

Contract Award Notice/Evaluation Report

1	Name of Procuring Agency:	Benazir Income Support Programme (BISP)																																										
2	Method of Procurement:	Selection Based on the Consultant's Qualifications (CQS) under ADB's Procurement Regulations for ADB Borrowers: Goods, Works, Non-consulting and Consulting Services																																										
3	Title of Procurement:	Hiring of Firm for Annual Fiduciary Review of Procurement Component Of BISP for Period FY-2021-22, 2022-23 & 2023-24																																										
4	Tender Inquiry No.:	1-149/Proc/FR 21-24/ADB/BISP/2022																																										
5	PPRA Ref. No. (TSE):	TS 500914 E																																										
6	Date & Time for EOIs Closing:	17 th February 2023 at 1400 hours																																										
7	Date & Time for EOIs Opening:	17 th February 2023 at 1430 hours																																										
8	Name of Firm submitted Proposals	M/s EY Ford Rhodes Chartered Accountants																																										
9	No of EOI Received, Shortlisting and Evaluation:	<p>Five (08)</p> <table border="1" style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <thead> <tr> <th colspan="4" style="text-align: center;">Hiring of Firm for Annual Fiduciary Review of Procurement Component Of BISP for Period FY-2021-22, 2022-23 & 2023-24</th> </tr> <tr> <th style="width: 5%;">S.No</th> <th style="width: 55%;">Name of Participating Firms</th> <th style="width: 20%;">Shortlisting</th> <th style="width: 20%;">Marks Obtained Out of 100</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>1.</td> <td>M/s BDO Ebrahim & Co. Chartered Accountants</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Yes</td> <td style="text-align: center;">77.85</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2.</td> <td>M/s MUNIFF ZIA UDDIN & CO Chartered Accounts</td> <td style="text-align: center;">No</td> <td style="text-align: center;">72.85</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3.</td> <td>Rafaqat Babar and Co. Chartered Accountants</td> <td style="text-align: center;">No</td> <td style="text-align: center;">40.35</td> </tr> <tr> <td>4.</td> <td>Aslam Malik & Co</td> <td style="text-align: center;">No</td> <td style="text-align: center;">61.10</td> </tr> <tr> <td>5.</td> <td>Bhuta Shah & CO. LLP</td> <td style="text-align: center;">No (excluded as the firm pertain to India while the assignment is national)</td> <td style="text-align: center;">N/A</td> </tr> <tr> <td>6.</td> <td>Baker Tilly Mehmood Idrees Qamar, Chartered Accountants</td> <td style="text-align: center;">No</td> <td style="text-align: center;">75</td> </tr> <tr> <td>7.</td> <td>EY Ford Rhodes Chartered Accountants</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Yes</td> <td style="text-align: center;">91.05</td> </tr> <tr> <td>8.</td> <td>UHY Hassan Naeem & Co.</td> <td style="text-align: center;">Yes</td> <td style="text-align: center;">88.15</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>Shortlisted Firms: Top Three Firm obtaining the minimum passing mars of 75%</p>			Hiring of Firm for Annual Fiduciary Review of Procurement Component Of BISP for Period FY-2021-22, 2022-23 & 2023-24				S.No	Name of Participating Firms	Shortlisting	Marks Obtained Out of 100	1.	M/s BDO Ebrahim & Co. Chartered Accountants	Yes	77.85	2.	M/s MUNIFF ZIA UDDIN & CO Chartered Accounts	No	72.85	3.	Rafaqat Babar and Co. Chartered Accountants	No	40.35	4.	Aslam Malik & Co	No	61.10	5.	Bhuta Shah & CO. LLP	No (excluded as the firm pertain to India while the assignment is national)	N/A	6.	Baker Tilly Mehmood Idrees Qamar, Chartered Accountants	No	75	7.	EY Ford Rhodes Chartered Accountants	Yes	91.05	8.	UHY Hassan Naeem & Co.	Yes	88.15
Hiring of Firm for Annual Fiduciary Review of Procurement Component Of BISP for Period FY-2021-22, 2022-23 & 2023-24																																												
S.No	Name of Participating Firms	Shortlisting	Marks Obtained Out of 100																																									
1.	M/s BDO Ebrahim & Co. Chartered Accountants	Yes	77.85																																									
2.	M/s MUNIFF ZIA UDDIN & CO Chartered Accounts	No	72.85																																									
3.	Rafaqat Babar and Co. Chartered Accountants	No	40.35																																									
4.	Aslam Malik & Co	No	61.10																																									
5.	Bhuta Shah & CO. LLP	No (excluded as the firm pertain to India while the assignment is national)	N/A																																									
6.	Baker Tilly Mehmood Idrees Qamar, Chartered Accountants	No	75																																									
7.	EY Ford Rhodes Chartered Accountants	Yes	91.05																																									
8.	UHY Hassan Naeem & Co.	Yes	88.15																																									




10	Criteria for evaluation of Technical Proposal:	Sr.#	Criteria/Sub-Criterions	Maximum	Marks Obtained by M/S EY Ford Rhodes & Co.
		1	Personnel Schedule & Work Plan:	100	58
		1.1	Work Plan (presentation of activities, bar chart, work plan is realistic and implementable and work plan is responding to the TORs, and also to the objective & scope of the assignment)	50	30
		1.2	Personnel Schedule (phasing of activities of work plan and timing of experts' individual inputs)	30	9
		1.3	Proposal Presentation (Clarity and ease of assessment of the entire proposal (including material presentation) and Adherence to page limits as specified in the RFP).	20	19
		2	Personnel (Key Experts)	900	828
		2.1	Team Leader	350	333
		2.2	Procurement Specialist	250	225
		2.3	Audit Officer-1 (Team Member)	150	135
		2.4	Audit Officer-2 (Team Member)	150	135
			Total	1000	886

Passing Marks: 750

11. Detail of Proposal Evaluation

Name of Bidder/Firm	Technical Marks out of 1000	Evaluated and Negotiated Price in PAK Rs. (Without GST)	Final Score and Ranking
M/s EY Ford Rhodes Chartered Accountants	886	12,623,123/-	M/s EY Ford Rhodes was invited for submission of RFP as the top ranked firm based on amplified EOI in accordance with Consultant's Qualifications Selection (CQS) Method -as per ADB's Procurement Regulations for ADB Borrowers: Goods, Works, Non-consulting and Consulting Services. On the base of successful negotiation M/s EY Ford Rhodes is the recommended firm for contract Award.


Deputy Director (Procurement)