

TECHNICAL EVALUATION REPORT

(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

- 1 Name of procuring Agency: Managing Director/CSF/PR/H.Q: Office, Lahore
- 2 Method of Procurement: Single Stage Two Envelope Procedure as per rule 36(b)
- 3 Title of Procurement: Supply of Hex Slit Nuts = 590,990 Nos for CSF/Sukkur.
- 4 Tender Inquiry No: CSF/1017/P/2023
- 5 PPRA Ref. No. (TSE): TS523757E
- 6 Date & Time of Bid Closing: 17.11.2023 at 11:00 Hours
- 7 Date & Time of Bid Opening: 17.11.2023 at 11:30 Hours
- 8 No of Bids Received: Three
- 9 Criteria for bid Evaluation: Attached
- 10 Details of Bid(s) Evaluation: Attached

Name of Bidder	Technical Marks Obtained	Rule/Regulation/SBD*/Policy/Basis for Rejection/Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004
M/s. Metal Form Enterprises Gujranwala.	90	The bid found responsive and technically qualified
M/s. Continental Engineering Services (Pvt) Ltd, Karachi.	-	The bid found technically un-suitable/Not qualified
M/s. ASR Enterprises, Lahore	95	The bid found responsive and technically qualified


(Mateen Ahmed Khan)
Executive Engineer/CSF/HQ;
for Managing Director/CSF,
Ph # 042-99201737.

**EVALUATION REPORT OF TECHNICAL BID AGAINST ADVERTISED TENDER NO.CSF/1017/P/2023 OPENED ON 17.11.2023 FOR THE
PROCUREMENT OF HEX SLIT NUTS = 590,990 NOS FOR CSF/SUKKUR.**

PARTICULARS / REQUIREMENTS (AS PER QUALIFICATION CRITERIA, PLACED AT S.NO.2/134 to 2/136)		M/s Metal Form Enterprises, Gujranwala.	M/s Continental Engg. Services (Pvt) Ltd, Karachi.	ASR Enterprises, Lahore
		Provided or not provided	Provided or not provided	Provided or not provided
(i) BASIC ELIGIBILITY (MANDATORY)				
a	Proof / Documents of registration as supplier or Manufacturer/Sole proprietor/partnership deed/ Memorandum of Association of Firm in case of Limited Company OR registration of FBR as supplier etc?	Provided (As flagged-1 in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged-11 in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged-18 in technical bid)
b	Proof of registration with Sales Tax, Income Tax Departments and active on FBR's Active Tax Payer's List?	Provided (As flagged-2 in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged-12 in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged-19 in technical bid)
c	Litigation history / Affidavit on Legal Stamp paper in original to the fact that no litigation hinders the bidder to participate in this tender?	Provided (As flagged-3 in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged-13 in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged-20 in technical bid)
d	Affidavit on legal stamp paper declaring that the firm has never been black listed?	Provided (As flagged-4 in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged-14 in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged-21 in technical bid)
e	Affidavit on legal stamp paper declaring that the firm has supplied the material within due time for last two years in CSF/Directorate, if the firm is already working in CSF/Directorate?	Provided (As flagged-5 in technical bid)	Not provided	Provided (As flagged-22 in technical bid)
f	Bid Security as mentioned in tender documents from Scheduled Bank in Pakistan in favor of MD/CSF or FA&CAO/M&S, Pakistan Railways, Headquarters office Lahore as per BDS (clause-18)?	CDR Provided (As flagged-6 in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged-15 in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged-23 in technical bid)
g	Has the bidder allowed that the purchaser shall have the right of stage inspection of manufacturing facilities by signing on all pages of bidding documents?	Yes by signing all pages of bidding documents.	Yes by signing all pages of bidding documents.	Yes by signing all pages of bidding documents.
h	Has the bidder provided 100 Nos. quality samples of Hex Slit Nuts duly engraved manufacture's name free of any cost with technical bid for evaluation, in case of new participant who has not already supplied Hex Slit Nuts to CSF. The performance of quality samples will be got tested at CSF/Sukkur.	Not Provided as the bidder has already supplied the Hex Slit Nuts to CSF	Provided and performance of quality samples has been tested at CSF/SUK and declared <u>technically un-suitable</u> vide report placed as S.No.11.	Sample already Provided and declared technically suitable vide WM/CSF/KWL's report placed at S.No.12.

i	Has the bidder certified on their letter head that goods shall be free of any defect, as per required standard material (steel SMn 28 K as per German Standard DIN 1651) and material must be of specifications mentioned in criteria for evaluation (Table-1 & 2) on page No.135 of the bidding documents.		Provided (As flagged-7 in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged-16 in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged-24 in technical bid)			
j	Has the bidder provided proof / certificate on letterhead or brochure / profile of the manufacturer showing that manufacturer must have manufacturing capacity of Hex Slit Nuts, at least 4,500 Nos per day?		Provided (As flagged-8 in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged-17 in technical bid)	Provided (As flagged-25 in technical bid)			
All the Mandatory requirements fulfilled or not?			Fulfilled	Not Fulfilled	Not Fulfilled			
Particulars / Requirements		Total Marks	Provided or Not Provided	Marks Obtained	Provided or Not Provided	Marks Obtained	Provided or Not Provided	Marks Obtained
(ii) EXPERIENCE OF MANUFACTURING OF HEX SLIT NUTS / SIMILAR ITEMS (MAX: MARKS = 35)								
1	Has the bidder provided brochure or profile or letter or purchase orders showing that the bidder has experience of manufacturing / supplying Hex Slit Nuts / Similar steel items to various organizations / customers / countries? More than or equal to 4 years. 100% Less than 4 years, but more than or equal to 3 years. 80% Less than 3 years, but more than or equal to 2 years. 65% Less than 2 years. 0%	35	Letter of supplies to CSF Provided (As flagged-8 in technical bid)	35 (More than 4 years experience)	-	-	Copies of purchase orders of similar item (Nuts) Provided (As flagged-26 in technical bid)	35 (More than 4 years experience)
(iii) MANUFACTURING EQUIPMENTS & INSPECTION / TESTING FACILITY (MAX: MARKS = 10)								
1	Has the bidder provided list or information or brochure showing that the manufacturer has all equipments of their own required for manufacturing of offered material?	5	List Provided (As flagged-09 in technical bid)	5	-	-	List Provided (As flagged-27 in technical bid)	5
2	Has the bidder provided list or information or brochure of the manufacturer showing that the manufacturer possesses adequate inspection, testing/analysis facilities?	5	Not provided	0	-	-	Not provided	0

Contd....

(iv) MANUFACTURING / SUPPLYING CAPACITY OF THE BIDDER (MAX: MARKS = 25)

1	Has the bidder provided brochure or profile or letter showing that the bidder has manufacturing / supplying capacity of desired / Similar steel items? Greater than or equal to 1,000,000 Nos per year = 25 Marks. Less than 1,000,000, but more than or equal to 900,000 Nos per year = 20 Marks. Less than 900,000 but more than or equal to 800,000 Nos per year = 15 Marks. Less than 800,000 but more than or equal to 700,000 Nos per year = 12 Marks. Less than 700,000 but more than or equal to 600,000 Nos per year = 09 Marks. Less than 600,000 but more than or equal to 500,000 Nos per year = 07 Marks. Less than 500,000 but more than or equal to 400,000 Nos per year = 05 Marks. Less than 400,000 Nos per year = 0 Marks.	25	Letter Provided (As flagged-8 in technical bid)	25 (More than 1,000,000 Nos per year @ 10,000 Nos per day)	-	-	Letter Provided (As flagged-25 in technical bid)	25 (More than 1,800,000 per year @ 5,000 Nos per day)
---	---	----	---	---	---	---	--	--

(v) FINANCIAL SOUNDNESS OF THE BIDDER (MAX: MARKS = 30)

1	Has the bidder provided annual audit reports / bank statement or annual sales tax / income tax returns for the last 3 years for the average annual turnover? Greater than or equal to 20 Million. = 30 Marks. Less than 20 Million, but more than or equal to 15 Million = 25 Marks. Less than 15 Million, but more than or equal to 10 Million = 20 Marks. Less than 10 Million, but more than or equal to 05 Million = 15 Marks. Less than 5 Million = 0 Marks.	30	Sales Tax returns Provided (As flagged-10 in technical bid)	25 (Less than 20, more than 15 million average annual turnover)	-	-	Provided (As flagged-28 in technical bid)	30 (Greater than 20 million average annual turnover)
---	--	----	---	--	---	---	---	---

Total 100 - 90 - - - 95

Status of the firm (Qualifying Marks = 70) (Similar item means Hex Slit Nuts, Nuts etc)	Technically Suitable/ Qualified	Technically Un-Suitable/ Not Qualified	Technically Suitable/ Qualified
---	------------------------------------	---	------------------------------------

Dy; CCP-I

Dy; CEN/South

Dy; CEN/Track

ANNEXURE-“A”**CRITERIA FOR EVALUATION OF TECHNICAL PROPOSAL****1. General**

The technical proposal of the Bidders shall be evaluated for qualification of bidders for the subject Bid based on the criteria regarding Eligibility, Work Experience, Personnel Capabilities, Equipment Capabilities and Financial Soundness as follows;

2. Weightage/Marks

The weightage/distribution of the marks shall be as given below:

- | | |
|--|-----------------|
| i. Basic Eligibility (Mandatory) | |
| ii. Experience of manufacturing / supplying of Steel / raw material | |
| iii. Manufacturing equipment & Inspection / Testing Facility of the manufacturer | 10 |
| iv. Manufacturing Capacity | 25 |
| v. Financial Soundness | 30 |
| | Total 100 Marks |

The overall minimum qualifying score shall be 70% marks to qualify. A detailed qualification criterion is given hereunder.

3. Marks Distribution**(i) Basic Eligibility (mandatory)**

The firms fulfilling the following basic requirements shall only be considered for further evaluation (relevant documents to be attached).

- Proof / Documents of registration as supplier or Manufacturer / Sole proprietor / partnership deed / Memorandum of Association of Firm in case of Limited Company or registration of FBR as supplier etc.
- The bidder must be registered with Sales Tax and Income Tax Departments and must be on FBR's Active Tax Payer's List (**documentary proof must be submitted along with bid**).
- Litigation history / Affidavit on Legal Stamp paper in original to the fact that no litigation hinders the bidder to participate in this tender.
- Affidavit on legal stamp paper declaring that the firm has never been black listed.
- Affidavit on legal stamp paper declaring that the firm has supplied the tendered material within due time for last two years in CSF/Directorate. If the firm has already working in CSF/Directorate.
- Bid Security as mentioned in tender documents from Scheduled Bank in Pakistan in favor of MD/CSF or FA&CAO/M&S, Pakistan Railways, Headquarters office Lahore as per BDS (Clause-18).
- The bidder must allow that the purchaser shall have the right of stage inspection of manufacturing facilities. The signatures of Bidders on all pages of bidding documents will be considered their permission.
- In case of new participant who has not already supplied Hex Slit Nuts to CSF, 100 Nos quality samples of the same duly engraved manufacture's name free of any cost to be submitted with technical bid for evaluation. The performance of quality samples will be got tested at CSF/Sukkur.

Contd.....

Bidder

- i) Bidder shall certify on their letter head that goods shall be free of any defect, as per required standard material (steel) and material must be of following specifications (mentioned in Table-1 & 2):

TABLE-1 CHEMICAL COMPOSITION

LIMIT VALUES OF CHEMICAL COMPOSITION			
RULING ELEMENTS		% BY WEIGHT	
		Minimum	Maximum
Carbon	C	-	0.14
Silicon	Si	-	0.05
Manganese	Mn	0.9	1.3
Phosphorus	P	-	0.10
Sulphur	S	0.24	0.325

TABLE-2 MECHANICAL COMPOSITION

		Minimum Value	Maximum Value
Tensile Strength	Kg/mm ²	52	77
Yield Point	Kg/mm ²	42	-
Elongation	%	7%	-

Note: - Minor variation from the above stated values shall be as per German Standard specification DIN 1651.

- j) Bidder provide the proof that manufacturer must have manufacturing capacity of Hex Slit Nuts, at least 4,500 Nos per day (Attach certificate on letterhead or contained in brochure / profile of the manufacturer).

Note: Any major deviation would render the bid likely to be rejected. Bidder must keep in mind while submitting their bid to avoid major deviations which may include:-

- Bid Security according to BDS Clause-18 being not enclosed with Technical Bid.
- Conditional bid being offered e.g. to stipulate condition of advance payment or other conditions.
- Specifications have not been signed / confirmed.
- Delivery Period has not been accepted / confirmed.

- (ii) **Experience of manufacturing of Hex Slit Nuts / Similar items**
(Max Marks = 35)

Marking for work experience of the manufacturer / supplier shall be evaluated as per following criteria.

S. No.	Description	Max. Marks
1	The Bidder has experience of manufacturing / supplying Hex Slit Nuts / Similar steel items to various organizations / customers / countries. a) More than or equal to 4 year. 100% b) Less than 4 years, but more than or equal to 3 years. 80% c) Less than 3 years, but more than or equal to 2 years. 65% d) Less than 2 years. 0%	35

Note: Manufacturer's / company brochure / profile / letter / purchase orders be enclosed

Contd.....

Bidder



(iii) Manufacturing equipment & Inspection / Testing Facility (Max Marks = 10)

S. No.	Description	Max. Marks
1	The manufacturer has all equipments of their own required for manufacturing of offered material.	5
2	The manufacturer possesses adequate inspection, testing/analysis facilities.	5

Note: The information about plant & machinery can be in the form of list / information provided by the manufacturer or contained in the company brochure.

(iv) Manufacturing / supplying capacity of the bidder (Max Marks = 25)

S. No.	Description	Max. Marks
1	Bidder has the manufacturing / supplying capacity of desired / similar steel items Greater than or equal to 1000000 Nos per year = 25 Marks. Less than 100000, but more than or equal to 900000 Nos per year = 20 Marks. Less than 900000, but more than or equal to 800000 Nos per year = 15 Marks. Less than 800000, but more than or equal to 700000 Nos per year = 12 Marks. Less than 700000, but more than or equal to 600000 Nos per year = 09 Marks. Less than 600000, but more than or equal to 500000 Nos per year = 07 Marks. Less than 500000, but more than or equal to 400000 Nos per year = 05 Marks. Less than 400000 Nos per year = 0 Marks.	25

Note: Manufacturer's / company brochure / profile / letter be enclosed for evidence.

2. (iv) Financial soundness of Bidder (Max Marks = 30)

S. No.	Description	Max. Marks
1	Annual Turnover of Bidder Average annual Turnover for the last 3 years: Greater than or equal to 20 Million = 30 Marks Less than 20 Million, but more than or equal to 15 Million = 25 Marks Less than 15 Million, but more than or equal to 10 Million = 20 Marks Less than 10 Million, but more than or equal to 05 Million = 15 Marks. Less than 5 Million = 0 Marks	30

Note: - Annual Audit reports / Bank Statement or annual sales tax / income tax returns of the bidder shall be enclosed.

Note	Similar item means Hex Slit Nuts, Nuts etc;
-------------	--

Total = 100 Marks.

Minimum Qualifying Marks = 70

Bidder

