



NATIONAL HIGHWAY AUTHORITY

Procurement & Contract Administration Section

28-Mauve Area, G-9/1, Islamabad Tel: 9032727, Fax: 9260419

No. 6(628)/GM/(P&CA)/NHA/2024/428

Islamabad, 29th November, 2024

DIRECTOR GENERAL

PUBLIC PROCUREMENT REGULATORY AUTHORITY

1ST FLOOR FBC BUILDING NEAR STATE BANK,

SECTOR G-5/2, ISLAMABAD.

**SUBJECT: ANNOUNCEMENT OF REVISED FINAL EVALUATION REPORT (PPRA RULE-35):
CONSULTANCY SERVICES FOR DESIGN REVIEW & CONSTRUCTION
SUPERVISION OF INTERCHANGE AT (M-3) ABDUL HAKIM MOTORWAY AT
ESSAN, SHARQPUR DISTRICT SHEIKHUPURA, 20 KM FROM M-2**

Reference: PPRA Rule-35

Find enclosed herewith the Revised Final Evaluation Report along with Evaluation Criteria (Annex-I) for the subject Services in line with PPRA Rule-35 for uploading on PPRA website at the earliest, please.


(FAYYAZ AHMED)

GENERAL MANAGER (P&CA)

DISTRIBUTION:

ENCL: Evaluation Report along with **Annex- I**

COPY TO:

- Member (Planning), NHA, Islamabad;
- Dy. Director (P&CA), NHA, Islamabad.

REVISED FINAL EVALUATION REPORT

(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

1.	Name of Procuring Agency:	National Highway Authority
2.	Method of Procurement:	Single Stage Two Envelope Procedure
3.	Title of Procurement:	Consultancy Services for Design Review & Construction Supervision of Interchange at (M-3) Abdul Hakim Motorway at Essan, Sharqpur District Sheikhpura, 20 Km from M-2
4.	Tender Inquiry No.:	6(628)
5.	PPRA Ref. No. (TSE):	TS533098E
6.	Date & Time of Bid Closing:	12 th March, 2024 at 1130 hours local time
7.	Date & Time of Bid Opening:	12 th March, 2024 at 1200 hours local time
8.	No of Bids Received:	Ten (10) Proposals were received
9.	Criteria for Bid Evaluation:	Criteria of Bid Evaluation is attached at Annex-I
10.	Details of Bid(s) Evaluation:	As below

Name of Bidder	Marks			Evaluated Cost (EC)* (PKR)	Rule/Regulation/ SBD**/Policy/ Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004.
	Technical Score (St) (80%)	Financial Score (Sf) (20 %)	Total Score (100%)		
i) M/s PAVRON in association with M/s Engineering & Technical Associates. (ETA) (Sub-Consultant)	594.4	200	794	24,183,100	Top scoring firm in combined evaluation (PPRA Rule 36(b) (ix))
ii) M/s Associated Consultancy Centre (Pvt.) Ltd. in JV with M/s Pakistan Railway Advisory & Consultancy Services (PRACS) (Pvt.) Ltd. and in association with M/s Tareek Consulting Engineers (SMC-Pvt.) Ltd. (Sub-Consultant)	636.8	153.7	790	31,470,600	2 nd
iii) M/s Indus Associated Consultants (Pvt.) Ltd. in JV M/s ECSP (Pvt.) Ltd., M/s Effective Engineering Expertise-EEE (Pvt.) Ltd. and in association with M/s Karakoram Engineers (Sub-Consultant)	617.6	156.4	774	30,930,400	3 rd

Consultancy Services for Design Review & Construction Supervision of Interchange at (M-3) Abdul Hakim Motorway at Essan, Sharqpur District Sheikhpura, 20 Km from M-2



REVISED FINAL EVALUATION REPORT

(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

Name of Bidder	Marks			Evaluated Cost (EC)* (PKR)	Rule/Regulation/ SBD**/Policy/ Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004.
	Technical Score (St) (80%)	Financial Score (Sf) (20 %)	Total Score (100%)		
iv) M/s PEAS Consulting (Pvt.) Ltd. in association with M/s HMR Consulting Engineering (Sub-Consultant)	566.4	159.4	726	30,334,150	4 th
v) M/s Associated Consulting Engineering (ACE) Ltd. in association with M/s Hadi Engg Consultants, Lahore (Sub-Consultant)	588.8	134.6	723	35,926,329	5 th
vi) M/s Prime Engineering & Testing Consultants in JV with M/s Finite Engineering (Pvt.) Ltd. M/s Engineering & Management Services and in association with M/s Z-Tech Engineering Solutions. (Sub -Consultant)	599.2	103.4	703	46,792,960	6 th
vii) M/s NESPAK (Pvt.) Ltd. in association with M/s EPCM Consultants (Sub-Consultant.)	625	Non-Responsive As per Data sheet : sub Clause 20.1 (II) (vii) : therefore financial score is considered as zero			
viii) M/s ESS.I.AAR Planning, Engineering & Services Consultants in JV with M/s Concept Engineering Services & in association with M/s GlaxCon (Sub-Consultant)	540 Dis- Qualified	Financial Proposal not Opened			
ix) M/s CAMEOS in JV with M/s National Infrastructure Engineering Services (NIES) and in association with M/s The Group of Engineers (Sub-Consultant)	521 Dis- Qualified	Financial Proposal not Opened			



[Handwritten Signature]

REVISED FINAL EVALUATION REPORT

(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

Name of Bidder	Marks			Evaluated Cost (EC)* (PKR)	Rule/Regulation/ SBD**/Policy/ Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004.
	Technical Score (St) (80%)	Financial Score (Sf) (20 %)	Total Score (100%)		
x) M/s Asif Ali & Associates in JV with M/s A.A Associates (Pvt.) Ltd. and in association with M/s Techno Engineering Services (Sub-Consultant).	Non-Responsive As per Clause 20.1 (l)-(i) of Data Sheet of RFP				

*EC is the Evaluated Cost used for evaluation purpose and includes only the cost of competitive component (i.e. Remuneration and Direct Non-Salary Cost) and is exclusive of Provisional Sum, Contingency and Indirect Taxes.

Most Advantageous Consultant: M/s PAVRON in association with M/s Engineering & Technical Associates. (ETA) (Sub-Consultant)

11. **Any other additional/supporting information, the procuring agency may like to share:** The Procurement was carried out in line with PPRA Rules & Regulations. The bidding was done on QCBS method with 80:20 Technical to Financial Proposals ratio. The Contract will be awarded to M/s PAVRON in association with M/s Engineering & Technical Associates. (ETA) (Sub-Consultant) at evaluated/rebated Consultancy Cost of Pak. Rs. 28,760,227/- which includes Remuneration, Reimbursable Expenses and all applicable Federal, Provisional and Local taxes including GST.

Signature: 

Official Stamp: **General Manager (P&CA)**
National Highway Authority
Islamabad
**Standard Bidding Documents (SBD).



National Highway Authority



Annex-I

Criteria

FOR

Revised Final Evaluation Report

**CONSULTANCY SERVICES FOR DESIGN
REVIEW & CONSTRUCTION SUPERVISION
OF INTERCHANGE AT (M-3) ABDUL HAKIM
MOTORWAY AT ESSAN, SHARQPUR
DISTRICT SHEIKHUPURA,
20 KM FROM M-2**

November, 2024

SUMMARY EVALUATION SHEET FOR FULL TECHNICAL PROPOSALS (FTP)

EVALUATION CRITERIA		Max. Weightage	Firm 1 Rating	Firm 1 Score	Firm 2 Rating	Firm 2 Score
1. Firms Experience		100				
	1-a. General Experience in road Transport Sector	25				
	1-b. Specific Experience related to particular Assignment	75				
2. Approach and Methodology		250				
	2-a. <u>Appreciation of the Project</u>	<u>70</u>				
	(i) Evidence of Site Visit with Photographs giving a clear understanding/ proof of the project site	(30)				
	(ii) Clarity of appreciation	(20)				
	(iii) Comprehensiveness of appreciation	(20)				
	2-b. <u>Problem Statement/ understanding of objectives</u>	<u>50</u>				
	(i) Identification of Problems/ Objectives	(30)				
	(ii) Components of Proposed Services	(20)				
	2-c. <u>Methodology</u>	<u>80</u>				
	(i) Proposed Solutions for this Project	(30)				
	(ii) Quality of Methodology	(20)				
	(iii) Conciseness, clarity and completeness of proposal	(30)				
	2-d. Suggested Changes for Improvement in TOR	10				
	2-e. Work Program	20				
	2-f. Staffing Schedule	20				
3. Key Personnel		450				
	Firm affidavit for presence of personnel	25				
a-	<u>Design Review (Key-Staff)</u>	<u>70</u>				
i.	Team Leader/ Structure Engineer	70				
b-	<u>Construction Supervision (Key-Staff)</u>	<u>355</u>				
i.	Resident Engineer	110				
ii.	Material Engineer	100				
iii.	ARE (Structures)	85				
iv.	Quantity Surveyor	60				
4. Performance Certification from clients		75				
	Affidavit on stamp paper duly attested by the Oath Commissioner regarding non-blacklisting	25				
5. Present Commitments (current engagement and available strength – justification)		50				
6. Transfer of Knowledge (Methodology/ Plans)		50				
TOTAL:		1000				

Excellent - 100% Very Good - 90-99% Above Average – 80-89% Average – 70-79% Below Average – 1-69% Non-complying – 0%
 Score: Maximum Weightage x rating / 100. Minimum qualifying score is 70% or 700 marks.



Consultancy Services for Design Review & Construction Supervision of Interchange at (M-3) Abdul Hakim Motorway at Essan, Sharqpur District Sheikhpura, 20 Km from M-2

PERSONNEL EVALUATION SHEET

POSITION / AREA OF EXPERTISE	Name	Academic and General Qualification Weightage 30%		Project-related Experience Weightage 60% for [Design Review] and 65% for [Construction Supervision]		Status with the Firm 10% for [Design Review] and 05% for [Construction Supervision]		OVERALL RATING (Sum of Weighted Ratings) (A+B+C)
		Percentage Rating	Weighted Rating (A)	Percentage Rating	Weighted Rating (B)	Percentage Rating	Weighted Rating (C)	
(Show all experts to be evaluated)								
Design Review Team								
i. Team Leader /Structure Engineer								
Construction Supervision (Key-Staff)								
i. Resident Engineer								
ii. Material Engineer								
iii. ARE (Structures)								
iv. Quantity Surveyor								

Rating: - Excellent - 100% Very good - 90-99% Above Average - 80-89% Average - 70-79% Below Average - 1-69%
 Non-complying - 0%

Score: Maximum Weightage X rating / 100.

* For Qualification and Experience of above Key Personnel, refer to TOR Chapter 5, Clause -5.6 (Qualification and Experience Requirement of Personnel).

** 6 month's older employee - 100%;
 The key professional staff whose duration with the firm is less than six (06) months/ available for the assignment/ associates/ part time available for the assignment in such case status with the firm's marks shall not be allocated.

