



GOVERNMENT OF PAKISTAN
OFFICE OF THE
PROJECT DIRECTOR
UP-GRADATION OF ROAD FROM RCC KONODAS BRIDGE
TO NALTAR AIRFORCE BASE CAMP VIA NOMAL (43.7 KM)

No. PD-NR/ Tech & Finc /2021-22/85

Dated: 16th February, 2022

To,



The Deputy Director,
PPRA, Islamabad.

SUB:

UPLOADING OF TECHNICAL & FINANCIAL EVALUATION REPORT
(MACHINERY FOR SLIDING/SNOW REMOVAL ON PPRA WEBSITE).

Please find enclosed herewith the **TECHNICAL & FINANCIAL EVALUATION REPORT** in respect of the PSDP project titled "UP-GRADATION OF ROAD FROM RCC BRIDGE KONODAS TO NALTER AIRFORCE BASE CAMP VIA NOMAL (43.7 KM)", (**Sub Head: Machinery for Sliding/ Snow Removal**) with the request to upload on PPRA website as per PPRA rule 35 as soon as, please.

(Engr. Abdul Hamid)
Project Director

FINAL EVALUATION REPORT

(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

1. Name of Procuring Agency: M/o Kashmir Affairs & Gilgit Baltistan through Project Director
2. Method of Procurement: Single Stage Two Envelope
3. Title of Procurement: Machinery for Sliding/Snow Removal for the Project Up-Gradation of Road From RCC Konodas Bridge to Nalter Air Force Base Camp Via Nomal
4. Tender Inquiry No. : PD-NR/SSRM/SSTE/2021-22
5. PPRA Ref. No. (TSE): TS465436E
6. Date & Time of Bid Closing: 16th December 2021, 11:30 AM
7. Date & Time of Bid Opening: 16th December 2021, 12:30 PM
8. No of Bids Received: 7 Nos
9. Criteria for Bid Evaluation: As per PEC Standard Procedure
10. Details of Bid(s) Evaluation: As attached

Name of Bidder	Marks		Evaluated Cost in PKR	Rule/Regulation/SBD*/Policy/ Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004.
	Technical (if applicable) obtained marks	Financial (If Applicable)		
M/S. Mohammad Yousuf & Sons (JV) M/S Orient Energy Systems Pvt.Ltd	64.86	N/A	278371014	4 th Lowest
M/S. Sultan Mahmood & Sons with Manufacturer's Authorization (XCMG)	74	N/A	525900000	5 th Lowest
M/S. MB Associates & Construction JV M/S. Progressive International	40.4	N/A	Nil	Fail in General Experience and After sale & Services during Evaluation of Technical Bid

M/S. Hussain Ali & Sons with HYUNDAI Authorized Distributer	75	N/A	87200000	2 nd Lowest
M/S. Irfan Brothers International Pvt. JV M/S. Rikans international	71	N/A	131200000	3 rd Lowest
M/S. Pearl Trade International	0	Nil	-	Not Submitted Original Company Profile as per Bid Documents Clause IB 23.1
M/S. Shaheen & Sons Gilgit	86	N/A	83592600	AS per PPRA Rule 38, Bid is accepted as 1 st Lowest being most Advantageous

Most Advantageous Bidder: M/S Shaheen & Sons Gilgit

11. Any other additional / supporting information, the procuring agency may like to share.

Signature:



Official Stamp

PROJECT DIRECTOR
Up-Gradation Road From RCC
Konodas Bridge To Nalter

***Standard Bidding Documents (SBD).**

Criteria for Pre-Qualification of Contractors /Suppliers

Project Name: Up-Gradation of road from RCC Bridge Konodas to Nalter Airforce Base Camp Via Nomal (43.7km) Gilgit

Sub Head : MACHINERY FOR SLIDING/SNOW REMOVAL

TOTAL Marks =100

Note: 50 % Mark is required in each category for pre qualification

S.No	Name of Contractor	General Experience (total 35 marks)					Personal Capabilities (total 15 marks)				After Sale Services (total 20 marks)			Financial Soundness (total 30 marks)						Total Marks Obtained	Qualified	Remarks									
		PEC (Category)	a) Supply of similar nature Machinery Completed in last Five years. Total marks= 15	b) Supply of similar nature Machinery In-hand during last Five years. Total Marks =10	c) General Experience of Supply Works Total Marks =05	d) Enlistment record with Government Organizations & other agencies Total Marks= 05	Marks obtained.	a) BSC Engineers Registered with PEC Total Marks=0 6	b) Finance and Business Management Staff Total Marks = 05	Technical /Skilled staffs for field technical support Total Marks= 04	Marks obtained.	Repair & maintenance/work shop facilities (to be determined through documentary proof) Total Marks= 10	Store and Availability of Spare Parts Total Marks = 10	Marks obtained.	a) Available Bank Credit line. Marks assigned=5	b) Working Capital in last Three years. Marks Assigned=5	c) Registration with incometax department. Marks assigned=5	d) Copy of Valid PEC License assigned=5	e) No Litigation Certificate 2021-2022 Marks assigned=5				f) No Blacklisting Certificate 2021 - 2022 Marks Assigned=5	Marks Obtained							
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17	18	19	20	21	22	23	24	25	26	27	28	29	30	31	32
1	M.S. Mohammad Yousuf & Sons (JV) M.S. Orient Energy Systems Pvt.Ltd	CA-520	12	0	4	3	19	6	5	4	15	6	4	10	5	0.86	0	5	5	5	20.86	64.86	Qualified								
2	M.S. Sultan Mahmood & Sons with Manufacturer's Authorization XCMG)	CA-311	12	0	4	3	19	6	5	4	15	6	4	10	5	5	5	5	5	30	74	Qualified									
3	M.S. MB Associates & Construction JV M.S. Progressive International	CA-238	0	0	2	2	4	6	0	4	10	0	0	0	5	1.4	5	5	5	26.4	40.4	Not qualified	Fall in G.E & ASS and JV Share % not enclosed								
4	M/S Hussain Ali & Sons with authorized distributorship of HYUNDAI CONSTRUCTION EQUIPMENT CO,LTD	CA-307	15	0	4	3	22	6	5	4	15	6	7	13	0	5	5	5	5	25	75	Qualified									
5	M.S. Irfan Brothers International Pvt. JV M.S. Rikans International	C2-2420	15	0	4	2	21	6	4	3	13	6	6	12	0	5	5	5	5	25	71	Qualified									
6	M.S. Pearl Trade International			0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	Not Submitted original Documents
7	M.S. Shabeen & Sons Gilgit	CA-197	15	8	4	5	32	6	5	4	15	7	7	14	5	5	5	5	0	5	25	86	Qualified								

Engr. Abdul Hamid
Project Director Nalter Road
(Member/Secretary)

Mr. Mohd Ayub
SDO Sub Division Workshop
GB PWD Gilgit
(Member)

Mr. Mohd Alam
SDO Internal Electrification
GB PWD Gilgit
(Member)

Mr. Sadaqat Khan Babuzai,
Assistant Chief (P&M)
M/o KA&GB
(Member)

Miss. Mehreen Gillani
Chief (P&M)
M/o KA&GB
(President)



OFFICE OF THE
PROJECT DIRECTOR
UP-GRADATION OF ROAD FROM RCC KONODAS BRIDGE
TO NALTAR AIRFORCE BASE CAMP VIA NOMAL (43.7 KM)

SUMMARY OF TECHNICAL BID EVALUATION OF CONSTRUCTORS/ FIRMS (MACHINERY FOR SLIDING/SNOW REMOVAL)

S.#	Name of Constructor/ Firm	Marks/ weight-age obtained of Categories				Total Scores/Marks obtained out of (100)	PEC Category	Pass/ Fail	Remarks
		Experienc e Record (35)	Personal Capabilities (15)	After Sale Services (20)	Financial Soundness (30)				
1/7	M/S. Mohammad Yousuf & Sons (JV) M/S. Orient Energy Systems Pvt.Ltd	19	15	10	20.86	64.86	CA-520	Pass	
2/7	M/S. Sultan Mahmood & Sons with Manufacturer's Authorization XCMG)	19	15	10	30	74	CA-311	Pass	
3/7	M/S. MB Associates & Construction JV M/S. Progressive International	4	10	0	26.4	40.4	CA-238	Fail	Fail in General Experience & After Sale & Services
4/7	M/S. Hussain Ali & Sons with HYUNDAI Authorized Distributer.	22	15	13	25	75	CA -307	Pass	
5/7	M/S. Irfan Brothers International Pvt. JV M/S. Rikans International	21	13	12	25	71	CA-2420	Pass	
6/7	M/S. Pearl Trade International	0	0	0	0	0	-	-	Not Submitted Original Documents
7/7	M/S. Shaheen & Sons Gilgit	32	15	14	25	86	CA-197	Pass	

Mr. Mohd Ayub
SDO Sub Division Workshop
GB PWD Gilgit
(Member)

Mr. Mohd Alam
SDO Internal Electrification
GB PWD Gilgit
(Member)

Engr. Abdul Hamid
Project Director Naltar Road
(Member/Secretary)

Mr. Sadaqat Khan Babuzai
Assistant Chief (P&M)
M/o KA&GB
(Member)

Mis. Mehreen Gillani
Chief (P&M) M/o KA&GB
(President)

FINANCIAL BID COMPARATIVE STATEMENT

Rs in Pak Rupees

Up-Gradation of road from RCC Konodas Bridge to Nalter Airforce base camp Via Nomal (43.7) (Machinery for Snow/Sliding Removal)

S#	SCOPE OF WORK/SUB HEAD	M/S. Mohammad Yousuf & Sons (JV) M/S. Orient Energy Systems Pvt.Ltd			M/S. Sultan Mahmood & Sons with Manufacturer's Authorization XCMG			(M/S Hussain Ali & Sons with authorized distributorship of HYUNDAI Construction Equipment Co.Ltd.			M/S. Irfan Brothers International Pvt. JV M/S. Rikans International			M/S. Shaheen & Sons Gilgit		
		Quantity (Nos)	Rate Quoted (each) With all Taxes	Total Amount	Quantity (Nos)	Rate Quoted (each) with all Taxes	Total Amount	Quantity (Nos)	Rate Quoted (each) with all taxes	Total Amount	Quantity (Nos)	Rate Quoted (each) wrth all taxes	Total Amount	Quantity (Nos)	Rate Quoted (each) with all taxes	Total Amount
01	SUPPLY OF BRAND NEW WHEEL LOADER Operating Weight: 17600 Kg Engine: 205 HP@ 2200RPM Emission Standard: Tier-II Bucket Capacity : 3.1 Cubic meter and i/c all essential Kit and Manuals from Well Reputed Manufactures.	2	94335507	188671014	2	245000000	490000000	2	22000000	44000000	2	33400000	66800000	2	21658300	43316600
02	SNOW BLOWER SELF DRIVEN Throw Height : 1400 mm Auger Quantity : 2 Working Capacity : 2500 T / H Throw Distance : 30 m Engine Power : 194 KW and i/c all essential Kit and Manuals from Well Reputed Manufacturers.	2	44850000	89700000	2	17950000	35900000	2	21600000	43200000	2	32200000	64400000	2	20138000	40276000
Corrected Bid Prices		G-Total		278371014	G-Total		525900000	G-Total		87200000	G-Total		131200000	G-Total		83592600
Over all Ranking of the Firm/JV		4th Lowest			5th Lowest			2nd Lowest			3rd Lowest			1st Lowest		
Excess/Saving from PC-1 Provision		178371014 (Excess)			425900000			12800000 (Saving)			31200000 (Excess)			16407400 (Saving)		
% age Excess/Saving from PC-1		178.371% Above			425% Above			12.8% Below			31.2% Above			16.407 % Below		

Consequent upon the approval of tender committee from Secretary Kashmir Affairs and Gilgit-Baltistan, being the Principal Accounting Officer (PAO) vide Notification No. PC.1(4)/2016 dated 19th November, 2021 for the procurement of above-mentioned machinery, initially after the technical evaluation the committee comprising of the below mentioned members have shortlisted 05 Nos firms. The rejected firms have been conveyed to collect their Call deposits and sealed Financial Bids envelope whereas the financial bids of the Technically responsive firms were opened on 4th January, 2022 by the Bids Opening and Evaluation Committee. It is pertinent to mention here that, after the opening of financial bids, a dispute occurred between M/S Sultan Mahmood & Sons and M/S Shaheen & Sons and it is worth mentioning here that the committee advised both the Representatives of the firms to settle the dispute at their own end but both the representatives of the firm advised the committee members to decide and they will accept the decision of the committee and video message has also been recorded by the both representatives of the firms in the presence of all committee members. The committee after detailed discussions and deliberations unanimously decided that the nomenclature for rates to be quoted was mentioned in the schedule A & B (price schedule for goods) in the bid documents hence the same rates will be considered which is inclusive of all custom duties, insurance and transportation etc. As per the above comparative statement, the cost offered under Financial Bids by five numbers bidders are M/S. Shaheen & Sons Gilgit (declared 1st lowest & 16.407 % below from PC-1 Provision), M/S. Hussain Ali & Sons with HYUNDAI Authorized Distributer (declared 2nd lowest & 12.8% below from PC-1 provision), M/S. Irfan Brothers International Pvt. JV M/S. Rikans International (declared 3rd lowest & 31.2 % above from PC-1 provision), M/S. Mohammad Yousuf & Sons (JV) M/S. Orient Energy Systems Pvt.Ltd (declared 4th lowest & 178.371 % above from PC-1 Provision) and M/S. Sultan Mahmood & Sons with Manufacturer's Authorization XCMG (declared 5th Lowest & 425% above from PC-1 provision).

Mr. Mohd Asub
SDO Sub-Division Workshop
SB PWD Gilgit
(Member)

Mr. Mehdi Alam
SDO Internal Electrification
GB PWD Gilgit

Engr. Abdul Hamid
Project Director, Nalter Road
(Member/Secretary)

Mr. Sadaqat Khan Babuzai
Assistant Chief (P&M)
M/o KA&GB
(Member)

Miss. Mahreen Gillani
Chief (P&M)
M/o KA&GB
(President)