

EVALUATION REPORT

(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

01	Name of Procuring Agency	National Highway Authority
02	Method of Procurement	Single Stage Two Envelope Procedure
03	Title of Procurement	Hiring the services of a consultancy firm for development of Business Plan.
05	PPRA Ref. No. (TSE)	TS454530E
06	Date & Time of Bid Closing	2 nd August 2021 at 11:30 hours local time
07	Date & Time of Bid Opening	2 nd August 2021 at 12:00 hours local time
08	No of Bids Received	Ten (09) Proposals were received
09	Criteria for Bid Evaluation	Criteria of Bid Evaluation is attached at Annex-1
10	Details of Bid(s) Evaluation	As below

Name of Bidder	Marks			Bid Amount/ Evaluated Cost (EC)* (PKR)	Rules/ Regulations/SBD**/ Policy/Basis for Rejection/ Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004
	Technical (if applicable)	Financial (if applicable)	Total (out of 100)		
M/s HLB Ijaz Tabussum & Co	72	6.12	78.12	180,960,000	2 nd
M/s Prime Global Naveed Zafar Ashfaq Jaffery & Co	57.20	10.55	67.75	105,031,200	5 th
M/s Grant Thornton, M/s NESPAK & M/s FSC Integrated Services (Pvt) Ltd	58.78	18.47	77.25	60,000,000	3 rd
M/s Bakertilly Mehmood Idrees Qamar	67.80	6.82	74.62	162,409,213	4 th
M/s KPMG Taseer Hadi & Co	61.60	20	81.60	55,395,529	1st Top scoring firm in combined evaluation (PPRA Rule 36(b) (ix))
M/s RSM Avais Hyder Liaqat Nauman	4.00	Not Applicable	Disqualified		PPRA Rule-36(b)(v)
M/s NJHR	50.00				
M/s BDO Ebrahim & Co	48.20				

HIRING THE SERVICES OF A CONSULTANCY FIRM FOR DEVELOPMENT OF BUSINESS PLAN

for nha 8/221. P 272309

M/s IConsult, M/s ABS and Co and M/s RSM	Non - Responsive (as per clause 5.8 of the bidding documents).			
--	--	--	--	--

*EC is the Evaluated Cost/ bid amount used for evaluation purpose and includes only the cost of competitive component and is inclusive of indirect taxes (sales tax) as well.

** Standard Bidding Documents (SBD)

Top Ranked Bidder: M/s KPMG Taseer Hadi & Co, Chartered Accountants

Any other additional/supporting information, the procuring agency may like to share:

The Procurement was carried out in line with PPRA Rules & Regulations, single stage two envelope procedure with 80:20 Technical to Financial Proposals ratio. The Contract is being awarded to **M/s KPMG Taseer Hadi & Co, Chartered Accountants** at the total evaluated cost/bid amount of Pak. Rs. 55,395,529/- to be paid in line with RFP for each deliverable as quoted in the financial proposals.

Signature.....



Name: Tariq Hussain Shah

Designation: Director (Finance)

TARIQ HUSSAIN SHAH
Director (Finance)
Official Stamp.....
National Highway Authority
Islamabad

HIRING THE SERVICES OF A CONSULTANCY FIRM FOR DEVELOPMENT OF BUSINESS PLAN

Annex-I

Sr	Evaluation Criteria	Points Distribution
a	Experience of the Consultant	30
b	Adequacy of methodology and work plan	20
c	Qualifications and Competence of Staff	30
d	Tax returns and audited accounts	10
e	Financial Background	10
	Total	100

Sr	Evaluation Criteria	Evaluation Sub Criteria	Points
a	Experience of the Consultant	(i) Number of Successful Financial Consultancy Projects in Pakistan of comparable magnitude, complexity and technical specialty. (At least 3 such assignment each year for the 5 preceding years with client satisfaction certificates)	15
		(ii) Number of Successful Financial Consultancy Projects procured on Business plan development (Minimum 3 such projects are essential with client satisfaction certificates)	15
b	Adequacy of methodology and work plan (specific to the assignment)	(i) Work Plan	10
		(ii) Organization and Staffing w.r.t the following: a) Overall organizational setup; b) Specific to this engagement;	10
c	Qualifications and Competence of Staff (with reference to the firm/company profile)	(i) General Qualifications (education, length of experience, types of position held, length of service with the consultant/firm, etc.)	30

		<p>Separately indicating:</p> <p>(i) Number of Qualified Staff: Marks @0.75 each</p> <p>a. Chartered Accountants = at least 10 (For Associate CA 10 years and for Fellow CA, 05 years of post-qualification experience)</p> <p>b. Transport Economist = 01 (For Master, 10 years and for Graduates 15 years of post-qualification experience)</p> <p>c. Road Asset Management Specialist = 01 (For Master, 10 years and for Graduates 15 years of post-qualification experience)</p> <p>d. Civil Engineer = 03 (For M. Tech, 10 years and for B. Tech 15 years of post-qualification experience)</p> <p>e. Actuarial =02 (Master degree in mathematics, finance, or economics with 10 years of post-qualification experience)</p> <p>f. Corporate lawyer = 02 (For LLB, 10 years and for LLM 05 years of post-qualification experience)</p> <p>g. Finance Managers = 05 (MBA, M. Com, CA Inter or equivalent with 10 years of post-qualification experience)</p> <p>h. Finance Assistants = 08 (MBA, M. Com, CA Inter or equivalent with 05 years of post-qualification experience)</p> <p>i. Civil Engineering Assistants= 08 (For M.Tech, 05 years and for B. Tech 10 years of post-qualification experience)</p> <p>Attach CVs of the above staff.</p>	
d	Tax Returns and audited accounts	Firm Tax Return & Audited Accounts for the year 2018, 2019 and 2020 in line with the directions of table "A".	10
f	Financial Soundness	The firm with average gross revenue in last three financial year will be awarded as follows, Up to Rs. 150 million – 2.5 Greater than 150 million & less than 500 million - 5 greater than 500 million – 10	10
Total			100

Table "A"

Sr	Type of Organization	Minimum requirement of Auditors	Basis of preparation of Audit Reports	Basis of preparation of Financial Statements
1.	Corporate entities (duly registered with Securities and Exchange Commission of Pakistan)	Licensed Chartered Accountant Firms (Minimum Partnership Firm with international affiliation) enlisted and appearing on the list of firms in ICAP directory as at the finalization of procurement.	International auditing standards as applicable in Pakistan.	i. Companies Ordinance 1984 or Companies Act 2017 (whichever is applicable). ii. International accounting and financial reporting standards as applicable in Pakistan at the time of issuance of the reports.
2.	Partnership Firm/ AOPs/Joint Ventures	Licensed Chartered Accountant Firms (Minimum Partnership Firm) enlisted and appearing on the list of firms in ICAP directory as at the finalization of procurement.	International auditing standards as applicable in Pakistan.	i. International accounting and financial reporting standards as applicable in Pakistan at the time of issuance of the reports.
3.	Individuals/Sole Proprietorship	Licensed Cost & Management Accountant Firms enlisted and appearing on the list of firms in ICMAP directory as at the finalization of procurement for organizations of net worth up to 10 million only. In all other cases Licensed Chartered Accountant Firms enlisted and appearing on the list of firms in ICAP directory as at the finalization of procurement.	International auditing standards as applicable in Pakistan.	Consistent and acceptable accounting policies.