



# NATIONAL HIGHWAY AUTHORITY

Procurement & Contract Administration Section

28-Mauve Area, G-9/1, Islamabad Tel: 9032727, Fax: 9260419

No. 6(565)/DIR (P&CA)/NHA/2022/1080

Islamabad, .....<sup>22/11</sup>November, 2022  
D. A. Khan


## Director General

Public Procurement Regulatory Authority  
1<sup>st</sup> Floor FBC Building near State Bank,  
Sector G-5/2, **Islamabad.**

Subject: **ANNOUNCEMENT OF EVALUATION REPORT (PPRA RULE-35):  
Consultancy Services for Feasibility Study and Detailed Design  
for Construction of Wangu Hill Tunnel on M-8**

Reference: PPRA Rule-35

Find enclosed herewith the Evaluation Report along with Evaluation Criteria (Annex-I) for the subject Services in line with PPRA Rule-35 for uploading on PPRA website at the earliest, please.

  
(MUHAMMAD AHMED ABRO)  
Director Consultancy (P&CA)

**Encl:** Evaluation Report along with **Annex- I**

### Copy to:

- Member (Planning), NHA, Islamabad;
- General Manager (P&CA), NHA, Islamabad;
- Director (Tech. to Chairman), NHA, Islamabad;
- Dy. Director (P&CA), NHA, Islamabad.

# EVALUATION REPORT

## (As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

1.	Name of Procuring Agency:	National Highway Authority
2.	Method of Procurement:	Single Stage Two Envelope Procedure
3.	Title of Procurement:	Consultancy Services for Feasibility Study and Detailed Design for Construction of Wangu Hill Tunnel on M-8
4.	Tender Inquiry No.:	6(565)
5.	PPRA Ref. No. (TSE):	TS482922E
6.	Date & Time of Bid Closing:	18 <sup>th</sup> July, 2022 at 1130 hours local time
7.	Date & Time of Bid Opening:	18 <sup>th</sup> July, 2022 at 1200 hours local time
8.	No of Bids Received:	Three (03) Proposals were received
9.	Criteria for Bid Evaluation:	Criteria of Bid Evaluation is attached at Annex-I
10.	Details of Bid(s) Evaluation:	As below

Name of Bidder	Marks			Evaluated Cost (EC)* (PKR)	Rule/Regulation/ SBD**/Policy/ Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004.
	Technical Score (St) (80%)	Financial Score (Sf) (20 %)	Total Score (100%)		
1) M/s Prime Engineering & Testing Consultants (Pvt.) Ltd. in JV with M/s Engineering and Management Services and in association with M/s Origin Consulting Engineers (Sub-Consultant)	578	200	778	54,076,884	Top scoring firm in combined evaluation (PPRA Rule 36(b) (ix))
2) M/s NESPAK (Pvt.) Ltd. in JV with M/s BK Consultant (SMC-Pvt.) Ltd. and in association with M/s Khyber Design Engineers (Sub-Consultant)	610	106	716	101,621,348	2 <sup>nd</sup>
3) M/s Finite Engineering (Pvt.) Ltd. in JV with M/s Associated Consultancy Center (Pvt.) Ltd. and in Association With M/s National Infrastructure	567	100	667	107,746,060	3 <sup>rd</sup>

y e

# EVALUATION REPORT

## (As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)


Name of Bidder	Marks			Evaluated Cost (EC)* (PKR)	Rule/Regulation/SBD**/Policy/Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004.
	Technical Score (St) (80%)	Financial Score (Sf) (20 %)	Total Score (100%)		
Engineering Services Pakistan (Sub-Consultant)					

*\*EC is the Evaluated Cost used for evaluation purpose and includes only the cost of competitive component (i.e. Remuneration and Direct Non-Salary Cost) and is exclusive of Provisional Sum, Contingency and Indirect Taxes.*

**Top Ranked Bidder:** M/s Prime Engineering & Testing Consultants (Pvt.) Ltd. in JV with M/s Engineering and Management Services in association with M/s Origin Consulting Engineers (Sub-Consultant)

11. **Any other additional/supporting information, the procuring agency may like to share:** The Procurement was carried out in line with PPRA Rules & Regulations. The bidding was done on QCBS method with 80:20 Technical to Financial Proposals ratio. The Contract is being awarded to M/s Prime Engineering & Testing Consultants (Pvt.) Ltd. in JV with M/s Engineering and Management Services in association with M/s Origin Consulting Engineers (sub-Consultant) at rebated/agreed consultancy cost of Pak. Rs. 48,274,700/-.

Signature:.....  


Official Stamp:.....  


**\*\*Standard Bidding Documents (SBD).**

*B*

# National Highway Authority



**Annex-I**

**Criteria**

*FOR*

**Bid Evaluation**

**Consultancy Services for Feasibility Study  
and Detailed Design for Construction of  
Wangu Hill Tunnel on M-8**

**November, 2022**

## SUMMARY EVALUATION SHEET FOR FULL TECHNICAL PROPOSALS (QCBS)

EVALUATION CRITERIA	Max. Weightage	Firm 1		Firm 2	
		Rating	Score	Rating	Score
<b>1. Firms Experience</b>	<b>100</b>				
General Experience in road Transport Sector	25				
Specific Experience related to particular Assignment	75				
<b>2. Approach and Methodology</b>	<b>250</b>				
<b>2-a. Appreciation of the Project</b>	<b>70</b>				
(i) Evidence of Site Visit with Photographs	(30)				
(ii) Clarity of appreciation	(20)				
(iii) Comprehensiveness of appreciation	(20)				
<b>2-b. Problem Statement/ understanding of objectives</b>	<b>50</b>				
(i) Identification of Problems/ Objectives	(30)				
(ii) Components of Proposed Services	(20)				
<b>2-c. Methodology</b>	<b>80</b>				
(i) Proposed Solutions for this Project	(30)				
(ii) Quality of Methodology	(20)				
(iii) Conciseness, clarity and completeness of proposal	(30)				
<b>2-d. Suggested Changes for Improvement in TOR</b>	<b>10</b>				
2-e. Work Program	20				
2-f. Staffing Schedule	20				
<b>3. Key Personnel</b>	<b>450</b>				
Firm affidavit for presence of personnel	25				
i. Team Leader/ Tunnel Engineer	100				
ii. Senior Geotechnical Engineer/ Land Sliding Expert	70				
iii. Senior Geologist	60				
iv. Senior Structural Engineer	60				
v. Senior Highway Engineer	60				
vi. Electrical & Mechanical (E&M) Expert for Tunnel	45				
vii. IT Specialist (SCADA Design)	30				
<b>4. Performance Certification from clients</b>	<b>75</b>				
Affidavit on stamp paper duly attested by the Oath Commissioner regarding non-blacklisting	25				
<b>5. Present Commitments (current engagement and available strength – justification)</b>	<b>50</b>				
<b>6. Transfer of Knowledge (Methodology/ Plans)</b>	<b>50</b>				
<b>TOTAL:</b>	<b>1000</b>				

Excellent - 100% Very Good - 90-99% Above Average – 80-89% Average – 70-79% Below Average – 1-69% Non-complying – 0%,

Score: Maximum Weightage rating / 100. Minimum qualifying score is 70% or 700 marks.

Consultancy Services for Feasibility Study and Detailed Design for Construction of Wangu Hill Tunnel on M-8



**PERSONNEL EVALUATION SHEET**

POSITION / AREA OF EXPERTISE	Name	Academic and General Qualification Weightage 30%		Project related Experience Weightage 60%		Status with the Firm 10%		OVERALL RATING (Sum of Weighted Ratings)
		Percentage Rating	Weighted Rating (A)	Percentage Rating	Weighted Rating (B)	Percentage Rating	Weighted Rating (C)	(A+B+C)
(Show all experts to be evaluated)								
i. Team Leader/ Tunnel Engineer								
ii. Senior Geotechnical Engineer/ Land Sliding Expert								
iii. Senior Geologist								
iv. Senior Structural Engineer								
v. Senior Highway Engineer								
vi. Electrical & Mechanical (E&M) Expert for Tunnel								
vii. IT Specialist (SCADA Design)								

Rating: - Excellent - 100%    Very good - 90-99%    Above Average - 80-89%    Average - 70-79%    Below Average - 1-69%    Non-complying - 0%

Score: Maximum Weightage X rating / 100. Minimum qualifying score is 70%.

