

# **TECHNICAL EVALUATION REPORT**

**(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)**

- 1** Name of procuring Agency: Managing Director/CSF/PR/H.Q: Office, Lahore
- 2** Method of Procurement: Single Stage Two Envelope Procedure as per rule 36(b)
- 3** Title of Procurement: Supply of M.S Anchorage Plates = 651,680 Nos for CSF/Sukkur.
- 4** Tender Inquiry No: CSF/1011/P/2023
- 5** PPRA Ref. No. (TSE): TS519907E
- 6** Date & Time of Bid Closing: 20.09.2023 at 11:00 Hours
- 7** Date & Time of Bid Opening: 20-09-2023 at 11:30 Hours
- 8** No of Bids Received: Two
- 9** Criteria for bid Evaluation: Attached
- 10** Details of Bid(s) Evaluation: Attached

<b>Name of Bidder</b>	<b>Technical Marks Obtained</b>	<b>Rule/Regulation/SBD*/Policy/Basis for Rejection/Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004</b>
M/s. Agro Steel Industry, Lahore.	95	The bid found responsive and technically qualified
M/s. Continental Engineering Services (Pvt) Ltd, Karachi.	82.75	The bid found responsive and technically qualified

  
**(Muhammad Anjum)**

for Managing Director/CSF,  
Ph # 042-99201737.

ANNEXURE-"A"**CRITERIA FOR EVALUATION OF TECHNICAL PROPOSAL****1. General**

The technical proposal of the Bidders shall be evaluated for qualification of bidders for the subject Bid based on the criteria regarding Eligibility, Work Experience, Equipment Capabilities and Financial Soundness as follows;

**2. Weightage/Marks**

The weightage/distribution of the marks shall be as given below:

- |  |           |
|--|-----------|
| i. Basic Eligibility (Mandatory)   |           |
| ii. Experience of manufacturing / supplying of Steel / raw material              | 35        |
| iii. Manufacturing equipment & Inspection / Testing Facility of the manufacturer | 10        |
| iv. Manufacturing Capacity   | 25        |
| v. Financial Soundness   | <u>30</u> |

**Total 100 Marks**

The overall minimum qualifying score shall be 70% marks and fulfilling the basic / mandatory requirements to qualify. A detailed qualification criterion is given hereunder.

**3. (i) Basic Eligibility (mandatory)**

The firms fulfilling the following basic requirements shall only be considered for further evaluation (relevant documents to be attached).

- a) Proof / Documents of registration as supplier or Manufacturer / Sole proprietor / partnership deed / Memorandum of Association of Firm in case of Limited Company or Registration of FBR as supplier etc.
- b) The bidder must be registered with Sales Tax and Income Tax Departments and must be on FBR's Active Tax Payer's List (**documentary proof must be submitted along with bid**).
- c) Litigation history / Affidavit on Legal Stamp paper in original to the fact that no litigation hinders the bidder to participate in this tender.
- d) Affidavit on legal stamp paper declaring that the firm has never been black listed.
- e) Affidavit on legal stamp paper declaring that the firm has supplied the material within due time for last two years in CSF/Directorate. If the firm has already working in CSF/Directorate.
- f) Bid Security as mentioned in tender documents from Scheduled Bank in Pakistan in favor of MD/CSF or FA&CAO/M&S, Pakistan Railways, Headquarters office Lahore as per BDS (Clause-18).
- g) The bidder must provide the information / detail on declaration beneficial owners information form as attached (**Annexure-C**)
- h) The bidder must allow that the purchaser shall have the right of stage inspection of manufacturing facilities. The signatures of bidders on all pages of bidding documents will be considered their permission.

Contd.....

**Bidder**



- i) Bidder shall certify on their letter head that goods shall be brand new, free of any defect, as per required standard material (steel) and material must be of following specifications (Table-1 & 2):

TABLE-1 BASIC MATERIAL

LIMIT VALUES OF CHEMICAL COMPOSITION		
RULING ELEMENTS		% BY WEIGHT
		Maximum
Phosphorus	P	0.06
Sulphur	S	0.06

TABLE-2 DIMENSIONS AND PROPERTIES

		Minimum Value	Maximum Value
Tensile Strength	Ton per square inch	28	33
Elongation	%	16%	-

- j) Bidder provide the proof that manufacturer must have manufacturing capacity of M.S Anchorage Plate, at least 4,000 Nos per day (Attach certificate on letter head or contained in brochure / profile of the manufacturer).
- k) Bidder provide the bank statement for the last month / 30 days (before date of opening of tender) i.e. from 18.08.2023 to 19.09.2023 of Firm's account showing available balance of at least Rs.10.00 million in company's account on any day during said last 30 days.

**Note:** Any major deviation would render the bid likely to be rejected. Bidder must keep in mind while submitting their bid to avoid major deviations which may include: -

- i) Bid Security according to BDS Clause-18 being not enclosed with Technical Bid.
  - ii) Conditional bid being offered e.g. to stipulate condition of advance payment or other conditions.
  - iii) Specifications have not been signed / confirmed.
  - iv) Delivery Period has not been accepted / confirmed.
4. (ii) Experience of manufacturing / supplying of M.S Anchorage Plate / similar steel items (Max Marks = 35)

Marking for work experience of the manufacturer / supplier shall be evaluated as per following criteria.

S. No.	Description	Max. Marks
1	The Bidder has experience of manufacturing / supplying M.S Anchorage Plate / Similar steel items to various organizations / customers / countries.	35
	a) More than or equal to 5 years. 100%	
	b) Less than 5 years but more than or equal to 4 years. 80%	
	c) Less than 4 years but more than or equal to 2 years. 65%	
	d) Less than 2 years. 0%	

**Note:** Manufacturer's / company brochure / profile / letter / purchase orders be enclosed

Contd.....

**Bidder**



- i) Bidder shall certify on their letter head that goods shall be brand new, free of any defect, as per required standard material (steel) and material must be of following specifications (Table-1 & 2):

TABLE-1 BASIC MATERIAL

LIMIT VALUES OF CHEMICAL COMPOSITION		
RULING ELEMENTS		% BY WEIGHT
		Maximum
Phosphorus	P	0.06
Sulphur	S	0.06

TABLE-2 DIMENSIONS AND PROPERTIES

		Minimum Value	Maximum Value
Tensile Strength	Ton per square inch	28	33
Elongation	%	16%	-

- j) Bidder provide the proof that manufacturer must have manufacturing capacity of M.S Anchorage Plate, at least 4,000 Nos per day (Attach certificate on letter head or contained in brochure / profile of the manufacturer).
- k) Bidder provide the bank statement for the last month / 30 days (before date of opening of tender) i.e. from 18.08.2023 to 19.09.2023 of Firm's account showing available balance of at least Rs.10.00 million in company's account on any day during said last 30 days.

**Note:** Any major deviation would render the bid likely to be rejected. Bidder must keep in mind while submitting their bid to avoid major deviations which may include: -

- i) Bid Security according to BDS Clause-18 being not enclosed with Technical Bid.
  - ii) Conditional bid being offered e.g. to stipulate condition of advance payment or other conditions.
  - iii) Specifications have not been signed / confirmed.
  - iv) Delivery Period has not been accepted / confirmed.
4. (ii) **Experience of manufacturing / supplying of M.S Anchorage Plate / similar steel items (Max Marks = 35)**

Marking for work experience of the manufacturer / supplier shall be evaluated as per following criteria.

S. No.	Description	Max. Marks
1	The Bidder has experience of manufacturing / supplying M.S Anchorage Plate / Similar steel items to various organizations / customers / countries. a) More than or equal to 5 years. 100% b) Less than 5 years but more than or equal to 4 years. 80% c) Less than 4 years but more than or equal to 2 years. 65% d) Less than 2 years. 0%	35

**Note:** Manufacturer's / company brochure / profile / letter / purchase orders be enclosed

Contd.....

**Bidder**

**EVALUATION REPORT OF TECHNICAL BID AGAINST ADVERTISED TENDER NO.CSF/182/P/2023 OPENED ON 21.09.2023 FOR THE  
PROCUREMENT OF M.S ANCHORAGE PLATES = 651.680 NOS FOR CSF/SUNKUR.**

PARTICULARS / REQUIREMENTS (AS PER QUALIFICATION CRITERIA, PLACED AT S.NO.3/131 to 3/133).	M/s Continental Engg: Services (Pvt) Ltd, Karachi. Provided or not provided	M/s Agro Steel Industry, Lahore. Provided or not provided
<b>(i) BASIC ELIGIBILITY (MANDATORY)</b>		
a Proof / Documents of registration as supplier or Manufacturer/Sole proprietor/partnership deed/ Memorandum of Association of Firm in case of Limited Company OR registration of FBR as supplier etc?	Provided (As flagged-A in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged-O & P in technical bid)
b Proof of registration with Sales Tax, Income Tax Departments and active on FBR's Active Tax Payer's List?	Provided (As flagged-B in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged-P in technical bid)
c Litigation history / Affidavit on Legal Stamp paper in original to the fact that no litigation hinders the bidder to participate in this tender?	Provided (As flagged-C in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged-Q in technical bid)
d Affidavit on legal stamp paper declaring that the firm has never been black listed?	Provided (As flagged-D in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged-R in technical bid)
e Affidavit on legal stamp paper declaring that the firm has supplied the material within due time for last two years in CSF/Directorate, if the firm is already working in CSF?	Provided (As flagged-E in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged-S in technical bid)
f Bid Security as mentioned in tender documents from Scheduled Bank in Pakistan in favor of MD/CSF or FA&CAO/M&S, Pakistan Railways, Headquarters office Lahore as per BDS (clause-18)?	CDR Provided (As flagged-F in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged-T in technical bid)
g Has the bidder provided information / detail on declaration beneficial owners information form as attached (Annex-C) with bidding documents?	Yes (As flagged-G in technical bid)	Yes (As flagged-U in technical bid)
h Has the bidder allowed that the purchaser shall have the right of stage inspection of manufacturing facilities by signing on all pages of bidding documents?	Yes by signing all pages of bidding documents.	Yes by signing all pages of bidding documents.
i Has the bidder certified on their letter head that goods shall be free of any defect, as per required standard material (steel) and material must be of specifications mentioned in criteria for evaluation (Table-1 & 2) on page No.132 of the bidding documents?	Provided (As flagged-H in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged-V in technical bid)
j Has the bidder provided proof / certificate on letter head or brochure / profile of the manufacturer showing that manufacturer must have manufacturing capacity of M.S Anchorage Plate, at least 4000 Nos per day?	Certificate Provided on letter head (As flagged-I in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged-W in technical bid)
k Has the bidder provided the bank statement for the last month / 30 days (before date of opening of tender) i.e. 18.08.2023 to 19.09.2023 of firm's account showing available balance of at least Rs.10.00 million in company's account on any day during said last 30 days?	Provided (As flagged-J in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged-X in technical bid)
All the Mandatory requirements fulfilled or not?	Fulfilled	Fulfilled

Particulars / Requirements		Total Marks	Provided or Not Provided	Marks Obtained	Provided or Not Provided	Marks Obtained
<b>(ii) EXPERIENCE OF MANUFACTURING / SUPPLYING OF M.S ANCHORAGE PLATE/SIMILAR STEEL ITEMS (MAX: MARKS = 35)</b>						
1	Has the bidder provided brochure or profile or letter or purchase orders showing that the bidder has experience of manufacturing / supplying M.S Anchorage Plate / Similar steel items to various organizations / customers / countries? a) More than or equal to 5 years. 100% b) Less than 5 years, but more than or equal to 4 years. 80% c) Less than 4 years, but more than or equal to 2 years. 65% d) Less than 2 years. 0%	35	Copies of purchase orders of CSF Provided (As flagged-K in technical bid)	22.75 (More than 2 years experience)	Copies of purchase orders of CSF & other Railway units Provided (As flagged-Y in technical bid)	35 (More than 5 years experience in similar steel items)
<b>(iii) MANUFACTURING EQUIPMENTS &amp; INSPECTION / TESTING FACILITY (MAX: MARKS = 10)</b>						
1	Has the bidder provided list or information or brochure showing of the manufacturer that the manufacturer has all equipments of their own required for manufacturing of offered material?	5	List Provided (As flagged-L in technical bid)	5	Provided (As flagged-Z in technical bid)	5
2	Has the bidder provided list or information or brochure of the manufacturer showing that the manufacturer possesses adequate inspection, testing/analysis facilities?	5	Not provided	0	Not provided	0
<b>(iv) MANUFACTURING / SUPPLYING CAPACITY OF THE BIDDER (MAX: MARKS = 25)</b>						
1	Has the bidder provided brochure or profile or letter showing that the bidder has manufacturing / supplying capacity of desired / Similar steel items? Greater than 500,000 Nos or 600 Ton similar steel item per year. = 25 Marks. 400,000-500,000 Nos or 400-500 Ton similar steel item per year = 20 Marks. 300,000-400,000 Nos or 300-400 Ton similar steel item per year = 15 Marks. 200,000-300,000 Nos or 200-300 Ton similar steel item per year = 10 Marks. Less than 200,000 Nos or 200 Ton similar steel item per year = 05 Marks.	25	Letter Provided (As flagged-M in technical bid)	25 (More than 500,000 Nos per year)	Provided (As flagged-A/1 in technical bid)	25 (More than 600 Ton per year similar steel items)

(v) FINANCIAL SOUNDNESS OF THE BIDDER (MAX: MARKS = 30)

1	Has the bidder provided annual audit reports / bank statement or annual sales tax / income tax returns for the last 3 years showing the average annual turnover?	30	Annual audit reports Provided (As flagged-N in technical bid)	30 (More than 30 million)	Provided (As flagged-A/2 in technical bid)	30 (More than 30 million)
	Greater than or equal to 50 Million.	= 30 Marks.				
	Less than 50, but more than or equal to 40 Million	= 25 Marks.				
	Less than 40, but more than or equal to 30 Million	= 20 Marks.				
	Less than 30, but more than or equal to 20 Million	= 15 Marks.				
	Less than 20, but more than or equal to 10 Million	= 10 Marks.				
	Less than 10, but more than or equal to 05 Million	= 05 Marks.				
	Less than 5 Million	= 0 Marks.				
		Total 100	-	82.75	-	95
		Status of the firm	Not Provided		Not Provided	

Dy; /CCP-I

Dy; CEN/South

Dy; CEN/Track