### EVALUATION REPORT (As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules. 2004)

1. Name of Procuring Agency

: CANTONMENT BOARD MALIR

2. Method of Procurement

: Single Stage Single Envelop (Online Electronic

tenders)

3. Title of Procurement

: ANNUAL REPAIR / MAINTENANCE AND

ORIGINAL WORKS FOR THE YEAR

2021-2022

4. Tender Inquiry No

: Tender Notice vide dallies "Dawn" and "Express"

Karachi dated: 05.10.2021

5. PPRA Ref. No.(TSE)

: TS461227E dated 4-10-2021

6. Date & time of Bid Closing

: 20.10.2021 at 1200 hrs

7.Date & time of Bid Opening

: 20.10.2021 at 1400 hrs

8. No of Bid Received

: Total 140 Nos

9. Criteria for Bid Evaluation

: Bid in % Based on MES Schedule of Rates 2014

10.Detail of Bid(s) Evaluation

: Given Below

#### A. ORIGINAL WORKS:

#### 1. <u>CONSTRUCTION OF BOUNDARY WALL & ENTRY /EXIT GATE AT DOHS-II</u> <u>ESTIMATED COST RS.21.000 (M)</u>

S. No.	Name of Firm / Contractor	Schedule Item Tender Rates Above/ Below MES Schedule of Rates 2014	Remarks
1	M/s Uzma Associates	03.20% above	Lowest
2	M/s Ramsha Enterprises	04.11% above	
3	M/s Classic Enterprise	10.00 % above	
4	M/s Standard Corporation	16.00 % above	
5	M/s Sher Ali & Brothers	17.30 % above	
6	M/s O.S Construction Company	18.00 % above	
7	M/s Al-Hakeem Builders	43.66 % above	
8	M/s AEA Brothers Construction Co	49.60 % above	

The lowest rates 3.20% above on MES Schedule of Rates 2014 offered by M/s Uzma Associates.

#### 2. <u>CONSTRUCTION OF 4X WATER FILTRATION PLANTS IN ENTIRE CANTT AREA- ESTIMATED COST RS.12.000 (M)</u>

S. No.	Name of Firm / Contractor	Schedule Item Tender Rates Above/ Below MES Schedule of Rates 2014	Remarks
1	M/s Uzma Associates	9.94% Below	Lowest
2	M/s M.R Enterprises & Brothers	01.00% Below	
3	M/s Shahfaisal & Brothers	02.95% above	
4	M/s H&S Construction	15.05% above	
5	M/s Standard Corporation	20.00 % above	

6	M/s O.S Construction Company	22.00 % above	***
7	M/s AEA Brothers Construction Co	23.99 % above	

The lowest rates 9.94% Below on MES Schedule of Rates 2014 offered by M/s Uzma Associates.

## 3. <u>IMPROVEMENT OF SHUHADA ROAD FROM CP-01 TO SARWAR SHAHEED ROAD- ESTIMATED COST RS.36.350 (M).</u>

S. No.	Name of Firm / Contractor	Schedule Item Tender Rates Above/ Below MES Schedule of Rates 2014	Remarks
1	M/s Classic Enterprise	17.7% Below	Lowest
2	M/s Sher Ali & Brothers	12.25 % Below	***
3	M/s Shah Faisal & Brothers	11.11 % Below	
4	M/s R-Tech	05.85 % Below	
5	M/s Haider Builders	03.00 % Above	
6	M/s Standard Corporation	04.00 % Above	
7	M/s Rafiq & Sons	10.50 % Above	

The lowest rates 17.7% Below on MES Schedule of Rates 2014 offered by M/s Classic Enterprise.

#### 4. <u>IMPROVEMENT OF HUSSAIN SHAHEED ROAD FROM JAHAZ CHOWK TO</u> FOUNTAIN CHOWK- ESTIMATED COST RS.39.150(M)

S. No.	Name of Firm / Contractor	Schedule Item Tender Rates Above/ Below MES Schedule of Rates 2014	Remarks
1	M/s R-Tech	24.75% Below	Lowest
2	M/s Classic Enterprise	12.3 % Below	
3	M/s Mehran Construction	10.75 % Below	•••
4	M/s Sher Ali & Brothers	9.9 % Below	
5	M/s Haider Builders	9.00 % Below	
6	M/s Ghaffar & Sons	3.00 % Below	
7	M/s Standard Corporation	10.00 % Above	
8	M/s Rafiq & Sons	12.50 % Above	

The lowest rates 24.75% Below on MES Schedule of Rates 2014 offered by M/s R-Tech.

#### 5. <u>IMPROVEMENT OF SARWAR SHAHEED ROAD FROM SECTOR-G TO IFTIKHAR ROAD – ESTIMATED COST RS.39.210 (M)</u>

S. No.	Name of Firm / Contractor	Schedule Item Tender Rates Above/ Below MES Schedule of Rates 2014	Remarks
1	M/s R-Tech	24.65% Below	Lowest
2_	M/s Ramsha Enterprises	11.11% Below	***
3	M/s Haider Builders	09.00 % Below	
4	M/s Classic Enterprise	05.10 % Below	
5	M/s Sher Ali & Brothers	05.00 % Below	
6	M/s Amir Sawab & Brothers	05.00 % Above	
7	M/s Standard Corporation	07.00 % Above	~

8 M/s Rafiq & Sons	11.55 % Above	

The lowest rates 24.65% Below on MES Schedule of Rates 2014 offered by M/s R-Tech.

#### 6. IMPROVEMENT OF SARWAR SHAHEED ROAD FROM EME WORK SHOP TO FOUNTAIN CHOWK- ESTIMATED COST RS.39.562 (M)

S. No.	Name of Firm / Contractor	Schedule Item Tender Rates Above/ Below MES Schedule of Rates 2014	Remarks
1	M/s Amir Sawab & Brothers	12.35%Below	Lowest
2	M/s R-Tech	09.75% Below	
3	M/s Haider Builders	09.00% Below	
4	M/s Classic Enterprise	05.10 % Below	
5	M/s Standard Corporation	12.00 % Above	
6	M/s Rafiq & Sons	14.00 % Above	

The lowest rates 12.35% Below on MES Schedule of Rates 2014 offered by M/s Amir Sawab & Brothers

## 7. IMPROVEMENT OF SARWAR SHAHEED ROAD FROM MISSILE CHOWK TO JINNAH SPORTS COMPLEX – ESTIMATED COST RS.39.800 (M)

S. No.	Name of Firm / Contractor	Schedule Item Tender Rates Above/ Below MES Schedule of Rates 2014	Remarks
1	M/s Humayoun Khan & Sons	11.00%Below	Lowest
2	M/s R-Tech	09.99% Below	
3	M/s Classic Enterprise	08.00 %Below	
4	M/s Standard Corporation	05.00 % Above	
5	M/s Amir Sawab & Brothers	06.00 % Above	
6	M/s Rafiq & Sons	10.99 % Above	

The lowest rates 11.00% Below on MES Schedule of Rates 2014 offered by M/s Humayoun Khan & Sons.

## 8. <u>IMPROVEMENT / INSTALLATION OF LED STREETLIGHTS ALONGWITH POLES AT LINK STREETS DOHS-I – ESTIMATED COST RS.14.750 (M)</u>

S. No.	Name of Firm / Contractor	Schedule Item Tender Rates Above/ Below MES Schedule of Rates 2014	Remarks
1	M/s Standard Corporation	05.00 %above	Lowest
2	M/s ST & Sons	17.70 % above	
3	M/s Mehran Construction Company	20.95 % above	
4	M/s O.S Construction Company	27.00 % above	
	M/s Al-Zaman Construction Co	29.00 % above	

The lowest rates 05.00% above on MES Schedule of Rates 2014 offered by M/s Standard Corporation.

# 9. IMPROVEMENT / INSTALLATION OF LED STREET LIGHTS ALONG WITH POLES, STORM WATER DRAIN & FOOTPATH AT SARWAR SHAHEED ROAD FROM SECTOR-G TO IFTIKHAR ROAD - ESTIMATED COST RS.19.000 (M)

S. No.	Name of Firm / Contractor	Schedule Item Tender Rates Above/ Below MES Schedule of Rates 2014	Remarks
1	M/s Standard Corporation	09.50 %Below	Lowest
2	M/s ST & Sons	17.70 % above	esi ési én
3	M/s O.S Construction Company	23.00 % above	4440
4	M/s Sher Ali & Brothers	26.78 % above	
5	M/s Ghaffar & Sons	31.32 % above	•••
6	M/s Al-Zaman Construction Co	35.75 % above	

The lowest rates 09.50% Below on MES Schedule of Rates 2014 offered by M/s Standard Corporation.

# 10. IMPROVEMENT / INSTALLATION OF LED STREET LIGHTS ALONGWITH POLES, STORM WATER DRAIN & FOOTPATH AT SARWAR SHAHEED ROAD FROM EME WORK SHOP TO FOUNTAIN CHOWK.— ESTIMATED COST RS. 17.200 (M)

S. No.	Name of Firm / Contractor	Schedule Item Tender Rates Above/ Below MES Schedule of Rates 2014	Remarks
1	M/s Standard Corporation	09.00 %Below	Lowest
2	M/s ST & Sons	17.70 % above	
3	M/s O.S Construction Company	23.00 % above	
4	M/s Ghaffar & Sons	28.90 % above	
5	M/s Al-Zaman Construction Co	34.85 % above	

The lowest rates 09.00% Below on MES Schedule of Rates 2014 offered by M/s Standard Corporation.

#### 11. <u>UPLIFTING / IMPROVEMENT OF SAFOORA CHOWK - ESTIMATED COST</u> RS.34.428 (M)

S. No.	Name of Firm / Contractor	Schedule Item Tender Rates Above/ Below MES Schedule of Rates 2014	Remarks
1	M/s Standard Corporation	09.90 %Below	Lowest
2	M/s Rafiq & Sons	03.99 %Below	
3	M/s Haider Builders	03.00% Below	
4	M/s Pak Construction	01.00 % above	
5	M/s Al-Zaman Construction Co	22.15 % above	
6	M/s Ghaffar & Sons	35.36 % above	

The lowest rates 09.90% Below on MES Schedule of Rates 2014 offered by M/s Standard Corporation.

## 12. <u>UPLIFTING / IMPROVEMENT OF RIM JHIM - ESTIMATED COST RS.20.000 (M)</u>

S. No.	Name of Firm / Contractor	Schedule Item Tender Rates Above/ Below MES Schedule of Rates 2014	Remarks
1	M/s Standard Corporation	07.00 %Below	Lowest
2	M/s Rafiq & Sons	02.00 % Below	a in (in
3	M/s Pak Construction	01.00 % above	
4	M/s Sher Ali & Brothers	04.79 % above	
5	M/s Haider Builders	05.00 % above	
6	M/s Mehran Construction Company	06.75 % above	
7	M/s Uzma Associates	07.50 % above	
8	M/s Classic Enterprises	10.50 % above	40.00
9	M/s Al-Zaman Construction Co	13.50 % above	***
10	M/s Al-Hakeem Builders	43.66 % above	

The lowest 07.00 % Below on MES Schedule of Rates 2014 offered by M/s Standard Corporation.

## 13. <u>UPLIFTING / IMPROVEMENT OF SAADI TOWN – ESTIMATED COST RS.10.000 (M)</u>

S. No.	Name of Firm / Contractor	Schedule Item Tender Rates Above/ Below MES Schedule of Rates 2014	Remarks
1	M/s O.S Construction Company	09.00 % Below	Lowest
2	M/s Standard Corporation	05.00 % Below	
3	M/s Sher Ali & Brothers	02.00 % Below	
4	M/s Pak Construction	01.00 % above	
5	M/s Rafiq & Sons	01.00 % above	
6	M/s Humayoun Khan & Sons	05.75 % above	
7	M/s Uzma Associates	07.50 % above	
8	M/s Al-Zaman Construction Co	09.25 % above	***
9	M/s H&S Construction	14.95 % above	
10	M/s Al-Hakeem Builders	43.66% above	***
11	M/s Altaf Hussain Jatoi & Company		

The lowest rates 09.00% Below on MES Schedule of Rates 2014 offered by M/s O.S Construction Company.

#### B. REPAIR & MAINTENANCE WORKS:

1. REPAIR / MAINTENANCE OF CANTT BOARD BUILDINGS - ESTIMATED

S. No.	Name of Firm / Contractor	Schedule Item Tender Rates Above/ Below MES Schedule of Rates 2014	Remarks
1	M/s Shah Faisal & Brothers	05.00% Below	Lowest
2	M/s H&S Construction	09.45 % above	
	M/s O.S Construction Company	19.00% above	
4	M/s ST & Sons	24.00% above	
5	M/s Standard Corporation	25.00% above	
6	M/s AEA Brothers Construction Co	40.65% above	

The lowest rates 05.00% Below on MES Schedule of Rates 2014 offered by M/s Shah Faisal & Brothers.

2. REPAIR / PATCH WORK ETC. OF ROADS IN CANTT AREA – ESTIMATED COST RS.35.000(M)

S. No.	Name of Firm / Contractor	Schedule Item Tender Rates Above/ Below MES Schedule of Rates 2014	Remarks
1	M/s R-Tech	27.25% Below	Lowest
2	M/s ST & Sons	15.00% Below	
3	M/s Pak Construction	01.00% above	
4	M/s Abdul Ghaffar & Sons	13.00% above	400
5	M/s Standard Corporation	20.00% above	
6	M/s Rafiq & Sons	25.16% above	

The lowest rates 27.25% Below on MES Schedule of Rates 2014 offered by M/s R-Tech.

### 3. REPAIR / MAINTENANCE OF DRAINS / SEWERAGE LINES - ESTIMATED COST RS.24.000 (M)

S. No.	Name of Firm / Contractor	Schedule Item Tender Rates Above/ Below MES Schedule of Rates 2014	Remarks
1	M/s Shah Faisal & Brothers	25.00% Below	Lowest
2	M/s TNS Enterprises	20.25 % Below	
3	M/s ST & Sons	19.60 % Below	***
4	M/s Haider Builders	15.00 % Below	
5	M/s Hamza Brothers	13.00 % Below	
6	M/s Sher Ali & Brothers	09.99 % Below	
7	M/s Pak Construction	01.00 % above	
8	M/s Abdul Ghaffar & Sons	19.90 % above	
9	M/s AEA Brothers Construction Co	22.00% above	
10	M/s Altaf Hussain Jatoi &		
	Company		

The lowest rates 25.00 % Below on MES Schedule of Rates 2014 offered by M/s Shah Faisal & Brothers.

# 4. REPAIR / MAINTENANCE / LEAKAGES OF WATER SUPPLY LINES IN CANTT AREA – ESTIMATED COST RS.10.000 (M)

S. No.	Name of Firm / Contractor	Schedule Item Tender Rates Above/ Below MES Schedule of Rates 2014	Remarks
1	M/s H&S Construction	10.95 % Below	Lowest
-	M/s Hamza Brothers	9.05 % Below	
3	M/s Sher Ali & Brothers	1.89 % above	***
4	M/s R-Tech	5.75 % above	
- 5	M/s TNS Enterprises	18.00 % above	
	M/s AEA Brothers Construction Co	60.00% above	
6			
7	M/s Altaf Hussain Jatoi &		
	Company		

The lowest rates 10.95 % Below on MES Schedule of Rates 2014 offered by M/s H&S Construction.

## 5. REPAIR / MAINTENANCE OF MISC PUBLIC IMPROVEMENTS / PARKS-ESTIMATED COST RS.100.000 (M)

S. No.	Name of Firm / Contractor	Schedule Item Tender Rates Above/ Below MES Schedule of Rates 2014	Remarks
1	M/s Standard Corporation	03.00% Below	Lowest
2	M/s ST&Sons	05.10 % above	
3	M/s Amir Sawab & Brothers	12.00 % above	***
4	M/s OS Construction Company	13.00 % above	
5	M/s Al-Zaman Construction Co	13.95 % above	
6	M/s Rafiq & Sons	24.99 % above	
7	M/s Abdul Ghaffar & Sons	29.80 % above	

The lowest rates 03.00% Below on MES Schedule of Rates 2014 offered by M/s Standard Corporation.

#### 6. REPAIR / MAINTENANCE OF CB HEALTH CENTER BUILDINGS-ESTIMATED COST RS.5.000 (M)

S. No.	Name of Firm / Contractor	Schedule Item Tender Rates Above/ Below MES Schedule of Rates 2014	Remarks
I	M/s Shah Faisal & Brothers	03.00% Below	Lowest
2	M/s OS Construction Company	18.00% above	
3	M/s Standard Corporation	20.00 % above	

The lowest rates 03.00% Below on MES Schedule of Rates 2014 offered by M/s Shah Faisal & Brothers.

# 7. REPAIR / MAINTENANCE OF BUILDING OF CANTT PUBLIC PG COLLEGE FOR WOMEN, MALIR CANTT-ESTIMATED COST RS.10.000 (M)

S. No.	Name of Firm / Contractor	Schedule Item Tender Rates Above/ Below MES Schedule of Rates 2014	Remarks
1	M/s Shah Faisal & Brothers	05.00% Below	Lowest
2	M/s H&S Construction	12.75% above	
3	M/s ST & Sons	17.70% above	
4	M/s OS Construction Company	18.00% above	
- 4-	M/s Uzma Associates	20.01% above	
<del></del>	M/s Standard Corporation	26.00% above	
6	M/s AEA Brothers Construction Co	38.60% above	
$\frac{7}{8}$	M/s Al-Hakeem Builders	38.86% above	

The lowest rates 05.00% Below on MES Schedule of Rates 2014 offered by M/s Shah Faisal & Brothers.

Cantonment Executive Officer
Malir Cantonment

#### Copy to:-

- 1. Account Branch.
- 2. IT Branch for Publication on PPRA website.
- 3. Mater file.