

# EVALUATION REPORT

(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

1. Name of Procuring Agency: CANTONMENT BOARD CLIFTON
2. Method of Procurement: Single Stage Two Envelope Rule 36 (b)
3. Title of Procurement: I. Construction of retaining wall for the safety of human lives & properties at 1<sup>st</sup> Commercial Street, Phase-IV, DHA, Karachi.  
II. Construction of retaining wall for the safety of human lives & properties at 2<sup>nd</sup> Street, Kh-e-Momin, Phase-IV, DHA, Karachi.
4. Tender Inquiry No.: Tender Notice vide Dailies The News, Jang & Awami Awaz Dated 14-10-2021
5. PPRA Ref. No.(TSE): TS462184E
6. Date & Time of Bid Closing: 02-11-2021 at 1100 Hours
7. Date & Time of Bid Opening: 02-11-2021 at 1130 Hours
8. No of Bids Received: 04 Nos
9. Criteria for Bid Evaluation: Attached as Annex-A
10. Details of Bid(s)Evaluation: as given below

Name of Bidder	Technical Evaluation (marks)	Financial Bid (Rates Quoted on MES Sch of Rates, 2014, as amended)	Lowest Evaluated Bidder	Rule/Regulation/SBD*/ Policy/ Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004.
<b>I. Construction of retaining wall for the safety of human lives &amp; properties at 1<sup>st</sup> Commercial Street, Phase-IV, DHA, Karachi</b>				
M/s Al Hakeem Builders	59	18.88% above	Lowest	Accepted being lowest
M/s Haider Builders	72	46% above	-	Rejected being not lowest
M/s Shah Faisal & Brothers	45	-	-	Rejected being not lowest
M/s Zahid & Co.	43	-	-	Rejected being not lowest
<b>II. Construction of retaining wall for the safety of human lives &amp; properties at 2<sup>nd</sup> Street, Kh-e-Momin, Phase-IV, DHA, Karachi</b>				
M/s Al Hakeem Builders	59	21.88% above	Lowest	Accepted being lowest
M/s Haider Builders	72	46% above	-	Rejected being not lowest
M/s Shah Faisal & Brothers	45	-	-	Rejected being not lowest
M/s Zahid & Co.	43	-	-	Rejected being not lowest

  
CANTT: EXECUTIVE OFFICER  
CLIFTON CANTONMENT

**TECHNICAL BID EVALUATION CRITERIA  
(CONSTRUCTION OF RETAINING WALL)**

**I. Detail of project / General Experience**

<b>Sr. No.</b>	<b>Description</b>	<b>Marks Assigned</b>	<b>Explanation for Marks Obtained</b>
a)	Projects of similar nature Completed in last 5 years.	20	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• 20 Marks are given if the contractor has completed at least 10 projects of similar nature in last 5 years.</li><li>• 14 Marks are given if the contractor has completed at least 7 projects of similar nature in last 5 years.</li><li>• 2 Marks are given if the contractor has completed at least 1 projects of similar nature in last 5 years.</li></ul>
b)	Projects of similar nature in-hand during last 5 years.	20	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• 20 Marks are given if the contractor has completed at least 10 projects of similar nature in last 5 years.</li><li>• 14 Marks are given if the contractor has completed at least 7 projects of similar nature in last 5 years.</li><li>• 2 Marks are given if the contractor has completed at least 1 projects of similar nature in last 5 years.</li></ul>
c)	Enlistment record with Government Organizations & other agencies	10	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• 2 Mark for each enlistment up to maximum of five enlistments.</li></ul>
<b>Total Marks Allocated</b>			<b>50</b>

## II Financial Statement

Sr. No.	Description	Marks Assigned	Criteria for Marks Obtained
a)	Bank statement for last 3 years	20	<b>Credit</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• 100 M – 200 M - 9 Marks</li><li>• 201 M – 300 M - 11 Marks</li><li>• 301 M – 400 M - 15 Marks</li><li>• Above 400 M full marks</li></ul>
b)	Registration with income tax department and tax paid during the last 3 years for the projects	5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• No points will be given if income tax certificate is not attached and 5 points will be added in case of valid certificate.</li></ul>
c)	Litigation History in which Decision has been given against the firm(s)	5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• In case the firm is involved in any litigation, no marks will be given and 5 points will be added in case affidavit of no litigation is attached.</li></ul>
d)	Blacklisting from any agency	5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• In case the firm is blacklisted, no Marks will be given and 5 points will be added in case affidavit by the company that it has not been black listed is attached.</li></ul>
<b>Total Marks Allocated</b>			<b>35</b>



### III Technical Staff

Requirement of Employer/User will be varied from Project to Project. However following factors may be used as a guideline:

Sr. No.	Description	Marks Assigned	Explanation for Marks Obtained
i)	B.Sc Engineers registered with Pakistan Engineering Council (PEC)	9	<p><b><u>Experience (3-Marks) :</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 3 Marks will be given if the individual experience of at least 4 no. of B.Sc Engineers (professional) is equal to 15 years or above.</li> <li>• For less than 4 no of B.Sc Engineers having individual experience of 15 years, marks will be given as per following formulas:  <math display="block">= (A/4) * 3</math>                     A = No. of Engineers having individual experience of 15 years or above.</li> </ul> <p><b><u>Strength of Engineers (6 Marks)</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 6 Marks will be given if the total no. of Engineers registered with PEC are 15 nos. or above.</li> <li>• For less than 15 no of B.Sc Engineers registered with PEC marks will be given as per following formulas:  <math display="block">= (A/15) * 6</math>                     A = No. of Engineers</li> </ul>
ii)	Associates Engineers (DAE)	6	<p><b><u>Experience (2-Marks) :</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 2 Marks will be given if the individual experience of at least 8 no. of Associates Engineers (DAE) is equal to 10 years or above.</li> <li>• For less than 8 no of Associates Engineers (DAE) having individual experience of 10 years, marks will be given as per following formulas:  <math display="block">= (A/8) * 2</math>                     A = No. of DAE Engineers.</li> </ul> <p><b><u>Strength of Associate Engineers (4 Marks)</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 4 Marks will be given if the total no. of Associate Engineers (DAE) are 20 nos. or above.</li> <li>• For less than 20 no of Associate Engineers marks will be given as per following formulas:  <math display="block">= (A/20) * 4</math>                     A = No. of Associate Engineers</li> </ul>
<b>Total Marks Allocated</b>			<b>15</b>