

TECHNICAL EVALUATION REPORT

(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

1. Name of Procuring Agency: Pakistan Tobacco Board
2. Method of Procurement: Quality & Cost Based Selection (QCBS)
3. Title of Procurement: Detailed study on determination of Cost of Production/Minimum Indicative Prices of tobacco.
4. Tender Inquiry No: S.M.4/PTB/TdNo.1
5. PPRA Ref. No. (TSE): TS488215E
6. Date & Time of Bid Closing: 08-09-2022 at 1400 hours
7. Date & Time of Bid Opening: 20-12-2022 at 1200 hours
8. No of Bids Received: 02
9. Criteria for Bid Evaluation: Quality & Cost Based Selection (QCBS) (80:20) 75 marks for qualification of technical proposal
10. Details of Bid(s) Evaluation:

Name of Bidder	Marks			Evaluated Cost	Rule/Regulation/SBD*/Policy/Basis for Rejection/Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules,2004.
	Technical (If applicable)	Financial	Final		
M/S ASB/IPSOS	64.264	20	84.26	Rs: 7,616,000	Under rule 36 (b) (ix), Selected for Contract Negotiation
M/S IJAZ TABASSUM & CO.	67.600	10.70	78.30	Rs: 14,235,000	

Most Advantageous Bidder: M/S ASB/IPSOS

11. Any other additional/ supporting information, the procuring agency may like to share.

Signature:



Official Stamp:

Dr. Hafiz Abdul Samad Tahir
Deputy Director (Marketing)
Pakistan Tobacco Board
Ministry National Food
Security & Research Peshawar

Combined Evaluation Report

HIRING OF CONSULTING FIRM FOR CONSULTANCY SERVICES FOR THE PROJECT “DETAILED STUDY ON DETERMINATION OF COST OF PRODUCTION/ MINIMUM INDICATIVE PRICES OF TOBACCO”



Pakistan Tobacco Board
Ministry of National Food Security & Research

وزارت برائے قومی تحقیق و حفظانِ تغذیہ، پاکستان

December, 2022

**Deputy Director Marketing
Pakistan Tobacco Board (PTB)**

**Ministry of National Food Security & Research
GOVERNMENT OF PAKISTAN**

Contents

Section I. Annex.

Annex I.	Technical Evaluation – Basic Data.....	03
Annex II.	Financial Evaluation – Basic Data.....	08
Annex III.	Minutes of Opening of Financial Proposal	10

.....

Annex-I. Technical Evaluation-Basic Data

Annex-I. Technical Evaluation - Basic Data

- 2.1 Name of country Islamic Republic of Pakistan
- 2.2 Client:
 (a) name Pakistan Tobacco Board
 (b) address, phone Ministry of National Food Security & Research,
 Government of Pakistan
 46 B Office Enclave Phase 5 Hayatabad,
 Peshawar, Pakistan,
 Phone: - +92(91) 17833.
 Email: ddmarketing@ptb.gov.pk
- 2.3 Type of assignment (pre-investment, preparation, or implementation), and brief description of sources Hiring of consulting firm for consultancy services for “Detailed study on determination of cost of production/minimum indicative price of tobacco”
- 2.4 Method of selection: Quality & Cost Based Selection (QCBS) (80:20)
- 2.5 Request for expressions of interest:
 (a) publication on Public Procurement Authority Website Yes (30th July, 2022)
 (b) publication in national newspaper(s) Yes (30th July, 2022)
 (c) publication in international newspaper(s) N/A
 (d) number of responses Five (05) responses
- 2.6 Shortlisted Consulting Firms:
- | Sr. # | Consulting Firms (Single/Joint Venture/Consortium) |
|-------|--|
| 1. | HLB IJAZ TABASSUM & CO. |
| 2. | ASB/IPSOS in Pakistan |
| 3 | NIELSONIQ |
- 2.7 Request for Proposals:
 (a) First issuance to Firms Date: 31st October, 2022
 (b) Second issuance, if any Not Applicable
- 2.8 Amendments and clarifications to the RFP (describe) No
- 2.9 Contract Type: Lumpsum – Deliverable based
- 2.10 Pre-proposal conference:
 (a) First Conference Yes (8th November, 2022)
- 2.11 Proposal submission:
 (a) one envelope (Technical)

- (b) original submission
(d) extensions(s)
- 2.12 Submission of Financial Proposal
- 2.13 Opening of Technical Proposals by selection committee
- 2.14 Number of proposals submitted
- 2.15 (a) Procurement Evaluation Committee:
Members' names and titles
- 2.16 Proposal validity period (days):
(a) original expiration date
(b) extension(s), if any
- Two envelopes (Technical and Financial proposals in separate sealed envelopes)
Date: 15th November, 2022 Time: 1500 hrs
Date: 16th November, 2022 Time: 1330 hrs
Location: Deputy Director (Marketing)
Pakistan Tobacco Board, Ministry of National Food Security & Research, Government of Pakistan,
46 B Office Enclave Phase 5 Hayatabad, Peshawar.
- Date: 16th November, 2022 Time 1330 hours
- Three (03) Proposals Received
- Dr. Qaizar Ahmed, Secretary (PTB)- **Convener**
Mr. Muhammad Khurram Jamshaid, Deputy Food Security Commissioner I, MoNFS&R, Islamabad- **Member**
Mr. Muhammad Zubair, Financial Management Specialist (PPDU), Ministry of Water Resources, Islamabad- **Member**
Mr. Rizwan Ullah, Assistant Director (B&F), PTB- **Member**
Jalal Ud Din, Director Marketing, Agri. Extension, Department Khyber Pakhtunkhwa- **Member**
Dr. Hafiz Abdul Samad Tahir, Deputy Director (Marketing) PTB- **Secretary/Member**
- 180 days
14-05-2022

2.17 Evaluation Criteria/sub-criteria:

Sr. #	Criterion	Points
1.	General Experience of the Consultant (i.e. Length of Incorporation as Company/firm or Registration/Licensing, General Assignments etc.)	10
2.	Specific experience of the Consultant (as a firm) relevant to the Assignment (3 Projects similar to the assignment)	10

	<p>Please provide the relevant (similar, specific or related experiences) assignments/works, duly substantiated, completed by the Firm/Joint venture, with the following details:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Name of the Project Cost of the Project Name and address of the Client If case of association of service providers, the names and address of all the partners Start & Completion Date Number of staff-months provided by the firm (in case of association/JV, by other partner firms) Brief description of the services rendered 	
3.	<p>Adequacy and quality of the proposed methodology, and work plan in responding to the Terms of Reference (TORs)</p> <p>The number of points to be assigned to the following sub-criteria and relevant weights:</p>	45
3.1	<p><u>Methodology</u></p> <p>[It will be assessed as to whether the proposed methodology is clear, responds to all the components and requirements of the TORs]</p>	25
3.1.1	Performance Assessment Planning and Methodology	06
3.1.2	Tools for analysis of Administrative Environment and governance structure of technically complex organization	05
3.1.3	Feasibility studies and surveys conducted	06
3.1.4	Approach for backstopping/technical support for the implementation of the approved implementation mechanism	04
3.1.5	Tools for establishing cost/feasibility studies or farmer's surveys system	04
3.2	<p><u>Staffing Plan</u></p> <p>[Overall team composition is balanced, appropriately deployed and has adequate qualifications & skills mix; and the work plan has rational inputs of Experts]</p>	10
3.3	<p><u>Work Plan</u></p> <p>[It will be assessed that work plan is responding to the given timelines of the client, realistic, implementable and covering all the aspects/components of service delivery]</p>	10
4.	<p>Key Experts' qualifications and competence for the Assignment:</p> <p>The number of points to be assigned to each of the below positions or disciplines shall be determined considering the following sub criteria and relevant percentage weights:</p>	35

(a)	Qualification	20%
(b)	General Experience	20%
(C)	Specific Experience related to the assignment/project	60%
4.1	Team Leader/Project Director Ph.D. in Statistics with 3 years' experience or M.S./M.Sc. in Statistics with 10 years' experience in the Data statistical modeling.	10
4.2	Senior Analyst M.Phil. in Statistics/Agricultural Economics/Economics with at least 5 years' experience in data analysis modeling	05
4.3	Data Expert MS in Computer Science or in a related field with minimum 5 years' experience in data management. S/he shall possess knowledge of managing and optimizing crops related data	05
4.4	Field Team Supervisor B.Sc. (Hons) in Agriculture with 5 years' experience as field supervisor	05
4.5	Field Coordinator Diploma in Agriculture with 5 years' experience as data collector	05
4.6	Cost Accountant ACMA/CA qualified with 5 years' experience in costing & financial reporting	05
Total Points =		100
Qualifying Marks		75

Form IIB. Evaluation Summary—Technical Scores/Ranking 2.18 Technical scores of the Firms

S #	Names of Firms	Technical scores
1	HLB IJAZ TABASSUM & CO	84.50
2	ASB/IPSOS	80.33

Annex-2. Financial Evaluation-Basic Data

Annex - II: Financial Evaluation—Basic Data

3.1 Approval of technical evaluation report by Chairman, PTB (Quality-Cost Based Selection) Date: 8th December, 2022

3.2 Public opening of financial proposals Date 20th December, 2022 Time 1200 hours

(a) Names and proposal prices (*mark FIs that attended public opening)

Name of FIs	Proposal Price (Pak Rupees) Exclusive of GST (if applicable)	Scores obtained in Financial Proposal
HLB IJAZ TABASSUM & CO	Rs: 14,235,000/-	53.50
ASB/IPSOS	Rs: 7,616,000 /-	100

* Representatives of ASB/IPSOS attended public opening while a letter from HLB Ijaz Tabassum & Co. has been received containing the consent to open the financial bids without the presence of their representative.

Same as detailed in Technical Evaluation Basic Data Sheet

3.3 Evaluation committee: members' names and titles (if not the same as in the technical evaluation - Quality-Cost Based Selection)

3.4 Methodology (formula) for evaluation of cost (QCBS) Weight inversely proportional to cost
 $S = S_t * T + S_f * P$ (T=0.8 & P = 0.2)

3.5 QCBS Firms Technical, Financial and Final Score.

(a) Technical, financial and final scores.

FIs Name	Weighted Technical Score	Weighted Financial Score	Final Score	Ranking
ASB/IPSOS	64.264	20	84.26	1 st
HLB IJAZ TABASSUM & CO	67.60	10.70	78.30	2 nd

(b) Award recommendation

As per combined evaluation of technical and financial scores, ASB/ IPSOS has emerged as the top ranked consulting firm by scoring 84.26 final score and accordingly, the Procurement Evaluation Committee recommended that ASB/ IPSOS may be invited for Contract negotiations for the said project.

Annex – III
Minutes of Opening of Financial Proposal