

FINAL EVALUATION REPORT

(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

1.	Name of Procuring Agency:	National Highway Authority
2.	Method of Procurement:	Single Stage Two Envelope Procedure
3.	Title of Procurement:	Consultancy Services for Hiring of Structural Expert for Design and Design Review of Bridges and Allied Structures on NHA Network
5.	PPRA Ref. No. (TSE):	TS550682E
6.	Date & Time of Bid Closing:	18 th November, 2024 at 1130 hours local time
7.	Date & Time of Bid Opening:	18 th November, 2024 at 1200 hours local time
8.	No of Bids Received:	Three (03) Proposals were received
9.	Criteria for Bid Evaluation:	Criteria of Bid Evaluation is attached at Annex-I
10.	Details of Bid(s) Evaluation:	As below

Name of Bidder	Marks			Evaluated Cost (EC)* (PKR)	Rule/Regulation/ SBD**/Policy/ Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004.
	Technical Score (St) (80%)	Financial Score (Sf) (20 %)	Total Score (100%)		
i) M/s CECON (Civil Engineers and Consultants)	736.8	200	936.8	104,610,304	1 st
ii) M/s EN & EM Associates	Disqualified (Failed to obtain minimum passing score prescribed in RFP)	Financial Proposal Not Opened			
iii) M/s Finite Engineering	Disqualified (Failed to obtain minimum passing score prescribed in RFP)	Financial Proposal Not Opened			

*EC is the Evaluated Cost used for evaluation purpose and includes only the cost of competitive component (i.e. Remuneration and Direct Non-Salary Cost) and is exclusive of Provisional Sum, Contingency and Indirect Taxes.

24/1.

FINAL EVALUATION REPORT

(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

Most Advantageous Consultant: M/s CECON (Civil Engineers and Consultants)

11. **Any other additional/supporting information, the procuring agency may like to share:** The Procurement was carried out in line with PPRA Rules & Regulations. The bidding was done on QCBS method with 80:20 Technical to Financial Proposals ratio. The Contract will be awarded to M/s CECON(Civil Engineers and Consultants) at evaluated/rebated Consultancy Cost of Pak. Rs. 104,610,304/- which includes Remuneration, Reimbursable Expenses and all applicable Federal, Provisional and Local taxes including GST.

Signature:

Official Stamp:

SUMMARY EVALUATION SHEET FOR FULL TECHNICAL PROPOSALS (QCBS)

EVALUATION CRITERIA	Max. Weightage	Firm 1		Firm 2	
		Rating	Score	Rating	Score
1. Firms Experience	100				
General Experience in road Transport Sector	25				
Specific Experience related to particular Assignment	75				
2. Approach and Methodology	200				
2-a. <u>Appreciation of the Project</u>	70				
(i) Evidence of Site Visit with Photographs	(30)				
(ii) Clarity of appreciation	(20)				
(iii) Comprehensiveness of appreciation	(20)				
2-b. <u>Problem Statement/ understanding of objectives</u>	50				
(i) Identification of Problems/ Objectives	(30)				
(ii) Components of Proposed Services	(20)				
2-c. <u>Methodology</u>	70				
(i) Proposed Solutions for this Project	(30)				
(ii) Quality of Methodology	(20)				
(iii) Conciseness, clarity and completeness of proposal	(20)				
2-d. <u>Suggested Changes for Improvement in TOR</u>	10				
3. Key Personnel (Structural Expert)	550				
Firm affidavit for presence of personnel	25				
Academic Qualification	100				
General Experience	100				
Bridge Design Experience	125				
Bridge Rehabilitation Experience	200				
	100				
4. Performance Certification from clients					
Affidavit on stamp paper duly attested by the Oath Commissioner regarding non-blacklisting	25				
	50				
6. Present Commitments (current engagement and available strength – justification)					
TOTAL:	1000				

Excellent - 100% Very Good - 90-99% Above Average – 80-89% Average – 70-79% Below Average – 1-69% Non-complying – 0%.

Score: Maximum Weightage rating / 100. Minimum qualifying score is 70% or 700 marks.

DESIGN AND DESIGN REVIEW OF BRIDGES AND ALLIED STRUCTURES ON NHA NETWORK.

Page 17 of 67

PERSONNEL EVALUATION SHEET

POSITION / AREA OF EXPERTISE	Name	Academic Qualification		General Experience		Bridge Design Experience		Bridge Rehabilitation Experience	
		Percentage Rating	Weighted Rating (A)	Percentage Rating	Weighted Rating (B)	Percentage Rating	Weighted Rating (C)	Percentage Rating	Weighted Rating (C)
(Show all experts to be evaluated)									
i. Structural Expert									

Academic Qualification: (100)

Ph.D in Structural Engineering-100%, M.Sc in Structural Engineering. with additional trainings/courses relevant to assignment-90%; M.Sc in Structural Engineering. 80%

General Experience: (100)

Minimum 20 years' experience in Bridge Design (80 marks);

04 marks per year experience of Bridge Design exceeding the said 20 years' experience (up to maximum of 20 marks).

Bridge Design Experience: (125)

The individual would be evaluated on the basis of number of bridges designed, and vetted. The scoring criteria is as under:

Experience	Number of Bridges			
	< 100	100 – 200	200 – 300	> 300
Design of New Bridges	25	50	75	100
Vetting of Bridge Design	10	15	20	25

Bridge Rehabilitation Experience: (200)

The individual would be evaluated on the basis of number of bridges rehabilitated. The scoring criteria is as under:

Experience	Number of Bridges			
	< 100	100 – 200	200 – 300	> 300
Rehabilitation of Old Bridges	50	100	150	200

The Consultant will provide duly certified (signed and stamped) list of projects alongwith following information:

- Name of Project
- Name of Structure
- Type of Structure
- Length of Structure
- Location Information
- Client Name