

**EVALUATION REPORT**  
**(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)**

Name of Procuring Agency:	National Engineering Services Pakistan (Pvt.) Ltd. (NESPAK)
Method of Procurement:	Open Competitive Bidding, Single Stage Two Envelope
Title of Procurement:	Hiring Services of Environmental Laboratory
Tender Inquiry No.:	nepak 244
PPRA Ref. No. (TSE):	109402
Date & Time of Bid Closing:	December 8, 2017 at 11:00 AM
Date & Time of Bid Opening:	December 8, 2017 at 11:30 AM
No of Bids Received:	Three (3) bids were received
Criteria for Bid Evaluation:	The criteria was mentioned in RFP advertised on PPRA website and NESPAK website dated November 21, 2017
Details of Bid(s) Evaluation:	As below

**Technical & Financial Proposals from Environmental Laboratories**

In response to RFP, following laboratories submitted their proposal along with required documents:

1. M/s HSE Services
2. M/s Green Crescent Environmental Consultant (Pvt.) Ltd.
3. M/s SGS Pakistan Pvt. Ltd.

**Constitution of Selection Committee of NESPAK**

As per Procurement of Consultancy Services Regulations, 2010, NESPAK constituted a committee for selection of Environmental Laboratory. The committee comprises the following members:

1. Syed Tahir Uddin Faridi                      General manager
2. Syed Ali Sher Shah                         Project Manager / Principal Engineer
3. Ather Ali Khan                                Principal Engineer

The objective of the committee is to select the Environmental Laboratory in accordance with PPRA rules.

**Evaluation of Technical & Financial Comparison of Proposals**

The technical & financial proposals were evaluated afterward by the selection committee. The selection committee started the process of evaluation of environmental laboratories and initial results of evaluation are depicted in **Table 1**.

**Table 1: Technical and Financial Evaluation of Environmental Laboratories**

Sr. No.	Laboratory Name	Financial	Technical			
			EPA Certification	EPA Certification for all the Parameters mentioned in TOR	Quote for Testing Parameters mentioned in RFP	Remarks
1	M/s HSE Services	<p><b><u>Announced Price</u></b> Rs. 764,558/- including 13% SST</p> <p><b><u>Corrected Price</u></b> Rs. 778,090/- including 15% BRA Sales Tax</p>	Provided Certification of EPA-Sindh for the year 2017 which is valid up to 2019.	EPA-Sindh certified this lab in testing parameters as required in RFP.	They did not quote for all parameters mentioned in RFP except Noise.	Rates / prices against each parameter without changing the substance of proposal are to be required from the lab.
2	M/s Green Crescent Environmental Consultant (Pvt.) Ltd.	<p><b><u>Announced Price</u></b> Rs. 721,120/- including 16% GST</p> <p><b><u>Corrected Price</u></b> Rs. 749,800/- including 15% BRA Sales Tax</p>	Provided Certification of EPA-Punjab for the year 2017 which is valid up to 2020.	EPA-Punjab certified this lab in testing parameters as required in RFP.	They quoted for all parameters mentioned in RFP except Boron, chlorine, fluorine for Drinking Water and odour, residual chlorine, flourine for Surface Water in proposal. The lab also applied some terms &	<p>The lab did not quote for some parameters as mentioned in RFP.</p> <p>The lab applied some terms &amp; conditions with their financial proposal.</p> <p>The lab also quoted additional prices for mobilization, boarding</p>

Sr. No.	Laboratory Name	Financial	Technical			
			EPA Certification	EPA Certification for all the Parameters mentioned in TOR	Quote for Testing Parameters mentioned in RFP	Remarks
					conditions with their financial proposal.	lodging & electricity charges.
3	M/s SGS Pakistan Pvt. Ltd.	<p><b><u>Announced Price</u></b> Rs. 1,674,400/- including 15% PSST</p> <p><b><u>Corrected Price</u></b> Rs. 1,729,600/- Including 15% BRA Sales Tax</p>	Provided Certification of EPA-Sindh for the year 2016 which is valid up to 2018.	EPA-Sindh certified this lab in testing parameters as required in RFP.	<p>The lab does not have the capability to perform testing of Argon (Ar) for Surface Water and therefore they did not quote for Argon (Ar) in their proposal.</p> <p>The lab also applied some terms &amp; conditions with their financial proposal.</p>	<p>The lab does not have the capability to perform testing of Argon (Ar) for Surface Water and therefore They did not quote for Argon (Ar) in their proposal.</p> <p>The lab applied some terms &amp; conditions with their financial proposal.</p> <p>The lab also quoted additional prices for mobilization, boarding lodging, man days charges, Report preparation &amp; submission.</p>

Keeping in view the outcome of initial evaluation as mentioned in Table 1, the selection committee raised the queries through letters to respective laboratories for clarification. The laboratories submitted their response by due date i.e. December 20, 2017.

In light of their response, the final evaluation is presented in **Table 2**.

**Table 2: Conclusion of Technical and Financial Proposals**

Sr. No.	Laboratory Name	Financial	Technical			
			EPA Certification	EPA Certification for all the Parameters mentioned in TOR	Quote for Testing Parameters mentioned in RFP	Remarks
1	M/s HSE Services	<p><b><u>Announced Price</u></b> Rs. 764,558/- including 13% SST</p> <p><b><u>Corrected Price</u></b> Rs. 778,090/- including 15% BRA Sales Tax</p>	Provided Certification of EPA-Sindh for the year 2017 which is valid up to 2019.	EPA-Sindh certified this lab in testing parameters as required in RFP.	Instead of providing rates / prices against each parameter, The lab completely revised his bid, which is not acceptable as per PPRA Rule 31(1).	The lab is second lowest.
2	M/s Green Crescent Environmental Consultant (Pvt.) Ltd.	<p><b><u>Announced Price</u></b> Rs. 721,120/- including 16% GST</p> <p><b><u>Corrected Price</u></b> Rs. 749,800/- including 15% BRA Sales Tax</p>	Provided Certification of EPA-Punjab for the year 2017 which is valid up to 2020.	EPA-Punjab certified this lab in testing parameters as required in RFP.	The lab confirmed that testing of parameters will be done as per TOR. The lab also confirmed that there was a typo error regarding parameters in	The lab meets the requirements mentioned in RFP. Lowest evaluated bidder.

Sr. No.	Laboratory Name	Financial	Technical			
			EPA Certification	EPA Certification for all the Parameters mentioned in TOR	Quote for Testing Parameters mentioned in RFP	Remarks
					their RFP.	
3	M/s SGS Pakistan Pvt. Ltd.	<p><b><u>Announced Price</u></b> Rs. 1,674,400/- including 15% PSST</p> <p><b><u>Corrected Price</u></b> Rs. 1,729,600/- Including 15% BRA Sales Tax</p>	Provided Certification of EPA-Sindh for the year 2016 which is valid upto 2018.	EPA-Sindh certified this lab in testing parameters as required in RFP.	The lab confirmed that they do not have the capability to perform testing of Argon (Ar) for Surface Water.	The lab does not have the capability to perform testing of Argon (Ar) Therefore, the lab does not meet the criteria mentioned in RFP.

## 5.0 CONCLUSION

Taking into consideration all the financial and technical proposals, all the environmental laboratories meet the criteria mentioned in RFP except those which have been highlighted in Table-2.

As per comparison, M/s Green Crescent Environmental Consultants (Pvt.) Limited is the lowest laboratory at their corrected bid price of Rs. 749,800/- (including 15% BRA Sales Tax).

M/s HSE Services is the second lowest laboratory at their corrected bid price of Rs. 778,090/- (including 15% BRA Sales Tax). Whereas, M/s. SGS Pakistan (Pvt.) Limited is the highest laboratory at their corrected bid price of Rs. 1,729,600/- (including 15% BRA Sales Tax).

## 6.0 RECOMMENDATION

In the light of above conclusion, it is recommended that the works may be awarded to lowest evaluated laboratory **M/s Green Crescent Environmental Consultants (Pvt.) Limited** at their corrected bid price of **Rs. 749,800/-** (Rupees Seven Hundred Forty Nine Thousand Eight Hundred only) including 15% BRA Sales Tax.

Member



Syed Tahir Uddin Faridi  
(General Manager)

Member



Syed Ali Sher Shah  
(Project Manager/Principal Engineer)

Member



Ather Ali Khan  
(Principal Engineer)