



Dated: 19-11-2024

EVALUATION REPORT
(As Per PPRA Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

01	Name of Procuring Agency	Karachi Port Trust
02	Method of Procuring	Notice for inviting Tenders through News Papers Published in Business Recorder & Daily Jang Pakistan on 14-03-2024, KPT & PPRA Websites, under PPRA Rule 36(b) from Bidders i-e Single Stage One Envelope.
03	Title of Procurement	RE-HABILITATION OF RAIL TRACKS AT GATE NO.36 & VARIOUS LOCATIONS AT WEST WHARF.
04	Tender Inquiry No	E/CW-26(538)/
05	PPRA Ref No. (TSE)	TS535003E
06	Date & Time of Bid Closing	07-05-2024 at 10:30 AM
07	Date & Time of Bid Opening	07-05-2024 at 11:00 AM
08	No. of Bid Received	(01) One Nos.
08	Criteria of Bid Evaluation	lowest evaluated bid
09	Detail of Bid (s) Evaluation	As Per Departmental Tender Committee Report (attached).

S. No.	Name of Bidder	Marks		Evaluated Cost	Rule / Regulation / SBD / Policy / Basis of Rejection/Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules,2004
		Technical (If Applicable)	Financial (If Applicable)		
1.	M/s. Al-Madad Construction Co.	N/A	N/A	Rs. 55,891,552.50	Lowest Bid Accepted

Lowest Evaluated Bidder: - M/s. Al-Madad Construction Co.

11. Any other additional /supporting information, the procuring agency may like to share (DTC) Report and Comparative Statement).

Signature _____

Official Stamp _____
EXECUTIVE ENGINEER (PW)

**Head Office. Eduljee Dinshaw Road I. I. Chundrigar Road, Karachi Phone # 99214530-40
Fax # 99214329-30**

Evaluation Results

Organization Name: *Karachi Port Trust*

Evaluation No	Evaluation Result Title	Download	Uploaded Date
EV62233	Karachi Port Trust Final Evaluation Fixing of Pavers..... E/N-2(153)/ TS539084E		8/7/2024
EV62236	Karachi Port Trust Technical Evaluation Rehabilitation of Rail Tracks..... E/CW-26(538) TS535003E		8/7/2024
EV61954	Karachi Port Trust Final Evaluation Maintenance/Repairs and Allied Work..... E/CS-2(03)/ TS535707E		27/6/2024
EV61951	Karachi Port Trust Final Evaluation Rehabilitation of Fountain..... E/N-2(152)/ TS535918E		27/6/2024
EV62156	Karachi Port Trust Final Evaluation RENOVATION OF CHAIRMANS OFFICE WASHROOM E/N-2(148)/ TS535923E		20/6/2024
EV61753	Karachi Port Trust Final Evaluation MAINTENANCE REPAIR TO KITCHEN FACILITY E/CS-2(1009)/ TS535697E		20/6/2024
EV61700	Karachi Port Trust Final Evaluation Maintenance and Repair Boundary Wall... E/CS-2(1014)/ TS535614E		14/6/2024
EV61144	Karachi Port Trust Final Evaluation Rehabilitation of The Roads..... E/N-2(128)/ TS528345E		30/5/2024
EV61118	Karachi Port Trust Final Evaluation Maintenance Repair Work..... E/N-2(137)/ TS534910E		29/5/2024

COMPARATIVE STATEMENT

NAME OF WORK		<u>RE-HABILITATION OF RAIL TRACKS AT GATE NO. 36 & VARIOUS LOCATIONS AT WEST WHARF</u>
FILE NO.		E/CW-26(538)
ESTIMATED COST		Rs. 47,120,305.60
DATE OF OPENING OF FINANCIAL PROPOSAL		06-06-2024
S. No.	Name of Bidder	Amount Quoted
1.	M/s. Al-Madad Construction Co.	Rs.55,891,552.00

10/7.
GENERAL MANAGER (O)
(MEMBER)
✓ 10/7/24

10/7/24
GENERAL MANAGER (E)
(MEMBER)

10/7/24
GENERAL MANAGER (P&D)
(MEMBER)

10/7/24
GENERAL MANAGER (F)
(MEMBER)

10/7/24
DIRECTOR PORT INTELLIGENCE
(MEMBER)

10/7/24
GENERAL MANAGER (CW)
(CONVENOR)

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE DEPARTMENTAL TENDER COMMITTEE HELD ON 10-07-2024 IN THE COMMITTEE ROOM OF THE ENGINEERING DEPARTMENT, KPT.

NAME OF WORK:- RE-HABILITATION OF RAIL TRACKS AT GATE NO. 36 & VARIOUS LOCATIONS AT WEST WHARF.

1. The Rail Tracks in the West Wharf Port area at Gate No. 36 were laid down by the KPT in early 1960s, and same are under the use of Pakistan Railways for embarkation / disembarkation of cargo.
2. The routine maintenance of the 03 Nos. tracks at Gate No. 36 used by Pakistan Railways is being done by KPT Permanent Way Sub-Division and accordingly, with the passage of time these tracks have become dilapidated, due to wear / tear and extensive use of the same.

Further it is pertinent to mentioned here that, these tracks have outlived their useful life and are in deteriorated condition & have also sunk at some locations, causing a lot of derailments, resulting time to time unnecessary delay in the train movement, as observed by this Department & Pakistan Railways Authorities.

3. Due to frequent derailments of Railway Wagons severe damages have occurred to the Rail Tracks, hence, it is deemed necessary that, the tracks at Gate No. 36 be re-habilitated. In this regard, the Pakistan Railways Authorities have also communicated to KPT regarding the deteriorated condition of rail tracks (vide their letter placed at F/A) and hence the work of Re-habilitation of Rail Tracks have now become imperative.
4. Hence, Dy. Chief Engineer-I alongwith the Executive Engineer & Asstt. Executive Engineer (PW) of KPT visited the site, wherein it was observed that, some of the Tracks needs immediate repair / rehabilitation work which includes, the Rail Track length of approximately 130 T/Mtr. and the area of flush track which is to be re-carpeted is about 6,000 Sq. mtr.
5. Accordingly, AXEN (PW) has prepared an Estimate amounting to Rs.46,196,378.00 alongwith a Plan placed at S.No.1/A & 1/B respectively, for attending the work through outsourcing, as the same is beyond the scope of In-house arrangements.
The Estimate is based on current market rates including 13% SRB, but now the SRB has been revised as 15% by Govt. of Sindh (ref. placed at F/A) & hence addition of 2% SRB has been taken into amount of Rs. 817,634.50 & now the estimate amounts of Rs. 47,014,013.00.
6. Subsequently, the tenders were invited through Press, KPT / PPRA & MoMA Websites on 14-03-2024 in accordance to the Rule 36 (b) of PPRA and received on 07-05-2024.
7. In response, the following Two (02) Firms submitted their sealed Technical & Financial Proposals.

S.No.	Name of Firms
1.	M/s. Al-Madad Construction Co.
2.	M/s. Valiant Corporation

8. Technical Proposals of the above 02 firms were opened on same day in the presence of the Committee Members or their representative viz:

1.	Rep. of Chief Engineer
2.	Rep. of Manager Finance
3.	Rep. of Traffic Manager
4.	Rep. of Manager IR&W
5.	Rep. of Director Port Intelligence

9. After the opening of Technical Proposals, an In-house Committee comprising on the following members was constituted by the Chief Engineer KPT vide letter at S.No.27, directed to examine the received Technical Bids as per the criteria and submit their Technical Evaluation Report.

1.	Engr. Ismail Soomro	Dy. Chief Engineer-I	Convener
2.	Engr. Mansoor Bhutto	Executive Engineer (W)	Member
3.	Engr. Salman Bashir	Executive Engineer (PW)	Member
4.	Engr. Muhammad Khan	Asst. Executive Engineer (W)	Member
5.	Mr. Haris Usman Rep. of Finance Division	Asstt. Manager (Finance)	Member

10. The In-house Technical Evaluation Committee carried out the Evaluation of the Bids and has recommended the only one firm which stood Technically Qualified out of the 02 Nos. firms. (ref. is placed at S.No. 32).

S.No.	Name of Firms	Remarks
1.	M/s. Al-Madad Construction Co.	Qualified

11. Subsequently, Technical Report was placed before the DTC's Committee and the same agreed with the recommendations of the Technical Evaluation Committee and further recommended that, Financial Bids of the only Technically Qualified firm M/s. Al-Madad Construction Co. for the work of **"RE-HABILITATION OF RAIL TRACKS AT GATE NO. 36 & VARIOUS LOCATIONS AT WEST WHARE"** may please be opened, with the approval of the Competent Authority. (ref. is placed at S.No.34).
12. The Chairman's approval was received as per recommendations of DTC for the opening of Financial Proposals of the Bidders on 06-06-2024. (PP-33 & 34)
13. Accordingly, the Financial Proposal for the Technically Qualified Bidder was opened on 27-06-2024 and the result is tabulated as under:

	A	B	C	D	E	F
Name of Firm	Amount of Bid Inclusive of 5% Contingencies (Rs.)	13% SRB for the F.Y 2023-24 (Rs.)	15% SRB as per new revised SST for the FY 2024-25 (Rs.)	Total Bid Prices (Rs.) @13% SRB	Total Bid Prices (Rs.) @15% SRB	Differences of Bid Amount (Rs.)
				(A + B)	(A+C)	(D - E)
M/s. Al-Madad Construction Co.	48,601,350.00	6,318,175.00	7,290,202.50	54,919,525.50	55,891,552.50	972,027.00

- a) Authority of Sanction. KPT Board
- b) Budget Provision figures. Rs. 480 (M)
- c) Estimated Cost Rs. 46,196,378.00 (Inclusive 13% SRB)
2% has been revised by Sindh Government.
Rs. 47,014,013.00 (Inclusive 15% SRB)


- d) Debit Head The cost of work will be debited to "Capital Expenditure" Head of Accounts Code No.01013012-082199 (Other Structures East wharf / West Wharf) Project No. 16002 of 2023-24 (ADP) wherein an amount of Rs.480 (M) have been proposed under budget 2024-2025.
- e) Date on which Tender Notice was Published on Press & KPT, MoMA & PPRA Web Sites. 14-03-2024
- f) Date of opening of Bids Technical 07-05-2024
Financial 27-06-2024
- g) Total No. of Tenders Sold. Not known (Uploaded from Websites)
- h) Total No. of Tenders received. 02 Nos.
- i) Date when Departmental Tender Committee meeting held. Technical 27-05-2024
Financial 10-07-2024
- j) Detail of offers received. Total 02 Nos. Bids received out of which 01 No. Technically Qualified
- | <u>S.No.</u> | <u>Name of Technically Qualified Bidders</u> | <u>Quoted Tendered Amount Including 5%Contingencies</u> | <u>Corrected Tendered Amount Including 5%Contingencies</u> |
|--------------|--|---|--|
| 1. | M/s. Al-Madad Construction Co. | Rs. 54,919,525.50
(18.88% Above) | Rs. 55,891,552.00
(18.88% Above) |
- k) Position of offer recommended for acceptance as compared with other offers Most Advantageous / Single Evaluated Bid
- l) Validity period of the offers. Six Months expiring on 06-11-2024
- m) Past performance of the tenderer recommended and how they behaved in the past. M/s. Al-Madad Construction Co. is registered in C-5 Category with Pakistan Engineering Council. They have carried out many works for KPT, and their past performance on those works are found satisfactory.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The Most Advantageous / Single Evaluated Bid amounting to Rs.55,891,552.50 (Rupees: Fifty Five Million Eight Hundred Ninety One Thousand Five Hundred Fifty Two & Fifty Paise Only) received in accordance under Clause PPRA Rule 36 (b) from M/s.Al-Madad Construction Co. which is 18.88% above the corresponding estimated cost of Rs. 47,014,013.00 (Inclusive 15% SRB) based on current market rates is considered reasonable. Keeping in view of their past performance as mentioned in Para(m), M/s. Al-Madad Construction Co. is considered capable for carrying out the work viz. **"RE-HABILITATION OF RAIL TRACKS AT GATE NO. 36 & VARIOUS LOCATIONS AT WEST WHARF"**.

It is pertinent to mentioned here that the estimated cost of work was Rs. 47,014,013.00 (Inclusive 15% SRB). However, the received Bid of the Bidder M/s. Al-Madad Construction Co. is Rs.55,891,552.50, which is greater than Rs.50.0(M), therefore the DTC report is placed before the GMs' Committee for consideration.


The Committee therefore, recommends the acceptance of the Most Advantageous / Single Evaluated Bid amounting to Rs.55,891,552.00 (Rupees: Fifty Five Million Eight Hundred Ninety One Thousand Five Hundred Fifty Two Only) inclusive of 15% SRB received from M/s. Al-Madad Construction Co. is considered reasonable for the work viz. **“RE-HABILITATION OF RAIL TRACKS AT GATE NO. 36 & VARIOUS LOCATIONS AT WEST WHARF”**.


GENERAL MANAGER (O)
(MEMBER)
10/7/24


GENERAL MANAGER (E)
(MEMBER)
10/7/24


GENERAL MANAGER (P&D)
(MEMBER)
30/7


GENERAL MANAGER (F)
(MEMBER)
10/7/24


DIRECTOR PORT INTELEGEENCE
(MEMBER)
10/7/24


GENERAL MANAGER (CW)
(CONVENOR)
10/7/24