

EVALUATION REPORT

(As Per Rule 35 of PPRA Rules,2004)

1.	Name of Procuring Agency:	National Transport Research Centre(NTRC)
2.	Method of Procurement:	Single Stage Two Envelop Procedure
3.	Title of Procurement:	NTRC Study on Freight Transport (Trucking) in Pakistan
4.	Tender Inquiry No.:	NTRC-15(1)/2006-Vol-II
5.	PPRA Ref. No.(TSE):	TS404358E (29.11.2019)
6.	Date &Time of Bid Closing:	11 th December, 2019 11:00 AM
7.	Date &Time of Bid Opening:	11 th December, 2019 11:30 AM
8.	No of Bids Received:	Four (4) Proposals were received
9.	Criteria for Bid Evaluation:	Criteria of Bid Evaluation is attached at Annex-I
10.	DetailsofBid(s)Evaluation:	As below

NTRC Study on Freight Transport(Trucking) in Pakistan	Name of Bidder	Marks			Evaluated Cost (PKR)	Rule/Regulation /SBD*/Policy/ Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 Of PPRules,2004.
		Technical (if applicable)	Financial (if applicable)	Total		
1.	M/s Zeeruk International (Pvt), Islamabad	655.04	199.84	854.88	39.13 Million	1 st Top scoring firm in combined evaluation (PPRA Rule 36(b) (ix))
2.	M/s NESPAK, Islamabad	619.68	200	819.68	39.1 Million	2 nd
3.	M/s Finite Engineering, Islamabad	594.72	177.16	771.88	44.139718 Million	3 rd
4.	M/s Urban Unit, Lahore	595.36	167.73	763.09	46.62 Million	4 th

Top Ranked Bidder: M/s Zeeruk International (Pvt), Islamabad.

11. **Any other additional/supporting information, the procuring agency may like to share:** The Procurement was carried out in line with PPRA Rules & Regulations. The bidding was done on QCBS method with 80:20 Technical to Financial Proposals ratio.

Signature:


.....
Muhammad Sayyar
Deputy Chief
National Transport Centre (NTRC)
Ministry of Communication
Islamabad

Official Stamp:





***Standard Bidding Documents(SBD).**

Intoc 21. 2019

COMBINED SUMMARY EVALUATION SHEET
Consultancy Services for Study on 'Freight Transport (Trucking) in Pakistan'

Evaluation Criteria	Max. Weight	M/s Finite Engineering						M/s Urban Unit						M/s NESPAK						M/s Zeeruk					
		E-1	E-2	E-3	E-4	E-5	Avg	E-1	E-2	E-3	E-4	E-5	Avg	E-1	E-2	E-3	E-4	E-5	Avg	E-1	E-2	E-3	E-4	E-5	Avg
i) Consultancy firm Experience	100	73	85	74	70	67	73.8	55	76	56	59	56	60.4	85	86	88	83	86	86	90	80	87	75	86	83.6
a) General Experience	25	18	20	18	18	17	18.2	10	16	11	13	10	12	25	24	25	24	24	24.6	20	20	20	21	18	19.8
b) specific Experience	75	55	65	56	52	50	55.6	45	60	45	46	46	48.4	60	62	63	60	62	61.4	70	60	67	54	68	63.8
ii) Approach and methodology	300	237	241	232	237	231	235.6	203	219	207	206	211	209.2	226	228	224	228	232	227.6	249	230	243	245	242	241.8
a) Understanding of Objectives	50	37	40	38	37	33	37	35	40	38	35	40	37.6	35	37	38	36	38	36.8	45	40	40	45	42	42.4
b) Quality of Methodology	200	160	160	153	159	160	158.4	130	140	132	135	135	134.4	150	152	150	154	152	###	160	150	158	158	155	156.2
c) Innovativeness / Comments on TOR	10	7	7	5	7	6	6.4	0	5	0	0	0	1	6	5	6	7	5.8	10	8	9	8	9	8	8.8
d) Work Program	10	10	8	9	10	9	9.2	10	9	10	10	10	9.8	10	8	9	8	10	9	8	9	10	8	9	8.8
e) Staffing Schedule	10	8	9	10	8	8	8.6	8	7	7	8	7	7.4	10	10	8	9	10	9.4	8	8	9	10	9	8.8
f) Conciseness, clarity and completeness in Proposal Presentation	20	15	17	17	16	15	16	20	18	20	18	19	19	15	16	14	15	15	15	18	15	17	16	18	16.8
iii) Personnel (Arrears of Expertise) Qualification and Competence of key personnel	500																								
a) Team Leader/Highway/Road Design Engr	200	158	162	157	158	156	158.2	160	165	160	160	158	160.6	155	154	150	150	155	152.8	160	155	160	160	159	158.8
Academic (30%)		48	52	48	48	48	48.8	60	60	60	60	60	60	60	60	60	60	60	60	60	60	60	60	60	60
Project Experience (60%)		90	92	87	90	88	89.4	80	85	80	80	78	80.6	85	84	80	80	85	82.8	90	85	90	90	89	88.8
Status with Firm (10%)		20	18	22	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10
b) Transport Economist / Statistician	125	95	102	97	94	96	96.8	100	107	102	99	103	102.2	80	97	78	80	81	83.2	113	110	111	114	112	112
Academic (30%)		30	32	30	30	30	30.4	35	37	37	37	37	36.6	20	25	20	18	21	20.8	37	37	37	37	37	37
Project Experience (60%)		55	60	57	54	56	56.4	55	60	55	52	56	55.6	48	60	46	50	48	50.4	70	65	68	69	70	68.4
Status with Firm (10%)		10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	12	12	12	12	12	12	6	8	6	8	5	6.6
c) Computer Expert	125	65	80	62	62	65	66.8	95	105	94	96	93	96.6	94	97	98	94	101	96.8	102	95	96	96	99	97.6
Academic (30%)		15	25	14	15	15	16.8	35	35	35	35	35	35	37	37	37	36	37	36.8	30	30	30	30	30	30
Project Experience (60%)		40	45	38	37	40	40	50	60	49	51	48	51.6	45	50	49	48	52	48.8	60	55	54	57	59	57
Status with Firm (10%)		10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	12	10	12	10	12	11.2	12	10	12	9	10	10.6
d) Supervisor	50	40	42	39	38	40	39.8	35	45	33	35	33	36.2	43	45	42	40	41	42.2	45	45	40	43	40	42.6
Academic (30%)		15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	13	15	14	14.4	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15
Project Experience (60%)		20	22	19	18	20	19.8	15	25	15	15	14	16.8	23	25	22	20	21	22.2	25	25	20	23	20	22.6
Status with Firm (10%)		5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
iv) Past preference of the consultant in last two assignment the basis for post performance of the consultants is the report from previous clients	100	70	75	70	72	75	72.4	80	82	78	80	75	79	90	90	85	80	85	86	80	85	84	82	81	82.4
Total	1000	738	787	731	731	730	743.4	728	799	730	735	729	744.2	773	797	765	757	781	774.6	839	800	821	815	819	818.8
RANK																									
Minimum qualifying is 70% or 700 marks																									

- i) The basis Past Performance of the consultant is the report from various quarters in parts particularly technical / academic. The client's satisfaction certificates are also required to be attached for last three completed projects of comparable magnitude. The current commitments are to be assessed as per works in hand of the consultant
- ii) The joint venture (JV) shall be evaluated in the same manner as a single entity, since they function as one unit.

E-1 (Deputy Chief)	Mrs. Fozia Sultana,	Signature		E-3 (Deputy Chief)	Muhammad Sayyar Khan,	Signature	
E-2 (Deputy Chief)	Khizar Javed,	Signature		E-4 (Assistant Chief)	Yousaf Zia,	Signature	
			E-5 (Assistant Chief)	Zia ul Islam,	Signature	