

FINANCIAL EVALUATION REPORT (FER)

(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

- 1.. Name of Procurement Agency: National TB Control Programme (NTP), Islamabad
2.. Method of Procurement: Single Stage - Two Envelops
3.. Title of Procurement: PROCUREMENT OF HIRING OF COURIER COMPANY FOR CMU
4.. Tender Inquiry No: CMU-NTP/025/2022
5.. PPRA Ref. No. (TSE): TS482525E Technical Evaluation Report EV44033 dated 02.09.2022
6.. Date and Time of Bid Closing: June 20, 2022 at 11:00am
7.. Date and Time of Bid Opening: June 20, 2022 at 11:30am
8.. No. of Bids Received: 03 (Three)
9.. Criteria for Bid Evaluation: As per criteria prescribed in the SBD.
10.. Details of Bid(s) Evaluation: The detail bid evaluation report is as under:-

Name of Bidder (s)	Marks Technical (if applicable)	Marks Financial (if applicable)	Evaluation Cost in PKR	Rules / Regulations / SBD* /Policy / Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004
1 M/s (M&P) Express Logistics Pvt Ltd	Technically Qualified	Not Applicable	Comparison Sheet attached	Financially higher fuel adjustment price i.e flat 40 % on each category i. After calculating & adding the fuel adjustment charges with net quoted rates, M/s M&P has quoted lowest price for Intra City courier services only. As per End-user i.e Manager Warehouse and Manager Admin/HR recommendations, in the previous transaction intra city courier services never occurred that may be ignored. Therefore proceed for the contract agreement with the firm quoted lowest for Intra province and Intra country courier services.
2 M/s TCS Pvt Ltd	Technically Not Qualified	Not Applicable	---	Technically Not Qualified (as per end user complaints while providing services to CMU therefore not recommended by the LFA) "as per clause (K) of the Preliminary Examination Criteria to be evaluated based on the technical proposal of SBD at page 36".
3 M/s (LCS) Leopard Courier Services Pvt Ltd	Technically Qualified	Not Applicable	Comparison Sheet attached	ii. After calculating & adding the fuel adjustment charges with net quoted rates, M/s LCS has quoted lowest prices for Intra Province and Intra Country Courier Services for the 1st year also LCS is the lowest for International courier services. For international courier services (Prices quoted in USD are converted into PKR on interbank forex exchange rates "Bids evaluation date i.e dated 27-09-2022 @ 1USD=236PKR" Formula Used= USD\$ quoted Price including fuel adjustment charges x current USD\$ rate". Screen Shot of the web for exchange rate is attached. Screen Shot of the web for exchange rate is attached. The vendor is lowest / most advantageous bidder for Intra Province and Intra Country and International courier services for the 1st year. As mentioned in SBD ITB 31.3 The resulting contract shall be a framework contract valid for twelve (12) months from the date of signing the contract.

Most Advantageous Bidder:

- i) M/s (LCS) Leopard Courier Services Pvt Ltd has quoted lowest prices for Intra Province and Intra Country Courier Services for the 1st year also LCS is the lowest for International courier services.

11.. Any other additional / supporting information, the procuring agency may like to share.

Comparison Sheet Attached

* This issues with the approval of Competent Authority.

Kareed
Signature / Stamp with Date

* Standard Bidding Documents (SBD)

10th 21st - 6
YARAR



Hiring of Courier Firm for CMU Financial Bid for 3 Three Years		M/s Muller & Phips Express Logistics Pvt Ltd																		
DOMESTIC/NATIONAL RATES INCLUSIVE OF fuel ADJUSTMENT CHARGES		Intra City						Intra Province Same Zone						Intra Country Different Zone						
Description of Item	Weight	1st Year Net Price	1st Year With fuel 40%	2nd Year Net Price	2nd Year With fuel 40%	3rd Year Net Price	3rd Year With fuel 40%	1st Year Net Price	1st Year With fuel 40%	2nd Year Net Price	2nd Year With fuel 40%	3rd Year Net Price	3rd Year With fuel 40%	1st Year Net Price	1st Year With fuel 40%	2nd Year Net Price	2nd Year With fuel 40%	3rd Year Net Price	3rd Year With fuel 40%	
National Overnight Courier Service	0.0 KG to 0.5 KG	20	28	23	32.2	26.45	37.03	40	56	46	64.4	52.9	74.06	60	84	69	96.6	79.35	111.09	
	0.6 to 1 KG	30	42	34.5	48.3	39.68	55.552	60	84	69	96.6	79.35	111.09	125	175	143.75	201.25	165.31	231.434	
	Each Additional 0.5 Kg	15	21	17.25	24.15	19.84	27.776	30	42	34.5	48.3	39.675	55.545	55	77	63.25	88.55	72.74	101.836	
M/s M&P has quoted cost for each additional 1 KG therefore the quoted cost mentioned in this line is divided into 2 for price comparison		30	42	34.5	48.3	39.68	55.552	60	84	69	96.6	79.35	111.09	110	154	126.5	177.1	145.48	203.672	
Total Cost in PKR With fuel Adjustment Charges for National/Domestic Services (Without GST)			91		104.65		120.358		182		209.3		240.695		336		386.4		444.36	
Lowest Bidder Name with Cost Deference		M&P	87.25	M&P	109.25	M&P	135.892	LCS	3.75	M&P	4.6	M&P	15.555	LCS	157.75	LCS	172.5	LCS	188.11	
INTERNATIONAL RATES INCLUSIVE OF fuel ADJUSTMENT CHARGES		M/s Muller & Phips Express Logistics Pvt Ltd						M/s Leopards Courier Service Pvt Ltd												Remarks
Price Comparison For 3 three years		International Flat Reates in PKR						International Flat Rates (Prices quoted in USD) and converted in PKR on current forex rates dated 27-09-2022 " @ 1USD=236PKR"												
Description of Item	Weight	1st Year Net Price	1st Year With fuel 40%	2nd Year Net Price	2nd Year With fuel 40%	3rd Year Net Price	3rd Year With fuel 40%	1st Year Net Price in USD\$	1st Year With fuel 15%	1st Year Gross Price in PKR	2nd Year Net Price in USD\$	2nd Year With fuel 20%	2nd Year Gross Price in PKR	3rd Year Net Price in USD\$	3rd Year With fuel 25%	3rd Year Gross Price in PKR				
International Overnight Courier Service	0.0 KG to 0.5 KG	4500	6300	6000	8400	7000	9800	17	19.55	4613.8	20	24	5664	22	27.5	6490				
	0.6 to 1 KG	7500	10500	8000	11200	9000	12600	34	39.1	9227.6	40	48	11328	44	55	12980				
	Each Additional 0.5 Kg	4000	5600	4500	6300	5000	7000	17	19.55	4613.8	20	24	5664	22	27.5	6490				
Total Cost in PKR With fuel Adjustment Charges for International Services (Without GST)			22400		25900		29400			13841.4			16992			19470				
Cost Deference with Name of Lowest bidder		LCS	8558.6	LCS	8908	LCS	9930													
		Recommendation of End User/ Co-opted Members																		



M/s Leopards Courier Service Pvt Ltd

Intra City						Intra Province Same Zone						Intra Country Different Zone					
1st Year Net Price	1st Year With fuel 15%	2nd Year Net Price	2nd Year With fuel 20%	3rd Year Net Price	3rd Year With fuel 25%	1st Year Net Price	1st Year With fuel 15%	2nd Year Net Price	2nd Year With fuel 20%	3rd Year Net Price	3rd Year With fuel 25%	1st Year Net Price	1st Year With fuel 15%	2nd Year Net Price	2nd Year With fuel 20%	3rd Year Net Price	3rd Year With fuel 25%
50	57.5	57.5	69	66.13	82.6625	50	57.5	57.5	69	66.13	82.6625	50	57.5	57.5	69	66.13	82.6625
70	80.5	80.5	96.6	92.58	115.725	70	80.5	80.5	96.6	92.58	115.725	70	80.5	80.5	96.6	92.58	115.725
35	40.25	40.25	48.3	46.29	57.8625	35	40.25	40.25	48.3	46.29	57.8625	35	40.25	40.25	48.3	46.29	57.8625
	178.25		213.9		256.25		178.25		213.9		256.25		178.25		213.9		256.25
M&P	87.25	M&P	109.25	M&P	135.892	LCS	3.75	M&P	4.6	M&P	15.555	LCS	157.75	LCS	172.5	LCS	188.11

1. Financial bids of the two qualified firms (M/s LCS and M/s M&P) was opened by the DPC on 28th Sep.2022 at CMU Islamabad. M/s M&P has attended the bids opening meeting while M/s LCS was not able to attend the said bids opening meeting.

2. M/s M&P has quoted the prices in PKR for National/Domestic, International and Cold chain services "Cold chain services for national deliveries only. While M/s LCS has quoted National/Domestic rates in PKR but International services are quoted in USD\$, also Cold chain services was not quoted by the LCS.

3. In a written response, as per email of Mr. Zia Ur Rehman Corporate Business Head of LCS Pvt Ltd dated 27-09-2022 the international trade is in USD\$ and cost will be charged as per current Govt PKR conversion rate.

4. After price comparison, the sheet shows below details
 i. After calculating & adding the fuel adjustment charges with net quoted rates, M/s M&P has quoted lowest price for Intra City courier services.
 ii. After calculating & adding the fuel adjustment charges with net quoted rates, M/s LCS has quoted lowest prices for Intra Province and Intra Country Courier Services.
 iii. For international courier services (Prices quoted in USD are converted into PKR on current interbank forex exchange rates dated 27-09-2022 @ 1USD=236PKR "Formula Used= USD\$ quoted Price including fuel adjustment charges x current USD\$ rate". Screen Shot of the web for exchange rate is attached.

5. M/s M&P has quoted the cost for each additional 1 KG while in the tender document format of price schedule were so cleared to quote the cost for each additional 0.5 KG (Half Kg only) "mentioned on the page# 28 and 44 in the SBD/tender document". Therefore the quoted cost one "1 KG" is divided into 2 for getting the half KG price for equal comparison.

As per End-user i.e Manager Warehouse and Manager Admin/HR recommendations, in the previous transaction intra city courier services never occurred that may be ignored. Therefore proceed for the contract agreement with the firm quoted lowest for Intra province and Intra country courier services.



Government of Pakistan (GoP)
Ministry of National Health Services, Regulations and Coordination, Islamabad
Common Management Unit (CMU) for AIDS, TB and Malaria (ATM) Programmes
The GFATM Grants



Hiring of Courier Firm for CMU Financial Bid for 3 Three Years		M/s Muller & Phips Express Logistics Pvt Ltd															M/s Leopards Courier Service Pvt Ltd		
COLD CHAIN ONLY DOMESTIC/NATIONAL RATES INCLUSIVE OF fuel ADJUSTMENT CHARGES		Intra City					Intra Province Same Zone					Intra Country Different Zone							
Description of Item	Weight	1st Year Net Price	1st Year With fuel 40%	2nd Year Net Price	2nd Year With fuel 40%	3rd Year Net Price	3rd Year With fuel 40%	1st Year Net Price	1st Year With fuel 40%	2nd Year Net Price	2nd Year With fuel 40%	3rd Year Net Price	3rd Year With fuel 40%	1st Year Net Price	1st Year With fuel 40%	2nd Year Net Price	2nd Year With fuel 40%	3rd Year Net Price	3rd Year With fuel 40%
National Overnight Courier Service	0.0 KG to 0.5 KG	20	28	23	32.2	26.45	37.03	40	56	46	64.4	52.9	74.06	60	84	69	96.6	79.35	111.09
	0.6 to 1 KG	30	42	34.5	48.3	39.68	55.552	60	84	69	96.6	79.35	111.09	125	175	143.75	201.25	165.31	231.434
	Each Additional 0.5 Kg	15	21	17.25	24.15	19.84	27.776	30	42	34.5	48.3	39.675	55.545	55	77	63.25	88.55	72.74	101.836
M/s M&P has quoted cost for Each additional 1 KG therefore the quoted cost mentioned in this line is divided into 2 for price comparison		30	42	34.5	48.3	39.68	55.552	60	84	69	96.6	79.35	111.09	110	154	126.5	177.1	145.48	203.672
Total Cost in PKR With fuel Adjustment Charges for National/Domestic Services (Without GST)			91		104.65		120.358		182		209.3		240.695		336		386.4		444.36

Did not Quoted for
Cold Chain
Shipments

Remarks	1. Only M/s M&P has quoted the prices in PKR for Cold chain services "Cold chain services for national deliveries only. While M/s LCS did not quoted for Cold chain services.
	2. M/s M&P has quoted the cost for Each additional 1 KG while in the tender document format of price schedule were so cleared to quote the cost for each additional 0.5 KG (Half Kg only) "mentioned on the page# 28 and 44 in the SBD/tender document". Therefore the quoted cost one "1 KG" is divided into 2 for getting the half KG price for equal comparison.

Recommendations

ahmad.zeb@ntp.gov.pk

From: ahmad.zeb@ntp.gov.pk
Sent: Tuesday, December 27, 2022 10:56 AM
To: 'info@ppra.org.pk'
Cc: 'naveed@ntp.gov.pk'; 'Hamid Awan'; 'Mr. Zaheer Ahmad'
Subject: uploading of Final Evaluation Report vide TS482525E & TER vide EV44033
Attachments: FER_CMU_025_2022.pdf; PO_2215.pdf

Dear Sir,

In continuation of this office letter no even dated 31.05.2022 uploaded on PPRA portal vide TS482525E dated 01.06.2022 and subsequently uploaded the Technical Evaluation Report dated 02.09.2022 vide EV44033; Please find closed herewith a Final Evaluation Report for the PROCUREMENT OF HIRING OF COURIER SERVICES FOR CMU.

Looking forward to upload the attached TER as mentioned above please.

Please note that the delivery of hard copy is on the way to your kind office by today.

Thanks & Regards

Ahmad Zeb Khan

Procurement Officer, National TB Control Program (CMU)

| Mobile +92(0)333 9425792, (L)+92-51-9255621-22 |

EPI Building, Block-C, Prime Minister Health Complex Near NIH, Park Road Chak Shahzad, Islamabad

The Global Fund Grant for AIDS, TB & Malaria | Common Management Unit |

From: ahmad.zeb@ntp.gov.pk [mailto:ahmad.zeb@ntp.gov.pk]
Sent: Friday, September 2, 2022 10:11 AM
To: 'info@ppra.org.pk' <info@ppra.org.pk>
Cc: 'naveed@ntp.gov.pk' <naveed@ntp.gov.pk>; 'Hamid Awan' <hamid@ntp.gov.pk>; 'Mr. Zaheer Ahmad' <zaheer.ahmad@ntp.gov.pk>
Subject: uploading of Technical Evaluation Report vide TS482525E

Dear Sir,

Reference to below email and in continuation of tender uploaded on PPRA portal vide TS482525E dated 01.06.2022, Please find enclosed herewith a Technical Evaluation Report (TER) for the procurement of (Hiring Services of Courier Firm for CMU-NTP Islamabad).

Looking forward to upload the attached TER as mentioned above please.

Please note that the delivery of hard copy is on the way to your kind office by today.

Thanks & Regards

Ahmad Zeb Khan

Procurement Officer, National TB Control Program (CMU)

| Mobile +92(0)333 9425792, (L)+92-51-9255621-22 |

EPI Building, Block-C, Prime Minister Health Complex Near NIH, Park Road Chak Shahzad, Islamabad

The Global Fund Grant for AIDS, TB & Malaria | Common Management Unit |

From: info@ppra.org.pk [mailto:info@ppra.org.pk]

Sent: Tuesday, May 31, 2022 12:10 PM