

EVALUATION REPORT
(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules-2004)

Name of Procuring Agency: National Bank of Pakistan
Method of Procurement: 3B(i)-Quality and Cost based selection of PCSR-2010

Title of Procurement: Expression of Interest (EOI)-Procurement of Consultancy Services for implementation of SBP's Compliance Risk Management Guidelines.

Tender Inquiry No.: NT-08/20/2021-1
PPRA Ref. No. TSE: TS458016E
Date & Time of EOI Submission: September 07, 2021 at 03:00 pm.
Date & Time of EOI Opening: September 07, 2021 at 03:30 pm.
January 14, 2022 at 03:00 pm. (Technical Bid Submission)
January 14, 2022 at 03:30 pm. (Technical Bid Opening)
February 16, 2022 at 03:30 pm. (Financial Bid Opening)

Number of Bids Received: Four (04)
Criteria for Bid Evaluation: Mentioned in the RFP/Bidding documents.
Details of Bid(s) Evaluation: As follows

Name of Bidder	Score			Total Score (Technical Score × 80% + Financial Score × 20%)	Total Bid Amount in (PKR)	Rule/Regulation/SBD*/Policy/Basis for Rejection/Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP, 2004
	Total Score	Technical Obtained Score	Financial Obtained Score			
M/s. KPMG Taseer Hadi & Co.	100	69.8	100	75.8	76,212,850/-	Most Advantageous bidder.
M/s. EY Ford Rhodes	100	77.8	53	72.8	143,811,594/-	-
M/s. A.F. Ferguson & Co.	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Proposal did not meet the specified requirement of published EOI.
M/s. RSM Avais Hyder Liaquat Nauman	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Proposal did not meet the specified requirement of published EOI.

Based on aggregate score as per criteria in the RFP **M/s. KPMG Taseer Hadi & Co.** declared as successful bidder.

11. Any other additional / supporting information, the procuring agency may like to share.
- Section-5- Evaluation Criteria

(Divisional Head)
Procurement Division
Logistics, Communications & Marketing Group
Head Office, NBP, Karachi.

Section-5

EVALUATION CRITERIA

- a. NBP's Cross Functional Team for CRM Project shall review and evaluate technical proposals on the basis of responsiveness to this RFP applying below mentioned evaluation criteria. Each technical proposal shall be given a score. A proposal shall be rendered nonresponsive at this stage if it substantially does not respond to requirements of this RFP, which also means that proposal failed to achieve minimum technical score. NBP will not make any changes in the evaluation criteria after all the proposals have been received.
- b. Financial proposals of the applicants, whose technical proposals are responsive, will only be opened for evaluation, comparison and determination of the successful applicant.
- c. The overall evaluation score will be based on combination of technical and financial score calculated on the basis of the following formula:
 - Technical Score = (Technical Score of Applicant / Max Score for Technical Proposal) x 100
 - Financial Score = (Lowest bid offered among all proposals qualified in technical proposal / bid offered by the applicant) x100
 - Total Score = Technical Score x 80% + Financial Score x 20%
- d. Technical Proposal will be evaluated on the following three primary factors.
 - Expertise of the Firm's offices from where the proposed team originates.
 - Proposed Methodology, Approach and Implementation Plan
 - Proposed Local Team

Technical Proposal Evaluation:

Ref.	Area	Score	Applicant Feedback (Yes/No)	Ref in RFP
A	Mandatory Requirements			
1	Applicant should have at least 10 partners.	Mandatory		
2	Applicant should be an audit firm in the list of practicing firms having satisfactory QCR rating prescribed by the Institute of Chartered Accountants of Pakistan and should be in the list of category 'A' in SBP Panel of Auditors. Copy of registration / enlistment certificate for ascertaining the legal entity status of the Consultant firm attested by the Partner/CEO/CFO should also be attached.	Mandatory		
3	Applicant should provide a copy of valid Income Tax Registration Certificate/ Valid General Sales Tax Registration and Active Tax Payer Certificate attested by the Partner/CEO/CFO. Copy of Valid Registration certificate in case of any other applicable taxes (if any) attested by the Partner/CEO/CFO should also be provided by the Applicants.	Mandatory		
4	Applicant should provide an undertaking on non-judicial stamp paper stating that "the firm is not blacklisted by any of Provincial or Federal Government Department, Agency or Autonomous body or Private Sector Organization anywhere in Pakistan".	Mandatory		
5	The Applicant must have net profit of above PKR 100 million each in last three (3) years (2018-20).	Mandatory		
B	Experience/ expertise of the Firm in:	20		
1	Compliance Risk Management experience (particularly compliance RCSA) with multinational banks or Top 10 Banks in Pakistan. (client's position to be assessed on the basis of total asset size as at December 31, 2019).	8		
2	BPR, Internal Controls, systems advisory and other related projects	5		
3	Conducting Operational Risk RCSA	7		
B	Approach / Methodology	40		
1	Coverage of RFP requirements	5		

Ref.	Area	Score	Applicant Feedback (Yes/No)	Ref in RFP
2	Depth and quality of approach, deliverables and prototypes	25		
3	Presentation on the proposal	10		
C	Proposed Local Team	40		
1	<p>Profile of the Team Lead</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Knowledge and experience of the team lead in compliance risk management in Pakistan (particularly in conducting Compliance risk assessment/RCSA) • Knowledge and experience of the team lead in banking sector in Pakistan, in related projects of governance, risk, compliance, BPR/ process improvement, internal control and system advisory • Knowledge and experience of the team lead in conducting Operational Risk RCSAs for banks in Pakistan 	10		
2	<p>Profile of the rest of the team</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Knowledge and experience of the team in compliance risk management in Pakistan (particularly in conducting Compliance risk assessment/RCSA) • Knowledge and experience of the team in banking sector in Pakistan, in related projects of governance, risk, compliance, BPR/ process improvement, internal control and system advisory • Knowledge and experience of the team in conducting Operational Risk RCSAs for banks in Pakistan 	15		
3	Knowledge and experience of the team in providing Functional System Consultancy for development of Compliance or Operational Risk Management system for a bank	15		
Total		100		

NOTE:

- a) For evaluation purpose, a desired response of only 'Yes' is required in the "Applicant's Response" column for all mandatory requirements (mentioned in Technical Requirements above). Any response in "No" for mandatory requirements shall result in immediate disqualification of bid.
- b) For all requirements against which Applicant is responding "Yes", applicant must specify the proper reference of the proposal in the "Applicant Response" column.
- c) During the evaluation period, NBP may ask/request for any other additional documentary evidence or explanation against any item that is submitted/ provided by the Applicant. Applicants should respond to such requests within the time frame indicated in the correspondence (letter/email/fax). If the Applicant fails to provide the required information within given timeframe or extended time frame if it is allowed by NBP then it will create a ground where its bid may be considered as rejected.
- d) Financial proposals of the applicants, whose technical proposals are responsive, will only be opened for opened for evaluation, comparison and determination of the successful applicant. Financial proposals of disqualified Applicants during technical evaluation stage will be returned un-opened.
- e) The Applicants are required to quote the prices in the format given in Section 8 "Financial Bid Format" of this RFP.
- f) A combined evaluation of technical and financial proposals shall follow and the applicant with the winning proposal (i.e. who will obtain the highest score in combined evaluation) will be accepted.
- g) Submission of verifiable documentary proof for all above requirements and criteria points are mandatory requirement and marks will be awarded on the basis of these verifiable proofs.