

FINAL EVALUATION REPORT

(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

1. NAME OF PROCURING AGENCY : PAKISTAN NATIONAL SHIPPING CORPORATION,
2. METHOD OF PROCUREMENT : SINGLE STAGE ONE ENVELOP PROCEDURE, AS PER RULE 36(a) OF PPR 2004.
3. TITLE OF PROCUREMENT : TENDER FOR CLEANING AND JANITORIAL SERVICE AT PNSC BUILDING (HEAD OFFICE) FOR A PERIOD OF ONE YEAR. [EMERGENT REQUIREMENT, AS PER PROVISIO OF RULE 13(1)]
4. TENDER INQUIRY NO. : PRCD/CLN JNTL/PNSC/2023 24/242
5. PPRA REF. NO. (TSE) : TS523985E
6. DATE & TIME OF BID CLOSING : 07-11-2023 – (12:00 PM)
7. DATE & TIME OF BID OPENING : 07-12-2023 – (12:30 PM)
8. NO OF BIDS RECEIVED : FIVE (05)
9. CRITERIA FOR BID EVALUATION : **MOST ADVANTAGEOUS BID,**
10. DETAILS OF BID(S) EVALUATION : DETAILS ARE TABULATED HEREUNDER:

NAME OF BIDDERS	MARKS		EVALUATED COST OF PKR:	Rules/ Regulation/ SBD*/Policy/ Basis of Rejection/ Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004
	Technical	Financial		
M/S. MOMI Associates,	Qualified	Lowest	PKR: 1,176,752/- (PER MONTH) X 12 = PKR: 14,121,024/- FOR (ONE YEAR)	M/s. Momi Associates had previously worked with PNSC in last Fiscal Year 2021-22, and their performance did not meet the expected standards. Several verbal warnings were issued to the contractor as a result. Tender Committee is unable to recommend awarding the contract M/s. Momi Associates due to unsatisfactory and poor performance.
M/S American Commercial Building Management Services (Pvt.) Ltd,	Qualified	2 nd Lowest	PKR: 1,320,683/- (PER MONTH) X 12 = PKR: 15,848,196/- FOR (ONE YEAR)	Accepted as per PPRA Rule No. 38, being Second Lowest & Most Advantageous Bidder.
M/S. SWIFT Property Management Services (Pvt.) Ltd,	Qualified	3 rd Lowest	PKR: 1,565,023/- (PER MONTH) X 12 = PKR: 18,780,276/- FOR (ONE YEAR)	THIRD (03) LOWEST BIDDER
M/S PAKISTAN Contractor,	Qualified	4 th Lowest	PKR: 1,676,661/- (PER MONTH) X 12 = PKR: 20,119,932/- FOR (ONE YEAR)	FORTH (04) LOWEST BIDDER
M/S. 3J Solutions.	Disqualified bidder – Could not be justified as the bid submitted is not as per the format provided in the bid document.			

MOST ADVANTAGEOUS BIDDER : M/S AMERICAN COMMERCIAL BUILDING MANAGEMENT SERVICES (PVT.) LTD,

11. Any other additional/supporting information, SCANNED BIDDERS ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA / COMPARATIVE STATEMENT REPORT IS ATTACHED.

Signature:

SYED ZESHAN TAQVI
Group General Manager Finance
PAKISTAN NATIONAL SHIPPING CORPORATION
Karachi

Official Stamp:

Standard Bidding Documents (SBD).

PAKISTAN NATIONAL SHIPPING CORPORATION

BIDDER'S ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA

SR.No.	PARTICULARS	Bidder's Details				
		M/s. Swift Facility Management	M/s. American Commercial Building Management Services (Pvt Ltd)	M/s. Momi Associates	M/s. Pakistan Contractors	M/s. 3J Solution
1	NTN Certificate	Submitted	Submitted	Submitted	Submitted	Submitted
2	SRB Certificate	Submitted	Submitted	Submitted	Submitted	Submitted
3	Active Tax Payer List (ATL) from FBR	Submitted	Submitted	Submitted	Submitted	Submitted
4	Certificate shall be registered with SESSI & EOBI, if applicable	Submitted	Submitted	Submitted	Submitted	Nil
5	Minimum Experience of five years including 10 plus residential / commercial and office buildings	Submitted	Submitted	Submitted	Submitted	Nil
6	Notarized Affidavit / undertaking for Not Black listing	Submitted	Submitted	Submitted	Submitted	Submitted
7	List of existing clients	Submitted	Submitted	Submitted	Submitted	Submitted
8	Pay Order @ 2% of total Bid Value	Submitted	Submitted	Submitted	Submitted	Submitted
	Qualified / Disqualified	Qualified	Qualified	Qualified	Qualified	Dis-Qualified

BIDDER'S COMPARATIVE STATEMENT							
1	Total Amount of PKR: (Per Month), (Including all Taxes)	1,505,023.00	1,320,683.00	1,176,752.00	1,676,661.00		Could not be justified as the bid submitted is not as per the format provided in the bidding document
2	Total Amount of RKR: (Per Year), Including all Taxes)	18,780,276.00	15,848,196.00	14,121,024.00	20,119,937.00		
3	02% Earnest Money / Bid Security of Total Bid Value of PKR	375,605.52	316,963.92	282,420.48	402,398.64		
4	Category	3rd Lowest	2nd Lowest	Lowest			

Hamdullah Shaikh
M. (Estate)
Member

Mustafa Bilal Kazi
M. (Estate)
Member

Altamash Qureshi
M. (Finance)
Member

Syed Zeeshan Taqvi
G.M. (Finance)
Chairman Tender Committee

4. Bidder's Qualification / Eligibility Criteria as per clause-4 of Tender document for subject tender is enclosed at Annex A for ready reference, however, summary of Bidders qualification criteria is mentioned below:

S.No.	Bidder's Name	Amount Per Month in Rs.	Amount Per Annum in Rs.	Status
1	M/s Swift Facility Management	1,565,023	18,780,276	Qualified
2	M/s. American Commercial Building Management Services (Pvt.) Ltd.	1,320,683	15,848,196	Qualified
3	M/s. MOMI Associates	1,176,752	14,121,024	Qualified
4	M/s. Pakistan Contractors	1,676,661	20,119,932	Qualified
5	M/s. 3J Solutions	Could not be justified as the bid submitted is not as per the format provided in the 'Bid Data Sheet'		Disqualified

5. As per Bidder's Eligibility Criteria table enclosed at **Annex A**, lowest qualified bidder (first) M/s. MOMI Associates has bid for a total amount of Rs. 1,176,752/- per month & Rs. 14,121,024/- per Annum (inclusive of all taxes) however, M/s MOMI Associates has previously worked with Estate department in the year 2021-2022 and their performance was not up to the mark and several verbal warnings were given to said contractor. Therefore, tender committee is unable to recommend to award the contract to M/s MOMI Associates due to unsatisfactory performance.
6. Consequently, it is recommended that contract may please be awarded to 2nd lowest bidder M/s **American Commercial Building Management Services (Pvt.) Ltd.** for total amount of Rs. 1,320,683/- per month & Rs. 15,848,196/- per Annum (inclusive of all taxes) under the condition of a two-month trial period. This decision is made in the interest of ensuring that the janitorial services provided meet our standards and expectations. By initiating a trial-period, we aim to assess the performance of **M/s American Commercial Building Management Services (Pvt.) Ltd.** and ensure their capability to deliver the required services satisfactorily
7. Submitted please.


Engr. Hamadullah Shaikh
Manager (Estate)
MEMBER


Mustafa Bilal Kazi
Deputy Manager (Estate)
MEMBER


Altamash Qureshi
Manager (Finance)
MEMBER


Zeeshan Taqvi
G.M (Finance)
CHAIRMAN TENDER COMMITTEE