

### NATIONAL HIGHWAY AUTHORITY

Procurement & Contract Administration Section 28-Mauve Area, G-9/1, Islamabad Tel: 9032727, Fax: 9260419

No. 6(622)/GM/(P&CA)/NHA/2024/485 Islamabad, 1.9.14 November, 2024

#### **DIRECTOR GENERAL**

PUBLIC PROCUREMENT REGULATORY AUTHORITY 1<sup>ST</sup> FLOOR FBC BUILDING NEAR STATE BANK, SECTOR G-5/2; ISLAMABAD.

ANNOUNCEMENT OF TECHNICAL EVALUATION REPORT (PPRA RULE-35): SUBJECT:

CONSULTANCY SERVICES FOR DESIGN REVIEW & CONSTRUCTION SUPERVISION FOR CONSTRUCTION OF PHASE-I (A) OF PACKAGE-I (18.5 Km) of Lahore - Sahiwal - Bahawalnagar Motorway

tel

(LENGTH: 295 KM)

PPRA Rule-35 Reference:

Find enclosed herewith Technical Evaluation Report along with Evaluation Criteria (Annex-I) for the subject Services in line with PPRA Rule-35 for uploading on PPRA website at the earliest, please.

General Manager (P&CA)

### Distribution:

Encl: Evaluation Report along with Annex- I

### Copy to:

Member (Planning), NHA, Islamabad;

Dy. Director (P&CA), NHA, Islamabad.



# EVALUATION REPORT (As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

| 1.  | Name of Procuring Agency:     | I  | National Highway Authority  |
|-----|-------------------------------|----|---|
| 2.  | Method of Procurement:        |    | Single Stage Two Envelope Procedure   |
| 3.  | Title of Procurement:         |    | Consultancy Services for Design Review & Construction Supervision for Construction of Phase-I (A) of Package-I (18.5 Km) of Lahore - Sahiwal - Bahawalnagar Motorway (Length: 295 Km) |
| 4.  | Tender Inquiry No.:           |    | 6(622)  |
| 5.  | PPRA Ref. No. (TSE):          |    | TS538713Ē   |
| 6.  | Date & Time of Bid Closing:   |    | 27th June, 2024 at 1130 hours local time  |
| 7.  | Date & Time of Bid Opening:   |    | 27th June, 2024 at 1200 hours local time  |
| 8.  | No of Bids Received:          |    | Seven (07) Proposals were received  |
| 9.  | Criteria for Bid Evaluation:  | ./ | Criteria of Bid Evaluation is attached at Annex-I   |
| 10. | Details of Bid(s) Evaluation: |    | As below  |

| Name of Bidder  | Technical<br>Score (out of<br>1000) | Rule/Regulation/ SBD**/Policy<br>Basis for Rejection /<br>Acceptance as per Rule 35 of<br>PP Rules, 2004. |
|---|-------------------------------------|---|
| 1) M/s Associated Consulting Engineers ACE Ltd. in JV with M/s PEAS Consulting (Pvt.) Ltd. and in association with M/s Scenario Global Consulting Engineers (Pvt.) Ltd. (Sub-Consultant)                                      | 834                                 | Technically Qualified   |
| 2) M/s NESPAK (Pvt.) Ltd. in association with M/s Bosphorus Engineering (Pvt.) Ltd. (Sub-Consultant)  | 820                                 | Technically Qualified   |
| 3) M/s Associated Consultancy Centre (Pvt.) Ltd. in JV with M/s BK Consultants (Pvt.) Ltd., M/s Pakistan Railway Advisory & Consultancy Services Ltd.(PRACS) and in association with M/s Karakoram Engineers (Sub-Consultant) | 815                                 | Technically Qualified   |

Consultancy Services for Design Review & Construction Supervision for Construction of Phase-I (A) of Package-I (18.5 Km) of Page 1 of 2 Lahore - Sahiwal - Bahawalnagar Motorway (Length:295Km)

## **EVALUATION REPORT**

(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

| Name of Bidder  | Technical<br>Score (out of<br>1000) | Rule/Regulation/ SBD**/Policy/  **Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004. |  |  |
|---|-------------------------------------|--|--|--|
| 4) M/s Indus Associated Consultants (Pvt.) Ltd. in JV with M/s Engineering General Consultants (Pvt.) Ltd. and association with M/s Hadi Engineering Consultants (Sub-Consultant) | 791                                 | Technically Qualified  |  |  |
| 5) M/s Techno-Consult International (Pvt.) Ltd. in association with M/s HA ENG CON International (Sub-Consultant)   | 787                                 | Technically Qualified  |  |  |
| 6) M/s Asif Ali Associates in JV with M/s AA Associates and in association with M/s Mukaab Consultants (Sub-Consultant)   | 780                                 | Technically Qualified  |  |  |
| 7) M/s Development Management Consultants in association with M/s Roghani Associates Consultants (Sub-Consultant)   | 690                                 | Technically Dis-Qualified<br>(Less than 70%)   |  |  |

11. Any other additional/supporting information, the procuring agency may like to share: The Procurement is being carried out in line with PPRA Rules & Regulations using the QCBS method with 80:20 Technical to Financial Proposals ratio.

Signature.....General Manager (P&CA)

National Highway Authority

\*\*Standard Bidding Documents (SBD).



# **National Highway Authority**



Annex-I
Criteria
FOR

### **Technical Evaluation**

Consultancy Services for Design Review & Construction Supervision for Construction of Phase-I (A) of Package-I (18.5 Km) of Lahore - Sahiwal - Bahawalnagar Motorway (Length: 295 Km)

November, 2024

### SUMMARY EVALUATION SHEET FOR FULL TECHNICAL PROPOSALS (FTP)

### Annex-I to Data Sheet

|   | Max.      | Firm 1 |           | Firm 2 |      |
|---|-----------|--------|-----------|--------|------|
| VALUATION CRITERIA  | Weightage | Rating | Score     | Rating | Scor |
| Firms Experience  | 100       |        |           |        |      |
| 1-a. General Experience in road Transport Sector  | 25        |        |           |        |      |
| 1-b. Specific Experience related to particular Assignment   | 75        |        |           |        |      |
| Approach and Methodology  | 250       |        |           |        |      |
| 2-a. Appreciation of the Project  | <u>70</u> |        |           |        |      |
| (i) Evidence of Site Visit with Photographs giving a clear understanding/ proof of the project site | (30)      |        |           |        |      |
| (ii) Clarity of appreciation  | (20)      |        |           |        |      |
| (iii) Comprehensiveness of appreciation   | (20)      |        |           |        |      |
| 2-b. Problem Statement/ understanding of objectives   | <u>50</u> |        | -         |        |      |
| (i) Identification of Problems/ Objectives  | (30)      |        |           |        |      |
| (ii) Components of Proposed Services  | (20)      |        |           |        |      |
| 2-c. Methodology  | 80        |        |           |        |      |
| (i) Proposed Solutions for this Project   | (30)      |        |           |        |      |
| (ii) Quality of Methodology   | (20)      |        |           |        | _    |
| (iii) Conciseness, clarity and completeness of proposal   | (30)      |        |           |        | -    |
| 2-d. Suggested Changes for Improvement in TOR   | 10        |        |           |        |      |
| 2-e. Work Program   | 20        |        |           |        | -    |
| 2-f. Staffing Schedule  | 20        |        |           |        | -    |
| . Key Personnel   | 450       |        |           |        |      |
| Firm affidavit for presence of personnel  | 25        |        |           |        |      |
| a- Design Review (Key-Staff)  | 60        |        |           |        |      |
| i. Team Leader /Highway Engineer  | 60        |        |           |        |      |
| b- Construction Supervision (Key-Staff)   | 365       |        |           |        | _    |
| i. Resident Engineer  | 90        |        | ļ         |        | -    |
| ii. Material Engineer   | 60        |        |           |        | _    |
| iii.   Contract Specialist (Intermittent Basis)   | 35        |        |           |        | _    |
| iv. Environmental Specialist (Intermittent Basis)   | 30        |        |           |        | 4    |
| v. ARE (Highways) Engineer  | 55        |        |           |        | _    |
| vi. ARE Structures/ Bridge Engineer   | 55        |        | his -     |        | -    |
| vii. Quantity Surveyor  | 40        |        |           |        | _    |
| Performance Certification from clients  | 75        |        |           |        |      |
| Affidavit on stamp paper duly attested by the Oath Commissioner regarding non-blacklisting          | 25        |        |           |        |      |
| 5. Present Commitments (current engagement and available strength – justification)                  | 50        |        | a comment |        |      |
| 5. Transfer of Knowledge (Methodology/ Plans)   | 50        |        |           |        |      |
| TOTAL:  | 1000      |        |           |        |      |



Excellent - 100% Very Good - 90-99% Above Average - 80-89% Average - 70-79% Below Average - 1-69% Non-complying - 0% Score: Maximum Weightage x rating / 100. Minimum qualifying score is 70% or 700 marks.

Consultancy Services for Design Review & Construction Supervision for Construction of Phase-I (A) of Package-I (18.5 Km) of Lahore - Sahiwal - Bahawalnagar Motorway (Length: 295 Km)

### PERSONNEL EVALUATION SHEET

| POSITION / ARBA OF Name                           | Academic and General Name Qualification Weighinge 30% |                        | Project related. Experience Weightage 60%: for  Design Review  and 65% for  Construction Supervision |                        | Status with the Rime* 10% for [Design Review] and 05% for [Construction Sinervision] |                        | RATUNG (Sum<br>of Weighted |  |
|---|---|------------------------|--|------------------------|--|------------------------|----------------------------|--|
| (Show all experts to be evaluated)                | Percentage<br>Rating                                  | Weighted<br>Rating (A) | Percentage<br>Rating   | Weighted<br>Rating (B) | Percentage<br>Rating   | Weighted<br>Rating (C) | (A+B+C)                    |  |
| Design Review Team                                |   |                        |  |                        |  |                        |                            |  |
| i. Team Leader /Highway Engineer                  |   |                        |  |                        |  |                        |                            |  |
| Construction Supervision (Key-Staff)              |   |                        |  |                        |  |                        |                            |  |
| i. Resident Engineer                              |   |                        |  |                        |  |                        |                            |  |
| ii. Material Engineer                             |   |                        |  |                        |  |                        |                            |  |
| iii. Contract Specialist (Intermittent Basis)     |   |                        |  |                        |  |                        |                            |  |
| iv. Environmental Specialist (Intermittent Basis) |   |                        |  |                        |  |                        |                            |  |
| v. ARE (Highways)                                 |   |                        |  |                        |  |                        |                            |  |
| vi. ARE (Structures)                              |   |                        |  |                        |  |                        |                            |  |
| vii. Senior Quantity Surveyor                     |   |                        |  |                        |  |                        |                            |  |

Rating: -

Excellent - 100% Very good - 90-99% Non-complying - 0%

Above Average – 80-89%

Average - 70-79%

Below Average - 1-69%

Score: Maximum Weightage X rating / 100.

- \* For Qualification and Experience of above Key Personnel, refer to TOR Chapter 5, Clause -5.6 (Qualification and Experience Requirement of Personnel).
- \*\* 6 month's older employee 100%;
  The key professional staff whose duration with the firm is less than six (06) months/ available for the assignment/ associates/ part time available for the assignment in such case status with the firm's marks shall not be allocated.



Consultancy Services for Design Review & Construction Supervision for Construction of Phase-I (A) of Package-I (18.5 Km) of Lahore - Sahiwal - Bahawalnagar Motorway (Length: 295 Km)