

Bid Evaluation Report

(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

- 1 Name of Procuring Agency: Zarai Taraqiati Bank Limited
- 2 Method of Procurement: Single-Stage-Two-Envelops Procedures as provided under Rules 36(b) of Public Procurement Rules, 2004
- 3 Title of Procurement: Procurement of Third Party Head Hunting Services for Assistance in Recruitments Within Different Cadres of ZTBL on As-And-When Required Basis
- 4 Tender Inquiry No.: ZTBL-HR-01-2021/2
- 5 PPRA Ref. No. (TSE): TS457676E
- 6 Date & Time of Bid Closing: September 02, 2021 11:00 AM
- 7 Date & Time of Bid Opening: September 02, 2021 11:30 AM (Technical Proposals)
September 22, 2021 03:00 PM (Financial Proposals)
- 8 No of Bids Received:
(for each of 3 assignments)

Assignment-I	Assignment-II	Assignment-III
Seven (7)	Six (6)	Four (4)
- 9 Criteria for Bid Evaluation: As prescribed in the Bidding Document / RFP
- 10 Details of Bid(s) Evaluation:

10.1 **Assignment-I** ... Executive Search for senior management positions of rank of SEVP, EVP and SVP

#	Name of Bidder	Marks/ Score Assigned			Evaluated Cost		Basis for Rejection / Acceptance
		Technical Score	Financial Score	Total (Weighted)	Fee Code	Amount (in Pak Rs.)	
1	HRSG Recruiting	55.80	44.14	53.47	F1-a	=550,000/-	Technically Responsive
					F1-b	=550,000/-	
					F1-c	=550,000/-	
					F2	=25,000/-	
2	Human Resource Solutions International	83.00	100.00	86.40	F1-a	=271,200/-	Technically Responsive
					F1-b	=220,350/-	
					F1-c	=134,470/-	
					F2	=25,000/-	
3	Sidat Hyder Morshed Associates	X	X	X	X	Rejected See Note-1	
4	A.F. Ferguson	70.81	33.07	63.26	F1-a	=700,000/-	Technically Responsive
					F1-b	=700,000/-	
					F1-c	=700,000/-	
					F2	=40,000/-	
5	Executive Network Intl	X	X	X	X	Rejected See Note-2	
6	Open Testing Services	X	X	X	X	Rejected See Note-3	
7	Naseeb Online Services	74.22	75.94	74.56	F1-a	=341,250/-	Technically Responsive
					F1-b	=288,750/-	
					F1-c	=210,000/-	
					F2	=25,000/-	

Most Advantageous Bidder (for Assignment-I): M/s Human Resource Solutions International (HRSI)

10.2 **Assignment –II ...** Recruitments at Middle & Junior Management Level Positions (OG-II to VP)

#	Name of Bidder	Marks/ Score Assigned			Evaluated Cost		Basis for Rejection / Acceptance
		Technical Score	Financial Score	Total (Weighted)	Fee Code	Amount (in Pak Rs.)	
1	HRSG Recruiting	59.81	19.69	51.79	F3 -a	=450,000/-	Technically Responsive
					F3 -b	=450,000/-	
					F3-C	=450,000/-	
					F3-d	=450,000/-	
					F4	=20,000/-	
					F5	=20,000/-	
2	Human Resource Solutions International	73.96	98.00	78.77	F3 -a	=101,700/-	Technically Responsive
					F3 -b	=18,580/-	
					F3-C	=56,500/-	
					F3-d	=11,300/-	
					F4	=25,000/-	
					F5	=25,000/-	
3	Sidat Hyder Morshed Associates	X	X	X	X 3		Rejected See Note-1
4	A.F. Ferguson	52.28	18.97	45.62	F3 -a	=350,000/-	Technically Responsive
					F3 -b	=350,000/-	
					F3-C	=350,000/-	
					F3-d	=350,000/-	
					F4	=40,000/-	
					F5	=25,000/-	
5	Open Testing Services	X	X	X	X		Rejected See Note-4
6	Rozee.pk Naseeb Online Services	86.80	54.72	80.38	F3 -a	=136,500/-	Technically Responsive
					F3 -b	=110,000/-	
					F3-C	=57,750/-	
					F3-d	=52,500/-	
					F4	=25,000/-	
					F5	=25,000/-	

Most Advantageous Bidder (for Assignment-II): M/s Naseeb Online Services Pvt Ltd (Rozee.pk)

10.3 **Assignment –III ...** Batch Hiring (for entry level position of OG-III)

#	Name of Bidder	Marks/ Score Assigned			Evaluated Cost		Basis for Rejection / Acceptance
		Technical Score	Financial Score	Total (Weighted)	Fee Code	Amount (in Pak Rs.)	
1	A.F. Ferguson	X	X	X	X		Rejected See Note-5
2	Open Testing Services	90.00	100.00	92.00	F6 -a	= 3,500,000/-	Technically Responsive
					F6 -b	= 5,000,000/-	
					F6 -c	=4,200,000/-	
					F7	=15,000/-	
					F8	=10,000/-	
3	Allied Testing Services	X	X	X	X		Rejected See Note-6
4	Naseeb Online Services	X	X	X	X		Rejected See Note-7

Most Advantageous Bidder (for Assignment-III): M/s Open Testing Services (OTS)

11 Any other additional / supporting information:

11.1 Notes to Section (10) above

Note-1:

M/s Sidat Hyder Morshed Associates (Pvt) Ltd through their letter no. M/0220/2021 dated 13.09.2021 conveyed to withdraw their bid with request not to take adverse action against them. Hence, their bid was **rejected** without any penal action against them as per provisions of the RFP.

Note-2:

M/s Executive Network Intl (ENI) through their email dated 13.09.2021 wished not to further participate in the bidding process and hence their bid was **rejected** without any penal action against them as per provisions of the RFP.

Note-3:

Proposal of M/s Open Testing Services (OTS) was found **non-compliant** to Condition (2) of the 'Qualification Criteria' regarding bidder's experience of providing head hunting services for senior management level positions (SVP, EVP & SEVP or equivalent) to one Bank/DFI during last 5 years.

Note-4:

Proposal of M/s Open Testing Services (OTS) was found **non-compliant** to Condition (2) of the 'Qualification Criteria' regarding bidder's experience of providing head hunting services for middle/junior management level positions (VP, AVP, OG-I & OG-II or equivalent) to one Bank/DFI during last 5 years.

Note-5:

Proposal of M/s A.F. Ferguson was found **non-compliant** to Condition (2) of the 'Qualification Criteria' regarding bidder's experience of conducting written tests for batch hiring at entry level positions (OG-III or equivalent) to at-least one Bank/DFI, renowned multinational, public sector or private sector organizations during last 5 years.

Note-6:

Proposal of M/s Allied Testing Services (ATS) was found **non-compliant** to Condition (1) of the 'Qualification Criteria' regarding bidder's existence for at least 05 years since date of registration.

Note-7:

Proposal of M/s Naseeb Online Services (Pvt) Ltd (Rozee.pk) was found **non-compliant** to Condition (2) of the 'Qualification Criteria' regarding bidder's experience of conducting written tests for batch hiring at entry level positions (OG-III or equivalent) to at-least one Bank/DFI, renowned multinational, public sector or private sector organizations during last 5 years. Bidder vide its email dated 14.09.2021 clarified that bid was submitted for Online Test and if ZTBL has decided not to go with Online this time, their bid may not be considered for physical written test. Hence, their bid was **rejected** without any penal action against them as per provisions of the RFP.

11.2 Fee Codes referred in Section (10) above

Assignment	Fee Code	Fee/Price Description
Assignment-I: Executive Search for senior management positions of rank of SEVP, EVP and SVP	F1	Total Fee per advertised position irrespective of number of vacancies (separate fee for position SEVP, EVP and SVP):
		a. For Positions of SEVPs
		b. For Positions of EVPs

Assignment	Fee Code	Fee/Price Description
		c. For Positions of SVPs
	F2	Professional fee per day per external expert, if and when required by ZTBL.
Assignment –II: Recruitments at Middle & Junior Management Level Positions (from OG-II, OG-I, AVP to VP)	F3	Total Fee per advertised position irrespective of number of vacancies (separate fee for position VP, AVP, OG-I and OG-II):
		a. For Positions of VPs
		b. For Positions of AVPs
		c. For Positions of OG-Is
	F4	d. For Positions of OG-IIs
	F4	Professional fee per day per external expert, if and when required by ZTBL.
	F5	Professional fee per day of the psychologist, if and when required by ZTBL.
Assignment-III: Batch Hiring (for entry level position of OG-III where Written Test to be conducted)	F6	a. Total Fee per Batch where upto 10,000 eligible candidates appeared in written test.
		b. Total Fee per Batch where upto 20,000 eligible candidates appeared in written test.
		c. Total Fee per Batch where more than 20,000 eligible candidates appeared in written test.
	F7	Professional fee per day per external expert, if and when required by ZTBL.
	F8	Professional fee per day of the psychologist, if and when required by ZTBL.
