

EVALUATION REPORT

(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

1. Name of Procuring Agency Cantonment Board Malir
2. Method of Procurement Single stage – Two Envelope Procedure
3. Title of Procurement Outsourcing of Conservancy Contract
4. Tender Inquiry No. MLR/Consy Contract/2021/1221 dated 24/09/2021.
5. PPRA Ref. No. (TSE) TS460674E dated 27/09/2021
6. Date & Time of Technical Bid Closing 13/10/2021 at 11:30 am
7. Date & Time of Technical Bid Opening 13/10/2021 at 12:00 pm
8. Date & Time of Financial Bid Opening 02/12/2021 at 12:00 pm
9. No of Bids Received (02) Two
10. Criteria for Bid Evaluation Attached as Annex-A.
11. Details of Bid(s) Evaluation Detail is as under

Sr. #	Name of Bidder	Marks		Financial Quote (Rs.)		Rule/Regulation/SBD* /Policy/ Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004.
		Technical Bid	Financial Bid	Rate quoted per month including SST	Rate quoted per month excluding SST	
01	M/s. Amir Sawab & Brother Pvt. Ltd,	Qualified	Opened	1,12,70,000/-	99,70,500/-	The Most Advantageous Bid Accepted for Tender Schedule "A" only.
02	M/s. Shah Faisal & Brothers	Not Qualified	Returned	NA	NA	Failed to obtain minimum score required for technical qualification.

The Most Advantageous Bidder

M/s Amir Sawab & Brother Pvt. Ltd, is recommended as the most advantageous bidder by the Technical Evaluation committee meeting held on 21/01/2022.

Official Stamp: _____



Cantonment Executive Officer
Cantonment Board Malir

8. **Criteria for Evaluation**

8.1 **Experience of Bidders : Part-I Submission**

The Bidder's competence and capability is proposed to be established by the following parameters:

- (a) Related Experience
- (b) Financial capability

On each of these parameters, the Bidder would be required to meet the evaluation criteria as detailed in this Section.

C.F.O
Am
/

The Bidder must satisfy the following qualification criteria for experience:

- a). Collection, Segregation, transportation & Disposal of at least 15,000 tons per annum of Municipal Solid Waste/Landscape Waste etc, for each of the last two completed Financial years under a single contract.
- b). Annual billing of at least Rs. 100.00(M) from collection and transportation of Municipal Solid Waste/Landscape Waste etc, for each of the last two completed Financial Years.
- c). The Bidder shall have minimum 03 years experience in managing labor of minimum 200 in number in the field of solid Waste Management.

In case of a JV, the Lead Member should alone satisfy all of the above Qualification Criteria for experience as stated above. However, the financial eligibility criteria may be met by the Lead Member or the Other Member solely.

8.2 Financial Capability

Financial capability of the Bidders would be evaluated on the basis of the following;

- a) Net worth as at the end of the most recent Financial Year.
- b) Aggregate net cash accruals for the last two Financial Years.

8.3 Special Conditions for a JV

- a) In case the Bidder is a JV, the Lead Member should meet the experience criteria as stipulated in Clause 8.1.
- b) In case the Bidder is a JV, the net worth and net cash accruals would be required to be met by any one of the members alone. The Consortium would submit the financial capability details as mentioned in Clause 8.2.

9. Proposal Evaluation : Part I Submission

9.1 The Part I Submission of the Proposal would first be checked for responsiveness. The Proposal would be considered to be responsive if it meets the following conditions:

- a). It is received / deemed to be received by the Proposal Due Date including any extension thereof.
- b). It is signed, sealed and marked as stipulated in Clause 6 and Clause 7.
- c). It contains all the information and documents as requested in the Bid document.
- d). It contains information in formats specified in this Document.
- e). It mentions the Proposal Validity Period as set out in Clause 3.
- f). It provides information in reasonable detail. ("Reasonable Detail" means that, but for minor deviations, the information can be reviewed and evaluated by CBM without communication with the Bidder). CBM reserves the right to determine whether the information has been provided in reasonable detail.

C.E.O.
[Handwritten signature]

There are no inconsistencies between the Proposal and the supporting documents.

9.2 A Proposal that is substantially responsive is one that conforms to the preceding requirements without material deviation or reservation. A material deviation or reservation is one.

- a). which affects in any substantial way, the scope, quality, or performance of the contract, or
- b). Which would affect unfairly the competitive position of other Bidders presenting substantially responsive Proposals.

9.3 In case the Proposal is found to be responsive, Part I Submission would be evaluated in accordance with the criteria for qualification of Bidders as set out in Clause 8.1. In case the Part I Submission is found to be inadequate, CBM may request the Bidder for modifications to the same.

9.4 As part of the evaluation of the Part I Submission, CBM may also request the Bidder to submit clarifications.

10. **Proposal Evaluation : Part II Submission**

- 10.1 Part II Submission of only those Bidders who have met the qualification criteria, shall be taken up for evaluation. CBM reserves the right to reject the Proposal of a Bidder without opening Part II Submission if, in its opinion, Part I Submission is not substantially responsive with the requirements of this Bid Document.
- 10.2 The Technical Proposal would be scored on the basis of rating of various parameters such as the following:

S. No.	Evaluation Criteria	Score	
1	a) No. of employees of sanitation staff Drivers, Sanitary Workers & Supervisory Staff.	20	90
	b) Mechanical Fleet, i-e, Compactor, Hydraulic Trucks/Dumpers, 10 wheeler hydraulic Dumper, Mechanical sweeper, Tractor with Shovels, Tractor with front blade, Tractor Trolleys, Suzuki Pickup	60	
	c) Command, Control and Response Mechanism.	10	
2	Financial Soundness/Capability.		10
	Total		100

- Note:- i) The CONTRACTOR fulfilling the requirement of Mechanical Fleet as per specification / weight capacity / mark / model mentioned in serial 2(i) of schedule-A for CBM areas shall be awarded 60 marks.
- ii) Proof of ownership of mechanical fleet in the name firm/contractor shall be mandatory. In case of leased vehicles, Bank authority letter would be required.

- 10.3 If required, the Bidders may be asked to make a presentation to the evaluation committee for clarifying their Proposals. No marks are assigned to the presentation. CBM reserves the right to call for presentations from any / some / all of the Bidders.
- 10.4 The marks so assigned by Evaluation Committee of CBM would be final and binding on the Bidders.
- 10.5 The composite score under the Technical Proposal would be the arithmetic sum of the marks assigned to the Bidders under each of the Parameters listed above in Clause 10.2.
- 10.6 The Benchmark Score to be achieved for Stage II evaluation is 60.
- 10.7 Only Proposals that have obtained the Benchmark Score in Technical evaluation will be taken forward to Stage III evaluation, i.e, opening of Financial Proposal.

C.E.O.
An
7

Proposal Evaluation : Part III Submission (FINANCIAL BID)

11.

11.1

The Bidders would be required to submit the proposed charges/rate in lump sum in Rupees per month basis for schedule-A&B separately as set out in Appendix 8 of Tender Documents with SST & without SST for providing conservancy services in Cantonment Board Malir areas. The firms quoting lowest aggregates rates for schedule-A+B will be considered successful. Monthly Rates quoted including / excluding SST whichever will be applicable or levied shall be considered for contract agreement.

- SST: Sindh Sales Tax on services.

11.2

Financial Proposal of the Bidders whose Technical Proposals meet the Benchmark Score as set out in Clause 10.6 and other terms of the this document shall be opened in the presence of the bidders, representatives who choose to attend. The time and date for opening of Financial Proposal shall be informed to the technically qualified Bidders in advance. The Bidders' representatives who are present shall be required to sign and record their attendance. The format for quoting the Financial Proposal is set out in Appendix 8.

11.3

Physical inspection of equipment in working condition will be carried out by the Cantonment Board Malir before award of contract.

11.4

Sealed tender along with the requisite documents can be dropped in the tender box, placed in the office of Cantonment Board Malir on _____ at 11:30 A.M. and shall be opened on the same day at 12:00 p.m in the presence of Firm/Contractors or their representatives who may like to present and consequent to the evaluation of technical proposal, the financial proposal of technically qualified bidders will be opened in the presence of the bidders or their authorized reps on date and time which will be informed letter on.

12.

Selection Methodology

C.E.O.
[Signature]

12.1

The Bidder making the lowest Financial Proposal shall be declared as the Successful Bidder.

12.2

In case there are two or more Bidders quoting the same Financial Bid, CBM may in such case shall decide/select the successful one by coin flipping in presence of both parties.

12.3

CBM reserves the right to reject any Proposal, if:

- a) At any time, a material misrepresentation is made or discovered; or
- b) The Bidder does not respond promptly and diligently to requests for supplemental information required for the evaluation of the Proposal. Rejection of a Proposal by CBM as aforesaid would lead to the disqualification of the Bidder. If the Bidder is a JV, then the entire Consortium would be disqualified/ rejected. If such disqualification / rejection occurs after the Proposals have been opened and the Preferred Bidder gets disqualified / rejected, then CBM reserves the right to:

- i. • Either select the next lowest Bidder, or
- ii. Take any such measure/s as may be deemed fit in the sole discretion of CBM, including annulment of the bidding process.

12.4

The Successful Bidder shall execute the Contract Agreement with CBM within two (2) weeks of the issue of Letter of Acceptance or within such further time as CBM may agree to in its sole discretion.

12.5

Failure of the Successful Bidder to comply with the requirements of Clause 10.2 (ii) or Clause 12.4 shall constitute sufficient grounds for the annulment of the LoA, and forfeiture of the Bid Security. In such an event, CBM reserves the right to:

- a) Either declare the 2nd lowest Bidder as successful
or
- b). Take any such measures as may be deemed fit in the sole discretion of CBM, including annulment of the bidding process.

12.6

The successful bidder would have to furnish performance security before signing the contract agreement. The bid security submitted by the successful bidder shall be released upon furnishing the performance security.

12.7

Payment to the contractor, will be made monthly whom the contract shall be awarded, be made after deducting the applicable taxes as per rules.

12.8

Notwithstanding anything contained in this document, CBM reserves the right to accept or reject any Proposal, or to annul the bidding process or reject all Proposals, at any time without any liability or any obligation for such rejection or annulment, following the spirit of relevant clause of PPRA Rules 2004.

C.F.O.
[Signature]