales Tax at source under Federal Sales Tax Laws from payments made to suppliers/service providers. Advice on the applicability of Sales Taxes & Federal Excise Duty on services acquired and rendered under provisions of Provincial Sales Tax on Services Acts, Federal Excise Act, 2005 and relevant rules - Obtain Tax Exemption Certificates / Certificates of Residence from tax authorities for exempting receipts & payments from deduction of tax at source - Facilitation in compliance with rules regarding payment of taxes and submission of tax returns/ withholding statements/ returns to the tax authorities Assisting, representing and preparing responses/ appeals for presenting before tax authorities in response to notices, orders, demands, etc., issued or raised by tax authorities. Moderate w2 = 30% High W3 = 60% Moderate w2 = 30% WC=35% High W3 = 60% To,000 3,000 WC=35% WC=35% Moderate w2 = 30% WC=35% To,000 500 To,000 6,000 Moderate w2 = 30% WC=35% High W3 = 60% 10,000 3,000 To,000 2,100 Moderate w2 = 30% WC=35% High W3 = 60% Moderate w2 = 30% WC=35% To,000 2,100 To,000 3,000 To,000 14,000 To,000 14,000	A.	domestic and foreign payments and applicability of	High	W3 = 60%	VVA= 40%	15,000	9,000	127	
B. deduction/ collection of Sales Tax at source under Federal Sales Tax Laws from payments made to suppliers/service providers. Advice on the applicability of Sales Tax on Services Acts, Federal Excise Act, 2005 and relevant rules - Obtain Tax Exemption Certificates / Certificates of Residence from tax authorities for exempting receipts & payment of taxes and submission of tax at source - Facilitation in compliance with rules regarding payment of taxes and submission of tax returns/withholding statements/ returns to the tax authorities. - Assisting, representing and preparing responses/appeals for presenting before tax authorities in response to notices, orders, demands, etc., issued or raised by tax authorities. Moderate w2 = 30% High W3 = 60% Moderate w2 = 30% Figh W3 = 60% High W3 = 60% WC=35% 10,000 500 7,000 2,100 10,000 6,000 14,000 100,000 30,000 100,000 30,000 120,000 120,000			Low	w1 = 10%		7,000	700		
Federal Sales Tax Laws from payments made to suppliers/service providers. Advice on the applicability of Sales Taxes & Federal Excise Duty on services acquired and rendered under provisions of Provincial Sales Tax on Services Acts, Federal Excise Act, 2005 and relevant rules - Obtain Tax Exemption Certificates / Certificates of Residence from tax authorities for exempting receipts & payments from deduction of tax at source - Facilitation in compliance with rules regarding payment of taxes and submission of tax returns/withholding statements/ returns to the tax authorities Assisting, representing and preparing responses/appeals for presenting before tax authorities in response to notices, orders, demands, etc., issued or raised by tax authorities. High W3 = 60% Low W1 = 10% Moderate W2 = 30% Low W1 = 10% Moderate W2 = 30% Moderate W2 = 30% High W3 = 60% 15,000 500 7,000 2,100 10,000 6,000 140,000 30,000 100,000 30,000 120,000	D		Moderate	w2 = 30%	WD-2004	10,000	3,000	127	
C. Excise Duty on services acquired and rendered under provisions of Provincial Sales Tax on Services Acts, Federal Excise Act, 2005 and relevant rules - Obtain Tax Exemption Certificates / Certificates of Residence from tax authorities for exempting receipts & payments from deduction of tax at source - Facilitation in compliance with rules regarding payment of taxes and submission of tax returns/ withholding statements/ returns to the tax authorities. - Assisting, representing and preparing responses/ appeals for presenting before tax authorities in response to notices, orders, demands, etc., issued or raised by tax authorities. Moderate w2 = 30% High W3 = 60% Low w1 = 10% Moderate w2 = 30% 10,000 14,000 100,000 30,000 100,000 120,000 110,000 14,000 100,000 30,000 110,000 14,000 100,000 30,000 110,000 30,000	В.	Federal Sales Tax Laws from payments made to	High	W3 = 60%	WB=20%	15,000	9,000		
C. Excise Duty on services acquired and rendered under provisions of Provincial Sales Tax on Services Acts, Federal Excise Act, 2005 and relevant rules - Obtain Tax Exemption Certificates / Certificates of Residence from tax authorities for exempting receipts & payments from deduction of tax at source - Facilitation in compliance with rules regarding payment of taxes and submission of tax returns/ withholding statements/ returns to the tax authorities. - Assisting, representing and preparing responses/ appeals for presenting before tax authorities in response to notices, orders, demands, etc., issued or raised by tax authorities. Moderate w2 = 30% High W3 = 60% Moderate w2 = 30% Low w1 = 10% Moderate w2 = 30% 140,000 14,000 100,000 30,000 100,000 30,000 1100,000 120,000 120,000		Advice on the applicability of Sales Taxes & Federal	Low	w1 = 10%	MC 250/	5,000	500	86	
provisions of Provincial Sales Tax on Services Acts, Federal Excise Act, 2005 and relevant rules Obtain Tax Exemption Certificates / Certificates of Residence from tax authorities for exempting receipts & payments from deduction of tax at source Facilitation in compliance with rules regarding payment of taxes and submission of tax returns/ withholding statements/ returns to the tax authorities. Assisting, representing and preparing responses/ appeals for presenting before tax authorities in response to notices, orders, demands, etc., issued or raised by tax authorities. High W3 = 60% Low W1 = 10% Moderate W2 = 30% High W3 = 60% WD=5% WD=5% High W3 = 60% 10,000 14,000 100,000 30,000 120,000 120,000	C		Moderate	w2 = 30%		7,000	2,100		
Residence from tax authorities for exempting receipts & payments from deduction of tax at source - Facilitation in compliance with rules regarding payment of taxes and submission of tax returns/ withholding statements/ returns to the tax authorities. - Assisting, representing and preparing responses/ appeals for presenting before tax authorities in response to notices, orders, demands, etc., issued or raised by tax authorities. Moderate w2 = 30% High WD=5% WD=5% 1,6.	C.		High	W3 = 60%	WC=35%	10,000	6,000	00	
receipts & payments from deduction of tax at source Facilitation in compliance with rules regarding payment of taxes and submission of tax returns/ withholding statements/ returns to the tax authorities. High WD=5% WD=5% 1,64 200,000 120,000 120,000 120,000		- Obtain Tax Exemption Certificates / Certificates of	Low	w1 = 10%		140,000	14,000		
D. source - Facilitation in compliance with rules regarding payment of taxes and submission of tax returns/ withholding statements/ returns to the tax authorities Assisting, representing and preparing responses/ appeals for presenting before tax authorities in response to notices, orders, demands, etc., issued or raised by tax authorities. High W3 = 60% 1,64			Moderate	w2 = 30%		100,000	30,000		
	D.	 source Facilitation in compliance with rules regarding payment of taxes and submission of tax returns/ withholding statements/ returns to the tax authorities. Assisting, representing and preparing responses/ appeals for presenting before tax authorities in response to notices, orders, demands, etc., issued or 	High	W3 = 60%	WD=5%	200,000	120,000	1,640	
Combined (Unified Rate) 1.8			REAL PROPERTY.			Combined	(Unified Rate)	1.88	

Muhammad Irfari Assistan Director General Sevices Pakistan State Bahk of Pakistan State Bahk of Pakistan Hange 2.066

Annexure A Final Evaluation Report - Procurement of Tax Consultancy Services for the State Bank of Pakistan

2.	2. M/s Grant Thornton Anjum Rahman								
ory	Deliverable/Description	C l it	Weights		Consultancy	Sub-	Category		
Category		Complexity Level	Sub-category	Category	Fee (Rs.) (Excluding Services Sales Tax)	Category Weighted Rate	Weighted Rate		
	Advice on the Income Tax Ordinance 2001 regarding	Low	w1 = 10%		5,500	550			
A.	deductions/ collections of tax at source viz-a-viz	Moderate	w2 = 30%	WA= 40%	20,000	6,000	387		
A.	domestic and foreign payments and applicability of other provisions of ITO-2001,	High.	W3 = 60%	VVA- 40 /0	53,500	32,100	307		
	Advice on levy of Sales Tax on Goods procured &	Low	w1 = 10%		5,500	550			
В.	deduction/ collection of Sales Tax at source under Federal Sales Tax Laws from payments made to suppliers/service providers.	Moderate	w2 = 30%	WB=20%	22,500	6,750	394		
В.		High	W3 = 60%	VVD=20%	53,500	32,100			
	Advice on the applicability of Sales Taxes & Federal	Low	w1 = 10%	WC=35%	5,500	550	387		
	Excise Duty on services acquired and rendered under	Moderate	w2 = 30%		20,000	6,000			
	provisions of Provincial Sales Tax on Services Acts, Federal Excise Act, 2005 and relevant rules	High	W3 = 60%	WC-3370	53,500	32,100	307		
	- Obtain Tax Exemption Certificates / Certificates of	Low	w1 = 10%		35,000	3,500			
	Residence from tax authorities for exempting	Moderate	w2 = 30%		50,000	15,000			
D.	receipts & payments from deduction of tax at source - Facilitation in compliance with rules regarding payment of taxes and submission of tax returns/	High	High	High					
	withholding statements/ returns to the tax authorities Assisting, representing and preparing responses/				High	W3 = 60%	WD=5%	75,000	45,000
	appeals for presenting before tax authorities in response to notices, orders, demands, etc., issued or raised by tax authorities.						. dia		
					Combined	(Unified Rate)	4.00		



Annexure A Final Evaluation Report - Procurement of Tax Consultancy Services for the State Bank of Pakistan

	M/s Junaidy Shoaib Asad, Chartered Accountants		Weights			Sub-	
Category	Deliverable/Description	Complexity Level	Sub-category	Category	Consultancy Fee (Rs.) (Excluding Services Sales Tax)	Category Weighted Rate	Category Weighted Rate
	Advice on the Income Tax Ordinance 2001 regarding	Low	w1 = 10%		15,000	1,500	
A.	deductions/ collections of tax at source viz-a-viz	Moderate	w2 = 30%	WA= 40%	25,000	7,500	390
n.	domestic and foreign payments and applicability of other provisions of ITO-2001,	High	W3 = 60%	WA- 40 /0	50,000	30,000	390
	Advice on levy of Sales Tax on Goods procured &	Low	w1 = 10%		15,000	1,500	
B.	deduction/ collection of Sales Tax at source under	Moderate	w2 = 30%	WB=20%	25,000	7,500	390
Б.	Federal Sales Tax Laws from payments made to suppliers/service providers.	High	W3 = 60%	WB-2070	50,000	30,000	370
	Advice on the applicability of Sales Taxes & Federal	Low	w1 = 10%	WC=35%	15,000	1,500	390
C.	Excise Duty on services acquired and rendered under	Moderate	w2 = 30%		25,000	7,500	
G.	provisions of Provincial Sales Tax on Services Acts, Federal Excise Act, 2005 and relevant rules	High	W3 = 60%	WC-3370	50,000	30,000	370
	- Obtain Tax Exemption Certificates / Certificates of	Low	w1 = 10%		50,000	5,000	
	Residence from tax authorities for exempting	Moderate	w2 = 30%		100,000	30,000	
D.	 receipts & payments from deduction of tax at source Facilitation in compliance with rules regarding payment of taxes and submission of tax returns/ withholding statements/ returns to the tax authorities. Assisting, representing and preparing responses/ appeals for presenting before tax authorities in response to notices, orders, demands, etc., issued or raised by tax authorities. 	High	W3 = 60%	WD=5%	200,000	120,000	1,550
					Combined ((Unified Rate)	4.48

Muhammad Irfan

Muhammad Irfan

Assistant Director

Assistant Department

Assistant Appartment

Assistant Appartment

Assistant Appartment

Spp BSA Heart

Heart Appartment

Reart Appartment

Heart Appartment

A

Annexure A Final Evaluation Report - Procurement of Tax Consultancy Services for the State Bank of Pakistan

y			Weights		Consultancy	Sub-	
Category	Deliverable/Description	Complexity Level	Sub-category	Category	Fee (Rs.) (Excluding Services Sales Tax)	Category Weighted Rate	Category Weighted Rate
	Advice on the Income Tax Ordinance 2001 regarding	Low	w1 = 10%	DATE OF THE PARTY	141,250	14,125	
A.	deductions/ collections of tax at source viz-a-viz	Moderate	w2 = 30%	WA= 40%	226,000	67,800	2,514
A.	domestic and foreign payments and applicability of other provisions of ITO-2001,	High	W3 = 60%	WA- 4070	282,500	169,500	2,514
	Advice on levy of Sales Tax on Goods procured &	Low	w1 = 10%		141,250	14,125	2,514
В.	deduction/ collection of Sales Tax at source under Federal Sales Tax Laws from payments made to suppliers/service providers.	Moderate	w2 = 30%	WB=20%	226,000	67,800	
D.		High	W3 = 60%	VV D-2090	282,500	169,500	
	Advice on the applicability of Sales Taxes & Federal Excise Duty on services acquired and rendered under	Low	w1 = 10%		141,250	14,125	2,514
C		Moderate	w2 = 30%	WC=35%	226,000	67,800	
C.	provisions of Provincial Sales Tax on Services Acts, Federal Excise Act, 2005 and relevant rules	High	W3 = 60%	W C-33 70	282,500	169,500	2,314
	- Obtain Tax Exemption Certificates / Certificates of	Low	w1 = 10%		565,000	56,500	
	Residence from tax authorities for exempting	Moderate	w2 = 30%		1,130,000	339,000	
D.	 receipts & payments from deduction of tax at source Facilitation in compliance with rules regarding payment of taxes and submission of tax returns/ withholding statements/ returns to the tax authorities. Assisting, representing and preparing responses/ appeals for presenting before tax authorities in response to notices, orders, demands, etc., issued or raised by tax authorities. 	High	W3 = 60%	WD=5%	1,695,000	1,017,000	14,125
100	raisea by tax authorities.				Combined (Unified Rate)	30.95



Annexure A

Final Evaluation Report - Procurement of Tax Consultancy Services for the State Bank of Pakistan

Notes:

- ✓ Three tiers of Complexity have been defined based on the expected consultancy duration, i.e. **Low Complexity**: up to one hour of consultation time, **Moderate Complexity**: up to three hours of consultation time & **High Complexity**: more than three hours of consultation time.
- ✓ The contract shall be awarded to the most advantageous Consultant based on the lowest total amount / weighted average according to the formula below.

$$R_{C} = \frac{(R_{A} \times W_{A}) + (R_{B} \times W_{B}) + (R_{C} \times W_{C}) + (R_{D} \times W_{D})}{100}$$

Where,

$$R_A = \frac{(r_1 \times w_1) + (r_2 \times w_2) + (r_3 \times w_3)}{100} \mid R_B = \frac{(r_1 \times w_1) + (r_2 \times w_2) + (r_3 \times w_3)}{100}$$

$$R_C = \frac{(r_1 \times w_1) + (r_2 \times w_2) + (r_3 \times w_3)}{100} R_D = \frac{(r_1 \times w_1) + (r_2 \times w_2) + (r_3 \times w_3)}{100}$$

-	r1 = sub-category rate for Low Complexity Cases	-	w1 = sub-category weight for Low Complexity Cases
-	r2 = sub-category rate for Moderate Complexity Cases	-	w2 = sub-category weight for Moderate Complexity Cases
-	r3 = sub-category rate for High Complexity Cases	-	w3 = sub-category weight High Complexity Cases
-	RA = weighted average rate for category A	-	WA = Weight for Category A
-	RB = weighted average rate for category B	-	WB = Weight for Category B
-	RC = weighted average rate for category C	-	WC = Weight for Category C
-	RD = weighted average rate for category D	-	WD = Weight for Category D

- Rc = Combined (Unified) Weighted Average Rate

Muhammad Irfan Muhammad Irfan Assistant Director As