

And all to lesting 200332

Deposit Slip Customer Copy

	D D M M Y Y Y
Branch:	Date:
Account Title اكاوَنت بولدركانام	the date to state all to read 1 aid to a materiale, and or portion of the date of such
	45 500121007012
Currency: PKR USD EURO GBP JPY	Others Intercity Within city Same Branch
Credit Card No	
نفتر CASH نفتر	AMOUNT
BANK / BRANCH	CHEQUE/INSTRUMENT NO.
MAP.	31221 15 009
Contraction of the second second and held and held and the second of the second s	
esa te entered condes some ship	
Protection on the track of cach cheque.	TOTALAMOUNT تاريخ
Total Amount in Words:	Configuration of the second of the second of the configuration of the second of the se
	ommission (if any)
famer Myza	Other Bank Cheque Deposit
Depositor's Name	
Contact No. 0909 2026 990	Branch: 5441-IBB Clifton Br KYC
4220 - 1721355	From Account: XXXXXXX
Depositor's CNIC No. تحقی التاريخ المالية المالي (For non-HBL/Walk-in Customers. Also attach CNIC Copy)	Account Name PK17HA880004540013100701
Depositor's Account No.	Amount ************************************
For HBL Customers / Account Holders)	Charges ************************************
and and have fairly by	Teller 1050 Time 11.36.29.831000
Received By: وحول كشده Depositor's Signature وحول كشده	(As per Terms & Conditions on reverse) (Not official unless validated)

EVALUATION REPORT					
	(As Per Rules 35 of PP Rules, 2004)				
1.	Name of Procuring Agency:	Sindh Infrastructure Development Company Ltd. (SIDCL).			
		Ministry of Planning, Development & Special Initiatives, Government of Pakistan.			
2.	Method of Procurement:	Single-Stage Two Envelop under Rule 36(b) Public Procurement Rules 2004			
3.	Title of Procurement:	EXTERNAL AUDITORS' APPOINTMENT FOR THE YEARS 2024-25, 2025-26 & 2026-27 FOR SIDCL.			
4.	Tender Inquiry No.	EXTERNAL AUDITORS' APPOINTMENT			
5.	PPRA Ref. No (TSE):	TS547701E			
6.	Date & Time of Bid Closing:	30 th September, 2024 at 1100 Hrs			
7.	Date & Time of Bid Opening:	30 th September, 2024 at 1130 Hrs			
8.	No. of Bids Received	Four (04)			
9	Criteria for Bid Evaluation.	Evaluation criteria are already provided in the bidding documents. The evaluation criteria is attached at Annex - A for reference.			
		All bidders downloaded Tender Documents from the website of SIDCL. Four bidders submitted sealed bids as per the NIT/ RFP.			

The bidders who submitted sealed bids on the closing date

- 1. M/s. Ilyas Saeed & Co.M/s. BDO
- 2. M/s. Crowe Hussain Choudhary & Co
- 3. M/s. RSM Avais Hyder Liaquat Nauman
- 4. M/s. Riaz Ahmed & Co

The Technically non-responsive bidder and reason for failure are:

	Name of bidder	Reasons for failure to qualify the Technical Proposal
1.	M/s Ilyas Saeed & Co.	 Fail to provide evidence for "Member of Global Top Ten Accounting Network". Fail to provide an "Affidavit for the firm has never been blacklisted by any Government department / authority / agency / company".

		 Fail to provide an "Affidavit for not under any disciplinary Proceedings by Audit Oversight Board. Fail to provide "Income Tax returns for the last three (3) tax years" Fail to provide "Annual financial statements of the Firm for the last three (2) financial wars
	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	 Iast three (3) financial years. Fail to provide an "Affidavit from the Firm to the effect, that all the documents, statements and information provided with the proposal are complete, true and correct in all aspects.
2	M/s. Crowe Hussain Choudhary & Co	• Fail to provide "At least 20 Years conducting Audits of Government Entities".

The Qualified bidders

S No.	Name of Bidders	Technical Score (70%)	Financial Score (30%)	Total Score	Quoted (PKR)	Evaluated Cost (PKR)	Rule/Regulation/ SBD*/ Policy Basis for / Rejection/ Acceptance as per Rule35 PP Rules,2004
1	M/s. RSM Avais Hyder Liaquat Nauman	65.8	23.57	89.37	2,673,000	2,673,000	* Financially Non-Responsive
2	M/s. Riaz Ahmed & Co	58.8	30.00	88.80	2,100,000	2,100,000	1st

* Bid Security submitted by M/s RSM Avais Hyder Liaquat Nauman is less than 2%

Most Advantageous Bidder: M/s Riaz Ahmed & Co.

11, Any other additional/supporting information the procuring agency may like to share:

On recommendation of Technical Evaluation Committee, Procurement Committee of Board of Directors (BOD) recommended the evaluation to the Board of Directors (BOD) SIDCL for consideration.

Board of Directors (BOD) SIDCL, in its 48th Meeting held on 21.10.2024, approved the Final Evaluation Report, and allowed the management to hoist the Bid Evaluation Report to PPRA website and enter into contract negotiations with the Most Advantageous Bidder.

Company Secretary

Company Secretary Sindh Infrastructure Development (o. Ltd. (Formerty KIDCL.) Official Stampt. of Pakistan... Manager Contract Procurement

Mus

General Manager (F&A)

General Manager F&A/CFO Sindh Infrastructure Development Co Ltd. Ministry of Planning, Development, & Special Initiatives Official Stacopernment.of Pakistan.... Bidders must quote for the complete year's Scope of Services and any bid covering partial Scope of Services shall be rejected.

3. ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA

All information provided by the bidders in their technical proposals must be accompanied by the relevant supporting documents.

3.1 Eligibility on the basis of corporate information

- a) Profile of the Firm.
- b) The firm must be "A" ranked as per State Bank of Pakistan.
- c) The firm should be a member firm of Global Top Ten (10) Accounting Network.
- d) The firm must have at-least ten (10) partners.
- e) The firm must have at-least twenty (20) years' experience of conducting audits of Government Entities.
- f) Affidavit on stamp paper of Rs. 100/- that the firm has never been blacklisted by any Government department / authority / agency / company.
- g) Most recent QCR Rating of ICAP should be satisfactory.
- h) The firm should not have been under any disciplinary proceedings by Audit Oversight Board (AOB) or any other Regulatory Authority from July, 2018 till the signing of Contract. An Affidavit in this regard on the stamp paper of Rs. 100/- must be provided and enclosed with technical proposal.
- i) Taxpayer registration certificate (Income Tax and Sales Tax (if applicable)).
- j) Income Tax returns for the last three (3)tax years
- k) Partnership registration certificate (ICAP and Registrar of Firms).
- I) Annual financial statements of the Firm for the last three (3) financial years.
- m) Affidavit from the Firm on stamp paper of Rs. 100/- to the effect, that all the documents, statements and information provided with the proposal are complete, true and correct in all aspects.

4. EVALUATION CRITIERIA

SIDCL will use a "Quality & Cost Based Selection Method" under a Single Stage Two Envelope Process" for selection under the Public Procurement Rules, 2004. The criteria for technical and financial evaluation are given herein below. Scores will solely be based on the evidence /documents available in the proposal. The contract will be awarded to the firm with the highest total score based on the following weight ratios:

Page 7 of 12

- 70% for Technical Score
- 30% for Financial Score
- 4.1 Technical Evaluation

The bidders will be technically evaluated on the following criteria:

- a) Number of Partners in the firm within Pakistan
- b) Number of ICAP-qualified Chartered Accountants employed by the firm in Pakistan
- c) Number of Audit Staff
- d) Number of Offices in Pakistan
- e) Experience of Government Organization Audits
- f) Experience of Audit in the construction and development sector
- g) Experience in an audit firm
- h) Financial Strength

The evaluation criteria for technical evaluation are provided in the table below. The minimum score for competing in the next stage is 70%. The financial proposals of only those bidders will be opened who have secured 70% or more marks in technical evaluation.

S. No.	Technical Evaluation Criteria	Total Marks	Documents Required
1.	Numbers of Partners		
	 10 marks for 10 Partners and additional partner, up to a maximum of 20. (List of partners to be attached by the bidder) 2 Marks for each partner more than 10 partners. 	20	Documentary evidence required
2.	Number of ICAP-qualified Chartered Accountants employed by the firm in Pakistan		Documentary
	7 marks for 20 qualified and 1 additional mark for each additional qualified person with a maximum, up to 15 marks.	15	evidence required
	(List to be attached by the bidder)		
3.	Number of Audit Staff		
	5 marks for 100 staff and 1 additional mark for an additional 15 staff members, up to a maximum of 10 marks.	10	Documentary evidence required

Page 8 of 12

4.	Number of Offices in Pakistan		
	At least 4 offices in Pakistan.	10	Documentary evidence
	5 marks for 4 offices and 10 marks for 5 and above		required
5.	Experience of Government Organization Audits		
	Experience of audit of 10 Govt. organizations will earn 5 marks and 2 marks for each additional organization up to a maximum 5 additional marks.	10	Documentary evidence required
6.	Experience of Audit in the Construction and development sectorUp to 2 Similar assignments.2 marks 2 marks 5 marks 6 and above Similar assignments.	10	Documentary evidence required
7.	Experience of audit firm 4 marks for 10 years and 1 additional mark for each additional year, up to maximum 6 additional marks.	10	Documentary evidence required
8.	Financial Strength Revenue Up to 100 million 5 marks Above 100 million 15 marks	15	Documentary evidence required
	Grand Total	100	

4.2 Financial Evaluation

Financial proposals of only technically qualified bidders will be opened. The Bidder getting maximum marks on 70-30 weightage (70% for technical proposal and 30% for financial proposal) will be declared successful.

The formula for determining the financial score (FS) is as follows:

FS = 100 x LP / F

(Where, FS is the Financial Score; LP is the Lowest Price and F is the Price of the Proposal under consideration)

The weight given to the Technical (T) and Financial Proposals (F) are:

T = 0.7 and F = 0.3



Page **9** of **12**

4.3 Award of Contract

SIDCL shall award the contract to the Bidder with the highest total score based on the following weight ratios:

- 70% for Technical Score
- 30% for Financial Score

SIDCL shall enter into a lump sum contract with the successful Bidder after approval from the Competent Authority. The date of signing of Contract between successful bidder and SIDCL will be treated as commencement of services.

Notwithstanding the above, SIDCL reserves the right to annul the bidding process and reject all bids at any time prior to the award of the Contract as per Rule 33 of the Public Procurement Rules, 2004.

5. TERMS AND CONDITIONS

5.1 Time Frame

The Scope of Services with respect to each defined Financial Years be completed by within defined time as per Companies Act, 2017, which enable SIDCL to hold Annual General Meeting (AGM) before the stipulated time as per the Companies Act, 2017.

5.2 Extension of Time

Extension of time in submission of deliverables will be allowed without cost adder.

5.3 Invoicing and Payments

After acceptance of required Annual Reports as well as Statement of Compliance in the AGM, Auditors are required to submit related invoices within two weeks which will be paid by SIDCL within 30 days of receiving. Payment will be made through cross-cheque after deduction of all applicable taxes in Pakistan or otherwise the bidder shall have to produce certified copy of exemption certificate duly issued by the competent forum / tax authorities.



Page 10 of 12



And all to lesting 200332

Deposit Slip Customer Copy

	D D M M Y Y Y
Branch:	Date:
Account Title اكاوَنت بولدركانام	the date to state all to read 1 aid to a materiale, and or portion of the date of such
	45 500121007012
Currency: PKR USD EURO GBP JPY	Others Intercity Within city Same Branch
Credit Card No	
نفتر CASH نفتر	AMOUNT
BANK / BRANCH	CHEQUE/INSTRUMENT NO.
MAP.	31221 15 009
Contraction of the second second and held and held and the second of the second s	
esa te entered condes some ship	
Protection on the track of cach cheque.	TOTALAMOUNT تاريخ
Total Amount in Words:	Configuration of the second of the second of the configuration of the second of the se
	ommission (if any)
famer Myza	Other Bank Cheque Deposit
Depositor's Name	
Contact No. 0909 2026 990	Branch: 5441-IBB Clifton Br KYC
4220 - 1721355	From Account: XXXXXXX
Depositor's CNIC No. تحقی التاريخ المالية المالي (For non-HBL/Walk-in Customers. Also attach CNIC Copy)	Account Name PK17HA880004540013100701
Depositor's Account No.	Amount ************************************
For HBL Customers / Account Holders)	Charges ************************************
and and have fairly by	Teller 1050 Time 11.36.29.831000
Received By: وحول كشده Depositor's Signature وحول كشده	(As per Terms & Conditions on reverse) (Not official unless validated)