

## EVALUATION REPORT

(As per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

1. Name of Procuring Agency: **Walton Cantonment Board.**
2. Method of Procurement: **Single Stage Single Envelope.**
3. Title of Procurement: **Annual Repair /Maintenance Works for the**
4. Tender Inquiry No: **Tender Notice published in newspapers "Dailies "Dawn" dated 21.08.2022, "Nai Baat" dated 20.08.2022.**
5. PPRA Ref (TSE): **TS487843E dated 17-08-2022.**
6. Date & Time of Bid Closing: **07-09-2022 at 1100 Hrs**
7. Date & Time of Bid Opening: **07-09-2022 at 1530 Hrs**
8. No. of Bids Received: **As per detail given below.**
9. Criteria of Bid Evaluation: **Single Stage Single Envelope.**
10. Detail of Bid(s) Evaluation: **Given Below:**
11. Approval Authority. **CBR No.07 dated 06-10-022.**

### BUILDINGS

| Sr.# | TENDER NO.          | Description of work  | Est. Cost in (M) | Earnest Money (Rs.) |
|------|---------------------|--|------------------|---------------------|
| 1.   | WCB-18-08-2022-1590 | Annual repair /maintenance works of Cantt Fund Building, C.B. Office, Residential units etc. in Ward No.1 to 10. | 40.00            | 800,000             |

| Sr. # | Name of firm                 | Rates based on MES Sch. 2021 | Rule/Regulation/SBD*/Policy/Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004 |
|-------|------------------------------|------------------------------|---|
| i).   | M/s. The Pasha & Sons        | 12% Above                    | <b>Accepted being Lowest bidder</b>   |
| ii)   | M/s. Altaf Hussain& Sons.    | 25.786% Above                | --  |
| iii)  | M/s. Abdul Malik Khan & Co.  | 21.21% Above                 | --  |
| iv)   | M/s. Sitara Construction Co. | 14.14% Above                 | --  |

M/s. The Pasha & Sons quoted lowest rate i.e. 12% Above on MES Schedule of Rates 2021 for the subject work.

**METALLED ROAD**

|    |                     |   |       |         |
|----|---------------------|---|-------|---------|
| 2. | WCB-18-08-2022-1591 | Annual repair /maintenance of metalled road, road cut in Ward No.2,3,4,5,6&7 (separate rates for plant (JMF) & manual carpeting should be quoted) | 20.00 | 400,000 |
|----|---------------------|---|-------|---------|

| Sr. # | Name of firm                | Rates based on MES Sch. 2021 |           | Rule/Regulation/SBD*/Policy/Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004 |
|-------|-----------------------------|------------------------------|-----------|---|
|       |                             | Plant Carpet                 | Manual    |   |
| i)    | M/s. Abdul Malik Khan & Co. | 44.786% Above                | 55% Above | Rejected being single tender.   |

M/s. Abdul Malik Khan & Co quoted lowest rate i.e. 44.786% Above for Plant Carpet & 55% Above for Manual Carpet on MES Schedule of Rates 2021 for the subject work.

|    |                     |  |       |         |
|----|---------------------|--|-------|---------|
| 3. | WCB-18-08-2022-1592 | Annual repair /maintenance of metalled road, road cut in Ward No.1,8,9&10 (separate rates for plant (JMF) & manual carpeting should be quoted) | 20.00 | 400,000 |
|----|---------------------|--|-------|---------|

| Sr. # | Name of firm               | Rates based on MES Sch. 2021 |               | Rule/Regulation/SBD*/Policy/Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004 |
|-------|----------------------------|------------------------------|---------------|---|
|       |                            | Plant Carpet                 | Manual        |   |
| i)    | M/s. Altaf Hussain & Sons. | 43.786% Above                | 55.555% Above | Rejected being single tender.   |

M/s. Altaf Hussain & Sons quoted lowest rate i.e. 43.786% Above for Plant Carpet & 55.555% Above for Manual Carpet on MES Schedule of Rates 2021 for the subject work.

|    |                     |   |       |         |
|----|---------------------|---|-------|---------|
| 4. | WCB-18-08-2022-1593 | Annual repair /maintenance of PCC Roads/Streets etc. in Ward No.2&3 | 16.00 | 320,000 |
|----|---------------------|---|-------|---------|

| Sr. # | Name of firm               | Rates based on MES Sch. 2021 | Rule/Regulation/SBD*/Policy/Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004 |
|-------|----------------------------|------------------------------|---|
| i).   | M/s. Usman Munir Builders. | 6.19% Above.                 | --  |
| ii)   | M/s. Altaf Hussain & Sons. | 2.313% Below.                | <b>Accepted being Lowest bidder</b>   |
| iii)  | M/s. Shan Traders.         | 15.11% Above.                | --  |

M/s. Altaf Hussain & Sons quoted lowest rate i.e. 2.313% Below on MES Schedule of Rates 2021 for the subject work.

|    |                     |   |       |         |
|----|---------------------|---|-------|---------|
| 5. | WCB-18-08-2022-1594 | Annual repair /maintenance of PCC Roads/Streets etc. in Ward No.4&5 | 16.00 | 320,000 |
|----|---------------------|---|-------|---------|

| Sr. # | Name of firm                     | Rates based on MES Sch. 2021 | Rule/Regulation/SBD*/Policy/Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004 |
|-------|----------------------------------|------------------------------|---|
| i).   | M/s. NazirAftab Construction Co. | 4.60% Above.                 | --  |
| ii)   | M/s. Malik Dilawar               | 9.791% Above                 | --  |
| iii)  | M/s. The Pasha & Sons.           | 0.50% Below                  | <b>Accepted being Lowest bidder</b>   |
| iv)   | M/s. Khan Traders                | 2.01% Above                  | --  |

M/s. The Pasha & Sons quoted lowest rate i.e.0.50% Below on MES Schedule of Rates 2021 for the subject work.

|    |                     |  |       |         |
|----|---------------------|--|-------|---------|
| 6. | WCB-19-08-2022-1595 | Annual repair /maintenance of PCC Roads/Streets etc. in Ward No.1&10 | 16.00 | 320,000 |
|----|---------------------|--|-------|---------|

| Sr. # | Name of firm        | Rates based on MES Sch. 2021 | Rule/Regulation/SBD*/Policy/Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004 |
|-------|---------------------|------------------------------|---|
| i).   | M/s. Sunny Traders. | 6.16% Above.                 | <b>Accepted being Lowest bidder</b>   |
| ii)   | M/s. Shan Traders.  | 18.786% Above                | -   |

M/s. Sunny Traders quoted lowest rate i.e.6.16% Above on MES Schedule of Rates 2021 for the subject work.

|    |                     |  |       |         |
|----|---------------------|--|-------|---------|
| 7. | WCB-19-08-2022-1596 | Annual repair /maintenance of PCC Roads/Streets etc. in Ward No.6&7. | 16.00 | 320,000 |
|----|---------------------|--|-------|---------|

| Sr. # | Name of firm              | Rates based on MES Sch. 2021 | Rule/Regulation/SBD*/Policy/Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004 |
|-------|---------------------------|------------------------------|---|
| i).   | M/s. M. Razzaq& Brothers. | 39.65% Above                 | --  |
| ii)   | M/s. Malik Dilawar        | 14.791% Above                | --  |
| iii)  | M/s. UsmanMunir Builders. | 4.55% Above                  | --  |



|      |                                  |              |                                     |
|------|----------------------------------|--------------|-------------------------------------|
| iv)  | M/s. Shan Traders.               | 15.30% Above | --                                  |
| v)   | M/s. NazirAftab Construction Co. | 4.60% Above  | --                                  |
| vi)  | M/s. Mazher Engineers            | 11.00% Below | <b>Accepted being Lowest bidder</b> |
| vii) | M/s. Sitara Construction Co.     | 2.01% Below  | --                                  |

M/s. Mazher Engineers quoted lowest rate i.e.11.00% Below on MES Schedule of Rates 2021 for the subject work.

|    |                            |  |              |                |
|----|----------------------------|--|--------------|----------------|
| 8. | <b>WCB-19-08-2022-1597</b> | <b>Annual repair /maintenance of PCC Roads/Streets etc. in Ward No.8&amp;9</b> | <b>16.00</b> | <b>320,000</b> |
|----|----------------------------|--|--------------|----------------|

| Sr. # | Name of firm                | Rates based on MES Sch. 2021 | Rule/Regulation/SBD*/Policy/Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004 |
|-------|-----------------------------|------------------------------|---|
| i).   | M/s. Malik Dilawar          | 7.90% Above                  | --  |
| ii)   | M/s. Abdul Malik Khan & Co. | 2.01% Below                  | --  |
| iii)  | M/s. Usman Munir Builders.  | 3.145% Above                 |   |
| iv)   | M/s. Mazher Engineers       | 11.00% Below                 | <b>Accepted being Lowest bidder</b>   |

M/s. Mazher Engineers quoted lowest rate i.e.11.00% Below on MES Schedule of Rates 2021 for the subject work.

#### **MISC PUBLIC IMPROVEMENT**

|    |                            |  |              |                |
|----|----------------------------|--|--------------|----------------|
| 9. | <b>WCB-19-08-2022-1598</b> | <b>Misc. Public improvement works such as footpath, drain cum footpath, culverts, kerb stones, grills, street lights, tuff pavers, improvement of parks, fountains, rubbish enclosures etc. in Ward No.1,6,8,9&amp;10.</b> | <b>35.00</b> | <b>700,000</b> |
|----|----------------------------|--|--------------|----------------|

| Sr. # | Name of firm              | Rates based on MES Sch. 2021 | Rule/Regulation/SBD*/Policy/Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004 |
|-------|---------------------------|------------------------------|---|
| i).   | M/s. The Nascon Engineer. | 7.786% Below.                | <b>Accepted being Lowest bidder</b>   |
| ii)   | M/s. The Pasha & Sons.    | Bidder is unqualified.       | --  |
| iii)  | M/s. Altaf Hussain& Sons. | 7.89% Above.                 | --  |

M/s. The Nascon Engineer quoted lowest rate i.e.7.786% Below on MES Schedule of Rates 2021 for the subject work.

|     |                     |  |       |         |
|-----|---------------------|--|-------|---------|
| 10. | WCB-19-08-2022-1600 | Misc. Public improvement works such as footpath, drain cum footpath, culverts, kerb stones, grills, street lights, tuff pavers, improvement of parks, fountains, rubbish enclosures etc. in Ward No.2,3,4,5&7. | 35.00 | 700,000 |
|-----|---------------------|--|-------|---------|

| Sr. # | Name of firm               | Rates based on MES Sch. 2021 | Rule/Regulation/SBD*/Policy/Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004 |
|-------|----------------------------|------------------------------|---|
| i).   | M/s. Altaf Hussain & Sons. | 4.99% Above.                 | Rejected being single tender.   |

M/s. Altaf Hussain & Sons quoted lowest rate i.e.4.99% Above on MES Schedule of Rates 2021 for the subject work.

### SEWERAGE

|     |                     |  |       |         |
|-----|---------------------|--|-------|---------|
| 11. | WCB-19-08-2022-1601 | Annual repair / maintenance works of sewerage pipeline in Ward No.1. | 10.00 | 200,000 |
|-----|---------------------|--|-------|---------|

| Sr. # | Name of firm                                  | Rates based on MES Sch. 2021 | Rule/Regulation/SBD*/Policy/Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004 |
|-------|---|------------------------------|---|
| i).   | M/s. Arshad Traders.                          | 26.56% Below                 | --  |
| ii)   | M/s. Shan Traders.                            | 23.57% Below                 | --  |
| iii)  | M/s. Haji Liaqat Ali & Sons                   | 22% Below                    | --  |
| iv)   | M/s. The Pasha & Sons.                        | 14% Above.                   | --  |
| v)    | M/s. Rajput and Brothers Construction Company | 21.65% Below                 | --  |
| vi)   | M/s. Altaf Hussain & Sons.                    | 36.786% Below                | Accepted being Lowest bidder  |

M/s. Altaf Hussain & Sons quoted lowest rate i.e.36.786% Below on MES Schedule of Rates 2021 for the subject work.

|     |                     |  |       |         |
|-----|---------------------|--|-------|---------|
| 12. | WCB-19-08-2022-1602 | Annual repair / maintenance works of sewerage pipeline in Ward No.2. | 10.00 | 200,000 |
|-----|---------------------|--|-------|---------|

| Sr. # | Name of firm              | Rates based on MES Sch. 2021 | Rule/Regulation/SBD*/Policy/Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004 |
|-------|---------------------------|------------------------------|---|
| i).   | M/s. Sunny Traders.       | 26.786% Below                | Accepted being Lowest bidder  |
| ii)   | M/s. UsmanMunir Builders. | 19.5559% Below               | --  |
| iii)  | M/s. Shehryar Builders.   | 19.76% Below                 | --  |

M/s. Sunny Traders quoted lowest rate i.e.26.786% Below on MES Schedule of Rates 2021 for the subject work.

|     |                     |  |       |         |
|-----|---------------------|--|-------|---------|
| 13. | WCB-19-08-2022-1603 | Annual repair / maintenance works of sewerage pipeline in Ward No.3. | 10.00 | 200,000 |
|-----|---------------------|--|-------|---------|

| Sr. # | Name of firm                 | Rates based on MES Sch. 2021 | Rule/Regulation/SBD*/Policy/Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004 |
|-------|------------------------------|------------------------------|---|
| i).   | M/s. Haji Liaqat Ali & Sons. | Bidder is unqualified.       | --  |
| ii)   | M/s. The Pasha & Sons.       | Bidder is unqualified.       | --  |
| iii)  | M/s. Khan Traders.           | 31.786% Below.               | Accepted being Lowest bidder  |

M/s. Khan Traders quoted lowest rate i.e.31.786% Below on MES Schedule of Rates 2021 for the subject work.

|     |                     |  |       |         |
|-----|---------------------|--|-------|---------|
| 14. | WCB-19-08-2022-1604 | Annual repair / maintenance works of sewerage pipeline in Ward No.4. | 10.00 | 200,000 |
|-----|---------------------|--|-------|---------|

| Sr. # | Name of firm                     | Rates based on MES Sch. 2021 | Rule/Regulation/SBD*/Policy/Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004 |
|-------|----------------------------------|------------------------------|---|
| i).   | M/s. NazirAftab Construction Co. | 19.0% Below                  | --  |
| ii)   | M/s. Shehryar Builders.          | 14.51% Below                 | --  |
| iii)  | M/s. Sunny Traders.              | 36.36% Below.                | Accepted being Lowest bidder  |



M/s. Sunny Traders quoted lowest rate i.e.36.36% Below on MES Schedule of Rates 2021 for the subject work.

|     |                     |  |       |         |
|-----|---------------------|--|-------|---------|
| 15. | WCB-18-08-2022-1605 | Annual repair / maintenance works of sewerage pipeline in Ward No.5. | 10.00 | 200,000 |
|-----|---------------------|--|-------|---------|

| Sr. # | Name of firm            | Rates based on MES Sch. 2021 | Rule/Regulation/SBD*/Policy/Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004 |
|-------|-------------------------|------------------------------|---|
| i).   | M/s. The Pasha & Sons.  | Bidder is unqualified.       | --  |
| ii)   | M/s. Shehryar Builders. | 33.51% Below                 | --  |
| iii)  | M/s. Sunny Traders.     | 36.36% Below.                | <b>Accepted being Lowest bidder</b>   |

M/s. Sunny Traders quoted lowest rate i.e.36.36% Below on MES Schedule of Rates 2021 for the subject work

|     |                     |  |       |         |
|-----|---------------------|--|-------|---------|
| 16. | WCB-18-08-2022-1606 | Annual repair / maintenance works of sewerage pipeline in Ward No.6. | 10.00 | 200,000 |
|-----|---------------------|--|-------|---------|

| Sr. # | Name of firm               | Rates based on MES Sch. 2021 | Rule/Regulation/SBD*/Policy/Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004 |
|-------|----------------------------|------------------------------|---|
| i).   | M/s. Usman Munir Builders. | 17.87% Below                 | --  |
| ii)   | M/s. Khan Traders.         | 30.786% Below                | --  |
| iii)  | M/s. Sadaat Enterprises.   | 30.90% Below                 | <b>Accepted being Lowest bidder</b>   |
| iv)   | M/s. M. Razzaq & Brothers. | 16.78% Below                 | --  |

M/s. Sadaat Enterprises quoted lowest rate i.e.30.90% Below on MES Schedule of Rates 2021 for the subject work.

|     |                     |  |       |         |
|-----|---------------------|--|-------|---------|
| 17. | WCB-18-08-2022-1607 | Annual repair / maintenance works of sewerage pipeline in Ward No.7. | 10.00 | 200,000 |
|-----|---------------------|--|-------|---------|

| Sr. # | Name of firm                     | Rates based on MES Sch. 2021 | Rule/Regulation/SBD*/Policy/Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004 |
|-------|----------------------------------|------------------------------|---|
| i).   | M/s. NazirAftab Construction Co. | 19.0% Below                  | --  |
| ii)   | M/s. M. Razzaq& Brothers.        | 12.78% Below                 | --  |
| iii)  | M/s. Sadaat Enterprises.         | 26% Below                    | --  |
| iv)   | M/s. Shehryar Builders.          | 29.51% Below                 | --  |
| v)    | M/s. The Pasha & Sons.           | Bidder is unqualified.       | --  |
| vi)   | M/s. Abdul Malik Khan & Co.      | 33.33% Below                 | <b>Accepted being Lowest bidder</b>   |
| vii)  | M/s. Haji Liaqat Ali & Sons.     | 26% Below                    | --  |

M/s. Abdul Malik Khan & Co quoted lowest rate i.e.33.33% Below on MES Schedule of Rates 2021 for the subject work.

|     |                     |  |       |         |
|-----|---------------------|--|-------|---------|
| 18. | WCB-18-08-2022-1609 | Annual repair / maintenance works of sewerage pipeline in Ward No.8. | 10.00 | 200,000 |
|-----|---------------------|--|-------|---------|

| Sr. # | Name of firm                          | Rates based on MES Sch. 2021 | Rule/Regulation/SBD*/Policy/Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004 |
|-------|---------------------------------------|------------------------------|---|
| i).   | M/s. UsmanMunir Builders.             | 21.5559% Below               | --  |
| ii)   | M/s. Khan Traders.                    | 27.786% Below                | <b>Accepted being Lowest bidder</b>   |
| iii)  | M/s. M/s. NazirAftab Construction Co. | 15.40% Below                 | --  |
| iv)   | M/s. M. Razzaq& Brothers.             | 25.78% Below                 | --  |

M/s. Khan Traders quoted lowest rate i.e.27.786% Below on MES Schedule of Rates 2021 for the subject work.



|     |                     |  |       |         |
|-----|---------------------|--|-------|---------|
| 19. | WCB-18-08-2022-1610 | Annual repair / maintenance works of sewerage pipeline in Ward No.9. | 10.00 | 200,000 |
|-----|---------------------|--|-------|---------|

| Sr. # | Name of firm                           | Rates based on MES Sch. 2021 | Rule/Regulation/SBD*/Policy/Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004 |
|-------|--|------------------------------|---|
| i).   | M/s. M/s. Nazir Aftab Construction Co. | 14.50% Below                 | --  |
| ii)   | M/s. Usman Munir Builders.             | 21.09% Below                 | --  |
| iii)  | M/s. Abdul Malik Khan & Co.            | 26.26% Below                 | <b>Accepted being Lowest bidder</b>   |

M/s. Abdul Malik Khan & Co quoted lowest rate i.e.26.26% Below on MES Schedule of Rates 2021 for the subject work.

|     |                     |   |       |         |
|-----|---------------------|---|-------|---------|
| 20. | WCB-18-08-2022-1610 | Annual repair / maintenance works of sewerage pipeline in Ward No.10. | 10.00 | 200,000 |
|-----|---------------------|---|-------|---------|

| Sr. # | Name of firm                             | Rates based on MES Sch. 2021 | Rule/Regulation/SBD*/Policy/Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004 |
|-------|--|------------------------------|---|
| i).   | M/s. Rajput and Brothers Construction Co | 20.49% Below                 | --  |
| ii)   | M/s. Altaf Hussain & Sons.               | 33.09% Below                 | <b>Accepted being Lowest bidder</b>   |
| iii)  | M/s. Nazir Aftab Construction Co.        | 11.80% Below                 | --  |
| iv)   | M/s. Usman Munir Builders.               | 23.81% Below                 | --  |

M/s. Altaf Hussain & Sons quoted lowest rate i.e.33.09% Below on MES Schedule of Rates 2021 for the subject work.

**WATER SUPPLY**

|     |                     |  |       |           |
|-----|---------------------|--|-------|-----------|
| 21. | WCB-18-08-2022-1612 | Annual repair / maintenance works of water supply GI & PE pipeline in Ward No.2,3,4,5,6&7. | 50.00 | 1,000,000 |
|-----|---------------------|--|-------|-----------|

| Sr. # | Name of firm                     | Rates based on MES Sch. 2021 |             | Rule/Regulation/SBD*/Policy/Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004 |
|-------|----------------------------------|------------------------------|-------------|---|
|       |                                  | GI Pipe                      | P.E pipe    |   |
| i)    | M/s. The Industrial Machine Pool | 30% Above.                   | 5% Below    | --  |
| ii)   | M/s. Arshad Traders.             | 21.74% Above                 | 2.17% Below | <b>21.74% Above Lowest for GI Pipe Accepted being Lowest bidder</b>                           |
| iii)  | M/s. Abdul Malik Khan & Co.      | 65% Above                    | 25% Above   | --  |
| iv)   | M/s. Sitara Construction Co.     | 44.15% Above.                | 14% Above   | --  |
| v)    | M/s. NazirAftab Construction Co. | 39.0% Above                  | 5.32% Below | <b>5.32% Below for PE Pipe Accepted being Lowest bidder</b>                                   |

- i) M/s. Arshad Traders quoted lowest rate i.e. 21.74% Above for GI pipe on MES Schedule of Rates 2021 for the subject work.
- ii) M/s. Nazir Aftab Construction Co quoted lowest rate i.e. 5.32% Below for PE pipe on MES Schedule of Rates 2021 for the subject work.

|     |                     |   |       |           |
|-----|---------------------|---|-------|-----------|
| 22. | WCB-18-08-2022-1613 | Annual repair / maintenance works of water supply GI & PE pipeline in Ward No.1,8,9&10. | 50.00 | 1,000,000 |
|-----|---------------------|---|-------|-----------|

| Sr. # | Name of firm                     | Rates based on MES Sch. 2021 |             | Rule/Regulation/SBD*/Policy/Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004 |
|-------|----------------------------------|------------------------------|-------------|---|
|       |                                  | GI Pipe                      | P.E pipe    |   |
| i)    | M/s. The Industrial Machine Pool | 42% Above                    | 15% Above   | --  |
| ii)   | M/s. Sitara Construction Co.     | 48% Above                    | 14% Above   | --  |
| iii)  | M/s. Arshad Traders.             | 23.44% Above                 | 3.21% Below | <b>23.44% Above lowest for GI pipe Accepted being Lowest bidder</b>                           |
| iv)   | M/s. Abdul Malik                 | 65% Above                    | 20% Above   | --  |

|    |                                   |             |             |  |
|----|-----------------------------------|-------------|-------------|--|
|    | Khan & Co.                        |             |             |  |
| v) | M/s. Nazir Aftab Construction Co. | 37.0% Above | 4.60% Below | <b>4.60% Below for lowest PE pipe Accepted being Lowest bidder</b> |

- i) M/s. Arshad Traders quoted lowest rate i.e. 23.44% Above for GI pipe on MES Schedule of Rates 2021 for the subject work.
- ii) M/s. Nazir Aftab Construction Co quoted lowest rate i.e. 4.60% Below for PE pipe on MES Schedule of Rates 2021 for the subject work.



**CANTONMENT EXECUTIVE OFFICER  
WALTON CANTONMENT LAHORE**